

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 000 SC 0 P L # 233  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

There are only two instances (that I found) in text (not including subclause title or in PICS) of "PMD Transmit function" (note the captial "T").

112.5, pg 185, ln 50  
 112.5.2, pg 186, ln 51

Same goes for "PMD Receive function"

112.5, pg 185, ln 50  
 112.5.3, pg 187, ln 6

All other instances are lowercase.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Make consistent throughout draft. Either capitalize the "t"/"r" or make "T"/"R" lowercase.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "PMD transmit function" throughout in place of "PMD Transmit function".

Also, use "PMD receive function" throughout in place of "PMD Receive function".

CI 001 SC 1.3 P25 L35 # 67  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

In Draft 3.2 of 802.3bx the removed footnote is 18 not 16

SuggestedRemedy  
 change to 18

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 001 SC 1.4.64a P25 L46 # 207  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Should this item be placee after 1.4.77 '10 Gigabit Sixteen-Bit Interface (XSBI)' rather than 1.4.64 '10/10G-EPON'.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change subclause number 1.4.64a to read 1.4.77a and 1.4.64b to read 1.4.77b. Change 1.4.64c to read 1.4.64a and 1.4.64d to read 1.4.64b.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change subclause numbers and reorder as follows:  
 1.4.64a to 1.4.77a  
 1.4.64b to 1.4.77b  
 1.4.64c to 1.4.64a  
 1.4.64d to 1.4.64b  
 1.4.64e to 1.4.64c  
 1.4.64f to 1.4.64d  
 1.4.64g to 1.4.64e  
 1.4.64h to 1.4.64f  
 1.4.64i to 1.4.64g

CI 001 SC 1.5 P26 L35 # 68  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

If you want these inserted in alphabetical order they should start in alphabetical order

SuggestedRemedy  
 Swap 25GMII and 25GAUI

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Swap the order of 25GMII and 25GAUI.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 030 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P28 L10 # 205  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

The IEEE P802.3bw amendment, which is likely to publish before this draft, is also modifying this subclause which should be noted in the editing instructions.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest the editing instruction for 30.3.2.1.2 'aPhyType' and 30.3.2.1.3 'aPhyTypeList' be changed to read 'Insert the following new entry in "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw-201X) before the entry for 40GBASE-R:'.  
 Suggest that '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface.' be changed to read '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface (see Table 46-4 and Table 81-3).'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.3.2.1.5 P28 L31 # 69  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

For consistency with other sub-clauses of Cl 30 it would be better to omitt ATTRIBUTE

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "ATTRIBUTE"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.3.2.1.5 P28 L31 # 50  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

There is too much legacy text here.

SuggestedRemedy

Prune the text to include only the text that has been modified and a minimum amount of legacy text to show the context of the modified text.

Also do the same for 30.5.1.1.2, 30.5.1.1.4, 30.5.1.1.17 and 30.5.1.1.18

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comments 18 and 208

Cl 030 SC 30.3.2.1.5 P28 L52 # 214  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket

Not sure why the references to the encoding for "Receive Error" in Table 46-4 and Table 81-3 is been removed by this draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface.' be changed to read '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface (see Table 46-4 and Table 81-3).'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.17 P31 L17 # 85  
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

Consider making "10 Gb/s" non-breaking. Do same for any similar "value<space>units" or "value<dash>units", etc. in the draft where it makes visual sense.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P29 L11 # 206  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

The IEEE P802.3bw amendment, which is likely to publish before this draft, is also modifying the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of this attribute which should be noted in the editing instructions.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest the editing instruction for aMAUType "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section be changed to read 'Insert the following new entries in "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw-201X) before the entry for 40GBASE-R:'.  
 Suggest that '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface.' be changed to read '... to indicate "Receive Error" on the media independent interface (see Table 46-4 and Table 81-3).'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P29 L17 # 177  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"shielded copper balanced cabling" is usually "shielded balanced copper cabling" (see 40GBASE-CR4 for example).  
 Additionally, this description "shielded balanced copper cabling" is nowhere in clause 110 which defines the PMDs.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "shielded copper balanced cabling" with "shielded balanced copper cabling" (2 instances, lines 17 & 20)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P29 L30 # 18  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket

"Change "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section of 30.5.1.1.2 as follows:" - typically, in cases like this, we only include the second para that is being modified to avoid attracting comments on text that was not changed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove first para (lines 32-43) and change editorial note to read "Change second paragraph in "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section of 30.5.1.1.2 as follows:"

There are also other locations in Clause 30, e.g., 30.5.1.1.4, 30.5.1.1.17, 30.5.1.1.18 where similar change should be applied, i.e., show only changes to specific para of interest and scrub paras with text that are not being modified. In 30.5.1.1.18 (for example), the only change is in first sentence of "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:" and "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See comments 50 and 208.

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P29 L39 # 216  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket

To support the enumerations '25GBASE-CR', '25GBASE-CR-S', '25GBASE-KR' and '25GBASE-KR-S' when a Clause 45 MDIO interface is present, the new RS-FEC control register defined in subclause 45.2.1.101 needs to be accessed to determine if RS-FEC is enabled or not. Based on this a reference to subclause 45.2.1.101 'RS-FEC control register' should be added to the list of register.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the text '... the PMA/PMD control 1 register specified in 45.2.1.1, and the PCS control 1 register ...' to read '... the PMA/PMD control 1 register specified in 45.2.1.1, the 25G RS-FEC Enable bit in the RS-FEC control register, and the PCS control 1 register ...'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 030 SC 30.5.1.1.4 P29 L52 # 208  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The IEEE P802.3bw amendment, which is likely to publish before this draft, is also modifying the "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section of this attribute which should be noted in the editing instructions. In addition to avoid the potential misunderstanding that this change undoes the IEEE P802.3bw change, suggest that only the changed text of the "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section be included in the draft.

*SuggestedRemedy*

- [1] Change the editing instructions to read 'Change the first sentence of the sixth paragraph in the "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section of 30.5.1.1.4 as follows:'
- [2] Delete all the text shown for the 'BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS' section with the exception of the first sentence of the sixth paragraph.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See comment 18 and 50.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **030** SC **30.5.1.1.4** P**30** L**1** # **1**  
 Lewis, Jon Dell

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Bucket

If the MAU is a 10M b/s... This should be 10 Mb/s for consistency

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 10M b/s to 10 Mb/s.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This text is part of the base standard and modifications to this text are out of scope for P802.3by.

The suggested remedy to Comment 50 proposes to remove this text since it is not being modified by P802.3by.

See comment 50.

Cl **030** SC **30.6.1.1.5** P**33** L**11** # **51**  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket

New text has not been underlined

SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline "RS-FEC25G Req" and "BASE-RFEC25G Req"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **031B** SC **31B.3.7** P**199** L**14** # **57**  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket

Too much legacy text

SuggestedRemedy  
 Prune the text to include only the text that has been modified and a minimum amount of legacy text to show the context of the modified text. Make similar change in the PICS.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comments 24, 25 and 29.

Cl **031B** SC **31B.3.7** P**199** L**14** # **29**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket

incorrect editorial instruction.  
 Change to "Insert the following new paragraph before the paragraph starting with "At operating speeds of 40 Gb/s ...":"  
 Add new editorial instruction "Insert the following calculation for 25 Gb/s operation, before the line "40 Gb/s - max\_overrun = 7552 + frame\_length.:""

SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove all unmodified text to avoid comment bait

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comments 57, 24, and 25.

Cl **031B** SC **31B.4.3** P**201** L**27** # **24**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket

Modify editorial instruction to read: "Insert a new PICS item MIIf and renumber current MIIf and MIlg accordingly" + remove all unmodified PICS items to avoid comment bait

SuggestedRemedy  
 Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comments 57, 29, and 25.

Cl **031B** SC **31B.4.6** P**202** L**1** # **25**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket

Modify editorial instruction to read: "Insert a new PICS item TIM7 and renumber current TIM7 and TIM8 accordingly" + remove all unmodified PICS items to avoid comment bait.  
 Remove TIM1

SuggestedRemedy  
 Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comments 57, 29, and 24.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.10.a** P**39** L**23** # **54**  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Bucket

Renumber 45.2.1.10.a to 45.2.1.10.b as 45.2.1.10.a is being used by 802.3bw

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 45.2.1.10.a to 45.2.1.10.b

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The text needs to be inserted before so make it subclause 45.2.1.10.aa

Change editing instruction to:

"Insert new subclause 45.2.1.10.aa before 45.2.1.10.1a as follows:"

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.102.1** P**43** L**51** # **101**  
 Booth, Brad Microsoft

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Bucket

missing an "a"

Same error occurs in 45.2.1.102.2 on page 44, line 12.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change to read:

"When read as a one, this bit..."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.6** P**37** L**3** # **105**  
 Booth, Brad Microsoft

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket

Considering there is a huge bank of register bits (1 1 0 x x x) shown as reserved, it might be good to provide an editor's note (to be removed prior to publication) to explain the gap to prevent sponsor ballot reviewers from suggesting changes to optimize.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add an Editor's note stating something along the lines of:

"1 1 0 x x x is reserved for other IEEE 802.3 amendments that are planning to use these bits but will be published after this amendment."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.7.4** P**38** L**11** # **52**  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket

In table 45-9 put "25GBASE-KR, 25GBASE-KR-S" on a single line to match the base standard

*SuggestedRemedy*

Make formatting of Tables 45-9 and 45-10 match the base standard by removing line feeds in the PMA/PMD column.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.8** P**38** L**48** # **53**  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket

Make formatting of table 45-12 match the base standard

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "25GBASE-KR,25GBASE-KR-S" to "25GBASE-KR and 25GBASE-KR-S"  
 Change "25GBASE-CR,25GBASE-CR-S" to "25GBASE-CR and 25GBASE-CR-S"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **045** SC **45.2.1.94** P**41** L**36** # **185**  
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket

There is no need for a capital S in "bits in the Single-lane PHY"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "bits in the Single-lane PHY" to "bits in the single-lane PHY"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comment 40

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 045 SC 45.2.1.94 P41 L36 # 40  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "The assignment of bits in the Single-lane PHY" - "Single-lane" should likely start with lower caps  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "The assignment of bits in the Single-lane PHY" to read "The assignment of bits in the single-lane PHY"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See also comment 185

CI 045 SC 45.2.1.94 P41 L37 # 186  
 Anslow, Pete Ciena  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 The first sentence of 45.2.1.94 is shown as ending with an italic colon rather than the "." that it actually ends with.  
 Same issue in 45.2.1.95  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace the italic colon with "." at the end of the first sentence of 45.2.1.94 and 45.2.1.95  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 045 SC 45.2.1.94 P41 L40 # 187  
 Anslow, Pete Ciena  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 The title of Table 45-74 in the base standard is: "10GBASE-R FEC corrected blocks counter register bit definitions". However, the word "register" is not there in the draft.  
 Same issue in Table 45-75.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 insert the word "register" in normal font in the titles of Table 45-74 and Table 45-75.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 045 SC 45.2.1.96.1 P42 L44 # 189  
 Anslow, Pete Ciena  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 The modified text reads: "the optional CAUI-4 C2M and 25GAUI C2M interface defined in Annex 83E (see 83E.3.1.6).", but the 25GAUI C2M interface is not defined in Annex 83E.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change: "the optional CAUI-4 C2M and 25GAUI C2M interface defined in Annex 83E (see 83E.3.1.6)." to "the optional CAUI-4 C2M and 25GAUI C2M interface defined in Annex 83E and Annex 109B, respectively (see 83E.3.1.6)."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 045 SC 45.2.3.1 P45 L16 # 41  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Extra "." at the end of the sentence "Change the indicated row of Table 45-120 for 25 Gb/s speed selection as follows (unchanged rows not shown)"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove extra "."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 045 SC 45.2.3.13.1 P0 L0 # 126  
 Slavick, Jeff Avago Technologies  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket  
 25G missing from list of MAC rates in several places  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 10/40/100 BASE-R to 10/25/40/100 BASE-R in sections  
 45.2.3.2.7  
 45.2.3.14.1  
 45.2.3.14.2  
 45.2.3.14.3  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See also comment 219

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 045 SC 45.2.3.13.1 P41 L34 # 219  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

Subclause 45.2.3.13.1 'BASE-R and 10GBASE-T receive link status (3.32.12)' states that 'This bit is a reflection of the PCS\_status variable defined in 49.2.14.1 for 10GBASE-R ...'. Subclause 45.2.3.13.4 'BASE-R and 10GBASE-T PCS high BER (3.32.1)' states that 'This bit is a direct reflection of the state of the hi\_ber variable in the 64B/66B state diagram and is defined in 49.2.13.2.2 for 10GBASE-R'. Subclause 45.2.3.13.5 'BASE-R and 10GBASE-T PCS block lock (3.32.0)' states ' This bit is a direct reflection of the state of the block\_lock variable in the 64B/66B state diagram and is defined in 49.2.13.2.2 for 10GBASE-R ...'. Subclause 45.2.3.14.4 'Errored blocks (3.33.7:0)' states 'The errored blocks counter is an eight bit count defined by the errored\_block\_count counter specified in 49.2.14.2 for 10GBASE-R ...'.

Since the 25GBASE-R PCS uses the 10GBASE-R PCS (see subclause 107.1.2) it would seem that these bits should also support 25GBASE-R, and hence the description of these bits updated to reflect this.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Suggest '... for 10GBASE-R ...' be change to read '... for 10GBASE-R and 25GBASE-R ...'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See also comment 126

CI 045 SC 45.2.3.14.1 P47 L33 # 218  
 Law, David HP

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

Subclause 45.2.3.14.1 'Latched block lock (3.33.15)' states that 'When read as a one, bit 3.33.15 indicates that the 10/40/100GBASE-R or the 10GBASE-T PCS has achieved block lock.'. Subclause 45.2.3.14.2 'Latched high BER (3.33.14)' states that 'When read as a one, bit 3.33.14 indicates that the 10/40/100GBASE-R or the 10GBASE-T PCS has detected a high BER.'. Subclause 45.2.3.14.3 'BER(3.33.13:8)' states that 'The BER counter is a six bit count as defined by the ber\_count variable in 49.2.14.2 and 82.2.19.2.4 for 10/40/100GBASE-R ...'.

Since the 25GBASE-R PCS uses the 10GBASE-R PCS (see subclause 107.1.2) it would seem that these bits should also support 25GBASE-R, and hence the description of these bits updated to reflect this.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Suggest instances of the text '10/40/100GBASE-R' be changed to read '10/25/40/100GBASE-R' or simply 'BASE-R'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to '10/25/40/100GBASE-R'

See comment 126

CI 045 SC 45.2.3.17 P47 L38 # 8  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Unclear editorial instruction: "Change second last sentence of first paragraph as follows:"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Mmodify "second last" to "second sentence from the end"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 045** SC **45.2.3.6** P**46** L**18** # **108**  
 Booth, Brad Microsoft  
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Bit range in first column of Table 45-123 is wrong.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to read "3.7.2:0".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 045** SC **45.2.7.13** P**49** L**13** # **210**  
 Law, David HP  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Typo.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Suggest that '7.60:15' and '7.60:14' should read '7.60.15' and '7.60.14'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 069** SC **69.2** P**54** L**20** # **148**  
 Dudek, Mike QLogic  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The superscript note "a" applies to all the items in the table. Why is it placed just on the items in the middle of the row rather than on the first two items (top left) as is done for table 69-1 and 69-2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move the superscript to the first M and first O in the top left of the table.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 069** SC **69.2.3** P**54** L**7** # **87**  
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Table 69.1 and 69.2 clause numbers are horizontal. The Clause numbers on line 9 should probably match by being horizontal. It doesn't look like there is a space issue for requiring vertical. Also consider making them active cross references.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 As per comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change orientation of clause numbers in Table 69-1A to be horizontal.

**Cl 069** SC **69.3** P**54** L**30** # **9**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Missing "," after "111.4"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert missing ","  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 073** SC **73.10.1** P**59** L**35** # **23**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 List format does not match list format in 802.3bx-D3.2  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please align - there are missing "." at the end of each entry  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.



IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 073 SC 73.3 P55 L45 # 56  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Incorrect cross reference  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 73.6 to 73.9  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 073 SC 73.6.4 P57 L4 # 39  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Font size / type issue in line 4 for "[:11]" - it seems to be a point smaller than the test of the text  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please apply the proper font type / size  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 074 SC 74.11.3 P72 L16 # 88  
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Suggest "100GBASE-R" should be non-breaking. (or widen column slightly..)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 As per comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 074 SC 74.4.1a P63 L43 # 43  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Wrong format of Figure 74-2a caption  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please apply the correct caption format (missing "-" between number and text, see Figure 74-1 for example of proper format)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 074 SC 74.7.4.5.1 P68 L3 # 70  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Incorrect formatting of Editing Instruction "Change Figure 74-8 and item b) as follows:"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 use paragraph style Editing Instruction rather than T, Text  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 074 SC 74.7.4.5.1 P68 L3 # 10  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Wrong format of editorial instructions "Change Figure 74-8 and item b) as follows:"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Apply the proper style to editorial instructions  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 074 SC 74.8 P71 L23 # 72  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

It is common practice in 802.3 to avoid allowing variable names to cross line brakes. While I understand this is a royal pain, please follow the convention.

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 74-1 adjust the column wsizes so FEC variables are not broken.  
 For normal text remove the underscore (may want to consider slash also) from the characters that can precede a line break by:  
 Choose Format > Document > Text Options, enter the characters in the Allow Line Breaks After text box, and click Set. For example, you might want to remove the slash character from the list if you use terms such as and/or.  
 Specific word can be made non-breaking (Hyphenation control) by placing the cursor in the work and typing <Esc> n s (see FM help on "Changing hyphenation and line breaks" )

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 078 SC 78.1.1 P73 L20 # 11  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"these PCSs generate" - I think it should be "these PCSes generate" or even better "these PCS types generate"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change  
 "these PCSs generate"  
 To  
 "these PCS types generate"

CI 078 SC 78.1.1 P73 L23 # 12  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing serial comma in "25GAUI, XLAUI and CAUI-n" (two instances)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "25GAUI, XLAUI and CAUI-n" to ""25GAUI, XLAUI, and CAUI-n"  
 Use proper markup

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 078 SC 78.1.4 P74 L4 # 13  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Stray line with "."

SuggestedRemedy

Remove  
 The same issue on page 76, line 11

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 093A SC 93A.1 P203 L24 # 3  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Please fix font size for "Table 83D-6" - it seems larger than other entries

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 105 SC 105.2 P81 L34 # 102  
 Booth, Brad Microsoft  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Table 105-2 is missing a key to define what M and O mean.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a footnote to indicate the meaning of M and O.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 105 SC 105.3.1 P81 L40 # 63  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 Include the word logical in the 25GMII description as was done for XLGMII in 80.2.1. Also change "this" to "the".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "The 25GMII (Clause 106) provides an interconnection between the Media Access Control (MAC) sublayer and Physical Layer entities (PHY). This 25GMII supports 25 Gb/s operation through its 32-bit-wide transmit and receive data paths."  
 To:  
 "The 25GMII (Clause 106) provides a logical interconnection between the Media Access Control (MAC) sublayer and Physical Layer entities (PHY). The 25GMII supports 25 Gb/s operation through its 32-bit-wide transmit and receive data paths."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 105 SC 105.4.3.1.2 P84 L35 # 64  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 Isn't the signalling rate always going to be 25.78125 GBd for the PMD, PMA and FEC service interfaces?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 The sublayer continuously sends a bit stream IS\_UNITDATA.request(tx\_bit) to the next lower sublayer, at a nominal signaling rate defined by a specific instance of the inter-sublayer service interface.  
 To:  
 The sublayer continuously sends a bit stream IS\_UNITDATA.request(tx\_bit) to the next lower sublayer, at a nominal signaling rate of 25.78125 GBd.  
 Make similar change in 105.4.3.2.2  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 107 SC 107.1.1 P97 L9 # 104  
 Booth, Brad Microsoft  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Extra comma not required.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to read as: "... Physical Layer implementations known as 25GBASE-R."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 107 SC 107.1.3 P97 L29 # 15  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Double "." at the end of the sentence  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change ".." to "."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 107 SC 107.1.4.1 P98 L37 # 32  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

"The PCS service interface is precisely defined as the 25GMII in Clause 106" - this makes me wonder whether other elements of 25G PHY are defined less precisely than PCS service interface ... quantifiers of this type are meaningless. PCS service interface is the 25GMII. Period.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the word "precisely" from the selected statement.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 107 SC 107.2.1 P99 L35 # 33  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

"For values shown as binary, the leftmost bit is the first transmitted bit." and "Binary values are shown with the first transmitted bit (the LSB) on the left." are repetitive

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Binary values are shown with the first transmitted bit (the LSB) on the left." and "For values shown as binary, the leftmost bit is the first transmitted bit." with a single statement: "Values represented in binary are shown with the first transmitted bit (the LSB) on the left."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 107 SC 107.4 P101 L24 # 34  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

"A description of overall system delay constraints can be found in 106.1.4" - but the link points only to Table 106-1, which lists MAC, RS, and MAC Control RTT constraints.

SuggestedRemedy

Change reference to 105.5, where Table 105-3 lists all elements of 25G PHYs. For reference, note that 108.4 specifies this correctly, linking it to 105.5.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 107 SC 107.5 P101 L30 # 58  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing "a"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:  
 "as a 10GBASE-KR PMD"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to:  
 "as a PCS used with a 10GBASE-KR PMD"

Cl 108 SC 108.5.2.4 P108 L3 # 121  
 Slavick, Jeff Avago Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

Extra words "at predefined locations," make the sentence a little confusing.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the words "at predefined locations," so the sentence reads

In order to support codeword alignment in the receive direction, the 25GBASE-R RS-FEC shall periodically insert codeword markers into the stream of transcoded blocks as the first 257 bits of every 1024th RS-FEC codeword.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 108 SC 108.5.2.4 P108 L3 # 145  
 Hidaka, Yasuo Fujitsu Lab. of Americ

Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket

A brief description of what is an RS-FEC codeword is helpful to read this paragraph. It is not clearly described until 108.5.4.4.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following sentence in the paragraph:

An RS-FEC codeword for 25GBASE-R is 528 10-bit symbols or 5280 bits.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The RS-FEC encoder is fully specified (by reference to clause 91) in 108.5.2.5.

Insert "(See 108.5.2.5)" after "RS-FEC codeword".

Cl 108 SC 108.5.2.7 P109 L1 # 16  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Figure 108-3 breaks text into two section.

SuggestedRemedy

Wrestle with Frame and make sure that Figure 108-3 does not break text in the middle.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Apply formatting changes to prevent the figure from breaking the text.

Cl 108 SC 108.5.4.1 P113 L17 # 188  
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

"is comprised of" is considered poor English and has been replaced with "is composed of" in the frontmatter.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "is comprised of" to "is composed of"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 108 SC 108.7.4.2 P123 L44 # 17  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

Wrong font format in RF12

SuggestedRemedy

Font for "Figure 49-7" seems larger than the remaining text in PICS entries

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109 SC 109.1.1 P125 L14 # 59  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket

There is only one PMA service interface for 25G.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"PMA service interfaces are defined in an abstract manner and do not imply any particular implementation."

to:

"The PMA service interface is defined in an abstract manner and does not imply any particular implementation."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109 SC 109.1.3 P126 L14 # 47  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Change "The function diagram" to "The functional block diagram"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "The function diagram" to "The functional block diagram"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 109 SC 109.1.4 P127 L3 # 48  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Remove the comma after "physical"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "An implementation may use one or more PMA sublayers to provide an interface with a physical, electrical interface, 25GAUI, between devices"  
 To:  
 "An implementation may use one or more PMA sublayers to provide an interface with a physical electrical interface, 25GAUI, between devices"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109 SC 109.2 P128 L31 # 209  
 Law, David HP  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Being picky, since '25GAUI' is defined as '25 Gigabit Attachment Unit Interface' (see 1.4.64a) the text '... over a 25GAUI interface, clock and data ...' expands to '... over a 25 Gigabit Attachment Unit Interface interface, clock and data ...'.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Suggest that '... over a 25GAUI interface, clock and data ...' be changed to read '... over a 25GAUI, clock and data ...'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109 SC 109.4.4.2 P131 L20 # 49  
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syste  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Change "variables" to "variable"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "variables" to "variable"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109 SC 109.4.5 P133 L14 # 242  
 Butter, Adrian IBM  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 In 109.4.5 Energy Efficient Ethernet for 25GAUI, the first sentence states: "When the optional Energy Efficient Ethernet (EEE) deep sleep capability is supported and the PMA service interface is physically instantiated as 25GAUI, the additional functions listed in this subclause are required."  
 It is noted that since the "additional functions" do not directly appear in subclause 109.4.5, the current wording lacks clarity.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Update the sentence to directly reference these additional functions:

"When the optional Energy Efficient Ethernet (EEE) deep sleep capability is supported and the PMA service interface is physically instantiated as 25GAUI, the additional functions listed in 83.5.11 are required."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 109B SC 109B.3.2.1.1 P212 L17 # 197  
 Dawe, Piers Mellanox  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 This and the next subclause would be easier to follow if re-ordered.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move the third paragraphs before the second in each case. Then, the three paragraphs could be combined into two or one.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In 109B.2.3.1.1, swap the order of the second (line 19) and third (line 22) paragraph.  
 Similarly, in 109B.3.2.1.2, swap the order of the second (line 33) and third (line 29) paragraph.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 110 SC 110.7.5 P145 L36 # 155  
 Dudek, Mike QLogic  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket  
 There is a line in Table 92-6 labeled "differential peak-to-peak voltage" that does not apply here. We should be more precise.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "the maximum differential peak-to-peak output voltage in Table 92-6." to "the differential peak-to-peak output voltage (max) with Tx disabled in Table 92-6."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 110 SC 110.8.4.2 P148 L10 # 89  
 Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 Suggestion: what looks like an odd spurious check mark symbol in front of "GHz" should look a squareroot symbol. Might have to use the equation editor or perhaps use "dB/root-GHz", or do what was done in Table 111-4.  
 Same for line 37. Same Page 149, Line 10.  
 Clause 11.8.3.1, Page 173, Line 29, Table 111-4, Table 111-5, and Table 111-6, be consistent with how the squareroot is specified in the six tables.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 As per comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Delete the radical symbol and add a superscript "1/2" after "GHz" in P148 L10, P148 L37, P149 L10.

CI 110B SC 110B P225 L8 # 4  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Missing serial ",", in "25GBASE-CR, 25GBASE-CR-S and 25GAUI C2M"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "25GBASE-CR, 25GBASE-CR-S, and 25GAUI C2M"  
 Same fix on page 228, line 9, in 110B.2.1; and page 228, line 38, in 110B.2.2.2; page 229, line 14, in 110B.2.4 (caption)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 110B SC 110B.1 P225 L17 # 26  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket  
 Multiple dead links:  
 Cable assembly measurements for the SFP28-SFP28 form factor (see >>110C.3.1<<) are made between TP1 and TP4 with cable assembly test fixtures as specified in 110B.1.2 on both ends. Cable assembly measurements for the QSFP28-QSFP28 form factor (see >>110C.3.2<<) are made between TP1 and TP4 with cable assembly test fixtures as specified in 92.11.2 on both ends. Cable assembly measurements for the QSFP28-4xSFP28 form factor (see >>110C.3.3<<) are made between TP1 and TP4 with a cable assembly test fixture as specified in 110B.1.2 for each connector on the SFP28 end, and with a cable assembly test fixture as specified in 92.11.2  
 Links to 110B work fine, but to 110C not so much ...  
 for the QSFP28 end.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Please fix broken links  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 110C SC 1 P230 L52 # 228  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "n" in "Auto-negotiation" should be capitalized.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Auto-negotiation" to "Auto-Negotiation"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 110C SC 110C.1 P230 L21 # 5  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Missing serial comma in "CA-L, CA-S and CA-N"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "CA-L, CA-S, and CA-N"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 110C SC 110C.1 P230 L48 # 6  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 The text  
 "QSFP28 to  
 4xSFP28  
 (110C.3.3)"  
 should be left aligned. Now "to" seems to be right aligned for some reason  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Fix alignment.

Cl 110C SC 110C.2.1 P231 L10 # 7  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 missing "see" when referencing subclauses.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "(110C.3.1)" to "(see 110C.3.1)". Multiple locations in 110C.2.1 and 110C.2.2,  
 110C.3.1, 110C.3.2, and 110C.3.3  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 110C SC 110C.3.1 P231 L32 # 151  
 Dudek, Mike QLogic  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Poor grammar.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "characteristics a cable assembly" to "characteristics of a cable assembly"  
 Make the equivalent changes in 110C.3.2 and 110C.3.3  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change:  
 "The electrical characteristics a cable assembly of this form factor"  
 To:  
 "The electrical characteristics of a cable assembly for this form factor..."  
 Make the equivalent changes in 110C.3.2 and 110C.3.3

Cl 110C SC 110C.3.3 P233 L1 # 142  
 Hidaka, Yasuo Fujitsu Lab. of Americ  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "an QSFP28 plug" should be "a QSFP28 plug".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "an QSFP28 plug" with "a QSFP28 plug".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 111 SC 111.1 P166 L41 # 220  
 Law, David HP  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket  
 Since this overview is for 25GBASE-KR and 25GBASE-KR-S shouldn't the FEC mode  
 cross reference be to 111.6 rather than 110.6.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Suggest that '(see 110.6)' should read '(see 111.6)'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 Apply the change in the suggested remedy.



IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 111 SC 111.5 P169 L12 # 211  
 Law, David HP  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 Register 1.1450 is called 'PMD training pattern lane 0' based on subclause 45.2.1.122 of IEEE P802.3 (IEEE 802.3bx) draft D3.2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Suggest that 'PMD training pattern 0' should read 'PMD training pattern lane 0' for 'Polynomial identifier 0' and 'Seed 0' entries of Table 111-2.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Apply the change in the suggested remedy.  
 Apply a similar change in Table 110-2.

CI 111 SC 111.9 P175 L22 # 141  
 Hidaka, Yasuo Fujitsu Lab. of Americ  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 It is written as 93.9.1 through 93.8.4.  
 Clause 93.8.4 is prior to 93.9.1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the pointer to "93.9.1 through 93.8.4" to "93.9.1 through 93.9.4".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #46.

CI 111 SC 111.9 P175 L22 # 46  
 Zambell, Andrew FCI  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket  
 The first paragraph in clause 111.9 states,  
 "Channel characteristics for the links that comprise two 25GBASE-KR PHYs shall be the same as those of a single lane of 100GBASE-KR4, as defined in 93.9.1 through 93.8.4."  
 It should state, ..."as defined in 93.9.1 through 93.9.4."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 93.8.4 to 93.9.4.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #141.

CI 112 SC 10.2.1 P192 L52 # 229  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 Should "3" be "three"? Style guide states numbers less than 11 should be spelt... or something like that.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change "3 connections" to "three connections".

CI 112 SC 112.7.1 P189 L22 # 91  
 Lewis, David Lumentum  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 The reference for pattern 5 should be to 82.2.10, not 82.2.11.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace 82.2.11 with 82.2.10.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 112**    **SC 5.2**                    **P186**            **L49**            # **232**  
 Donahue, Curtis                    UNH-IOL

**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket*

Clauses 110 and 111 have a "PMD Transmit function", but 112 has "PMD transmit function".

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Make consistent throughout draft. Either capitalize the "t" or make "T" lowercase.

**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #233.

**Cl FM**    **SC 0**                    **P11**            **L1**            # **100**  
 Booth, Brad                    Microsoft

**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket*

IEEE-SA style guide only requires a maximum of three levels need to be shown in the table of contents.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change to match IEEE-SA style guide to simplify readability.

**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

[Editor changed Clause from 000 to FM.]

2014 IEEE-SA Standards Style Manual states:  
 "A table of contents listing the main clauses (identified by one digit) and the first series of subclauses under each clause (identified by two digits) should be supplied. The next series of subclauses (identified by three digits) may be included when deemed appropriate by the IEEE-SA content publishing staff and the working group."

In Table of Contents limit headings to 1, 2, and 3 level headings.

**Cl FM**    **SC 0**                    **P24**            **L46**            # **181**  
 Zimmerman, George                    CME Consulting, Inc.

**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket*

802.3bq already modifies some of the same text and precedes this document in WG ballot. needs to be added to the identified standards in progress to avoid confusion.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Add IEEE 802.3bq to IEEE 802.3bn and IEEE 802.3 in the note.

**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

[Editor changed Clause from 000 to FM.]

**Cl FM**    **SC 0**                    **P7**            **L18**            # **99**  
 Booth, Brad                    Microsoft

**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket*

Add the working group voters list.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Per comment.

**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

[Editor changed Clause from 000 to FM.]

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                    **P1**            **L5**            # **117**  
 Booth, Brad                    Microsoft

**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket*

Redundant uses of trademarks

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Remove TM from:  
 page 1, line 5: IEEE P802.3by  
 page 2, line 10: IEEE P802.3by  
 Page 9, line 7: IEEE Std. 802.3

**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

[Editor changed Clause from 000 to FM.]

IEEE 802.3by D2.0 25 Gb/s Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot comments

---

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                      **P4**            **L1**                      # 27  
Hajduczenia, Marek                      Bright House Networks

**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **D**                                      *bucket*

please re-apply the front matter text again into the draft - there are apparently extra white lines inserted between paragraphs without any reason.

*SuggestedRemedy*

For example, page 4, lines 6-8, 14-18, etc.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Fix vertical spacing between lines to be consistent with the template.

---

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                      **P7**            **L17**                      # 212  
Law, David                                      HP

**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                                      *bucket*

Now that the IEEE P802.3by balloting group has been established, please complete the list of officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Please include the list of officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

[Editor changed Clause number from 99 to FM]