

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 01 SC 1.3 P 29 L 23 # r02-2

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The reference "ISO 4892:1982, Plastics--Methods of exposure to laboratory light" has been removed from the draft, but references to this document are still present in 146.9.2.1 and 147.10.2.1

SuggestedRemedy

Restore the entry for ISO 4892

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.1.1 P 38 L 40 # r02-3

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The headings in the draft:
30.3.1 MAC entity managed object class
30.3.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames

Should be:
30.3.1 MAC entity managed object class
30.3.1.1 MAC entity attributes
30.3.1.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames

SuggestedRemedy

Insert the level 4 heading: "30.3.1.1 MAC entity attributes"
Chane the heading for 30.3.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames to be level 5: 30.3.1.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(fixes typo in "Change")

Insert the level 4 heading: "30.3.1.1 MAC entity attributes"
Change the heading for 30.3.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames to be level 5: 30.3.1.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames

CI 30 SC 30.3.1.3 P 38 L 42 # r02-4

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The editing instruction should reference the subclause number rather than the title.
As noted in another comment this should be 30.3.1.1.3.
Also, refer to the "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to:
"Change the "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" section of 30.3.1.1.3 as shown:

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.1.3 P 38 L 49 # r02-5

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"5.2.4.2" is an external cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag External to "5.2.4.2"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.1.3 P 94 L 22 # r02-6

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"Replace 104-3" should be "Replace Figure 104-3"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Replace 104-3" to: "Replace Figure 104-3"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 97 L 16 # r02-7

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The title of Table 104-2 in the base standard is "PSE power_available matrix".
Consequently " matrix" should not be in underline font.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the underline from " matrix"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 97 L 25 # r02-8

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In Table 104-2a there are two occurrences of "Classes 0-9".
The IEEE style manual includes:
"Ranges should repeat the unit (e.g., 115 V to 125 V). Dashes should never be used
because they can be misconstrued as subtraction signs."

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 104-2a change "Classes 0-9" to "Classes 0 to 9" in two places

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.4.6 P 99 L 27 # r02-9

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the Additional information cell for Item 7 of Table 104-4, "104.4.6.4" is an external cross-reference.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag External to "104.4.6.4"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.1a P 100 L 34 # r02-10

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Repeated "Table" in "Table Table 104-4a"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the first "Table"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.5.5.1 P 163 L 18 # r02-11

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Comment r01-48 was ACCEPT with suggested remedy:
"Delete "1x"
make the minus sign an en-dash"
The second part has been done, but the first part has not.
The number should just be 10⁻⁶ as per 10⁻⁹ on the line above

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "1 x "

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 147 SC 147.5.5.1 P 216 L 51 # r02-12

Anslow, Peter

Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"7.8 x 10⁻⁷" has been changed to "1 x 10⁻⁷".
However, the number should just be 10⁻⁷ as per 10⁻¹⁰ on the line above

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "1 x "

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 241 L 14 # r02-13

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

This is an action. See Table 30-11

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "aPLCAReset" with "acPLCAReset" in two locations in line 14.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.4.4.3 P 153 L 24 # r02-17

Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs AG

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Arc from TRAINING state to SILENT state for condition "maxtraining_timer_done + (mintraining_timer_done * (!slave_clock_locked) * (config = SLAVE))" is missing (the condition is there, but the arc itself is missing). This is only editorial and no technical change, as this arc got accidentally missed from D3.1 to D3.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the required arc from TRAINING state to SILENT state for condition "maxtraining_timer_done + (mintraining_timer_done * (!slave_clock_locked) * (config = SLAVE))".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.2.2 P 181 L 43 # r02-18

Graber, Steffen Pepperl+Fuchs AG

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Output voltage tolerance in 146.5.4.1 has been changed in D3.2, needs to be reflected in PICS.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2.4 V +/- 5%" to "2.4 V + 5%/- 15%" and change "1.0 V +/- 5%" to "1.0 V + 5%/- 15%"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 30 SC 30.3.1 P 38 L 41 # r02-26

Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Incorrect reference to sub-clause number for "aSingleCollisionFrame" in 802.3-2018

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "30.3.1.3" with "30.3.1.1.3"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accomdated by r02-3

Response to r02-3 is:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

(fixes typo in "Change")

Insert the level 4 heading: "30.3.1.1 MAC entity attributes"

Change the heading for 30.3.1.3 aSingleCollisionFrames to be level 5: 30.3.1.1.3

aSingleCollisionFrames

CI 148 SC 148.1 P 234 L 9 # r02-30

Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

As per r01-127, agreement that the RS should be referenced as "Reconciliation Sublayer" (with capital letter)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "reconciliation sublayer" with "Reconciliation Sublayer"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 148 SC 148.4.5.2 P 241 L 14 # r02-31

Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Incorrect reference to managed object

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "aPLCAReset" with "acPLCAReset"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accomdated by comment r02-13.

Response to comment r02-13 is:

ACCEPT.

Suggested Remedy of r02-13 is:

Replace, "aPLCAReset" with "acPLCAReset" in two locations in line 14.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID r02-31

Page 3 of 5

8/8/2019 3:20:12 PM

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 148 SC 148 P 250 L 1 # r02-34

Beruto, Piergiorgio Canova Tech S.r.l.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The PLCA Data State Diagram should be put into a dedicated subclause, as for the state Diagram in the rest of the draft.

SuggestedRemedy

Place Figure 148-4 into its own subclause "State Diagrams" 148.4.6.7.
Do the same for Figure 148-3 on page 244.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 240 L 15 # r02-37

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Shouldn't RXlat be RX_{lat} based on delta RX_{lat} above?

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
On P240 L15 Change RXlat so that lat is in subscript.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.1 P 240 L 27 # r02-39

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Suggest that '... node owns now a transmit opportunity ...' should read '... node now owns a transmit opportunity ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "owns now" to "now owns" on P240 L27
Note that the comment is out of scope of the recirculation on text unchanged from the previous draft, but is a nonsubstantive editorial change which improves clarity.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.1 P 246 L 25 # r02-45

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

We don't normally use inverted commas around variable names, states or variable values in Clause 148. Suggest that the inverted commas be removed in the few instances where they are used.

SuggestedRemedy

Subclause 148.4.6.1, page 246, line 25
Suggest that '... the "committed" variable ...' be changed to read '... the committed variable ...'.

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 9
Suggest that '... enters "INACTIVE" state ...' be changed to read '... enters the INACTIVE state ...'.

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 10
Suggest that '... plca_status as "FAIL".' be changed to read '... plca_status as FAIL.'

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 12
Suggest that '... plca_status as "OK".' be changed to read '... plca_status as OK.'

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 14
Suggest that 'From "ACTIVE" state ...' be changed to read 'From the ACTIVE state ...'.

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 15
Suggest that '... enters "HYSTERESIS" state ...' be changed to read '... enters the HYSTERESIS state ...'.

Suggest that '... as "OK" and ...' be changed to read '... as OK and ...'.

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 17
Suggest that '... to "ACTIVE" state ...' be changed to read '... to the ACTIVE state ...'.

Subclause 148.4.7.1, page 252, line 19
Suggest that '... to "INACTIVE" state, reporting plca_status as "FAIL"' be changed to '... to the INACTIVE state, reporting plca_status as FAIL.' (note also the addition of this missing full stop to the end of this sentence).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

anagement Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.2 P 247 L 7 # r02-46

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The subclause title seems to have become detached from the subclause number, separated by an editor's note box.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the text 'PLCA Data variables' from before the editor's note box and change the '148.4.6.2' to read '148.4.6.2 Variables'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.3 P 248 L 16 # r02-47

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Missing cross reference.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'Otherwise it returns the value of the plca_txer variable, defined in .' to read 'Otherwise it returns the value of the plca_txer variable, defined in 148.4.6.2.'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.6.6 P 250 L 48 # r02-50

Law, David Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The arrow seems to have become detached from the connection to a state on another page labelled 'B'.

SuggestedRemedy

Reconnect the arrow with the connection labelled 'B'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.12.3 P 226 L 11 # r02-54

Brandt, David Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

None of the PICS are conditioned on the conditional PICS Item *PLCA.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the "147.12.3 Major capabilities/options" row for Item *PLCA.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.