

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 00 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # 188
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] Throughout the document the page numbers use different fonts and font sizes.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Unify font types and sizes within the draft document.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P 1 L 31 # 184
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 802.3cb-201x and 802.3bt-201x were changed on page 11, but they also need to be changed on page 1. Also on line 2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3cb-201x to 802.3cb-2018 and 802.3bt-201x to 802.3bt-2018.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P 8 L 16 # 476
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Please add the list of Working Group members for the IEEE P802.3cg ballot supplied by the IEEE 802.3 Working Group Chair.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 8 # 14
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 ".." should be ":"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change ":" to ":" in this line.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 20 # 467
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Please move the text 'PHY' to be centre aligned with the squiggly brackets.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 24 # 86
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "10ABSE-T1L" should be "10BASE-T1L"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "10ABSE-T1L" to "10BASE-T1L"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 22, 466, 189, 396, and 442.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 24 # 22
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 typo in figure change "10ABSE-T1L, 10BASE-T1S"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change 10ABSE-T1L to 10BASE-T1L
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 86, 466, 189, 396, and 442.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 24 # 466
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Please change '10ABSE-T1L' to read '10BASE-T1L'.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 86, 22, 189, 396, and 442.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 24 # 189
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] 10ABSE-T1L
 SuggestedRemedy
 10BASE-T1L
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 86, 22, 466, 396, and 442.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 24 # 396
 Asmussen, Jes Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Spelling error "10ABSE-T1L"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "10BASE-T1L"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 86, 22, 466, 189, and 442.

CI 01 SC 1.1.3 P 25 L 25 # 442
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Typo in Figure 1-1
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "10ABSE-T1L" to "10BASE-T1L"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 86. Resolve with 86, 22, 466, 189, and 396.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 25 L 41 # 87
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEC references in the in-force standard have an em dash in front of "Part" with no spaces on either side.
 SuggestedRemedy
 For all of the IEC references being added replace " - " before "Part" with an em dash with no spaces before and after.
 For IEC references containing additional " - " separators, replace " - " with an em dash with no spaces before and after.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 26 L 12 # 15
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing space after comma between "2018," and "Electromagnetic"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "IEC 61000-6-4:2018,Electromagnetic compatibility"
 To
 "IEC 61000-6-4:2018, Electromagnetic compatibility"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 26 L 27 # 190
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] . use -EMC requirements ...
 SuggestedRemedy
 . use - EMC requirements . (add space before EMC)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 26 L 36 # 191
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] . cabling,
 SuggestedRemedy
 . cabling. (replace comma by dot).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 76. Resolve with 76.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 26 L 36 # 76
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
 Incorrect punctuation.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "," with "." at the end of the reference for IEC 63171-1:201x.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 76. Resolve with 191.

CI 01 SC 1.4 P 27 L 2 # 192
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] 15m
 SuggestedRemedy
 15 m (add space)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

CI 01 SC 1.4.50a P 26 L 53 # 88
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 According to the rules set out in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers
 "In text, where this improves clarity, follow the IEEE Editorial Style Manual: Use spaces instead of commas between numbers in tens or hundreds of thousands (e.g., 62 000, 100 000, but 4000)."
 The space in "1 000 m" is not in line with this.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "1 000 m" to "1000 m"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 01 SC 1.4.389a P 27 L 5 # 89
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction, "IEEE Std 802.3bt-201x" should not split across two lines.

SuggestedRemedy

use a non-breaking hyphen (Esc - h)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.9 P 26 L 12 # 84
Fritsche, Matthias HARTING Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

space sign between "IEC 61000-6-4:2018,Electromagnetic" is missing

SuggestedRemedy

Corrected reference: "IEC 61000-6-4:2018, Electromagnetic compatibility (EMC) - Part 6-4: Generic standards - Emission standard for industrial environments."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.4 P 29 L 20 # 193
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] 148.4.5.1 (too small font size)

SuggestedRemedy

148.4.5.1 (adjust font size as for normal text)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 30 L 7 # 194
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] See 148.4.5.1 for . COMMIT. (too small font size)

SuggestedRemedy

See 148.4.5.1 for . COMMIT. (adjust font size as for normal text)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 25. Resolve with 25.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 30 L 7 # 25
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"148.4.5.1 for the definition and usage of PLCA BEACON and COMMIT." appears to be in a smaller font than the rest of the paragraph.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the font size to match the paragraph style.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 25. Resolve with 194.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.2.1 P 31 L 6 # 90
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The heading number for "Major capabilities/options" should be 22.8.2.3 (as per the editing instruction).

SuggestedRemedy

Change the heading number for "Major capabilities/options" to 22.8.2.3

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 20 # 91
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The heading for 22.8.3.2 should not contain "(continued)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "(continued)" from the heading for 22.8.3.2
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 23 # 195
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] 22.8.3.2as
 SuggestedRemedy
 22.8.3.2 as (add space)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 29 # 92
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 PICS item SF15 is being deleted. This has the effect of renumbering all of the PICS items with numbers above 15.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Show SF18 as changing to SF17 and change the inserted items to be SF38 through SF40
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 34 # 26
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
 PICS SF18 - missing space between "at10 Mb/s"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to "at 10 Mb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 196. Resolve with 196.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 34 # 196
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] at10 Mb/s
 SuggestedRemedy
 at 10 Mb/s (add space)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 196. Resolve with 26.

Cl 22 SC 22.8.3.2 P 31 L 39 # 93
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "**PLCA:M" should be "PLCA:M" (no *)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "**PLCA:M" to "PLCA:M" (3 instances)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 30 **SC 30.2.5** **P 34** **L 3** # 94
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Since the whole of Table 30-1c is shown in the draft, the editing instruction should be much simpler
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the editing instruction with:
 "Change Table 30.2.5 as follows:"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 **SC 30.2.5** **P 34** **L 35** # 95
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Make the style of the changes to Table 30-1c follow the style of the in-force table
SuggestedRemedy
 For the block of inserted rows, remove the cell borders in the 3 blocks of columns on the right hand side.
 For all of the rows below the inserted rows (aRepeaterID onwards) remove the cell borders for the columns for "PHY Error Monitor Capability (optional)" and "PLCA Capability (optional)"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 **SC 30.3.2.1.2** **P 35** **L 38** # 197
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 . in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of .
SuggestedRemedy
 . in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX in section of . (add "in")
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, "new entries in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"
 with, "new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"

Cl 30 **SC 30.3.2.1.3** **P 35** **L 46** # 198
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 . in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of .
SuggestedRemedy
 . in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX in section of . (add "in")
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, "new entries in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"
 with, "new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"

Cl 30 **SC 30.3.9.1.1** **P 36** **L 18** # 96
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 As pointed out by comment #36 against D2.0:
 The 802.3 web page:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#mib
 says: "In IEEE Std 802.3 the spelling 'behaviour' is used throughout MIB clauses and their associated Annexes, and in any references to the behaviours defined there."
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "behavior" to "behaviour"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Perform a global search for "behavior" and replace with "behaviour"

Cl 30 **SC 30.3.9.2.3** **P 37** **L 11** # 199
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 . to define highest node ID .
SuggestedRemedy
 . to define the highest node ID . (add "the")
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.5 P 37 L 33 # 16
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"expressed as a the duration" should be "expressed as the duration"

SuggestedRemedy

change "expressed as a the duration"
to "expressed as the duration"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.5 P 37 L 33 # 97
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

According to the rules set out in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers
"In text, where this improves clarity, follow the IEEE Editorial Style Manual: Use spaces
instead of commas between numbers in tens or hundreds of thousands (e.g., 62 000, 100
000, but 4000)."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "65535" to "65 535"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 37 L 44 # 200
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ

. in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of .

SuggestedRemedy

. in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX in section of . (add "in")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "new entries in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"

with, "new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section"

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P 37 L 46 # 98
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Comment #41 against D2.0 was:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE

Replace, "Insert the following new entries in APPROPRIATE SYNTAX after the entry for
"1000BASE-T":

with, "Insert the following new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.5.1.1.2
after the entry for "10BASE-TS":

SuggestedRemedy

Change "1000BASE-T" to "10BASE-TS"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2 P 39 L 23 # 99
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction does not say where to put the new row and the ")" is missing from
the end.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"Change the row for 14 through 28 and insert new row in Table 45-1 as follows (unchanged
rows not shown):" to:

"Change the row for 14 through 28 and insert a new row below the changed row in Table
45-1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2 P 39 L 37 # 100
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction does not say where to put the new row.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"Change the row for m.6.12:0 and insert new row in Table 45-2 as follows (unchanged rows
not shown):" to:

"Change the row for m.6.12:0 and insert new row above the changed row in Table 45-2 as
follows (unchanged rows not shown):"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 45
SC 45.2

Page 7 of 44
11/4/2018 6:36:26 PM

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2 P 39 L 49 # 101
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

This should show "m.6.12:0" changing to "m.6.11:0" but it shows "m.12:0" changing to "m.11:0"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "m.6.1<u>1</u><s>2</s>:0"

Where <u> and </u>b are the start and end of underline font
and <s> and </s> are the start and end of strikethrough font

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P 40 L 3 # 201
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] Font size of 45-3 does not fit.

SuggestedRemedy

Adjust font size to normal text font size.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P 40 L 15 # 106
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The last 4 register addresses shown in Table 45-3 are:

1.2296 10BASE-T1L test mode control
1.2297 10BASE-T1S PMA control
1.2298 10BASE-T1S PMA status
1.2303 10BASE-T1S test mode control

but the registers shown in 45.2.1.186e through 45.2.1.186h are:

1.2298 10BASE-T1L test mode control
1.2299 10BASE-T1S PMA control
1.2300 10BASE-T1S PMA status
1.2303 10BASE-T1S test mode control

The first three of these do not match.

SuggestedRemedy

Either change the entries in Table 45-3 or the values in the corresponding subclauses so that the values match.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

No change to clause 45.2.1 required (this address numbering was implemented as a result of comment #471 against d2p0). Other comments (209, 212, and 214) have been submitted to fix the address numbering in subclauses 45.2.1.186e, 45.2.1.186f, and 45.2.1.186g.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.16 P 40 L 27 # 203
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] Font size of 45-19 does not fit.

SuggestedRemedy

Adjust font size to normal text font size.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185 P 41 L 3 # 204
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EASY] Font size of 45-149 does not fit.

SuggestedRemedy

Adjust font size to normal text font size.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P 41 L 22 # 102
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Inappropriate editing instruction: "Change the paragraph for bits 1.2100.3:0 as follows:"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "Change the text of 45.1.185.2 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P 41 L 25 # 103
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
The new sentences "When these bits are set to 0010, the mode of operation is 10BASE-T1L. When these bits are set to 0011, the mode of operation is 10BASE-T1S." are not in the correct place.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the two new sentences to be after "When these bits are set to 0001, the mode of operation is 1000BASE-T1."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 103. Resolve with 205.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P 41 L 25 # 205
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
[MDIO REGISTERS] Ordering of 10BASE-T1L, 10BASE-T1S, 100BASE-T1 and 1000BASE-T1 is reversed in the text compared to Table 45-149.

SuggestedRemedy

Move underlined (new) sentences below the sentence describing 1000BASE-T1 to stay in order with Table 45-149.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 103. Resolve with 103.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P 41 L 30 # 206
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[MDIO REGISTERS] Insert 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186h after 45.2.1.186 as follows:

SuggestedRemedy

Insert 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f after 45.2.1.186 as follows: (it is three 10BASE-T1L and three 10BASE-T1S registers, so six PMA registers in total, numbered from a to f). Rename also chapters 45.2.1.186c to 45.2.1.186h to start with 45.2.1.186a, rename also the references in Table 45-3 and in other positions of the document (Clause 45 PICS, several times, page 125, line 3, page 133, line 21, page 139, line 24, page 141, line 6, page 144, line 32, Clause 146 PICS, several times, page 183, line 11, page 187, line 10, Clause 147 pics, two times).

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment 206. Resolve with 104 and 27.

Change Editing instruction from, "45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186h" to 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f"

Start clause numbering on line 32 at 45.2.1.186a (not 45.2.1.186c).

Verify that the links in Table 45-3 updated correctly.

Verify the correct links in the Clause 45 PICS (page 125, line 3, page 133, line 21, page 139, line 24, page 141, line 6, page 144, line 32), Clause 146 PICS (page 183, line 11, page 187, line 10), and Clause 147 PICS (two locations).

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.186a** **P 41** **L 22** # **104**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E **Comment Status X** **EZ**

The editing instruction has the incorrect end heading number.
 The new headings start at 45.2.1.186c, but this should be 45.2.1.186a

SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, change "45.2.1.186h" to "45.2.1.186f"
 Renumber 45.2.1.186c through 45.2.1.186h to be 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment 206. Resolve with 206 and 27.

Change Editing instruction from, "45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186h" to 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f"

Start clause numbering on line 32 at 45.2.1.186a (not 45.2.1.186c).

Verify that the links in Table 45-3 updated correctly.

Verify the correct links in the Clause 45 PICS (page 125, line 3, page 133, line 21, page 139, line 24, page 141, line 6, page 144, line 32), Clause 146 PICS (page 183, line 11, page 187, line 10), and Clause 147 PICS (two locations).

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.186a** **P 41** **L 30** # **27**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E **Comment Status X** **EZ**

Editing instruction and numbering of subclauses is messed up - says "Insert 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186h after 45.2.1.186 as follows:" but there are only 6 subclauses. They should be 186a through 186f, but are currently labeled 186c through 186h.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change editing instruction to read "Insert 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f after 45.2.1.186 as follows:" and renumber 45.2.1.186c as 45.2.1.186a, (and subsequently change 186d to 186b, 186e to 186c, 186f to 186d, 186g to 186e, and 45.2.1.186h to 45.2.1.186f).

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment 206. Resolve with 206 and 104.

Change Editing instruction from, "45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186h" to 45.2.1.186a through 45.2.1.186f"

Start clause numbering on line 32 at 45.2.1.186a (not 45.2.1.186c).

Verify that the links in Table 45-3 updated correctly.

Verify the correct links in the Clause 45 PICS (page 125, line 3, page 133, line 21, page 139, line 24, page 141, line 6, page 144, line 32), Clause 146 PICS (page 183, line 11, page 187, line 10), and Clause 147 PICS (two locations).

CI 45 **SC 45.2.1.186c** **P 41** **L 50** # **207**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

EEE functionality

SuggestedRemedy
 EEE config value (match description to description of clause 45.2.1.186c.5).

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace "EEE functionality" with "EEE config value" in three locations for bit 1.2294.10.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186c.3** **P 42** **L 34** # **105**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 "146.5.4.1" should be a cross-reference
SuggestedRemedy
 Make "146.5.4.1" a cross-reference (2 instances)
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186d.3** **P 44** **L 11** # **208**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 low-power feature (2 occurrences in this line)
SuggestedRemedy
 low-power ability (low power ability is the wording used at other positions, so this should be aligned to the rest of the text).
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, "low-power feature" with "low-power ability" in two locations.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186e.1** **P 45** **L 11** # **209**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 [MDIO REGISTERS] Register 1.2298 is not reflecting the 10BASE-T1L test mode control register after renumbering from D2.0 to D2.1.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of 1.2298 to 1.2296 within Clauses 45.2.1.186e, Table 45-150c and 45.2.1.186e.1 (in total 6 instances). Check also other Clauses (1 instance in 146.5.2, page 139, line 23 and 1 instance in 146.11.4.2.2, page 160, line 10)
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186e.1** **P 45** **L 23** # **414**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 incorrect cross reference
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "are described in 147.5.1" to "are described in 147.5.2"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #414. Resolve with 210.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186e.1** **P 45** **L 23** # **210**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 [EASY] 146.5.4.2 is the wrong reference.
SuggestedRemedy
 146.5.2 (this is the chapter about test modes in Clause 146).
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #414. Resolve with 414.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186f** **P 46** **L 1** # **17**
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 "TableTable" should be "Table"
SuggestedRemedy
 change "TableTable" to "Table"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186f P 46 L 11 # 211
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] 1.2299:13:12 and 1.2299:9:1

SuggestedRemedy
 1.2297.13:12 and 1.2297.9:1 (replace 2 times a ":" by a "." and change register address to 1.2297).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Consider with 212.

Replace, "1.2299:13:12" with "1.2297.13:12"

Replace, "1.2299:9:1" with "1.2297.9:1"

Replace, "1.2299:11" with "1.2297.11"

Replace, "1.2299:10" with 1.2297.10"

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186f P 46 L 26 # 212
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [MDIO REGISTERS] Register 1.2299 is not reflecting the 10BASE-T1S PMA control register after renumbering from D2.0 to D2.1.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of 1.2299 to 1.2297 within Clauses 45.2.1.186f, Table 45-150d and sub clauses (in total 30 instances). Check also the other Clauses of 802.3cg for required register address changes (page 48, line 48, page 49, lines 1 and 2, page 63, line 49, page 64, line 5 and following (many instances there), page 187, line 10, page 198, line 32).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Consider with 211.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186f.3 P 47 L 11 # 213
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] Note-.

SuggestedRemedy
 Note- (remove dot).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment 108. Resolve with 108.

Change "NOTE-. The time" to "NOTE-The time" (delete "." and a space)

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186f.3 P 47 L 11 # 108
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOTE-. The time" should be "NOTE-The time"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "NOTE-. The time" to "NOTE-The time" (delete "." and a space)

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 108. Resolve with 213.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186g P 48 L # 214
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [MDIO REGISTERS] Register 1.2300 is not reflecting the 10BASE-T1S PMA status register after renumbering from D2.0 to D2.1.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of 1.2300 to 1.2298 within Clauses 45.2.1.186g, Table 45-150e and sub clauses (in total 24 instances). Check also the other Clauses of 802.3cg for required register address changes (page 47, line 20, page 65, line 18).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186g** **P 48** **L 29** # **109**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Footnote a to Table 45-150e should be just "RO = Read only"
SuggestedRemedy
 delete ", R/W = Read/Write," from footnote a to Table 45-150e
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.1.186h.1** **P 49** **L 36** # **415**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 incorrect cross reference
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "are described in 146.5.4.2" to "are described in 147.5.2"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "are described in 147.5.1" to "are described in 147.5.2"
Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3** **P 50** **L 25** # **215**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 [EASY] 45.2.3.68i is a wrong reference.
SuggestedRemedy
 45.2.3.68e (there are only 5 PCS MDIO registers for 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace "45.2.3.68i" with "45.2.3.68e"

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68.6** **P 54** **L 23** # **116**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 The heading for Remote Jabber Count (3.2293.15:0) should be 45.2.3.68e.1
SuggestedRemedy
 Renumber the heading for Remote Jabber Count (3.2293.15:0) to 45.2.3.68e.1
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68a** **P 50** **L 25** # **111**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 The editing instruction has the incorrect end heading number.
SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, change "45.2.3.68i" to "45.2.3.68e"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68a** **P 50** **L 42** # **216**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 [EASY] self-clearing
SuggestedRemedy
 Self-clearing (use capital "S" at the beginning, see other occurrences in 802.3 standard).
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68c** **P 52** **L 36** # **385**
 Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Title of Table 45-237c is wrong.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change title to "10BASE-T1S control register bit definitions"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 385. Resolve with 29 and 112.
 Change the title of Table 45-237c on line 43 to, "10BASE-T1S control register bit definitions"

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68c** **P 52** **L 43** # **112**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 The title of Table 45-237c is incorrect
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title to:
 "Table 45-237c-10BASE-T1S PCS control register bit definitions"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 385. Resolve with 385 and 29.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68c** **P 52** **L 43** # **29**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Title of Table 45-237c is incorrect
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS control register"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 385. Resolve with 385 and 112.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68e** **P 54** **L 14** # **114**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 The title of Table 45-237e is incorrect
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title to:
 "Table 45-237e-10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register bit definitions"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 30. Resolve with 30.
 Replace title of Table 45-237e to "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register"
 Change R/W entry for bit 3.2293.15:0 from, "RO, SC" to "RO/SC".

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68e** **P 54** **L 14** # **30**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 Title of Table 45-237e is incorrect
SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "10BASE-T1S PCS status 1 register" to "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 30. Resolve with 114.
 Replace title of Table 45-237e to "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register"
 Change R/W entry for bit 3.2293.15:0 from, "RO, SC" to "RO/SC".

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.3.68e** **P 54** **L 17** # **115**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 The Name for bits 3.2293.15:0 in Table 45-237e is "RemJabCnt" but the title of 45.2.3.68.6 (should be 45.2.3.68e.1) is "Remote Jabber Count"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the Name entry for bits 3.2293.15:0 in Table 45-237e to "Remote Jabber Count"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7 P 54 L 31 # 118
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"adjust reserved row" is not a valid editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

replace with "change reserved row"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Insert 2 rows in" with "Insert two rows in"

and

Replace, "adjust reserved row" with "change reserved row"

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7 P 54 L 37 # 119
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The subclause fields for the two added registers should not be blank.

SuggestedRemedy

Populate the subclause fields for the two added registers with "45.2.7.25" and "45.2.7.26" (cross-references)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.25.5 P 46 L 17 # 19
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"PHYshall" should be "PHY shall"

SuggestedRemedy

change both instances of "PHYshall" in the document to "PHY shall"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace two occurrences of "PHYshall" with "PHY shall" in 45.2.7.25.5 on pages 56, line 17 and in 45.2.7.25.6 on pages 56, line 24.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.26 P 57 L 39 # 120
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Footnote a to Table 45-330b should be just "RO = Read only"

SuggestedRemedy

delete ", R/W = Read/Write" from footnote a to Table 45-330b

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.1 P 58 L 6 # 220
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

. rows not shown):.)

SuggestedRemedy

. rows not shown): (remove ".)")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.1 P 58 L 6 # 20
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

".:)" should be "":"

SuggestedRemedy

change "":)" to "":"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment 20. Resolve with 220.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 25 # 221
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 . rows not shown):.
 SuggestedRemedy
 . rows not shown): (remove ".")
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment 20. Resolve with 20.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 25 # 21
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 change ":" to ":"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change ":" to ":"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 32 # 121
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "." missing from first row of Table 45-340
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "." to first row of Table 45-340
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add "..." to first row of Table 45-340.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 38 # 31
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 PoDL Status register has Class code 11 twice
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change entry for 1010 to read Class code 10
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master coment #31. Resolve with 122 and 6.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 39 # 122
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
 There are two rows for "Class code 11"
 "1 0 1 0 = Class code 11" should be "1 0 1 0 = Class code 10"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "1 0 1 0 = Class code 11" to "1 0 1 0 = Class code 10"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master coment #31. Resolve with 31 and 6.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P 58 L 39 # 6
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ
 The PD class for bits 13.1.6:3 equal to "1 0 1 0" should be "Class code 10", not "Class code 11"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "1 0 1 0 = Class code 11"
 To
 "1 0 1 0 = Class code 10"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master coment #31. Resolve with 31 and 122.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.9.2** **P 58** **L 49** # **123**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type T **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Footnote a to Table 45-340 should be "RO = Read Only, LH = Latching High"
SuggestedRemedy
 In Footnote a to Table 45-340, change "R/W = Read/Write, LH = Latching High" to "RO = Read Only, LH = Latching High"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #123. Resolve with 222.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.9.2** **P 58** **L 49** # **222**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 R/W = Read/Write
SuggestedRemedy
 RO = Read Only (replace R/W section by RO, as all bits are read only or Latching High, but not writable)
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment #123. Resolve with 123.
 In Footnote a to Table 45-340, change "R/W = Read/Write, LH = Latching High" to "RO = Read Only, LH = Latching High"

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.9.3** **P 59** **L 3** # **125**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Editing instruction needs improvement.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "insert row for new Bits 13.2.8:3 in" to "insert a new row for Bits 13.2.8:3 above the row for Bits 13.2.2:0 in"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.13** **P 59** **L 29** # **127**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Editing instruction is unnecessarily complicated.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change to:
 "Insert 45.2.13 (including its subclauses) after 45.2.12 as follows:"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change Editing instruction to, "Insert 45.2.13 (including its subclauses) after 45.2.12 as follows:"

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.13** **P 59** **L 35** # **128**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 The title of Table 45-351a is not correct.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title to: "PLCA registers"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 **SC 45.2.13.2** **P 60** **L 31** # **129**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Space missing in "control 2register"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "control 2register" to "control 2 register"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #129. Resolve with 457 and 387.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 **SC 45.2.13.2** **P 60** **L 31** # **387**
 Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 Typo: missing space between "2" and "register".
SuggestedRemedy
 Fix typo.
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #129. Resolve with 129, and 457.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.13.2** **P 60** **L 32** # **457**
 McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 fix typo
SuggestedRemedy
 change "PLCA control 2register"
 to "PLCA Control 2 register"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #129. Resolve with 129 and 387.

CI 45 **SC 45.3.9** **P 68** **L 31** # **232**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 7.526.7
SuggestedRemedy
 7.526.6 (7.526.6 is the 10BASE-T1S half duplex ability advertising bit).
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace "7.526.7" with "7.526.6" in AM101.

CI 45 **SC 45.5.3.3** **P 62** **L 13** # **223**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Bits 1.2100.3:0 are ignored with Auto-Negotiation enable bit 7.512.12 is set to one.
SuggestedRemedy
 Bits 1.2100.3:0 are ignored when Auto-Negotiation enable bit 7.512.12 is set to one.
 (replace with by when)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, " ignored with Auto-Negotiation" with, " ignored when Auto-Negotiation"

CI 45 **SC 45.5.3.3** **P 62** **L 18** # **225**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 10BASE-T1L PMA/PMD returns a one in bit 1.2294.15 when a reset is in progress;
 otherwise, return a value of zero
SuggestedRemedy
 10BASE-T1L PMA/PMD returns a one in bit 1.2294.15 when a reset is in progress;
 otherwise, it returns a value of zero. (add it and add an "s" at the end of return)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, "otherwise, return" with, "otherwise, it returns"

CI 45 **SC 45.5.3.3** **P 63** **L 26** # **228**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 [EASY] When bit 1.2294.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA is placed into near-end
 loopback mode, and accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path.
SuggestedRemedy
 [EASY] When bit 1.2294.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1L PMA is placed into near-end
 loopback mode, and accepts data on the transmit path and returns it on the receive path.
 (add "s" after accept and return).
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.3 P 64 L 29 # 1
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The sentence "When bit 1.2299.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, and accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path." has grammar errors

SuggestedRemedy

Change
"When bit 1.2299.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, and accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path."

To
"When bit 1.2299.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, where the PMA accepts data on the transmit path and returns it on the receive path."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #229. Resolve with 229.

Change to, "When bit 1.2297.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, and accepts data on the transmit path and returns it on the receive path." (add "s" after accept and return and modify register address from 1.2299 to 1.2297 to match Table 45-3)

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.3 P 64 L 30 # 229
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

When bit 1.2299.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, and accept data on the transmit path and return it on the receive path.

SuggestedRemedy

When bit 1.2297.0 is set to one, the 10BASE-T1S PMA is placed into loopback mode, and accepts data on the transmit path and returns it on the receive path. (add "s" after accept and return and modify register address from 1.2299 to 1.2297 to match Table 45-3)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #229. Resolve with 1.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.3 P 65 L 20 # 230
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The 10BASE-T1S PMA/PMD that is unable to detect a fault condition on the receive path returns a value of zero for bit 1.2295.1

SuggestedRemedy

The 10BASE-T1S PMA/PMD that is unable to detect a fault condition on the receive path returns a value of zero for bit 1.2298.1 (change register from 1.2295 to 1.2298).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.9 P 68 L 3 # 130
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"after Item 93 in" should be "after Item AM93 in"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "after Item 93 in" to "after Item AM93 in"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.9 P 68 L 42 # 2
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The description "When the AN process is complete, the 10BASE-T1 AN status register reflect the contents of the link partners 10BASE-T1 AN control register" has some grammar errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Change
"When the AN process is complete, the 10BASE-T1 AN status register reflect the contents of the link partners 10BASE-T1 AN control register"

To
"When the AN process is complete, the 10BASE-T1 AN status register reflects the contents of the link partner's 10BASE-T1 AN control register"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 78 **SC 78** **P70** **L 1** # **132**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 The title of Clause 78 is not "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)to zero"
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "to zero" from the end of the title of Clause 78.
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #132. Resolve with 233, 444, and 32.

Cl 78 **SC 78** **P70** **L 1** # **444**
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 Title has extra trailing text.
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "to zero" at end of line.
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #132. Resolve with 132, 233, and 32.

Cl 78 **SC 78** **P70** **L 1** # **32**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)to zero" should be "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)".
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)to zero" to be "Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)".
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #132. Resolve with 132, 233, and 444.

Cl 78 **SC 78** **P70** **L 1** # **233**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 [EASY] Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE)to zero
SuggestedRemedy
 Energy-Efficient Ethernet (EEE) (remove "to zero")
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #132. Resolve with 132, 444, and 32.

Cl 98 **SC 98.2.1.1.2** **P72** **L 30** # **133**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Comment #57 against D2.0 changed "800.0 ns ± 0.005 %" to "800 ns ± 0.005%" (no space between 0.005 and %)
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the space between 0.005 and %
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 98 **SC 98.3** **P73** **L 40** # **134**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 "Detailed functions and state diagrams" is 98.5 not 98.3
SuggestedRemedy
 Renummer the heading "Detailed functions and state diagrams" from 98.3 to 98.5 (and likewise 98.3.1 to 98.5.1 and 98.3.2 to 98.5.2)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #40. Resolve with 40 and 183.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 98 **SC 98.3** **P 73** **L 40** # **40**
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

title of 98.3 is incorrect relative to 802.3-2018, subclause being modified appears to be 98.5. 98.3.1 and 98.3.2 share the mis-numbering, but at 98.5.5 it goes back to the correct part.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 98.3, 98.3.1 and 98.3.2 to 98.5, 98.5.1 and 98.5.2

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #40. Resolve with 134 and 183.

Cl 98 **SC 98.3** **P 73** **L 41** # **183**
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E **Comment Status X** **EZ**

Should be subclause 98.5. 98.3.1 should be 98.5.1 and 98.3.2 should be 98.5.2. 98.5.5 and following subsections are correct.

SuggestedRemedy

Change subclause 98.3 back to 98.5. This should also change 98.3.1 to 98.5.1 and 98.3.2 to 98.5.2.

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #40. Resolve with 40 and 134.

Cl 98 **SC 98.3.2** **P 74** **L 19** # **135**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**

As pointed out by comment #59 against D2.0:

According to the rules set out in:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers

"In text, where this improves clarity, follow the IEEE Editorial Style Manual: Use spaces instead of commas between numbers in tens or hundreds of thousands (e.g., 62 000, 100 000, but 4000)."

However, numerous four digit numbers in 98.3.2 (should be 98.5.2) have had spaces added, which is not in accordance with the rules set out above.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the added spaces from all four digit numbers in 98.3.2 (should be 98.5.2). (23 instances)

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 98 **SC 98.5.5** **P 77** **L 6** # **459**
McClellan, Brett Marvell

Comment Type E **Comment Status X** **EZ**

the assignment operator in the TRANSMIT_DISABLE state was changed to another symbol

SuggestedRemedy

change back to the assignment operator, <=, in multiple locations in figure 98-7, 98-8, 98-9 and 98-10

Proposed Response **Response Status W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #459. Resolve with 182, 236, 239, and 240.

Replace "Ü " with ">" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box in 5 locations in figure 98-7.

Replace "Ü " with ">" in "TRANSMIT DATA BIT" box in 2 locations in figure 98-8.

Replace "Ü " with ">" in 4 locations (lines 11, 16, 18, and 24) in figure 98-9.

Replace "Ü " with ">" in 3 locations (lines 11, 12, and 19) in figure 98-10.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 98 **SC 98.5.5** **P 77** **L 6** # **236**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** **EZ**
 [EASY] There are 5 occurrences of an "Ü" instead of "<=" in state TRANSMIT DISABLE.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Ü" to "<=".

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #459. Resolve with 182, 239, 240, and 459.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box in 5 locations in figure 98-7.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DATA BIT" box in 2 locations in figure 98-8.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 4 locations (lines 11, 16, 18, and 24) in figure 98-9.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 3 locations (lines 11, 12, and 19) in figure 98-10.

CI 98 **SC 98.5.5** **P 77** **L 6** # **182**
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
 In "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box all arrows are changed to capital "U" with an umlaut over it.
 This was correct in D2p0.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #459. Resolve with 236, 239, 240, and 459.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box in 5 locations in figure 98-7.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DATA BIT" box in 2 locations in figure 98-8.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 4 locations (lines 11, 16, 18, and 24) in figure 98-9.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 3 locations (lines 11, 12, and 19) in figure 98-10.

CI 98 **SC 98.5.5** **P 79** **L 11** # **239**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** **EZ**
 [EASY] receive_DME_active Ü true

SuggestedRemedy
 receive_DME_active <= true (change "Ü" by "<="). There are also 3 other occurrences within the same state diagram which need to be changed (lines 16, 18 and 24)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #459. Resolve with 182, 236, 240, and 459.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box in 5 locations in figure 98-7.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DATA BIT" box in 2 locations in figure 98-8.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 4 locations (lines 11, 16, 18, and 24) in figure 98-9.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 3 locations (lines 11, 12, and 19) in figure 98-10.

CI 98 **SC 98.5.5** **P 80** **L 11** # **240**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** **EZ**
 [EASY] transmit_DME_wait Ü true

SuggestedRemedy
 transmit_DME_wait <= true (change "Ü" by "<="). There are also 2 other occurrences within the same state diagram which need to be changed (lines 12 and 19)

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #459. Resolve with 182, 236, 239, and 459.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DISABLE" box in 5 locations in figure 98-7.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in "TRANSMIT DATA BIT" box in 2 locations in figure 98-8.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 4 locations (lines 11, 16, 18, and 24) in figure 98-9.

Replace "Ü " with ">=" in 3 locations (lines 11, 12, and 19) in figure 98-10.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 98 SC 98.5.5 P 81 L 12 # 242
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] multispeed_autoneg_reset <=

SuggestedRemedy
 multispeed_autoneg_reset <= true (true has been missed).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #242. Resolve with 36.

Replace, "multispeed_autoneg_reset <=" with, "multispeed_autoneg_reset <= TRUE" on line 12.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6 P 80 L 13 # 36
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 Missing value to be assigned to multispeed_autoneg_reset in state SPEED_DETECTION.

SuggestedRemedy
 assign multispeed_autoneg_reset to TRUE in state SPEED_DETECTION

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #242. Resolve with 242.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6 P 81 L 4 # 37
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 variable mr_main_reset on entry to SPEED_DETECTION has two underscores between main and reset.

SuggestedRemedy
 change mr_main__reset to mr_main_reset on entry to SPEED_DETECTION

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6.1 P 81 L 43 # 137
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "Figure 98-11" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy
 Make "Figure 98-11" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6.2 P 82 L 20 # 138
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

According to the rules set out in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers
 "In text, where this improves clarity, follow the IEEE Editorial Style Manual: Use spaces instead of commas between numbers in tens or hundreds of thousands (e.g., 62 000, 100 000, but 4000)."
 Consequently, "2 000" should be "2000"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2 000" to "2000"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.6.4 P 84 L 10 # 139
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

1.2.6 of the base standard says "Unless otherwise stated, numerical limits in this standard are to be taken as exact, with the number of significant digits and trailing zeros having no significance."
 Also, usual practice in 802.3 is to not have a space between a number and %.

SuggestedRemedy
 In item DME8, show "shall be 30.0 ns \pm 0.01%." as changing to "shall be 30 ns \pm 0.01%."
 In item DME8a, change "800.0 ns \pm 0.005 %" to "800 ns \pm 0.005%"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 98 SC 98.6.8 P 84 L 33 # 140
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

According to the rules set out in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers
"In text, where this improves clarity, follow the IEEE Editorial Style Manual: Use spaces instead of commas between numbers in tens or hundreds of thousands (e.g., 62 000, 100 000, but 4000)."
However, 15 four digit numbers in 98.6.8 have had spaces added, which is not in accordance with the rules set out above.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the added spaces from the 15 four digit numbers in 98.6.8

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.6.8 P 85 L 8 # 3
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"nsfrom" should be "ns from"

SuggestedRemedy

change "nsfrom" to "ns from"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.2 P 86 L 23 # 142
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The omega in "The link segment dc loop resistance shall be less than 59 <omega> for" should be underlined as it is being added.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline it

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 86 L 33 # 185
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

There is an "and" with nothing after it.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "...are shown in Table 104-1, and ." to "...are shown in Table 104-1, and Table 104-2."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #143. Resolve with 143 and 245.

Replace "are shown in Table 104-1, and ."

with, "are shown in Table 104-1 and Table 104-1a."

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 86 L 33 # 143
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"are shown in Table 104-1, and ." should be "are shown in Table 104-1, and Table 104-1a."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "are shown in Table 104-1, and ." to "are shown in Table 104-1, and Table 104-1a."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #143. Resolve with 245 and 185.

Replace "are shown in Table 104-1, and ."

with, "are shown in Table 104-1 and Table 104-1a."

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 86 L 33 # 42
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 104-1 is in the draft and should not be marked external

SuggestedRemedy

Make Table 104-1 an active cross reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 86 L 33 # 245
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
[EASY] . are shown in Table 104-1, and .

SuggestedRemedy

Replace by: . are shown in Table 104-1, and Table 104-2."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #143. Resolve with 143 and 185.

Replace "are shown in Table 104-1, and ."

with, "are shown in Table 104-1 and Table 104-1a."

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 87 L 1 # 246
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Insert Table 104-1a .

SuggestedRemedy

Insert Table 104-2 . (the table below is shown as table 104-2, if this is problematic, as it changes the numbering of all other tables in Clause 104, then the table should be named 104-1a). This will then also affect the previous comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #144. Resolve with 246.

Renumber Table 104-2 to Table 104-1a.

CI 104 SC 104.3 P 87 L 4 # 144
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Table 104-2 should be Table 104-1a

SuggestedRemedy

Renumber Table 104-2 to Table 104-1a

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #144. Resolve with 246.

CI 104 SC 104.4.3.5 P 87 L 46 # 247
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
. return the VOLT_POWER_INFO, POWER_ASSIGN registers.

SuggestedRemedy

. return the VOLT_POWER_INFO, and POWER_ASSIGN registers. (add "and").

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "VOLT_POWER_INFO, POWER_ASSIGN"

with, "VOLT_POWER_INFO and POWER_ASSIGN"

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.5 P 90 L 22 # 145
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"Change the description of the do_classification function as follows:" should be "Change the description of the do_sccp function as follows:"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "do_classification" to "do_sccp"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.6 P 91 L 4 # 7
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
".." should be ":"

SuggestedRemedy

change ".." to ":"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.7 P 93 L 3 # 146
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There is no need for two editing instructions in 104.7

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the first editing instruction with:
"Change the text in 104.7 as follows:"
Delete the second editing instruction.
Show the added paragraph in underline font.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7 P 93 L 17 # 147
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

45.2.9.3 defines the "PoDL PSE Status 2 register"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
"shall report assigned power through PSE Status 2 Register (see 45.2.9.3)." to:
"shall report assigned power through the PoDL PSE Status 2 Register (see 45.2.9.3)."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.1 P 93 L 23 # 8
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Change ":" to ":

SuggestedRemedy

Change ":" to ":

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.3 P 96 L 7 # 78
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ

Table 104-8 editing instruction for new column PSE/PD type is an insert instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove underline from entries in column PSE/PD type and from column header.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #78. Resolve with 77.

On page 96, line 1, replace editing instruction, "Change Table 104-8 to modify rows for Items 4, 6, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, and 19, insert new rows for Items 6b, 20, and 21, and insert new column for PSE/PD Type as follows:"

with, "Change Table 104-8 as follows:"

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.3 P 96 L 32 # 77
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ

Table 104-8 editing instruction for new lines 6b, 20, and 21 is an insert instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove underline from rows 6b, 20, and 21.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #78. Resolve with 78.

On page 96, line 1, replace editing instruction, "Change Table 104-8 to modify rows for Items 4, 6, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, and 19, insert new rows for Items 6b, 20, and 21, and insert new column for PSE/PD Type as follows:"

with, "Change Table 104-8 as follows:"

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 **SC 104.7.2.4** **P 98** **L 28** # **148**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 "Change rTable 104-9" should be "Change Table 104-9"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "rTable 104-9" to "Table 104-9"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 9. Resolve with 9, 43, and 249.
 Correct "rTable" to "Table" and move the editing instruction to "Top of Page" so that it appears immediately before updated Table 104-9.

CI 104 **SC 104.7.2.4** **P 98** **L 29** # **9**
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 Editorial instructions state "Change rTable 104-9 as follows:", but
 - The table is actually on the next page (not next to the editorial text)
 - "rTable" probably should be "Table"
SuggestedRemedy
 Correct "rTable" to "Table" and move the comment so it is right before the updated Table 104-9 (or move the table so it is right after the comment)
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 9. Resolve with 43, 148, and 249.
 Correct "rTable" to "Table" and move the editing instruction to "Top of Page" so that it appears immediately before updated Table 104-9.

CI 104 **SC 104.7.2.4** **P 98** **L 30** # **249**
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 [EASY] rTable
SuggestedRemedy
 Table (remove "r")
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 9. Resolve with 9, 43, and 148.
 Correct "rTable" to "Table" and move the editing instruction to "Top of Page" so that it appears immediately before updated Table 104-9.

CI 104 **SC 104.7.2.4** **P 99** **L 10** # **10**
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
 "occurred" misspelled as "occured"
SuggestedRemedy
 change "occured" to "occurred"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 **SC 104.7.2.4** **P 100** **L 28** # **43**
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *EZ*
 "Change rTable 104-9 as follows:" has both an extra "r" in front of Table, and is separated from the table by text.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "rTable" to "Table" (just delete the r, the Table is in the xref), and bring Table 104-9 to be immediately following the editing instruction.
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Master comment 9. Resolve with 9, 148, and 249.
 Correct "rTable" to "Table" and move the editing instruction to "Top of Page" so that it appears immediately before updated Table 104-9.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.6 P 99 L 34 # 4
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 Title of Table 104-10 should be "VOLT_POWER_INFO Register Table"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of Table 104-10 from
 "CLASS_TYPE_INFO Register Table"
 to
 "VOLT_POWER_INFO Register Table"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #4. Resolve with 250.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.6 P 99 L 34 # 250
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] CLASS_TYPE_INFO
 SuggestedRemedy
 VOLT_POWER_INFO
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #4. Resolve with 4.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.7 P 100 L 1 # 252
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] CLASS_TYPE_INFO
 SuggestedRemedy
 POWER_ASSIGN
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #5. Resolve with 5.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.7 P 100 L 1 # 5
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 Title of Table 104-11 should be "POWER_ASSIGN Register Table"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of Table 104-11 from
 "CLASS_TYPE_INFO Register Table"
 to
 "POWER_ASSIGN Register Table"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #5. Resolve with 252.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.7 P 100 L 4 # 149
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Footnote a should not be on a separate line from "R/W"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Increase the column width to fix this
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.9 P 101 L 2 # 151
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Comment #82 against D2.0 pointed out that the title of 104.9 is: "Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Clause 104, Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Twisted-Pair Ethernet".

The response to this comment was:
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace "Clause 104, Reconciliation Sublayer (RS) and Media Independent Interface (MII)" with "Clause 104, Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single-Pair Ethernet"

This response is incorrect. The title of an in-force subclause cannot be changed by simply showing it as different text in an Amendment.

SuggestedRemedy

Place an editing instruction above the title of 104.9:
"Change the title of 104.9 as follows:"

Replace the current title with:

"Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Clause 104, Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single<s> Balanced Twisted</s>-Pair Ethernet".

Where <s> and </s> are the start and end of strikethrough font.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.9.4.3 P 102 L 15 # 153
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In PICS item PD27 Value/Comment "Clause 146" is in the wrong font size

SuggestedRemedy

Make the font size the same as the rest of the text.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.2 P 115 L 16 # 254
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] The stars (symbols of the "and" function, 2 occurrences) are not in the valid font style or size compared to other state diagrams.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct the font size and/or style.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.2.1 P 116 L 4 # 255
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] 22.2.2.5 is a reference to an external Clause and needs to be formatted in green.

SuggestedRemedy

Format the reference to the external Clause in green.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.
22.2.2.5 is in the draft, and correctly cross referenced

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.1.4 P 119 L 30 # 256
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] tx_disparity <= 2

SuggestedRemedy

tx_disparity <= 2 (add space)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.1.4 P 119 L 33 # 257
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] (tx_enable_mii = FALSE)*

SuggestedRemedy

(tx_enable_mii = FALSE) * (add space before the star). There is a second occurrence, which needs to be changed in line 38.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.9 P 122 L 39 # 46
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"The running disparity reflects this difference and is used to choose the coding of the next symbol coding." extra "coding" at the end shouldn't be there.

SuggestedRemedy

change "next symbol coding" to "next symbol"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 125 L 11 # 260
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] 22.2.2.8 is a reference to an external Clause and should be green colored.

SuggestedRemedy

Use the style for an external reference (green color).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

22.2.2.8 is in the draft and correctly cross referenced.

CI 146 SC 146.3.4.1.1 P 125 L 47 # 263
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Srn[3:0] is not used anymore in Receive state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove reference and descriptive text for Srn[3:0].

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.4.1.2 P 126 L 19 # 264
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Srn[3:0] = inverse_table4B3T(Rxn)

SuggestedRemedy

RXD[3:0] = descramble(inverse_table4B3T(Rxn)) (add descramble function as the receive state diagram now returns RXD[3:0] instead of Srn[3:0].

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4 P 131 L 41 # 154
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There are two notes in Figure 146-11, so they should be NOTE1 and NOTE 2
Also, the first note overlaps the figure

SuggestedRemedy

Change the notes to be NOTE1 and NOTE 2
Move the notes so that they don't overlap the figure

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.3.1 P 124 L 27 # 258
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"." too much.

SuggestedRemedy

Please remove ".".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.4.4 P 133 L 36 # 268
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] "." at the end of the sentence is missing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.2 P 135 L 11 # 48
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing space - "expire100 ms"
 SuggestedRemedy
 insert space between "expire" and "100"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implemented by comment 269.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.2 P 135 L 11 # 344
 Thompson, Geoff GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 Missing space
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: "...expire100 ms..." to "...expire 100 ms..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implemented by comment 269.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.2 P 135 L 11 # 269
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] expire100 ms
 SuggestedRemedy
 expire 100 ms (add space)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.2 P 135 L 39 # 155
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOTE- After" should not have a space between "-" and "After"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the space.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement with comment 345 if accepted.

CI 146 SC 146.5.2 P 139 L 23 # 271
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [MDIO REGISTERS] 1.2298.15:13 is reflecting the old MDIO register numbering. Since D2.1 register addresses changed.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 1.2296.15:13
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.4 P 142 L 11 # 447
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Key in Figure 149-19 needs clarification.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "lower PSD 2.4v" to "Lower PSD 2.4 Vpp" and "Upper PSD 2.4v" to "Upper PSD 2.4 Vpp"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.4 P 142 L 28 # 273
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] 1 Vpp

SuggestedRemedy
 2.4 Vpp (Figure 146-19 reflects the PSD mask for the 2.4 Vpp mode).

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implemented by comment 446

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.4 P 142 L 29 # 446
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Figure 146-19 title refers to wrong voltage.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "1 Vpp" to "2.4 Vpp"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.4 P 143 L 5 # 449
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Key in Figure 149-20 needs clarification.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Lower PSD 1v" to "Lower PSD 1 Vpp" and "Upper PSD 1v" to "Upper PSD 1 Vpp"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 144 L 9 # 313
 Yseboodt, Lennart Signify

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In Figure 146-21 there are no round connection points drawn for the 100 Ohm resistor in parallel with the noise source.

SuggestedRemedy
 Attention to detail is what separates us from lesser standards.
 Add connecting dots.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 144 L 16 # 156
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOTE- If" should not have a space between "-" and "If"

SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the space.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.6.2 P 145 L 52 # 157
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 Comment #134 against D2.0 was:
 146.6.2, P 126, L 52
 Comment
 "45.2.1.131" is not the correct reference for register 1.2100
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "45.2.1.131" to "45.2.1.185" here and in 146.11.4.3 item MI3
 ACCEPT.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "45.2.1.131" to "45.2.1.185" and make it a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 150 L 18 # 158
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In Table 146-6, the Frequency entry should be "0.1 to 20" but the "to" uses symbol font

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "0.1 to 20" all in the default font.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 150 L 18 # 275
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

0.1 to 20

SuggestedRemedy

0.1 <= f <= 20 (as for the other tables/frequency ranges in 146.7).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

The requirement is not a function of Frequency.

CI 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 150 L 19 # 453
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 146-6, under Frequency, uses tau instead of a t for the word "to".

SuggestedRemedy

Use correct letter.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve with comment#158

CI 146 SC 146.7.1.5 P 150 L 19 # 52
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 146-6 has font problems in the entry - size changes and greek letters for "to" - these should be roman.

SuggestedRemedy

Use consistent paragraph style (cell body), make standard size and use roman for "to".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve with comment#158

CI 146 SC 146.8.3 P 152 L 38 # 276
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] 1 < f } <= 10 MHz

SuggestedRemedy

1 < f <= 10 MHz (remove "}")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.8.4 P 152 L 51 # 160
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Clause 104" should be a cross-reference.

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Clause 104" a cross-reference.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.8.4 P 152 L 51 # 161
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "the devices does not" should be "the device does not"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "the devices does not" to "the device does not"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.8.5 P 153 L 4 # 11
 Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Need space between comma and "as"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "potential,as" to "potential, as"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.8.5 P 153 L 4 # 278
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] . or ground potential,as per .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . or ground potential, as per . (add space after comma)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implemented by comment 11

CI 146 SC 146.8.5 P 153 L 32 # 162
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOTE- Typically" should not have a space between "-" and "Typically"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the space.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.9.2.2 P 154 L 26 # 163
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 This says "NAMUR NE021 test methods" whereas on Page 26, line 44 we have "NAMUR NE 021:2017"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "NAMUR NE021 test methods" to "NAMUR NE 021 test methods"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.2.2 P 156 L 1 # 165
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Comment #101 against D2.0 was:
 CI 146, SC 146.11.2.2, P 136, L 33
 Comment
 146.11.2.2 should be on the same page as the rest of the PICS initial text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Uncheck "Keep with next" for the heading of 146.11.2.2
 ACCEPT
 However, this has not been implemented.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Uncheck "Keep with next" for the heading of 146.11.2.2
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.3 P 156 L 25 # 166
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 EEE is not used in the Status column anywhere in the Clause 146 PICS, so it should not be preceded by a ""
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change ""EEE" to "EEE"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.20 P 229 L 17 # 440
Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

The acronym DCR is used without definition (I believe it's Direct Current Resistance).

SuggestedRemedy

Add DCR to "1.5 Abbreviations" , and also spell out on first use, i.e., Direct Current Resistance(DCR).

Proposed Response Response Status C

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.A.1 P 227 L 50 # 178
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"NOTE- The" should not have a space between "-" and "The"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the space.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147 P 167 L 1 # 388
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

All timer names are uppercase, but it appears that in other clauses these are lowercase.

SuggestedRemedy

Change all timer names to lowercase across clause 147. Implement this comment after all other comments have been resolved.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.1 P 164 L 12 # 56
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

"The 10BASE-T1S PHY is a full-/half-duplex point-to-point and half-duplex multidrop PHY specification, capable of operating at 10 Mb/s. The 10BASE-T1S PHY is intended to be operated over the point-to-point link segment defined in 147.7 and the mixing segment defined in 147.8." is less clear than it could be The "PHY" is not a specification and the mixed modes make it confusing. (this relates to unsatisfied comment i-268) [OPTIONS]

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the first and 2nd sentences of the paragraph with "The 10BASE-T1S PHY is specified to be capable of operating at 10 Mb/s in several modes. All 10BASE-T1S PHYs can operate a half-duplex PHY with a single link partner over a point-to-point link segment defined in 147.7, and, additionally, there are two mutually exclusive optional operating modes: a full-duplex point-to-point mode over the link segment defined in 147.7, and a half-duplex shared-medium mode, referred to as multidrop mode, capable of operating with multiple link partners connected to a mixing segment, defined in 147.8.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.1.2 P 164 L 46 # 362
Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Text will refer to "differential manchester encoding (DME) modulation". However, DME is a line code, not a modulation.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "modulation".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.1.2 P 164 L 47 # 58
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"4B/5B encoding is used to further improve EMC performance and to signaling among the connected PHYs." - extra "to" before "signaling"

SuggestedRemedy

delete "to" in "to signaling"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Already dealt with by #168

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.1.2 P 164 L 47 # 168
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In "4B/5B encoding is used to further improve EMC performance and to signaling among the connected PHYs."
"signaling" should be "signal"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "signaling" to "signal"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.1.2 P 164 L 47 # 325
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Change "... and to signaling ..." to "... and signaling ..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "... and to signaling ..." to "... and signaling ..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Already dealt with by #168

CI 147 SC 147.1.2 P 164 L 47 # 363
Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The phrase "and to signaling among connected PHYs" is awkward. It appears that changes for resolved d2p0 Comment #641 were not correctly applied to the latest d2p1 draft (deleted "perform" along with "out-of-band").

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

====

4B/5B encoding is used to further improve EMC performance and to signaling among the connected PHYs.

====

to:

====

4B/5B encoding is used to further improve EMC performance and to perform signaling among the connected PHYs.

====

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Already dealt with by #168

CI 147 SC 147.2 P 166 L 42 # 280
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] PMA_CARRIER.indication(pma_crs)

SuggestedRemedy

PMA_CARRIER.indication (pma_crs) (add space before the opening bracket). There is also a second occurrence on page 167, line 2, which needs to have a space added.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.2.1.1 P 166 L 51 # 60
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Maps the primitive PMA_CARRIER.indication to the MII CRS sign." - "sign" should be "signal"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "sign" to "signal"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 147

SC 147.2.1.1

Page 36 of 44

11/4/2018 6:36:27 PM

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.1 P 167 L 27 # 169
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In: "The receipt of a request for reset from the management entity (see 3.2291.15 in 45.2.3.58e.1), independently from the current state of pcs_reset."
"see 3.2291.15 in 45.2.3.58e.1" does not make sense and also "3.2291.15" and "45.2.3.58e.1" should not be in forest green.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "The receipt of a request for reset from the management entity (bit 3.2291.15 defined in 45.2.3.58e.1), independently from the current state of pcs_reset."
with "3.2291.15" in normal font and "45.2.3.58e.1" as a cross-reference.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.1 P 168 L 47 # 326
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Line 53 on this page and other places use "5B" and here uses "five-bit", not consistent

SuggestedRemedy

Use 5B instead of five-bit

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "where tx_sym is a five-bit vector." to "where tx_sym is a 5B symbol."

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.2 P 169 L 20 # 170
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Comment #111 against D2.0 was:
CI 146, SC 146.3.2.1, P 98, L 4
Comment
"22.2.2.5" should be a cross-reference.
Same issue in 147.3.2.2 (page 149, line 36)
SuggestedRemedy
Make "22.2.2.5" a cross-reference here and in 147.3.2.2 (page 149, line 36).
ACCEPT
However, this has not been implemented in 147.3.2.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Make "22.2.2.5" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.3 P 173 L 10 # 281
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

XMIT_MAX_TIMER done

SuggestedRemedy

XMIT_MAX_TIMER_done (replace 2 occurrences in line 11 and line 19).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.3 P 173 L 33 # 282
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

UNJAB_TIMER done

SuggestedRemedy

UNJAB_TIMER_done (replace space by underline)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.3 P 178 L 15 # 314
Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Typo of "RXn2 = ESDOK2 ="

SuggestedRemedy

Change "RXn2 = ESDOK2 =" to "RXn-2 = ESDOK"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.3.1 P 174 L 52 # 283
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

ESDOK, ESDERR or ESDJAB symbol

SuggestedRemedy

ESDOK, ESDERR, or ESDJAB symbol (add comma before "or")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.1 P 175 L 2 # 284
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

. ESDJAB and ESDERR see 147.3.2.2.

SuggestedRemedy

. ESDJAB, and ESDERR see 147.3.2.2. (add comma before "and")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.5 P 177 L 1 # 399
Asmussen, Jes Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The PCS Receive state diagram should be in its own sub-clause section.

SuggestedRemedy

Introduce new sub-clause titled "PCS Receive state machine".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TODO:

- Create new clause "147.3.3.5 State diagrams" ("Self-synchronizing descrambler" and "Jabber diagnostics" will renumber)
- Move figures 147-8 and 147-9 to under 147.3.3.5

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.5 P 177 L 8 # 285
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

RXn=SYNC (line 8) / RXn=SSD (line 16)

SuggestedRemedy

RXn = SYNC / RXn = SSD (add spaces).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.5 P 177 L 8 # 398
Asmussen, Jes Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The PCB Receive state diagram doesn't show the progression of symbol time index n to indicate the next symbol received. For example before SYNCING state there is RXn=SYNC and after SYNCING state RXn=SSD. Shouldn't the RXn=SSD be replaced with RXn+1=SSD? There is a similar finding where WAIT_SSD state, there is RXn = SSD. After WAIT_SSD state, RXn=SSD where in this case n should be n+1.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct symbol time index n throughout diagram.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

The index "n" progresses at each RSCD by definition

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.5 P 177 L 31 # 286
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] precnt = 9 / precnt ? 9 has a too small font size.

SuggestedRemedy

Match font size.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.5 P 178 L 13 # 287
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

RSCD * RXn-3 = ESD * RXn2 = ESDOK2 =

SuggestedRemedy

RSCD * RXn-3 = ESD * RXn-2 = ESDOK

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.7.1 P 180 L 11 # 317
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 change "RXD" to "RXD<3:0>"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "RXD" to "RXD<3:0>"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.7.3 P 180 L 23 # 62
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Since 147.3.7.3 is the end of the lowest level numbering, there is no need to keep it around with an editors note - just remove it. The same applies to 147.4.4
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete header 147.3.7.3 and editors note on P180 L 23 through 28. Delete header 147.4.4 and editors note on P182 L29-34.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.4.2 P 181 L 15 # 320
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Change " a vector of 5 bits" to " a 5B vector"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change " a vector of 5 bits" to " a 5B vector"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change this:
 =====
 The tx_sym variable is a vector of 5 bits to be encoded, LSB first
 =====
 to this:
 =====
 The tx_sym variable is a 5B symbol, to be encoded LSB first
 =====

CI 147 SC 147.9.2 P 189 L 29 # 186
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Missing commas
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "R, L Ctot and Cnode" to "R, L, Ctot, and Cnode"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.9.2 P 190 L 4 # 28
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "Inductive elements are only required" reads like a requirement when it is meant to be an informative statement - it also isn't necessarily true - you never know what people might do...
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Inductive elements are only required where power is applied across the data lines." to "Inductive elements are often used when power is applied across the data lines, and may be absent in non-powered implementations."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.9.3 P 190 L 32 # 65
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "PoDL" is a trade name - the intent here is to provide tolerance for powering.
 SuggestedRemedy
 "Change "PoDL" to "line powering" in header for 147.9.3 (line 32) and in 2nd sentence of paragraph (line 36).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.9.3 P 190 L 35 # 66
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting et al

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

1200 mA is less than the maximum current of clause 104 powering (1360 mA per Table 104-1)

SuggestedRemedy

Change 1200mA to 1360mA

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TODO:

- Change "limited to 1200 mA, under" to "limited to 1360 mA, under"
- Adjust PICS/MDI2 as well

CI 147 SC 147.10.2.1 P 191 L 50 # 290
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] Climatic loads standards are written in justify mode, should ber left aligned.

SuggestedRemedy

Left align text related to climatic loads. The same should be done for the text in line 4 on page 192.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TODO: check all these lists in c147 and make them left-aligned

CI 147 SC 147.12.4.6.1 P 196 L 41 # 12
Regev, Alon Keysight Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"boundry" should be "boundary"

SuggestedRemedy

change "boundry" to "boundary"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.12.4.6.2 P 197 L 49 # 291
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EASY] 0.1 % (space too much)

SuggestedRemedy

0.1% (remove space). The same should also be done for the 0.1 % on page 198, line 5.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

To follow pre-established style do the following to the newly added PICS text in 147.12:

- remove space from before %
- make sure all spaces are non-breaking

CI 147 SC 147.12.4.10 P 200 L 6 # 292
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

References to Clause 146 in 147.12.4.10 and 147.12.4.11

SuggestedRemedy

Change in total 4 references from Clause 146 to Clause 147.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TODO:

- "147.12.4.10 Environmental specifications": Change "146.9.1" to "147.10.1" (2 locations)
- "147.12.4.11 Delay constraints": Change "146.10" to "147.11" (2 locations)

CI 147 SC 147.12.4.10 P 200 L 6 # 355
Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Clause 147 (T1S) PICS proforma tables incorrectly refer to subclauses in 146 (T1L).
(Copy/paste error)

SuggestedRemedy

147.12.4.10 Environmental specifications

- * Line 6, ES1 - change subclause 146.9.1 to 147.10.1
- * Line 9, ES2 - change subclause 146.9.1 to 147.10.1

147.12.4.11 Delay constraints

- * Line 19, DC1 - change subclause 146.10 to 147.11
- * Line 20, DC2 - change subclause 146.10 to 147.11

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Already dealt with by #292

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 147

SC 147.12.4.10

Page 40 of 44

11/4/2018 6:36:27 PM

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 207 L 29 # 401
 Asmussen, Jes Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Referencing Figure 148-4 twice
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove 2nd reference.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 207 L 29 # 322
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 Delete "and Figure 128-4"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "and Figure 128-4"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Duplicate of #401

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 207 L 29 # 356
 Baggett, Tim Microchip
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Reference to Figure 148-4 is duplicated. Actually, the first reference is to Figure 148-4 on page 209, and the second reference is to the continuation of the figure on page 210. The portion of Figure 148-4 which the text refers to is only the entry into the DISABLE state on page 209.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove second reference to Figure 148-4 which links to the continuation on page 210.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Duplicate of #401

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 208 L 15 # 175
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The list between lines 15 and line 26 is not formatted correctly.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the paragraph type of all of the items to "DL,DashedList" and remove the existing "-" tab from each.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 208 L 20 # 431
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 editorial cleanup - PHYs and stations have no gender.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "In this case the PHY skips his TO" to "In this case the PHY skips it's TO".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolve with #470

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 208 L 20 # 470
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Suggest the text 'In this case the PHY skips his TO and waits ...' be changed to read 'In this case the PHY skips its TO and waits ...' (change 'his' to 'its').
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 208 L 25 # 432
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 editorial cleanup
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "This is required not to send a BEACON" to "This avoids sending a BEACON"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolve with #357

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 208 L 25 # 357
 Baggett, Tim Microchip
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Sentence wording may lead to confusion to readers not familiar with the spec development.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 This is required not to send a BEACON while other PHYs might still be using their TO.
 To:
 This is required so as not to send a BEACON while other PHYs might still be using their TO
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 213 L 4 # 294
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 TO_TIMER x (plca_max_id + 1) + BEACON_TIMER (font size is in parts too small)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Adjust font size to normal text font size. The same adjustment needs to be done in line 38 of page 213.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 213 L 10 # 472
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Suggest the text 'PLCA Data state diagram...' be changed to read 'The PLCA Data state diagram ...'.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 213 L 54 # 471
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Suggest the text '... until PLCA Control state diagram signals ...' be changed to read '... until the PLCA Control state diagram signals ...' (add 'the' before 'PLCA Control state diagram').
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 215 L 8 # 295
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EASY] if CRS= TRUE
 SuggestedRemedy
 if CRS = TRUE (add space before "=").
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 215 L 14 # 296
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Transition with plca_en = TRUE condition is too long, reaching into the body of state NORMAL.

SuggestedRemedy

Adapt line length.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 215 L 42 # 297
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

committed = FALSE*

SuggestedRemedy

committed = FALSE * (add space after FALSE).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 215 L 44 # 298
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

receiving= FALSE

SuggestedRemedy

receiving = FALSE (add space after receiving).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 215 L 51 # 299
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

receiving = FALSE

SuggestedRemedy

receiving = FALSE * (likely add an "and" condition after FALSE, but check, if this is the correct logical operator here and remove the final "and" operator at the end of the condition in line 52).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P 218 L 10 # 176
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"i.e. receiving" should be "i.e., receiving"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "i.e. receiving" to "i.e., receiving"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.2 P 218 L 54 # 177
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"30.3.9.1.2" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Make "30.3.9.1.2" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 148	SC 148.5.4.6	P 223	L 10	# 13
Regev, Alon		Keysight Technologies		
Comment Type	E	Comment Status	D	EZ
"PLCAStatus" should be "PLCA Status"				
SuggestedRemedy				
change "PLCAStatus" to "PLCA Status"				
Proposed Response		Response Status	W	
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				