

## Proposed Responses

## IEEE P802.3cf D3.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

**Cl 4**      **SC 4**                      **P19**              **L6**              # **r01-11**  
 Remein, Duane                      Huawei Technologies

**Comment Type**    **E**              **Comment Status**    **D**                      *bucket*

Abbreviations should be in alphabetical order

**SuggestedRemedy**  
 reorder

**Proposed Response**              **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5**      **SC 5.2**                      **P21**              **L34**              # **r01-1**  
 Anslow, Peter                      Ciena Corporation

**Comment Type**    **E**              **Comment Status**    **D**                      *bucket*

As noted in comment #202 against P802.3cf D2.2, When tables split across pages, the bottom ruling of the table on all but the last page should be "very thin" and the final bottom ruling should follow the table format as "Thin". This is not done correctly in D3.1 for:  
 Table 5-1 where the bottom ruling on page 21 is not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)  
 Table 6-1 where the bottom ruling on page 53 is ok, but the bottom ruling on page 54 should be "Thin" to indicate the end of the table.  
 Table 7-1 where the bottom rulings on page 75 and on page 76 are not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)  
 Table 8-1 where the bottom rulings on page 127 and on page 128 are not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)

**SuggestedRemedy**  
 In Table 5-1 override the bottom ruling on page 21 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 22 "Thin".  
 In Table 6-1 make the bottom ruling on page 54 "Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 53 "Very Thin".  
 In Table 7-1 override the bottom rulings on page 75 and page 76 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 77 "Thin".  
 In Table 8-1 override the bottom rulings on page 127 and page 128 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 129 "Thin".

**Proposed Response**              **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5**      **SC 5.3.2**                      **P27**              **L3**              # **r01-12**  
 Remein, Duane                      Huawei Technologies

**Comment Type**    **E**              **Comment Status**    **D**                      *bucket*

"text of description" missing article. Same error pg/line: 56/3, 81/3, and 133/3

**SuggestedRemedy**  
 change to "text of the description" in 4x

**Proposed Response**              **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5**      **SC 5.3.2.1**                      **P27**              **L21**              # **r01-13**  
 Remein, Duane                      Huawei Technologies

**Comment Type**    **T**              **Comment Status**    **D**

The statement "revision <publication-date-in-yyyy-mm-dd-format> {" should be properly indented. Same issues pg/line: 44/44, 56/17, 81/18, and 133/18

**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add indenting 5x

**Proposed Response**              **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5**      **SC 5.3.2.2**                      **P45**              **L5**              # **r01-2**  
 Zhuang, Yan                      Huawei Technologies

**Comment Type**    **G**              **Comment Status**    **D**

we've changed the reference of iana-if-type in ethernet-interface module and should change it in other modules as well.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Delete editorial notes and change the reference of iana-if-type to  
 "http://www.iana.org/assignments/yang-parameters/iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang"

**Proposed Response**              **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P80 L26 # r01-14  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 Incomplete sentence in description:  
 "For a complete description of how the LLID is used in an EPON device.;"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to: "For a complete description of how the LLID is used in an EPON device see Std 802.3, Clause 65 for 1G-EPON and Clause 76 for 10G-EPON.;"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 Comment is against page 82, line 26.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P82 L10 # r01-15  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 There are two instances where we changed  
 "This object indicates that the given Ethernet interface supports MPCP ..." to  
 "This object indicates that the given EPON interface supports MPCP ..."  
 I don't know of any EPON interfaces which don't support MPCP.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 At the following locations change:  
 "This object indicates that the given EPON interface supports MPCP ..." to :  
 "This object indicates that the given interface supports MPCP ..."  
 Pg/Line - 81/10, 90/52  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P87 L42 # r01-4  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 missing period.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change:  
 description  
 "Exit EPON logical interface power-down state";  
 to  
 description  
 "Exit EPON logical interface power-down state.;"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P90 L62 # r01-16  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 There are five instances where we changed  
 "an Ethernet interface implementing MPCP, ..." to  
 "an EPON interface implementing MPCP"  
 I don't know of any EPON interfaces which don't support MPCP.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 At the following locations change:  
 " an EPON interface implementing MPCP, ..." to  
 "an EPON interface, ..."  
 Pg/Line - 90/62, 97/41, 102/62, 104/37, & 108/30  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P94 L34 # r01-5  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 both "the" and "a" appear as article and delete one.  
 same at:  
 pg 94, line 30 and line 61.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change  
 This object is applicable for an OLT and has the a distinct value for each logical link.  
 to  
 This object is applicable for an OLT and has a distinct value for each logical link.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P108 L48 # r01-17  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
 phrase has unmatched single quotes - "... 'Carrier Extend Error' ..."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "... 'Carrier Extend Error' ..." (matched single quotes)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P108 L48 # r01-6  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 'Carrier Extend Error' has error character  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change  
 'Carrier Extend Error'  
 to  
 'Carrier Extend Error'  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P109 L39 # r01-18  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Unconstrained "it" in phrase "it is a count". Same unconstrained it on pg 110 line 4.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "it is a count of" to "this object represents a count of" 2x  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P116 L35 # r01-19  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 This statement is self contradiction: "A count of the number of times a frame reception event results in a frame being queued in (for ONUs) or received from (for OLTs) the corresponding queue. This object is incremented by one for each frame received, when it is input into the associated queue." The last sentence does not agree with the first, in the OLT the received frame is not "put into the associated queue".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change  
 "This object is incremented by one for each frame received, when it is input into the associated queue." to read  
 "This object is incremented by one for each frame written to (in the case of the ONU) or received for (in case of the OLT) the associated queue."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P116 L45 # r01-20  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D  
 This sentence applies only to the OLT "It has a distinct value for each logical link and each queue."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link and each queue."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## Proposed Responses

## IEEE P802.3cf D3.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P121 L19 # r01-7  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

*Comment Type* **G** *Comment Status* **D**  
 yang error reported by yang validation tools.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 change  
 leaf mpcp-round-trip-time {  
 when "../ompe-mode = 'olt'";  
 to  
 leaf mpcp-round-trip-time {  
 when "../ompe-mode = 'olt'";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P121 L45 # r01-8  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

*Comment Type* **G** *Comment Status* **D**  
 yang error reported by yang validation tools

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 change  
 leaf mpcp-maximum-grant-count {  
 when "../ompe-mode = 'onu'";  
 to  
 leaf mpcp-maximum-grant-count {  
 when "../ompe-mode = 'onu'";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P122 L26 # r01-9  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

*Comment Type* **G** *Comment Status* **D**  
 yang errors reported by yang validation tools

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 change  
 leaf mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report {  
 when "../ompe-mode = olt";  
 to  
 leaf mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report {  
 when "../ompe-mode = olt";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P133 L40 # r01-3  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

*Comment Type* **G** *Comment Status* **D**  
 we've changed the reference of iana-if-type in ethernet-interface module and should change it in other modules as well

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Delete the editor note in line 39-40.  
 Change the reference of iana-if-type to "http://www.iana.org/assignments/yang-parameters/iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P138 L65 # r01-10  
 Zhuang, Yan Huawei Technologies

*Comment Type* **G** *Comment Status* **D**  
 string type is not defined in 'yang'.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 change  
 typedef vendor-oui {  
 type yang:string {  
 to  
 typedef vendor-oui {  
 type string {

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.