Cl **045**　　*SC* **45.2.1.108**　　　　*P* **57**　　　*L* **26**　　　# 1

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*<bucket>*

"Clause 91" should be a cross-reference and "91.5.2.4" and "91.6.3" should have character tag External applied.

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Clause 91" a cross-reference and apply character tag External to "91.5.2.4" and "91.6.3".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **136**　　*SC* **136.11.7.2**　　　　*P* **227**　　*L* **41**　　　# 2

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*<bucket>*

The format of Table 136-16 is not according to the 802.3 template:
The heading row is not bold.
The internal ruling is not according to the template (the heading row should have a thicker line at t5he bottom than it does).
The font used in the table is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

Re-create the table using the "IEEE" table format.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **136**　　*SC* **136.14.3**　　　　*P* **231**　　*L* **14**　　　# 3

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*<bucket>*

Item FFQS has a subclause entry of "136.11 and 136.11"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "136.11"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **137**　　*SC* **137.1**　　　　*P* **243**　　*L* **2**　　　# 4

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*<bucket>*

"." missing at the end of the sentence

SuggestedRemedy

Add the "."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **138**　　*SC* **138.7.2**　　　　*P* **262**　　*L* **48**　　　# 5

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*<bucket>*

Minus signs should be an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p)

SuggestedRemedy

in "-7", change the minus sign to an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **5**　　　Page 1 of 4
2017-05-19 4:52:03 PM

Cl **139**   *SC* **139.7.4**   *P* **286**   *L* **36**   # **6**

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   <bucket>

Comment i-20 against P802.3bs D3.0 made changes to the equivalent text to this in the P802.3bs draft.
See
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bs/comments/P802d3bs_D3p0_comments_final_a_ID.pdf#page=7
This comment therefore proposes to make the equivalent change in the P802.3cd draft.
Also, the draft says a "test pattern specified for extinction ratio" rather than "test pattern specified for OMAouter".
Same issues in 140.7.4

SuggestedRemedy

In 139.7.4, change:
"The OMAouter shall be within the limits given in Table 139-6 for 50GBASE-FR and 50GBASE-LR if measured using a test pattern specified for extinction ratio in Table 139-10. The OMAouter is defined as the difference between ." to:
"The OMAouter shall be within the limits given in Table 139-6 for 50GBASE-FR and 50GBASE-LR. The OMAouter is measured using a test pattern specified for OMAouter in Table 139-10 as the difference between ."
In 140.7.4, change:
"The OMAouter shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6 if measured using a test pattern specified for extinction ratio in Table 140-10. The OMAouter is defined as the difference between ." to:
"The OMAouter shall be within the limits given in Table 140-6. The OMAouter is measured using a test pattern specified for OMAouter in Table 140-10 as the difference between ."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **139**   *SC* **139.7.9.1**   *P* **290**   *L* **3**   # **7**

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**   <bucket>

Prompted by the Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (MEC) review of the P802.3bs draft, comment i-39 against P802.3bs D3.0 made changes to the equivalent text to this in the P802.3bs draft.
See
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bs/comments/P802d3bs_D3p0_comments_final_a_ID.pdf#page=14
This comment therefore proposes to make the equivalent change in the P802.3cd draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: "Baseline wander and overshoot and undershoot should be minimized." to:
"Baseline wander, overshoot, and undershoot should be negligible."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **139**   *SC* **139.7.9.3**   *P* **291**   *L* **12**   # **8**

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**   <bucket>

Prompted by the Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (MEC) review of the P802.3bs draft, comment i-40 against P802.3bs D3.0 made changes to the equivalent text to this in the P802.3bs draft.
See
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bs/comments/P802d3bs_D3p0_comments_final_a_ID.pdf#page=14
This comment therefore proposes to make the equivalent change in the P802.3cd draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
"Care should be taken to minimize the noise/jitter introduced by the O/E, filters, and oscilloscope and/or to correct for this noise." to:
"The noise/jitter introduced by the O/E, filters, and oscilloscope should be negligible or the results should be corrected for its effects."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **8**   Page 2 of 4
2017-05-19 4:52:03 PM

Cl **136B**   *SC* **136B.1.1.6**   *P* **373**   *L* **33**   # 9
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
Extra space before the "." in "in Table 136B-2 ."

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the space.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **136D**   *SC* **136D.2.3**   *P* **386**   *L* **54**   # 10
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
The footnotes at the foot of pages 386, 387, and 300 should be formatted more helpfully.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the footnote on page 386 to: "microQSFP specifications are available at http://www.microqsfp.com"
Change the footnote on page 387 to: "QSFP-DD specifications are available at http://www.qsfp-dd.com"
Change the footnote on page 388 to: "OSFP specifications are available at http://www.osfpmsa.org"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **136C**   *SC* **136C.1**   *P* **377**   *L* **15**   # 34
Hidaka, Yasuo   Fujitsu Lab of America

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
Here, references for SFP28 and QSFP28 are 110.11.1 and 92.12.1.1, respectively, but there are 136D.2.1 and 136D.2.2 in this same annex 136C. References within the same annex 136C are better, because 136D.2.1 and 136D.2.2 have reference to 110.11.1 and 92.12.1.1.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the reference for SFP28 to 136D.2.1 and the reference for QSFP28 to 136D.2.2.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **136**   *SC* **136.9.3**   *P* **215**   *L* **33**   # 43
Dawe, Piers   Mellanox

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
Align with 802.3bs 120D. Clause 94 should be deprecated and we should not refer to it in new clauses. The same definitions and figure as in 94.3.12.3 are in 93.8.1.3.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the references to 94.3.12.3 (five here, one in PICS 136.14.4.3, one in PICS 137.12.4.3) to 93.8.1.3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Align references with Annex 120D in 802.3bs, in Table 136-11 (cells and footnotes), and in PICS tables in 136.14.4.3 and 137.12.4.3.

Cl **136**   *SC* **136.3**   *P* **190**   *L* **50**   # 51
Nowell, Mark   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
Typo on Symbol rate 26.6525 should be 26.5625
Two instances: Pg 190, line 50 & pg 191 line 3

SuggestedRemedy
fix typo

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change 26.6525 to 26.5625 at the indicated locations, and also in other clauses as necessary.

Cl **138**   *SC* **138.2**   *P* **255**   *L* **41**   # 52
Nowell, Mark   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *<bucket>*
Typo on Symbol rate 26.6525 should be 26.5625
Two instances: Pg 255, line 41 & line 46

SuggestedRemedy
fix typo

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **52**   Page 3 of 4
2017-05-19 4:52:03 PM

Cl **139** *SC* **139.2** *P* **279** *L* **11** # 53

Nowell, Mark Cisco

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *<bucket>*

Typo on Symbol rate 26.6525 should be 26.5625
Two instances: Pg 279, line 11 & line 16

SuggestedRemedy

fix typo

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **140** *SC* **140.2** *P* **302** *L* **11** # 54

Nowell, Mark Cisco

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *<bucket>*

Typo on Symbol rate 26.6525 should be 26.5625
Two instances: Pg 302, line 11 & line 16

SuggestedRemedy

fix typo

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **54**

Page 4 of 4
2017-05-19 4:52:03 PM