

# P802.3 D3.2 ERL-related comment summary and proposed responses

Prepared by Adee Ran, Chris Diminico, and Mike Dudek for the editorial team's use

## Comment classification

Topic	Comments	Presentations	Notes
ERL equation - change $G_r$	19, 21 (Mellitz)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a> <a href="#">dudek_3cd_01_0518</a>	Change would require corresponding changes to ERL parameters in multiple places.
Tx ERL min clause 136	32, 20, 16 (Rysin, Mellitz, Dawe)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a> <a href="#">sakai_3cd_01_0518</a> <a href="#">dudek_3cd_01_0518</a>	
Tx ERL min clause 137	25, 35 (Mellitz, Dawe)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a>	
Rx ERL min	22, 31, 25, 36, 17 (Mellitz, Rysin)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a> <a href="#">dudek_3cd_01_0518</a>	
Cable assembly ERL min clause 136	23, 15 (Mellitz, Dudek)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a> <a href="#">dudek_3cd_01_0518</a>	
Channel ERL min clause 137	38, 61 (Dawe, Tracy)	(Tracy late presentation?)	
Channel ERL response length	11, 26 (Mellitz)	<a href="#">mellitz_3cd_01_0518</a>	Apparent consensus
ERL in Rx test	29 (Ran)		
Delete old RL specs	59, 24 (Tracy, Mellitz)		
Termination effect on	30 (Ran)	<a href="#">ran_3cd_01_0518</a>	

## Resolution topics and options

The list below suggests options for resolving some groups of comments. For any item, the option to adopt another resolution also exists. Straw polls may be taken for each item if consensus is not obvious.

Text in red is editor's notes and should not be retained in the final document.

1. ERL equation - change  $G_r$ 
  - a. Accept r02-19 (proposed modification of the equation) and r02-21 (proposed modification of  $\beta_x$  and  $\rho_x$  accordingly). **This drives changes in COM limits per other comments**
  - b. Reject both comments (if no consensus). **What about other comments proposing changes based on these comments?**
  - c. Reject both comments (if no consensus)
2. Tx ERL minimum in clause 136 (**currently equation**)
  - a. Accept r02-32 (in Clause 136 change to 12 dB regardless of  $V_f$  or  $p_{max}$ ) and AIP r02-20. **ignore [dudek\\_3cd\\_01\\_0518](#)**
  - b. Implement change per [dudek\\_3cd\\_01\\_0518](#) slide 19:  $ERL \geq 4 + 40 \cdot \log_{10} \frac{V_f}{p_{max}}$  dB. **This will hijack 32, 20; technically both will be AIP**
  - c. Implement piecewise constant version at bottom of slide 19 in [dudek\\_3cd\\_01\\_0518](#). **As above, hijack 32, 20; technically AIP**
  - d. Use SNR\_ISI ([mellitz\\_3cd\\_01\\_050918\\_elect\\_adhoc](#) slide 4) **As above, hijack 32, 20; technically AIP; refer to ad hoc presentation**
  - e. Reject both comments (if no consensus).

**Comment r02-16 (editorial, remove editor's note) proposed plain accept in all cases.**
3. Tx ERL minimum in clause 137 (**currently 16.1 dB**)
  - a. Accept r02-25 (in clause 137 change to 15 dB), AIP r02-35
  - b. Use value **TBD (need specific proposal)** (not 15 dB) lower than channel spec per r02-35, AIP both r02-35 and r02-25
  - c. Reject both comments (if no consensus)
4. ERL of pattern generator in Rx test
  - a. Accept r02-29 - specify pattern generator meets Tx ERL
  - b. Reject r02-29 (if no consensus)
5. Channel ERL minimum in clause 136 (**currently 11 dB**)
  - a. Accept r02-15 (Change to 14 dB), reject r02-23
  - b. Accept r02-23 (keep value but apply only with  $COM < 4$  dB), reject r02-15
  - c. Reject both comments (if no consensus)
6. Channel ERL minimum in clause 137 (**currently 10 dB**)
  - a. AIP r02-38 (value TBD higher than Tx spec?) **Tx ERL is currently 16.1, but is challenged by 35; r02-61 will be satisfied so also AIP**
  - b. AIP r02-61 (increase to value TBD but no higher than Tx spec). **We may have a late presentation with a proposed value; otherwise consider 14 dB as in clause**

136 comments; r02-38 essentially rejected but technically AIP

7. Channel ERL response length (currently 300 UI)
  - a. Accept r02-26 and r02-11 - change to 1000 UI in both clauses 136 and 137
  - b. Reject both comments (if no consensus)
8. Rx ERL minimum in clause 136 (currently 14.5 dB)
  - a. Accept r02-22 (Change from 14.5 to 12 dB), AIP r02-31 (same remedy)
  - b. Reject both comments (if no consensus)
9. Rx ERL minimum in clause 137 (currently 16.1)
  - a. Accept r02-25 (Change from 16.1 to 15 dB), AIP r02-36 (assuming this is not lower than Tx and channel specs), AIP r02-17 (editorial)
  - b. Use value TBD (need specific proposal) lower than the Tx and channel specs per r02-36; AIP r02-25 (technically), AIP r02-17 (editorial)
  - c. Accept only r02-17, reject comments r02-25 and r02-36 (if no consensus)
10. Delete old RL spec
  - a.
11. Termination effect on COM
  - a.



