Cl **104** *SC* **104.5.3.1** *P* **53** *L* **eq 1** # 241

Joseph, A ????

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *OK*

Change in return loss specificaiton will effect current BroadR-reach compliant 100Mbps PHY's. It should be left to the PHY vendor to determine if the PHY's can tolerate a higher return loss at < 2Mhz and not be forced by the specification. Impact of this would be different PHY's working with different inductor values. This choice should be left to the vendors.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove degradation in return loss from 1 to 2MHz. This comment is only for 100Base-T1

Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This relaxation of the RL was proposed by the PHY vendor for incorporation into Clause 104. See presentation pischl_3bu_1_0315.pdf for details.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7a.2.1** *P* **30** *L* **26** # 329

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *OK*

The use of the term shall here implies CL 45 is mandated. Clause 45 is optional in it's entirety and cannot be made mandatory.
"This bit shall be set to one when the PSE state diagram (Figure 104-4) enters the state 'ERROR.' The Power Denied bit shall be implemented with latching high behavior as defined in 45.2."
Given that you've not opened the PICS for Cl 45 I infer that you don't wish to include normative language here.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "shall be" to "is" in 12 places in 45.2.7a.2.x. For example the statements quoted above will read:
"This bit is set to one when the PSE state diagram (Figure 104-4) enters the state 'ERROR.' The Power Removed bit is implemented with latching high behavior as defined in 45.2."

Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

PICs will be added for Clause 45 shalls. The interface is optional.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7a.2.4** *P* **30** *L* **44** # 333

Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *OK*

MDIO registers affected by SD's should clearly be tied to a variable in the SD and not set/reset by a state transition as in "shall be set to one when the PSE state diagram (Figure 104-4) transitions directly from the
state CLASSIFICATION_EVAL to RESTART"

This issue exists for the following bit definitions; 12.1.15, 14, 13, 12, 11, 10 , 9:7, 6:3 and 2:0.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide a clear reference to a SD variable for bit 12.1.12. If one does not exist in the SD create it in the SD and xref here.

Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

All the bit fields with their corresponding subclauses will be reviewed and editor given license to change as per the suggested remedy.

Cl **104** *SC* **104.3.6** *P* **43** *L* **19** # 399

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/LTC

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *OK*

Power feeding ripple and noise are defined as a function of frequency, but the units are specified as Vp-p, and no bandwidth for the measurmeent is defined. Need to specify what filter bandwidth this Vpp is over. Same applies to item 3 in Table 104-6.

SuggestedRemedy

Change units to Vp-p/Hz. (sorry - don't know how many Hz were meant).

Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

We need to specify a measurement bandwidth for ripple. What is it? Commentor did not accept rejection in order to keep this open for the next meeting cycle so it can be addressed with a proposal from the editor and or members of the group.

TFTD.