

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 00 SC FM P9 L2 # 6
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There is text to the left of the list of WG ballot members on page 9 that should be below the list

SuggestedRemedy

Move the text to be below the list.
This can be done by changing the anchoring position of the frame containing the list to be "Below Current Line"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #6. Consider with #75.

Cl 00 SC 0 P9 L3 # 75
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved . text is accidently written in vertical direction.

SuggestedRemedy

Format text to be below the names list.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #6. Consider with #6.

Cl 00 SC 0 P15 L17 # 76
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Within the table of contents in several lines there is no space between the Clause number and the Cause title text.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a space after the Clause numbers in the affected lines or format the table of contents in a way, so that there is enough space there. Affected pages are 15, 21, 23 (several lines on each page)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Update the tab stop and left indents in the TOC as follows:

For H3 from 65 to 70

For H4 from 90 to 95

For H5 from 115 to 120

Cl 01 SC 1.1.3 P27 L8 # 7
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction is "Change the text at the bottom of the right column of Figure 1-1 as follows:" but there are changes in the NOTE that are not marked as changes and not covered by this editing instruction.

Also "of 10BASE-T1L and 10BASE-T1S and 100 Mb/s and above" has too many "and"s

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the editing instruction with "Change the text at the bottom of the right column and in the NOTE in Figure 1-1 as follows:"

Change the inserted text in the NOTE to : ""10BASE-T1L, 10BASE-T1S, and" in underline font.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 27 L 52 # 117
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Incorrect title and date referenced for IEC 60079-0.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "IEC 60079-0: 2014, Explosive atmospheres. Part 1. Equipment protection by flameproof enclosures" with "IEC 60079-0: 2017, Explosive atmospheres - Part 0: Equipment - General requirements"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 28 L 6 # 79
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
IEC 61000-4-5: 2017

SuggestedRemedy

IEC 61000-4-5:2017 (remove spaces before 2017)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "IEC 61000-4-5: 2017"

with, "IEC 61000-4-5:2017"

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.4 P 31 L 20 # 80
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
148.4.5.1 is in the wrong font size.

SuggestedRemedy

Please correct font size to match normal text.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.8 P 32 L 7 # 8
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"148.4.5.1" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

make "148.4.5.1" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.186d P 47 L 28 # 11
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"Table 45-150d" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

make "Table 45-150d" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68b P 52 L 20 # 149
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
[EZ] Cleanup; there is only one PCS status register for T1L.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "PCS status 1 register" to "PCS status register".

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #12. Consider with #12.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68b P 52 L 20 # 12
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The name of register 3.2279 is "10BASE-T1L PCS status" (not status 1). See comment #110 against D2.1

SuggestedRemedy

Change "status 1" to "status" in the title and also the first line of 45.2.3.68b

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #12. Consider with #149.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68b P 52 L 22 # 150
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EZ] Cleanup; there is only one PCS status register for T1L.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "PCS status 1 register" to "PCS status register".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68c P 54 L 8 # 13
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The name of register 3.2291 is "10BASE-T1S PCS control" (See comment #112 against D2.1)

SuggestedRemedy

In the title of Table 237c, change "control" to "PCS control"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68e P 55 L 41 # 14
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The name of register 3.2293 is "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1".

This means that references to it should be: "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register"

SuggestedRemedy

On lines 41 and 42 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 1" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (2 instances)

On line 43 change "10BASE-T1S PCS 1 diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register"

In the title of Table 45-237e change "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (add PCS and 1)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #14. Consider with #152 and #153.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68e P 55 L 43 # 152
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EZ] Text cleanup; the correct name of the register appears to be "PCS diagnostic 1"

SuggestedRemedy

Change occurrences of "PCS 1 diagnostic register" and "PCS diagnostic register 1" to "PCS diagnostic 1 register"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #14. Consider with #14 and #153.

On lines 41 and 42 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 1" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (2 instances)

On line 43 change "10BASE-T1S PCS 1 diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register"

In the title of Table 45-237e change "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (add PCS and 1)

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.68f** **P 56** **L 9** # **15**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 "Table 45-150f" should be a cross-reference
SuggestedRemedy
 make "Table 45-150f" a cross-reference
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.68f** **P 56** **L 10** # **16**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 The name of register 3.2294 is "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2".
 This means that references to it should be: "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register"
SuggestedRemedy
 On line 10 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 2" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register". Also, change the "-" in "10BASE-T1S" to be non-breaking (Ctrl space).
 In the title of Table 45-237f change "10BASE-T1S PCS status 2 register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register" (status to diagnostic).
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Master comment #16. Consider with #154 and #155.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.68f** **P 56** **L 11** # **154**
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 [EZ] Text cleanup; the correct name of the register appears to be "PCS diagnostic 2"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PCS diagnostic register 2" to "PCS diagnostic 2 register"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #16. Consider with #16 and #155.
 On line 10 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 2" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register".
 Also, change the "-" in "10BASE-T1S" to be non-breaking (Ctrl space).
 In the title of Table 45-237f change "10BASE-T1S PCS status 2 register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register" (status to diagnostic).

CI 45 **SC 45.2.3.68f.1** **P 56** **L 27** # **288**
 Jones, Peter Cisco Systems
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 missing word "the number of physical collisions (..) occurred since last time"
SuggestedRemedy
 missing word "the number of physical collisions (..) that occurred since last time"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 **SC 45.2.7** **P 56** **L 33** # **17**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 The title of Table 45-309 is "Auto-Negotiation MMD registers"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of Table 45-309 from "PMA/PMD registers" to "Auto-Negotiation MMD registers"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2.8 P 61 L 3 # 18
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "42.2.9.2.8" should be "45.2.9.2.8"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "42.2.9.2.8" to "45.2.9.2.8"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.13 P 62 L 13 # 45
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 PLCA TO Timer
 SuggestedRemedy
 PLCA TO timer (align with the rest of the text).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace, "PLCA TO Timer"
 with, "PLCA TO timer"

CI 45 SC 45.2.13.3 P 63 L 31 # 19
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The name of register 28.2 is "PLCA TO Timer".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of Table 45-351d from "PLCA to_timer register bit definitions" to "PLCA TO timer register bit definitions"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.13.6 P 64 L 32 # 346
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Wrong register name.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Control 1 register" to "Status register".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #159. Consider with #159.
 Replace, "PLCA Control 1 register"
 with, "PLCA status register"

CI 45 SC 45.2.13.6 P 64 L 32 # 159
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EZ] Incorrect section header
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PLCA Control 1" to "PLCA status".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #159. Consider with #346.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.24 P 72 L 7 # 20
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Item "**PLCA" has a status entry of "PLCA:O", which is not as per comment #131 against D2.1 and is self-referencing.
 Item "**PLCA" has a support entry of "Yes [] N/A []", which is not as per comment #131 against D2.1 (should be "Yes [] No []"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PLCA:O" to "O"
 Change "Yes [] N/A []" to "Yes [] No []"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC Table 45-237e P 55 L 46 # 153
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Text cleanup; incorrect table title.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #14. Consider with #14 and #152.

On lines 41 and 42 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 1" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (2 instances)

On line 43 change "10BASE-T1S PCS 1 diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register"

In the title of Table 45-237e change "10BASE-T1S diagnostic register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 1 register" (add PCS and 1)

CI 45 SC Table 45-237f P 56 L 14 # 155
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Text cleanup; incorrect table title.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "10BASE-T1S PCS status 2" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master comment #16. Consider with #16 and #154.

On line 10 change "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic register 2" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register".

Also, change the "-" in "10BASE-T1S" to be non-breaking (Ctrl space).

In the title of Table 45-237f change "10BASE-T1S PCS status 2 register" to "10BASE-T1S PCS diagnostic 2 register" (status to diagnostic).

CI 98 SC 98.5.5 P 81 L 1 # 46
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
In state diagram 98-9 at 4 positions a "≤" instead of a "<=" is being used.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct state diagram by replacing the "≤" by a "<=" symbol.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.5 P 82 L 1 # 47
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
In state diagram 98-10 at 3 positions a "≤" instead of a "<=" is being used.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct state diagram by replacing the "≤" by a "<=" symbol.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6 P 84 L 26 # 323
McClellan, Brett Marvell

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"timer done" should be "timer_done"

SuggestedRemedy

change "failure_timer done" to "failure_timer_done" in 2 locations
change "detection_timer done" to "detection_timer_done"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.6.3 P 83 L 45 # 77
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Timers:

SuggestedRemedy

Timers (remove double dot after Timers)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 98 SC 98.6.4 P 86 L 10 # 21
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Comment #139 against D2.1 was ACCEPT with part of the suggested remedy being:
In item DME8, show "shall be 30.0 ns \pm 0.01%." as changing to "shall be 30 ns \pm 0.01%."
Since DME8 is in the base standard, this should be done by showing ".0" in strikethrough font

SuggestedRemedy

In item DME8 add ".0" in strikethrough font after "30"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6 P 99 L 38 # 282
Stewart, Heath Analog Devices

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

field should not be subscript

SuggestedRemedy

Make field normal text

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #84. Consider with #84.

Cl 104 SC 104.6 P 99 L 44 # 283
Stewart, Heath Analog Devices

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Incorrect implementation of change from last cycle. Equation needs an "=" assignment operator.

SuggestedRemedy

Change
P_PD_assign >=
to
P_PD_assign =

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 22 # 22
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Equation(104-5)" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Equation(104-5)" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 29 # 51
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

RCableInitial

SuggestedRemedy

RCable_initial (align with Equation 104-5)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 37 # 83
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

0.1W

SuggestedRemedy

0.1 W (add space)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 38 # 84
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

", field" may not be in subscript

SuggestedRemedy

Write ", field" as normal text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Master comment #84. Consider with #282.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 39 # 86
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Comma after P(subscript)PD_req may not be subscript.

SuggestedRemedy

Write comma as normal text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 39 # 85
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

P(subscript)PD_Assign

SuggestedRemedy

P(subscript)PD_assign (align with Equation 145-6)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 43 # 87
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

A space after "P(subscript)PD_req," is missing and the bracket after I(subscript)PI(max)² is too much (I² * R results in power).

SuggestedRemedy

Please add space and remove wrong bracket.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 99 L 53 # 88
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 104-10

SuggestedRemedy

Table 104-11 (the POWER_ASSIGN register table needs to be referenced)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Table 104-10"

with, "Table 104-11"

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.6 P 102 L 8 # 23
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

104.7.2.6 seems to be about the "VOLT_POWER_INFO" register

SuggestedRemedy

Change the title of Table 104-10 from "CLASS_POWER_INFO Register Table" to "VOLT_POWER_INFO Register Table"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.7 P 102 L 25 # 78
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 PD assigned power [POWER_ASSIGN].
 SuggestedRemedy
 PD assigned power [POWER_ASSIGN] (remove dot at the end of the head line)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.2 P 116 L 16 # 91
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 tx_mode = SEND_N * TX_EN * !TX_ER
 SuggestedRemedy
 tx_mode = SEND_N * !TX_EN * !TX_ER (TX_EN needs to be negated as in Draft D2.1 the condition was TX_EN = FALSE)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.2.5 P 124 L 13 # 113
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In table 146-1, column Sdn[3:0] bit patterns (0100, 1000, 1001, and 1100) contain spaces.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please remove spaces.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 130 L 38 # 226
 Kim, Yong NIO
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 ".control SM.training". I presume SM stands for state machine. Preferred phrase is "state diagram".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please do careful global search and replace all appropriate SM with "state diagram"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.4.2 P 130 L 51 # 162
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EZ] Missing punctuation
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a period after FALSE.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.5 P 131 L 37 # 92
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 . should be matched , e.g., the .
 SuggestedRemedy
 . should be matched, e.g., the . (remove space before comma)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.3.5 P 131 L 37 # 163
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Extra space before comma

SuggestedRemedy

Remove space in "matched ,"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accomplished by comment 92, resolution to comment 92 is:

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

. should be matched, e.g., the . (remove space before comma)

CI 146 SC 146.4 P 132 L 28 # 39
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"rx_lpi_active" text is a remaining part from before redrawing some lines within the diagram and needs to be removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove text "rx_lpi_active" in line 28 of Figure 146-11.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.2 P 136 L 15 # 166
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Extra punctuation

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the second period after detected.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.3 P 142 L 21 # 52
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
transmitter

SuggestedRemedy

transmitter (add a "t")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.6 P 145 L 28 # 53
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
. should be matched , e.g., the .

SuggestedRemedy

. should be matched, e.g., the . (remove space before comma).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.6 P 145 L 29 # 171
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Extra space before comma

SuggestedRemedy

Remove space in "matched ,"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented by comment 63, Resolution to comment 63 is:

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

. should be matched, e.g., the . (remove space before comma).

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 146 **SC 146.8.3** **P 155** **L 23** # **172**
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
[EZ] Font is too small

SuggestedRemedy
Increase size of the font for "where f is the frequency in MHz." to match the font size for normal tex in the document.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.3** **P 159** **L 18** # **56**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Fast Startup Feature is no more present in 146.4.4.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove Fast Startup from PICS table.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.4.1.1** **P 159** **L 51** # **173**
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
[EZ] PCST8 refers to a subclause that is scheduled for removal.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "146.3.3.2.3" to "146.3.3.2.4"

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.4.2** **P 162** **L 47** # **60**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
Fast startup has been removed from 146.4.4.

SuggestedRemedy
Please remove PICS entry PMA6 and do a renumbering.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.4.2.1** **P 162** **L 45** # **59**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
See Figure 146-14

SuggestedRemedy
See Figure 146-14 and 146-15 (the PHY control state diagram has been split into two Figures).

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.4.2.2** **P 163** **L 43** # **63**
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
0.1 %

SuggestedRemedy
0.1% (remove space before "%" symbol).

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 146 **SC 146.11.4.2.2** **P 164** **L 9** # **175**
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **EZ**
[EZ] Droop specification does not match text.

SuggestedRemedy
Change to 10% to match text.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 9 # 64
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Less than 20%

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 10% (due to a different measurement position in the middle of the droop test pulse, the droop has been reduced from 20% to 10% in 146.5.4.2, therefore the PICS also needs to be changed to 10%)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accommodated by 175. Resolution to 175 was:
PROPOSED ACCEPT
Change to 10% to match text.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 11 # 176
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Plus/minus symbol was removed from text.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove plus/minus symbol.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 11 # 65
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Less than +/- 10 ns symbol-to-symbol jitter when measured on test mode 1

SuggestedRemedy

Less than 10 ns symbol-to-symbol jitter when measured on test mode 1 (remove +/- as this has also been removed in 146.5.4.3).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accommodated by 176. Resolution to 176 was:
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Remove plus/minus symbol.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 14 # 177
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Transmit amplitudes do not match text.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "8.8 +/- 1.0 dBm" to "8.6 +/- 1.2 dBm" and change "1.2 +/- 1.0 dBm" to "1.0 +/- 1.2 dBm"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 14 # 66
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
8.8 ± 1.0 dBm for the 2.4 Vpp transmit amplitude, and 1.2 ± 1.0 dBm for the 1.0 Vpp transmit amplitude, when measured into a 100 Ω load using the test fixture shown in Figure 146-18

SuggestedRemedy

8.6 ± 1.2 dBm for the 2.4 Vpp transmit amplitude, and 1.0 ± 1.2 dBm for the 1.0 Vpp transmit amplitude, when measured into a 100 Ω load using the test fixture shown in Figure 146-18 (adapt the values in the PICS to the value in 146.5.4.4)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accommodated by 177:
Change "8.8 +/- 1.0 dBm" to "8.6 +/- 1.2 dBm" and change "1.2 +/- 1.0 dBm" to "1.0 +/- 1.2 dBm"

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 164 L 47 # 67
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
., or in MDIO register 1.2294.13, defined in is set to one

SuggestedRemedy

., or in MDIO register 1.2294.0, defined in 45.2.1.186a.6 is set to one (change register bit from 13 to 0 and add reference to Clause 45)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.5 P 166 L 6 # 57
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 ES2 is no more optional. Should be removed and integrated in ES1.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete ES2 entry and modify ES1 entry Feature column to: Conform to IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1, or IEC 61010-1. Remove Value/Comment Column Entry.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC Figure 146-11 P 132 L 2 # 164
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Link_control and link_status should go to the Technology Dependent Interface, not Management. This matches what is done in Clause 97.4.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the figure to add the Technology Dependent Interface.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC Figure 146-11 P 132 L 28 # 165
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The rx_lpi_active label on line 28 is floating out in space. It can probably be removed because another label exists on line 13.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove floating rx_lpi_active label on line 28.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Accomodated by 39.
 Resolution to 39 was:
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Remove text "rx_lpi_active" in line 28 of Figure 146-11.

CI 147 SC 147.1 P 167 L 13 # 68
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 . can operate a half-duplex PHY .

SuggestedRemedy

. can operate as a half-duplex PHY . (add "as")

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.2.2 P 170 L 25 # 182
 Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [EZ] Change "the Auto-Negotiation" to "Auto-Negotiation" or "the Auto-Negotiation function"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "the Auto-Negotiation" to "Auto-Negotiation" or "the Auto-Negotiation function"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "the Auto-Negotiation" to "Auto-Negotiation"

CI 147 SC 147.2.2.2 P 170 L 36 # 69
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 When generation

SuggestedRemedy

When generated

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change the title of sub-clause 147.2.2. from "When generation" to "When generated"
 Note: also resolves #183

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.1 P 171 L 41 # 184
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Change "PCS reset" to "PCS Reset"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "PCS reset" to "PCS Reset"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.1 P 171 L 43 # 70
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
pcs_reset =OFF

SuggestedRemedy
pcs_reset = OFF (add space before OFF)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
There are 2 places to carry out this change:
- 171/43 (EOL)
- 171/48-49 (over line-break)

CI 147 SC 147.3.1 P 171 L 43 # 185
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Change "pcs_reset =OFF" to "pcs_reset = OFF"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "pcs_reset =OFF" to "pcs_reset = OFF"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.4 P 178 L 23 # 239
Kim, Yong NIO

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
txcnt is not used anywhere. At least Acrobat search function could not find it. Forward or backward. If not used, delete.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete or find the error and fix it.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete the content of "147.3.2.4 Counters" and replace it with the editor's note found under "147.5.4.5 Transmit clock frequency" that states the following:
====
Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication):
This clause has been deleted, and will be removed with renumbering at draft 3.0.
=====

CI 147 SC 147.3.5 P 183 L 25 # 188
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Change "in presence of" to "in the presence of"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "in presence of" to "in the presence of"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.6 P 183 L 31 # 189
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Change "MAC asserting" to "MAC by asserting"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "MAC asserting" to "MAC by asserting"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.1 P 186 L 1 # 299
 Jones, Peter Cisco Systems
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing clause header for state machines
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add clause "147.3.8.1.2 State diagrams"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add sub-clause header "147.3.8.1.3 State diagrams", after end of sub-clause "147.3.8.1.2 Timer" to page 185/24, and anchor Figure 147-10 there.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.1.1 P 184 L 28 # 71
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 See 147.3.2.2
 SuggestedRemedy
 See 147.3.2.2. (add a dot to be aligned with the following definitions in the same Clause), see also page 187, line 36.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.1.1 P 184 L 35 # 72
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 1.2279.10
 SuggestedRemedy
 1.2297.10 (this is the 10BASE-T1S PMA control register)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.1 P 187 L 52 # 335
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Variable cnt_l does not count HB, but counts number of times that link_hold_timer expires without HB or received packet.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from: "Counter of HB"
 To: "Count of link_hold_timer expiration periods without HB or receive packet"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.1 P 187 L 53 # 339
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Variables cnt_l and cnt_h are constrained in value by ACTIVE_CNT and INACTIVE_CNT.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change cnt_l from: "Values: integer number between 0 and ACTIVE_CNT".
 Change cnt_h from: "Values: integer number between 0 and INACTIVE_CNT".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.1 P 188 L 2 # 333
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Variable cnt_h increments with both HB and receive packets.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from: "Counter of HB"
 To: "Counter of HBs and receive packets"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.2 P 187 L 8 # 340
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Variable cnt_l can never exceed INACTIVE_CNT. Variable cnt_h can never exceed ACTIVE_CNT.

SuggestedRemedy

Change exit condition of COUNT_UP and COUNT_DOWN to be equal and not greater than or equal.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.2 P 188 L 17 # 334
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Variable ACTIVE_CNT sets threshold for both HB and receive packets.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from: "Number of HB"
To: "Number of combined HBs and receive packets"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.2 P 188 L 20 # 338
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Both ACTIVE_CNT and INACTIVE_CNT show a value that should have both a limit and a default.

SuggestedRemedy

Change both ACTIVE_CNT and INACTIVE_CNT show: "Value: integer number between 0 and 7." and add "Default value: 2" for ACTIVE_CNT and "Default value: 5" for INACTIVE_CNT".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.2 P 188 L 22 # 336
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Variable INACTIVE_CNT does set threshold for count of HBs, but sets threshold for number of times that link_hold_timer expires without HB or received packet.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from: "Number of HB"
To: "Number of link_hold_timer expirations without HB or receive packets"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.3 P 188 L 28 # 337
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Description of Link_hold_timer is inaccurate compared to state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from: "Time after which the count of HB is updated."
To: "Timer used to check inactivity."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.3 P 188 L 33 # 248
Kim, Yong NIO

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

"In compliance to 148.4.4.2.1, when PLCA RS operations are supported and enabled, the PHY shall notify the RS of a received BEACON indication by the means of MII interface as specified in 22.2.2.8." This could be read that 10BASE-T1S PHY support of PLCA related signals are NOT optional. If this is the intent, PLEASE explicitly state it (probably somewhere near 147.1) If not, then adjust the text to reflect optional nature of PLCA RS support.

SuggestedRemedy

Please consider and do one of the two choices.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "when PLCA RS operations are supported and enabled" to "when optional PLCA operations are supported and enabled"

Note: same resolution applies to #249 as well

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.4 P 188 L 42 # 249
Kim, Yong NIO

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

"In compliance to 148.4.4.2.2, when PLCA RS operations are supported and enabled, the PHY shall notify the RS of a received COMMIT indication by the means of MII interface as specified in 22.2.2.8." This could be read that 10BASE-T1S PHY support of PLCA related signals are NOT optional. If this is the intent, PLEASE explicitly state it (probably somewhere near 147.1) If not, then adjust the text to reflect optional nature of PLCA RS support.

SuggestedRemedy

Please consider and do one of the two choices. Could be considered together with my comment to 147.3.8.3

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "when PLCA RS operations are supported and enabled" to "when optional PLCA operations are supported and enabled"
Note: same resolution applies to #248 as well

CI 147 SC 147.4.4.1 P 191 L 13 # 303
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Entry conditions to LINK_UP should have link_control TRUE, otherwise "all PCS functions are switched off and no data can be sent or received".

SuggestedRemedy

Change entry conditions to pma_reset + link_control

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accommodated by comments #139.
Proposed resolution of #139 is:
>>>>
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Swap the labels of the two states.
<<<<

CI 147 SC 147.4.4.1 P 191 L 18 # 304
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

Entry conditions to LINK_DOWN should have pcs_status FALSE or loc_rev_status FALSE

SuggestedRemedy

Change entry conditions to !pcs_status + !loc_rev_status

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accommodated by comments #139.
Proposed resolution of #139 is:
>>>>
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Swap the labels of the two states.
<<<<

CI 147 SC 147.5.3 P 193 L 3 # 140
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

[EZ] Extra unnecessary comma

SuggestedRemedy

Remove comma after "Figure 147-15"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.5.4.3 P 194 L 28 # 123
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech Srl

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"maximum jitter at the transmitter side shall be less than 5 ns symbol-to-symbol jitter", the last "jitter" seems to be a needless repetition.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the last "jitter" word in the sentence before the full stop.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.10.2 P 250 L 39 # 311
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
Add other applications

SuggestedRemedy

change "In industrial applications, all 10BASE-T1S cabling is expected to be routed" to "in other applications, all 10BASE-T1S cabling is expected to be routed"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: The sentence in question is wrongly attributed to page 250, while it is in page 202.

Change "In industrial applications, all 10BASE-T1S cabling is expected" at 202/37-38 to "In other applications, all 10BASE-T1S cabling is expected"

CI 147 SC 147.12.4.6.2 P 210 L 15 # 147
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] Remove +/- symbol in the 5 ns jitter specification to match text.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove +/- symbol to match text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC Figure 147-12 P 189 L 2 # 137
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
[EZ] The arrow out of PMA Transmit is going the wrong direction.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the arrow to the right of PMA TRANSMIT so that is points towards BI_DA.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove arrow from the line that enters PMA TRANSMIT block from the right, but keep the bidirectional arrow on final segment (near BI_DA).

CI 147 SC Figure 147-14 P 191 L 12 # 139
Griffiths, Scott Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
The labels "LINK_UP" and "LINK_DOWN" appear to be reversed.

SuggestedRemedy

Swap the labels of the two states.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 221 L 24 # 348
Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Equations for the two exit conditions from state COMMIT are not separated and not clearly matched to exit arrows.

SuggestedRemedy

Separate "TX_EN" (left arrow) and "!TX_EN * !packetPending" (right arrow).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.4 P 228 L 53 # 310
Jones, Peter Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Incorrect state name

SuggestedRemedy

change "WAIT_MAC_STATE" to "WAIT_MAC"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "WAIT_MAC_STATE" to "WAIT_MAC state"

That was a typo.