

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D0.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Task Force review comments

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                    **P1**            **L1**                    # **1**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 No line numbers in Front Matter  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Add line numbers into Front Matter  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                    **P9**            **L1**                    # **4**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 Acknowledgements were neded in 802.3.1, not likely in 802.3.2 and not for now.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Remove. Consider adding it back when and if needed to acknowlege any public review on GIT?  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                    **P5**            **L1**                    # **2**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **T**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 Text under introduction box belongs to 802.3.1  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Replace three paragraphs with "TBD - to be added when the list of YANG modules is completed"  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl 1**        **SC 1**                    **P13**            **L39**                    # **5**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 Clause should start at the top of the page  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Insert page break before heading level 1  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl FM**    **SC FM**                    **P7**            **L10**                    # **3**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 Missing TF officers  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Add TF Chair and Chief Editor information  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl 1**        **SC 1.1**                    **P13**            **L47**                    # **6**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                    Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **TR**                    **Comment Status**    **X**  
 YANG data models or YANG data modules?  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 It seems like we have teminology issue: the majority of use cases seem to gravitate towards "YANG modules"  
 Change all instances of "YANG data models" to "YANG modules"  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **O**

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D0.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3 P17 L1 # 7  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X**

Page numbers at the bottom of the page do not coincide with the page numbers displayed in PDF reader. For example, it is page 19 (as marked in pdf) but page 17 (as shown in PDF reader)

SuggestedRemedy  
 Make sure pages are aligned

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl 5 SC 5.1 P21 L8 # 9  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **X**

Title of subclause 5.1 says "Module structure"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "YANG module structure" for consistency. The same in 6.3  
 Similaty, change "Module definition" to "YANG module definition". The same in 6.6

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl 3 SC 3.1 P17 L8 # 8  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **X**

There are a couple of terms which need to be defined and are missing now in [B6]: YANG module, YANG data node

SuggestedRemedy  
 TF needs to provide these definitions and their references, I assume these would come from IETF RFCs ?

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P21 L18 # 11  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

Missing comma between "802.3" and "clause"

SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl 5 SC 5 P21 L4 # 10  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

Hanging paragraph

SuggestedRemedy  
 Create new subclause 5.1 Introduction and move line 4 in there

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P21 L22 # 12  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **X**

"attributes" or "managed objects"? We speak of "Clause 30 managed objects everywhere else"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "and the attributes" to "and managed objects"

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D0.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P21 L27 # 13  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The whole mapping between Clause 30 and YANG module nodes is hard to read and follow in this structure. I would suggest to use the structure of the YANG module similar to the one shown in 5.3.1, and add managed object / attribute(s) abd reference, if available. Apply the same logic to Table 5-1 and Table 5-2, as well as Table 6-1 in Clause 6

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment. Example below

```
module: ieee802-ethernet-interface
augment /if:interfaces/if:interface:
+--rw ethernet
+--rw auto-negotiation
| +--rw enable: -/
+--rw duplex: oMACEntity/aDuplexStatus, IEEE Std 802.3, xxxxxxxxxx
+--rw speed: -/
+--rw flow-control
+--rw pause
| +--rw direction: -/
+--rw pfc {ethernet-pfc}?
| +--rw enable: -/
+--rw force-flow-control: -/
```

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P23 L12 # 24  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change "frame-statistics" in table 5-1 accroding to comment #3

SuggestedRemedy

replace "/frame-statistics" with "/statistics/frame"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P23 L49 # 25  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change"phy-statistics" in table 5-1 accroding to comment #3

SuggestedRemedy

replace "/phy-statistics" with "/statistics/phy";

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P23 L52 # 26  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change"phy-statistics" in table 5-1 accroding to comment #3

SuggestedRemedy

replace "/phy-statistics/lpi" with "/statistics/phy/lpi"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P24 L12 # 27  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change "mac-control-statistics" in table 5-1 accroding to comment #3

SuggestedRemedy

replace "/mac-control-statistics" with "/statistics/mac-control" in Table 5-1

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P24 L43 # 18  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change "/frame-statistics/" in table 5-2 according to comment #8

SuggestedRemedy

replace "/frame-statistics/csmacd{csma-cd}" with "/statistics/frame/csmacd{csma-cd}" in table 5-2.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D0.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.1 P25 L6 # 15  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Tree hierarchy contains a lot of nodes followed by data type (?) information - the arrangement of these data types is rather haphazard. Some of them are also non-standard and created within the module

SuggestedRemedy

As far as listing data types is concerned, consider adding ":" after node name, followed by space and data type Alternatively move all data type definitions farther to the right and align them into a single column for better readability  
 As far as non-standard data types are concerned, suggest to add reference (hyperlink?) to their definition within YANG module - this will at least help reader under what "pause-fc-direction-type" is (for example)  
 Similar changes needed in 6.6.1

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.1 P25 L6 # 14  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Tree hierarchy contains a lot of nodes marked with "?" which is not explained anywhere in the text

SuggestedRemedy

Add introductory note explaining the meaning of "?" symbol in tree hierarchy

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.1 P25 L47 # 23  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

There are 3 statistics containers ("frame-statistics", "phy-statistics", "mac-control-statistics"). Merge them into a single "statistics" container and rename these 3 containers by removing "-statistics".

Update the table 5-1 and YANG codes in 5.3.2 accordingly.

SuggestedRemedy

change to:  
 +--ro statistics  
     +--ro frame  
     +- ...  
     +--ro phy  
     +...  
     +--ro mac-control

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.1 P26 L26 # 28  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

provide a "statistics" container to hold types of different statistics under the ethernet-legacy module

SuggestedRemedy

create a "statistics" container and move the "frame-statistics" container under it. Rename the "frame-statistics" to "frame" container

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P38 L57 # 19  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

update codes for statistics in ethernet-interface module

SuggestedRemedy

with latest "ieee802-ethernet-interface.yang"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D0.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P50 L58 # 20  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 change codes for statistics in ethernet-interface-legacy module  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 replace "eth-if:frame-statistics" with "eth-if:statistics/eth-if:frame"  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.1 P55 L6 # 16  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Subclause 6.1 and 6.2 contain the same type of information: overview  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove heading 6.2 - there is no difference between Introduction and Overview anyway  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5A SC 5A P73 L0 # 21  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 No line numbers  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add line numbers  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.3 P55 L25 # 17  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 Ethernet interface YANG module is named "ieee802-ethernet-interface" and "ieee802-ethernet-interface-legacy". "ieee802-pse" skips "ethernet" which is important from marketing and identification purposes  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change module names in Clause 6 adding "ethernet" between "ieee802" and "pse"  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5A SC 5A.2 P73 L0 # 22  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 Missing managed objects in modules from other standards in annex of Relationship to other standards  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add managed objects: dot3HCInPFCFrames and dot3HCOuPFCFrames from ETHERLIKE MIB, etherStatsOctets and (etherStatsUndersizePkts+etherStatsFragments).  
 Proposed Response Response Status O