

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 239 L 29 # r01-1

Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech S.r.l.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Wrong symbol for "not equal" operator.

SuggestedRemedy

Where the text says "local_nodeID != 0" change the "!=" expression with a "not equal" sign. Do the same at line 31 on the same page.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.2.8 P 197 L 43 # r01-2

Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech S.r.l.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The standalone "n" in the sentence "The bits stored in the shift register delay line at time n are denoted" could be more readable if put in evidence.

SuggestedRemedy

Surround the standalone 'n' in the aforementioned sentence with apexes, as shown here. Do the same in 147.3.3.7 on page 201 line 31.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

CRG disagrees with the commenter.

Existing text is clear and consistent with style.

Changing these 2 locations would make other, similar, constructs (e.g. "with i ranging from 0 to 3") inconsistent.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # r01-8

Berger, Catherine

Comment Type G Comment Status D EZ

This draft meets all editorial requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 245 L 13 # r01-10

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Data state diagram" is not a proper noun.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Data State Diagram" with "Data state diagram" in two locations in this paragraph (lines 13 and 14)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 244 L 27 # r01-11

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Data state diagram" is not a proper noun.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Data State Diagram" with "Data state diagram" in the clause header

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.3.1.2 P 236 L 9 # r01-12

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"PLCA DATA state diagram" and "PLCA Data state diagram" are used interchangeably throughout the document.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "PLCA DATA state" with "PLCA Data state" in the following locations: P236-L9, P236-L17, P236-L31, P236-L42, P236-L52, P242-L24, P243-L1, P243-L5, P246-L54, P247-L54, P253-L27, and P253-L34.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 146 SC 146.11.4.3 P 183 L 3 # r01-14

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There are two rows for identified as item M11

SuggestedRemedy

Correct PICS numbering for row entries in the 146.11.4.3 Management interface clause

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P 11 L 30 # r01-15

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Yellow highlighting is unnecessary

SuggestedRemedy

Remove yellow highlighting from "xx"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P 12 L 52 # r01-16

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

A number of cross-references to the first level heading of Clause 146 now seem to point to the newly inserted editing instruction at the top of page 114. This means that they now say "Clause " rather than "Clause 146". The best way to fix this issue is to delete the T shaped cross-reference marker associated with the editing instruction. This will cause all of the incorrect cross references to become unresolved. Then doing an "Update Book" will identify all of the unresolved cross-references, which can then be replaced with a cross-reference to the Clause 146 first level heading.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix all of the cross-references that point to the editing instruction at the top of page 114.

This is at least :

Page 12, line 52

Page 32, line 9

Page 39, line 48

Page 40, line 6

Page 76, line 15 (cell is now empty)

Page 101, line 10

Page 175, line 2, line 7, line 36

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.3 P 29 L 24 # r01-17

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The references to IEC standards in 1.3 of the base standard do not include the Edition number, just the year.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEC 63171-1 Ed.1:201x," to "IEC 63171-1:201x,"

Change "IEC 63171-6 Ed.1:201x," to "IEC 63171-6:201x,"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

CI 01 SC 1.4.198 P 30 L 25 # r01-18

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"96.3" is an external cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag "External" to make it forest green.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.4.319 P 30 L 29 # r01-19

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Definition 1.4.319 has been renumbered to 1.4.318 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to "Change 1.4.318 (re-numbered from 1.4.319 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:"
Renumber the definition accordingly.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.4.456 P 30 L 47 # r01-20

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Definition 1.4.456 has been renumbered to 1.4.455 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to "Change 1.4.455 (re-numbered from 1.4.456 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:"
Renumber the definition accordingly.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 01 SC 1.4.471 P 31 L 4 # r01-21

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Definition 1.4.471 has been renumbered to 1.4.470 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to "Change 1.4.470 (re-numbered from 1.4.471 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:"
Renumber the definition accordingly.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.2.2.1 P 37 L 10 # r01-22

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The web page http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#list contains instructions:
The editing instructions list only amendment(s) that have edited the specific part (e.g. paragraph) of the subclause being changed. Based on this: ... [2] For Change, the only other amendments included in the editing instruction are those that include the base text that follows.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to "Change the entry for oPHYEntity in 30.2.2.1 as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.2.3 P 38 L 18 # r01-23

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

In Figure 30-3, the line from the "oOAM" box to the "oMACEntity" box in Figure 30-3 has a single arrowhead (Denotes one-to-one relationship) in the base standard, but has a double arrowhead (Denotes one-to-many relationship) in this draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the line to have a single arrowhead as per the base standard.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

Cl 30 SC 30.2.3 P 38 L 44 # r01-24

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In Figure 30-3, in the "oResourceTypeID" box there is a dashed box around "Present if MII"

SuggestedRemedy

Restore the dashed box

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.5 P 39 L 6 # r01-25

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table 30-11" should be a cross-reference and should be underlined

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Table 30-11" a cross-reference and underline it

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.1.6 P 41 L 43 # r01-26

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Clause 45" and "45.2.9.2.8" should be cross-references

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Clause 45" and "45.2.9.2.8" cross-references

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.16 P 42 L 1 # r01-27

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction, space missing in "30.15(and"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "30.15 (and"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.68e P 60 L 32 # r01-28

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the title of 45.2.3.68e, "(Register 1 3.2293)" contains a spurious "1"

SuggestedRemedy

In the title of 45.2.3.68e, change "(Register 1 3.2293)" to "(Register 3.2293)"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9 P 65 L 8 # r01-29

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Table 45-331 should be Table 45-338 as per the editing instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Re-number Table 45-331 to be Table 45-338

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.3 P 67 L 3 # r01-32

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction, "Bits 10:9" should be "Bits 13.2.10:9"

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change "Bits 10:9" to "Bits 13.2.10:9"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.3.1a P 67 L 31 # r01-33

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction, space missing in "45.2.9.3.1as"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "45.2.9.3.1 as"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.3.1a P 67 L 33 # r01-34

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

In the heading for 45.2.9.3.1a, "(13.2.4:3)" should be "(13.2.10:9)"

SuggestedRemedy

In the heading for 45.2.9.3.1a, change "(13.2.4:3)" to "(13.2.10:9)"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.5 P 68 L 39 # r01-38

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In Table 45-341b:

"13.3.15:12" should be "13.4.15:12"

"13.3.11:0" should be "13.4.11:0"

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 45-341b:

Change "13.3.15:12" to "13.4.15:12"

Change "13.3.11:0" to "13.4.11:0"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.3 P 69 L 8 # r01-39

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction, "through MM203" should be "through MM204"

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change "through MM203" to "through MM204"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This comment is accomodated by comment #r01-160.

The resolution to comment #r01-160 is:

Delete PICS item MM177, renumber PICS entries, and do not change Editing Instruction on page 69, line 8.

CI 98 SC 98.5.2 P 79 L 41 # r01-41

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Changes have been made to the text of the first sentence of "break_link_timer" that are not shown with underline and strikethrough in the clean version.

The text in the base standard is:

"Timer for the amount of time to wait in order to assure that the link partner enters a Link Fail state."

SuggestedRemedy

Show the added text in underline font and the deleted text in strikethrough font.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 98 SC 98.6.4 P 90 L 3 # r01-42

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction says "and insert one new row immediately below each changed row in the table in 98.6.4" but there is only one new row (DME9a).

SuggestedRemedy

Change "and insert one new row immediately below each changed row in the table in 98.6.4" to "and insert a row for DME9a immediately below the DME9 row in the table in 98.6.4"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.1.3 P 92 L 22 # r01-44

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction says "Change" the figure, but there are no changes indicated. This should be a "Replace" editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Change" to "Replace"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

CI 104 SC 104.5.1a P 98 L 30 # r01-45

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table 104-4a" should be a cross-reference
There is a double "." at the end of the sentence.

SuggestedRemedy
Make "Table 104-4a" a cross-reference
delete one "." at the end of the sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.7.1.5 P 106 L 54 # r01-46

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Table 104-1" should be an external cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy
Apply character tag "External" to "Table 104-1" to make it Forest green

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.3.3.5.1 P 136 L 38 # r01-47

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Space missing in "2or 3,"

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "2 or 3,"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.5.1 P 161 L 18 # r01-48

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"1x10-6" should be just "10-6" as per "10-9" above.
The minus sign should be an en-dash

SuggestedRemedy
Delete "1x"
make the minus sign an en-dash

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.3 P 176 L 8 # r01-49

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"EEE" should be "**EEE" as it appears in the Status column in 146.11.4.2.1

SuggestedRemedy
Change "EEE" to "**EEE"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.3.3.9 P 202 L 11 # r01-50

Anslo, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"3.2293" is not an external cross-reference, so should not be Forest green.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove the character tag "External" so that this text reverts to black
(highlight the text and in the character catalogue pod, click on Default font)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

CI 147 SC 147.11 P 223 L 35 # r01-51

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

As stated in 1.2.6:

"Unless otherwise stated, numerical limits in this standard are to be taken as exact, with the number of significant digits and trailing zeros having no significance."

SuggestedRemedy

In the row for "MDI input to COL asserted" change "5.0" to "5"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.2 P 233 L 45 # r01-52

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Clause 148" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Clause 148" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.2 P 248 L 16 # r01-53

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"22.2.1.6" should be in Forest green and "22.2.2.5" should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag External to "22.2.1.6" and make "22.2.2.5" a cross-reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.3 P 183 L 9 # r01-76

Graber, Steffen

Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There are two MI1 entries, needs a renumbering.

SuggestedRemedy

Renumber PICS in 146.11.4.3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accommodated by comment r01-14 (same comment, same remedy)

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.3 P 152 L 20 # r01-84

McCarthy, Mick

Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

An assignment to loc_lpi_sync_timer_en in the LPI SYNC CLR state does not use the correct assignment character.

SuggestedRemedy

Use the correct left arrow assignment character for this assignment (as per 1.2.1).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.3 P 153 L 1 # r01-85

McCarthy, Mick

Analog Devices Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Figure 146-17 - PHY Control state diagram (part c) pertains to the optional EEE capability. Therefore, it should be contained within a dashed box.

SuggestedRemedy

Enclose Figure 146-17 within a dashed box.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Enclose the functionality in Figure 146-17 within a dashed box. Editorial license to collapse Figures 146-16 and 146-17 into a single figure, if it helps clarity, as these are both EEE functions in the PHY control diagram.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 00 SC 0 P 12 L 52 # r01-95
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Clause number missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "adds Clause through Clause 148" with "adds Clause 146 through Clause 148"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.3 P 38 L 44 # r01-101
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The term "Present if MII" is encapsulated in a dashed line box in 802.3-2018 but is not in this draft
 SuggestedRemedy
 Enclose "Present if MII" in a dashed-line box as in 802.3-2018 Figure 30-3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Accomodated by #r01-24. The resolution to #r01-24 is:
 Restore the dashed box

Cl 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P 39 L 47 # r01-102
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Clause number missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Clause 10Mb/s" with "Clause 146 10 Mb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.2.1.3 P 40 L 6 # r01-103
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Clause number missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Clause 10Mb/s" with "Clause 146 10 Mb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.1.1 P 237 L 41 # r01-131
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "in" is missing. Same is true in line 53 (148.4.4.1.2)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "defined this" with "defined in this"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.8 P 201 L 51 # r01-142
 Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The subclause "147.3.3.8 Timer" is not at proper place
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move the subclause "147.3.3.8 Timer" after 147.3.3.5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by r01-153, proposed resolution of which is as follows:
 >>>>
 Move section 147.3.3.8 to follow 147.3.3.5. (Rename it at 147.3.3.6 and renumber following sections)
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 <<<<

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 147 SC 147.3.7.1.1 P 204 L 17 # r01-143

Xu, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Minor edit

SuggestedRemedy

Change "... when an HB ..." to "... when a HB .."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.
CRG disagrees with the commenter.
The article "an" is used correctly before an acronym.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.8 P 201 L 51 # r01-153

Baggett, Tim Microchip Technology, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
The newly added section "147.3.3.8 Timers" is located in an odd place between the descrambler and jabber diagnostics sections.

SuggestedRemedy

Move section 147.3.3.8 to follow 147.3.3.5. (Rename it at 147.3.3.6 and renumber following sections)

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.4 P 68 L 22 # r01-159

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
"0.0249 W per LSb" is inconsistent with the specification in clause 104, and the proper abbreviation in 802.3-2018 is LSB

SuggestedRemedy

Change "0.0249 W per LSb" to "0.025 W per LSB" in Table 45-341a at P68 L22 and Table 45-341b at P68 L41.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.5.4.4 P 213 L 40 # r01-169

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
The language "shall be measured using ..." puts a requirement on the user. The language in the related PICS item PMAE15 is "when measured using test mode 3" - also, the reference to the equations as the requirements is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "The transmitter Power Spectral Density (PSD) shall be measured using test mode 3 in combination with the test fixture shown in Figure 147-16."
to "When measured using test mode 3 and the test fixture shown in Figure 147-16, or equivalent, the transmitter Power Spectral Density (PSD) shall be between the upper and lower masks specified in Equation (147-1) and Equation (147-2)."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.5.2 P 211 L 34 # r01-177

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
"The test modes described in this subclause shall be provided to allow testing of the transmitter waveform, transmitter distortion, transmitter jitter, and transmitter droop" is redundant to the enumerated list of test modes below, and also incorrectly includes transmitter distortion.

It is simpler and more correct to simply say they allow testing of the transmitter.

SuggestedRemedy

Change : "The test modes described in this subclause shall be provided to allow testing of the transmitter waveform, transmitter distortion, transmitter jitter, and transmitter droop"

to: "The test modes described in this subclause shall be provided to allow testing of the transmitter."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 147 SC 147.3.2.4 P 195 L 1 # r01-179 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

There seems to be a spurious space between 'TXCMD_' and 'ENCODE' in the function name.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'TXCMD_ ENCODE' to read 'TXCMD_ENCODE' to match the function call in the SILENT state of Figure 147-4 'PCS Transmit state diagram (part a)'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.2.5 P 195 L 12 # r01-180 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

There no other mention of 'symbol timer' in the draft, suggest that 'symbol timer' should be symb_timer, see timer definition immediately below.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'Alias for symbol timer done.' should be changed to read 'Alias for symb_timer_done.'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.2.7 P 196 L 9 # r01-181 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The variable hb_cmd is used as an input to the TXCMD_ENCODE function in the SILENT state in Figure 147-4 'PCS Transmit state diagram (part a)' but is not defined in subclause 147.3.2.2 'Variables'.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following addition to subclause 147.3.2.2 'Variables':

hb_cmd
See 147.3.7.1.1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.2.7 P 197 L 6 # r01-182 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The is no definition in subclause 147.3.2.2 'Variables' of the meaning of the subscript n in respect to TXDn passed to the ENCODE() function in the DATA state in Figure 147-5 'PCS Transmit state diagram (part b)'. Since TXD is defined in subclause 147.3.2.2, is only used in the DATA state in the PCS Transmit state diagram, and the timing is defined by the state diagram since entry into the DATA state is based on STD (symbol timer done) being true, suggest that TXDn be replaced by TXD.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the action 'tx_sym <= ENCODE(TXDn)' to read 'tx_sym <= ENCODE(TXD)'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.3.2 P 199 L 9 # r01-183 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Suggest that a cross reference be added to subclause 22.2.2.8 'RXD'.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text 'PCS decoded data synchronous to RX_CLK.' to read ' PCS decoded data synchronous to RX_CLK as specified in 22.2.2.8.'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.3.7.1.1 P 204 L 5 # r01-186 EZ

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The definition for the variable 'hb_cmd' includes the text '... or a higher priority request is in effect, as specified in 147.3.2.2.'. There is however no mention of 'hb_cmd' in subclause 147.3.2.2. Instead I think this cross-reference should be to subclause 147.3.2.4 'Functions' where the description of the TXCMD_ENCODE function which includes the text '... his function takes as its arguments the values of tx_cmd and hb_cmd variables and returns a 5B symbol ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text '... as specified in 147.3.2.2.' to read ' as specified in 147.3.2.4.'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 147 SC 147.3.7.2 P 206 L 2 # r01-191

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Unit symbols shouldn't be used to stand for the quantity being measured (see IEEE-SA Style Guide subclause 12.4).

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that '... within link_hold_timer ms for ...' should read '... within link_hold_timer time for ...'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 246 L 35 # r01-192

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Typo, TXER should read TX_ER.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that:

- [1] The action 'TXER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)' in the RECEIVE state should read 'TX_ER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)'.
- [2] The action 'TXER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)' in the PENDING state should read 'TX_ER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)'.
- [3] The action 'TXER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)' in the PENDING state should read 'TX_ER <= ENCODE_TXER(tx_cmd)'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.4 P 249 L 30 # r01-193

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Typo.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the spurious '. At the end of the 'Restart time' definition.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 22 SC 22.2.2.4 P L # r01-199

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-213 withdrawn in the comment database.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185 P L # r01-201

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-220 withdrawn in the comment database.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P L # r01-202

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-221 withdrawn in the comment database.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.68c P L # r01-203

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-225 withdrawn in the comment database.

CI 45 SC 45.5.3.3 P L # r01-204

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-231 withdrawn in the comment database.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.3 P L # r01-205

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-241 closed in the comment database.

CI 147 SC 147.1 P L # r01-206

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remedy accepted. This is no longer a DISAPPROVE comment

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-242 closed in the comment database.

CI 147 SC 147.3.7.2 P L # r01-207

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remedy accepted. This is no longer a DISAPPROVE comment

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-250 closed in the comment database.

CI 147 SC 147.4 P L # r01-208

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remedy accepted. This is no longer a DISAPPROVE comment

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-252 closed in the comment database.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pai

CI 147 SC 147.5.1 P L # r01-209

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remedy accepted. This is no longer a DISAPPROVE comment

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-252 closed in the comment database.

CI 30 SC 30.3.9.2.3 P L # r01-212

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status X EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-267 withdrawn in the comment database.

CI 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P L # r01-216

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remedy accepted. This is no longer a DISAPPROVE comment

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-276 closed in the comment database.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P L # r01-217

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Withdrawn

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to mark comment #-428 withdrawn in the comment database.