

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 00 SC P 14 L 3 # 63
Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Page number in the Table of Contents are off by one page. The page numbers listed are one greater than they should be. This issue follows throughout the table.

For example, Section 1 "Introduction" is listed in the Table of Contents as being on page 28, but the text actually is on page 27.

SuggestedRemedy

Plesae fix the Table of Contents so entries refer to the correct page number.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 27 L 52 # 34
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Explosive atmospheres - Part 0

SuggestedRemedy

Explosive atmospheres - (using an em dash) Part 0

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 27 L 52 # 17
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In "Explosive atmospheres - Part 0: Equipment - General requirements" the two instances of " - " should be em-dashes without any spaces as per the five references above this.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the two instances of " - " to em-dashes without any spaces as per the five references above this.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.4.389a P 29 L 24 # 19
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

After 1.4.494a on line 24 there is a spurious "1.4.389a"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the spurious text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete "1.4.389a" on page 29, line 25.

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.5 P 31 L 49 # 2
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

At the end of the second paragraph of 22.2.2.5, the base standard has:
". a PHY is operating at 10 Mb/s, or when TX_EN is deasserted."
The first part of this text is retained on lines 48 and 49 of the draft, but ", or when TX_EN is deasserted." in strikethrough font should be shown where this text is no longer present.

SuggestedRemedy

Add ", or when TX_EN is deasserted." in strikethrough font after ". a PHY is operating at 10 Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.2.2.1 P 34 L 9 # 3
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction is "Insert oPLCA after the description of oPD as follows:"
but the IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 amendment has deleted "oPD" in this subclause.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to "Insert oPLCA after the description of oPAF as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Insert oPLCA after the description of oPD as follows:"

with, "Insert oPLCA in 30.2.2.1 (as amended by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) after the description of oPAF as follows:"

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.3 P 39 L 12 # 35
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The default value is 255;
 SuggestedRemedy
 The default value is 255.; (add a dot)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.3 P 39 L 12 # 4
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "." missing at the end of the subclause (before the ";")
 Same issue in 30.3.9.2.4
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "The default value is 255;" to "The default value is 255.;"
 at the end of 30.3.9.2.4, change "(inclusive).;" to "(inclusive).;"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.4 P 39 L 22 # 36
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 . (inclusive);
 SuggestedRemedy
 . (inclusive).; (add a dot)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.5 P 39 L 32 # 5
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 This text contains two instances of "aPLCATransmitOpportunity" but this is not defined.
 Should be "aPLCATransmitOpportunityTimer"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change two instances of "aPLCATransmitOpportunity" to
 "aPLCATransmitOpportunityTimer".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68f P 58 L 9 # 38
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Table 45-150f
 SuggestedRemedy
 Table 45-237f
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68f P 58 L 9 # 6
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Cross-reference to "Table 45-150f" should be a cross-reference to "Table 45-237f"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change cross-reference to be to "Table 45-237f"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 45 SC 45.2.7 P 58 L 39 # 20
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
If text is inserted I don't think it should be underlined
SuggestedRemedy
Remove underling for rows 7.526 and 7.527 in Table 45-309
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2.7 P 63 L 25 # 7
Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"Change the 42.2.9.2.7 as follows:" should be "Change 45.2.9.2.7 as follows:"
(delete "the" and change 42 to 45)
SuggestedRemedy
Change the editing instruction to "Change 45.2.9.2.7 as follows:"
(delete "the" and change 42 to 45)
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2.7 P 63 L 25 # 21
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"Change the 42.2.9.2.7 as follows:"
SuggestedRemedy
"Change the 42.2.9.2.7 as follows:"
should be:
"Change 45.2.9.2.7 as follows"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
P63, L25: Replace, "Change the 42.2.9.2.7" with, "Change 45.2.9.2.7"
P44, L22: Replace, "Change the text of 45.1.185.2" with, "Change 45.1.185.2"
P97, L25: Replace, "Change the text in 104.7" with, "Change 104.7"

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2.7 P 63 L 27 # 8
Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"104.4.1" should be a cross-reference
SuggestedRemedy
Make "104.4.1" a cross-reference
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.13.4 P 67 L 3 # 39
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Table 45-351f and Table 45-351e on page 67 and references to these tables are not in
alphabetic order.
SuggestedRemedy
Please exchange numbering of Tables 45-351e and 45-351f, so that Table 45-351e is
coming in the text before Table 45-351f. Also change the reference in line 3 to Table 45-
351e and the reference in line 34 to Table 45-351f.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 67, line 3: Replace, "Table 45-351f" with "Table 45-351e" and add "." to the end of
the sentence.

Page 67, line 6: Replace, "Table 45-351f" with "Table 45-351e"

Page 67, line 34: Replace, "Table 45-351e" with "Table 45-351f" and add "." to the end of
the sentence.

Page 67, line 37: Replace, "Table 45-351e" with "Table 45-351e"

CI 45 SC 45.2.13.4 P 67 L 6 # 88
Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Incorrect table title.
SuggestedRemedy
Replace "PLCA status register bit definitions" with "PLCA burst mode register bit
definitions"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 78 SC 78.2 P 76 L 33 # 9
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The IEEE Style manual has:
In numbers of four digits, the space is not necessary, unless four-digit numbers are grouped in a column with numbers of five digits or more.
In the addition to Table 78-2, the numbers "6000" and "6300" are in columns containing numbers with five digits, so should include the space.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "6000" to "6 000" and change "6300" to "6 300"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.5.5 P 83 L 40 # 41
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

tx_bit_cnt Û tx_bit_cnt + 1

SuggestedRemedy

tx_bit_cnt <= tx_bit_cnt + 1 (replace Û by <=)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.5 P 95 L 38 # 10
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table 104-11" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Table 104-11" a cross-reference.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.3 P 101 L 44 # 42
Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

PSEs that that suport .

SuggestedRemedy

PSEs that support . (remove double "that")

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 102 L 26 # 11
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In Equation (104-5) "min" is a function not a variable, so should not be italic font.
Same issue for Equation (104-6)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Min" to "min" in upright font in both Equation (104-5) and Equation (104-6)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2 P 103 L 29 # 33
Bhagwat, Gitesh Analog Devices

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

A decision box in the flowchart says "VOLT_POWER_INPUT READ?" This command is Read VOLT_POWER_INFO

SuggestedRemedy

Change "VOLT_POWER_INPUT READ?" to "VOLT_POWER_INFO READ?"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.5 P 105 L 22 # 43
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 104.7.28
 SuggestedRemedy
 104.7.2.8 (dot is missing)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.2.6 P 105 L 22 # 12
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the editing instruction, "104.7.28" should be "104.7.2.8"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, change "104.7.28" to "104.7.2.8"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.9.2.2 P 107 L 23 # 13
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "IEEE Std 802.3bu-2016" should be "IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3bu-2016" to "IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.1 P 147 L 1 # 57
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Incorrect formatting of the NOTE
 SuggestedRemedy
 Format the NOTE on lines 1-3 using paragraph tag "NOTE"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.4.1 P 147 L 1 # 14
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOTE- In" should be "NOTE-In" (no space)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the space
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.5.3 P 149 L 51 # 45
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 After " magnitude of" there is an additional space, which needs to be removed.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please remove space at the end of the line.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.8.2.2 P 195 L 25 # 49
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 without HB or receive packets
 SuggestedRemedy
 without HBs or receive packets (add "s" after "HB")
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "HB or receive" to "HBs or receive" at 2 locations:
 - 194/52-53
 - 195/25-26

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

CI 147 SC 147.5.5.1 P 202 L 45 # 15
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE uses an en-dash as a minus sign. (2 instances)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "-" to an en-dash in 10-10 and 10-7 on lines 45 and 46.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.8 P 204 L 52 # 75
 Asmussen, Jes Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ
 The reference (1.4.332) in the 802.3 standard defines a payload pointer. This definition doesn't apply to mixing segment.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the reference to 1.4.277.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 231 L 51 # 53
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 . that aligns transmission with the transmit opportunity..
 SuggestedRemedy
 . that aligns a transmission with the transmit opportunity. (add "a" before transmission and remove second dot at the end of the sentence).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 231 L 52 # 72
 Baggett, Tim Microchip
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The equation "to_timer x plca_node_count + beacon_timer" is of mixed font size. to_timer is 10 pt.
 plca_node_count and beacon_timer are 9 pt.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please verify that correct sizing is being used.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P 246 L 46 # 89
 Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Misspelled caption in Figure 148-5
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "PLCS" to "PLCA"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.7.4 P 237 L 15 # 54
 Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 wide spaces due to justify alignment.
 SuggestedRemedy
 If possible from editorial style, put a part of the formula in line 16 already in line 15 to make the text better readable.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

gement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.4 P 237 L 16 # 16
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The space in "130 090" should be changed to a non-breaking space (Ctrl space) as this will force it to be just one space wide.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the space in "130 090" to a non-breaking space (Ctrl space).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.5.4.6 P 241 L 1 # 92
Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing space in clause title

SuggestedRemedy

Change "PLCAStatus" to "PLCA Status"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.