Cl **126**   *SC* **126.5.3**   *P* **146**   *L* **26**   # 20

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   BQEZ

Comment i-54 against the Revision project D3.0 has changed all instances in 802.3 of "AC coupling" to "AC-coupling"
Also applies to PICS item PME18

SuggestedRemedy

Change "AC coupling" to "AC-coupling" on Page 153, line 27 and also on Page 189, line 37

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
EZ

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.6.1.1**   *P* **152**   *L* **5**   # 22

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   BQEZ

'Clause 45' should be a cross-reference

BQ CARRY OVER 15

SuggestedRemedy

Make 'Clause 45' a cross-reference

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.12**   *P* **167**   *L* **1**   # 23

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   BQEZ

The PICS proforma should start at the top of a new page. (Ed note - in bz is appears to, but isn't forced to this)
The text in 126.12 and the tables in 126.12.1.1 and 126.12.1.2 should be based on those in the 802.3 template

BQ CARRY OVER 17

SuggestedRemedy

In the paragraph designer, set the heading for 113.12 to Start: Top of Page as per the 802.3 template.
Change text in 113.12 and the tables in 113.12.1.1 and 113.12.1.2 to be based on those in the 802.3 template.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution, except it is 126.12.
EZ

Cl **126**   *SC* **126.3.2.2.16**   *P* **91**   *L* **35**   # 25

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   BQEZ

Extraneous period after colon,

BQ CARRY OVER 35 (modified)

SuggestedRemedy

Delete extraneous period

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **25**

Page 1 of 6
7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126,1,2**　　　　　　　*P* **66**　　　*L* **3**　　　　# 26

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　BQEZ

Figure 126-1 references CSMA/CD, align with IEEE Std. 802.3bx D3p1, Replace "LAN CSMA/CD" with "ETHERNET" in upper part of figure, and in figure title on line 29.

Also: figure 125-1 (P62 L3), 126.1.2, p65 L42,

BQ CARRY OVER 85 (extended to include other references)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "LAN CSMA/CD LAYERS" with "ETHERNET LAYERS" in Figure 126-1 (line 4)
Replace "CSMA/CD LAN" with "Ethernet" in figure title on line 30
Replace "LAN CSMA/CD LAYERS" with "ETHERNET LAYERS" in Figure 125-1 (P62 L3)
Replace "CSMA/CD LAN" with "Ethernet" in text of 126.1.2 (P65 L42)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **126**　　*SC* **126.6.1.2**　　　　　　*P* **153**　　*L* **45**　　　　# 35

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　BQEZ

Table 126-16, U18 - "10GBASE-T PHY Short Reach mode" should be "10G/40GBASE-T PHY Short Reach mode" if 802.3bq comment is accepted

SuggestedRemedy

Align name of U18 with 802.3bq D2p2 (resolution of D2p1 comments)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Align with BQ comment resolution
EZ

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.22**　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **48**　　　# 41

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　BQEZ

"see 945.2.1.69" - not sure we have 945 Clauses :)

BQ CARRY OVER 45

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "9"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.24**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **7**　　　　# 42

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　BQEZ

"see 45.2.1.79.2 and 55.4.5.1 113.4.5.4, and 126.4.5.4" - missing serial comma, unnecesary "and"

BQ CARRY OVER 46

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "see 45.2.1.79.2, 55.4.5.1, 113.4.5.4, and 126.4.5.4" with proper editorial markup
Similar change in 30.5.1.1.25

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **42**　　　Page 2 of 6
7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **20**   *L* **20**   # 46

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *BQEZ*

Editing instructions should not re-number clauses or definitions when inserted as an "a" (or other letter) heading number
"Insert definition and re-number remaining definitions" (P 20 L 29)
"Insert new clause after 45.2.1.12.15 and re-number remaining clauses (P 35 L 14) and others

BQ CARRY OVER 75

SuggestedRemedy

Editor to search document and delete "an re-number remaining..." throughout document in Editing instructions.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.72b**   *P* **20**   *L* **23**   # 47

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *BQEZ*

In the definition for MultiGBASE-T:
"1000Mbps" should be "1000 Mb/s"
"Clause 55" should be "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 55" and "Clause 55 should be a crossreference.
"Clause 113" should be "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 113" and "Clause 113 should be a crossreference.
"Clause 126" should be "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 126" and "Clause 126 should be a crossreference.

BQ CARRY OVER 36

SuggestedRemedy

Change: "1000Mbps" to "1000 Mb/s"
Change: "Clause 55" to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 55" and make "Clause 55" a crossreference.
Change: "Clause 113" to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 113" and make "Clause 113" a crossreference.
Change: "Clause 126" to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 126" and make "Clause 126" a crossreference.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.5**   *P* **20**   *L* **45**   # 48

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *BQEZ*

Editing instruction references definitions, should be abbreviations in Clause 1.5

BQ CARRY OVER 79

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Insert the following new definitions into the definitions list, in alphanumeric order:" to "Insert the following new abbreviations into the abbreviations list, in alphanumeric order:"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.1.2**   *P* **61**   *L* **31**   # 54

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *BQEZ*

Comment #196 against D2.0 was ACCEPT but has not been implemented correctly.
As explained in the comment:
"The point of the list in 80.1.3 is to define the locations where the data-path widths cannot be changed by the implementation. Each element in the existing list states what the width at that location is."
The suggested remedy was:
Change to: "k) The MDI as specified in Clause 113 for 40GBASE-T uses a 4 lane data path." but the "uses a 4 lane data path." part (which is the point of having the item at all) is missing from the draft.

(this effects BZ draft in 125.1.2 in item c)

BQ CARRY OVER 31

SuggestedRemedy

Add "uses a 4 lane data path" to the end of item c

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **54**

Page 3 of 6
7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM

Cl **125**　　*SC* **125.1.2**　　　　　*P* **62**　　　*L* **2**　　　# **55**
Zimmerman, George　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　BQEZ
Figure 126-1 CSMA CD has been taken out of 802.3 and replaced with Ethernet.
Same issue in Figure 126-1 and figure and title of figure 126-1 need to be updated.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "LAN CSMA/CD LAYERS" with "ETHERNET LAYERS" in Figures 125-1 (p.62) and
126-1 (P66 L2).
Change "IEEE 802.3 CSMA/CD LAN" to "IEEE 802.3 ETHERNET" in title to Figure 126-1(P66
L29)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Per BQ comment resolution
EZ

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.3.9**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L* **22**　　　# **57**
Zimmerman, George　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　BQEZ
Font size inconsistency in Feature column for AM51

BQ CARRY OVER 64

SuggestedRemedy
Please align font format and size

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.11**　　　　　*P* **48**　　　*L* **11**　　　# **58**
Zimmerman, George　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　BQEZ
Multiple tables, including Table 45–208 and Table 45–207, are not aligned with P802.3bx,
D3.1. For example, Reserved bit 7.33.8:2 has description changed from "Value always 0,
writes ignored" to "Value always 0"

BQ CARRY OVER 62

SuggestedRemedy
Align tables with Clause 45 in 802.3bx D3.1

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.11**　　　　　*P* **48**　　　*L* **11**　　　# **60**
Zimmerman, George　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　BQEZ
In Table 45-208, "Value always 0, writes ignored" has been changed to "Value always 0" in the
base standard.
The reserved bits in this row are "7.33.8:2" in the base standard, so there should be an "8" in
strikeout font.

BQ CARRY OVER 27

SuggestedRemedy
Change "Value always 0, writes ignored" to "Value always 0"
Show "8:2" in strikeout and "7" underlined

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **60**

Page 4 of 6
7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.64.1**   *P* **36**   *L* **46**   # 61
Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*
    Space missing in "negotiation process.The 10GBASE-T"

    BQ CARRY OVER 49

SuggestedRemedy
    Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.
    per BQ d2p1 resolution
    EZ

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13**   *P* **42**   *L* **52**   # 63
Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*
    the second "the" not needed in "the BASE-R, 10GBASE-T, or the 40GBASE-T "

    Other changes in 45.2.3.14 appear to have been fixed in bz:
    45.2.3.14, page 41, line 17
    45.2.3.14.1, page 41, line 41
    45.2.3.14.1, page 41, line 43
    45.2.3.14.2, page 42, line 5
    45.2.3.14.2, page 42, line 7
    several PICS in 45.5.3.7

    BQ CARRY OVER 52

SuggestedRemedy
    SuggestedRemedy
    Change to "the BASE-R, 10GBASE-T, or 40GBASE-T "
    Editor to confirm other changes referenced.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.
    per BQ d2p1 resolution
    EZ

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.13.4**   *P* **43**   *L* **54**   # 64
Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*
    After the changes, the new sentence does not read correctly: "This bit is a direct reflection of the state of the hi_lfer variable in the 2.5GBASE-T, 5GBASE-T, 10GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T 64B/65B state diagrams and is defined in 126.3.6.2.2, 55.3.6.1 and 113.3.6.2.2."

    BQ CARRY OVER 53

SuggestedRemedy
    Suggest to change to (changes shown in >><<): "This bit is a direct reflection of the state of the hi_lfer variable in the 2.5GBASE-T, 5GBASE-T, 10GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T 64B/65B state diagrams, defined in 55.3.6.1 and 113.3.6.2.2 >>for 2.5/5GBASE-T, 10GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T, respectively<<".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.
    per BQ d2p1 resolution
    EZ

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.10**   *P* **47**   *L* **21**   # 65
Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*
    Footnote to table 45-207 somehow got moved to the next page.
    (note - this is in bq, not shown in bz, but the same defect probably exists in the bz source)

    BQ CARRY OVER 57

SuggestedRemedy
    Beat on Frame, make sure footnote is attached to table and now allowed to move to next page on its own.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.
    per BQ d2p1 resolution
    EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **65**

Page 5 of 6
7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM

CI **78**   *SC* **78.5**   *P* **59**   *L* **51**   # 72

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*

Inconsistenct changes: "10GBASE-T PHY and 40GBASE-T PHY" - in Clause 45, similar text
was modified to read "10GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T PHY"

BQ CARRY OVER 66

SuggestedRemedy

Change "10GBASE-T PHY and 40GBASE-T PHY" to "10GBASE-T and 40GBASE-T PHY"
on page 59, lines 51 and 53

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
per BQ d2p1 resolution
EZ

CI **99**   *SC*   *P* **3**   *L* **36**   # 73

Zimmerman, George   CME Consulting, Inc.

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *BQEZ*

As the P802.3bq draft is not currently approved it is inappropriate to have text: "At the date of
IEEE Std 802.3bq-2015 publication,..."
Same issue on page 4, line 25

BQ CARRY OVER 33

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3bq-2015" to "IEEE Std 802.3bq-201x" on page 3, line 36 and
change "IEEE Std 802.3bqTM-2015" to "IEEE Std 802.3bqTM-201x" on page 4, line 25

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Substitute 802.3bz for 802.3bq in remedy
EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **73**   Page 6 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   7/14/2015 7:26:52 AM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID