Cl **98**   *SC* **98.2.1.1.2**   *P* **72**   *L* **15**   # 479
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
From the text starting on line 16 to line 20 implies 10BASE-T1S can use HSM or LSM for auto-negotiation, but HSM speed is higher than12MBd. This means only option is LSM for speed for 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S

SuggestedRemedy
HSM serves all speeds above 10 Mb/s and LSM serves 10Mb/s auto-negogiation

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.3.1**   *P* **73**   *L* **42**   # 480
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
Wrong heading number

SuggestedRemedy
Change 98.3 to 98.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.5**   *P* **77**   *L* **6**   # 481
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
"U"

SuggestedRemedy
Change U with <=

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.6**   *P* **81**   *L* **81**   # 483
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
Figure 98-11 missing variable value

SuggestedRemedy
Assign vaule to multispeed_auto-neg_reset

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.6.1**   *P*   *L* **37**   # 482
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
98.5.6.1 Varibables defined after state machines

SuggestedRemedy
Move section 98.5.6.1 before 98.5.5 and re-number

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.7**   *P* **93**   *L* **14**   # 492
Stewart, Heath   Analog Devices

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**   *Late*
Cable resistance measurement scheme requires a binding shall to ensure the PD allocated power calculation does not exceed Pclass, min and incorporates sufficient margin for items such as cable temperature rise.

SuggestedRemedy
See stewart_1118_01.pdf

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.7**

Page 1 of 3
11/6/2018 2:24:38 AM

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.5.4.1**	*P* **140**	*L* **51**	# 484

Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

This test in test fixture and not with partner PHY auto-neg is not possible

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ""Additionally, Auto-Negotiation can be used
to find a common transmitter output voltage for the two PHYs"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.5.4.1**	*P* **141**	*L* **9**	# 485

Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

This test in test fixture and not with partner PHY auto-neg is not possible

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ""Additionally, Auto-Negotiation can be used
to find a common transmitter output voltage for the two PHYs"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.9.2.2**	*P* **154**	*L* **24**	# 478

Carty, Clark   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

D3.0 rejected comment #353 that requests removal of this section. The second and third paragraphs have issues. This includes listing specific tests. These test may not be complete, could change over time, and are covered within "all applicable local and national codes".   There are also "shalls and mays" that are not in the PICS, and don't match 147.10.2.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the 2nd and 3rd paragraphs of 146.9.2.2 leaving it as "A system integrating the 10BASE-T1L PHY shall comply with all applicable local and national codes."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
TFTD with 55, 307, 411, 330, 164

Cl **147**	*SC* **147.1.1**	*P* **164**	*L* **32**	# 486

Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

Optional MDIO is defined
in Clause 45. Management is not optional

SuggestedRemedy

Change to " Management Entity is required using MDIO or other function"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
TFTD
See also #418 (which may remove this text)

Cl **147**	*SC* **147.3.2.4**	*P* **173**	*L* **38**	# 487

Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

Abbreviations should be bfore figure 147-5

SuggestedRemedy

Move section 147.3.2.4 to be before Figure 147-4

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
TODO: find the appropriate solution to makes sure no figures appear in the flow of 147.3.2.2-6
Possible means are:
- Check if the "Top of Page" is applied to the paragraph just before these figures
- Move the anchors of figures 147-4 an 147-5 to the very end of "147.3.2.1 PCS Transmit overview"
- Anything else that works here

Cl **147**	*SC* **147.3.2.6**	*P* **174**	*L*	# 488

Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

Not clear on what the timers are based on?

SuggestedRemedy

Clarify how the timer values are based on - number of packets or symbols

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
174/19: replace "Duration: 2 ms ± 100 us" by "Duration: 2 ms ± 100 us. NOTE-This is approximately 50% greater than the maximum frame size (1522 bytes)"
Remark: "NOTE-" must harmonize with the rest of the text: use that from 190/28

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **147**
SC **147.3.2.6**

Page 2 of 3
11/6/2018 2:24:38 AM

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.1**   *P* **201**   *L*   # 489
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

"PLCA provides improved performance over the standard CSMA/CD method in terms of throughput and latency for small multidrop networks having a limited number of nodes and high utilization"

Text "and high utilization" seems to be redundent

SuggestedRemedy

"PLCA provides improved performance over the standard CSMA/CD method in terms of throughput and latency for small multidrop networks having a limited number of nodes"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.4.5**   *P* **207**   *L* **18**   # 490
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

This section not clear on how the node_ID and various conditions are determined. I think it would help to state the PLCA parameters should be configured before enable transmit and receive data

SuggestedRemedy

Add statement "To acehive error free operation the PLCA node should be configured approriatley before transmit function are enabled"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.4.6.2**   *P* **217**   *L* **1**   # 491
Bains, Amrik   Cisco Systems INC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Late*

This is a repeat Data Variables

SuggestedRemedy

Remove 148.4.6.2 and add missing variables to section before 148.4.6.1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Search throughout clauses 146, 147, 148 and put definitions for variables, timers and functions before the actual state diagrams, as in 802.3bz.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **148**   Page 3 of 3
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **148.4.6.2**   11/6/2018 2:24:38 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line