

Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes: Meeting of the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single-Pair Ethernet Task Force

July 15-16, 2019
Vienna, Austria

Prepared by Jon Lewis, Dell EMC

The meeting of the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single Pair Ethernet Task Force convened at 1:02 PM, Monday, July 15, 2019 by George Zimmerman, P802.3cg Task Force chair.

Attendance for the meeting is listed in Appendix A

All presentations referenced in these minutes are located on the [July 2019 P802.3cg public website](#).

Administrative Matters

George Zimmerman displayed the agenda in [agenda 3cg_01b_0719.pdf](#).

The Task Force Chair asked the participants to introduce themselves, their employer and affiliations.

Motion #1: Move to approve the agenda as shown in [agenda 3cg_01b_0719.pdf](#).

M: Valerie Maguire S: Theo Brillhart

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

Motion #2: Move to approve minutes of IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single Pair Ethernet Task Force from May 2019 (r1) as posted.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Bernd Hormeyer

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

- Mr. Zimmerman noted that there should be no recording or photography permitted.
- Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting. None responded.

Chair reviewed the goals for the meeting, big ticket items, access to the reflector and website, and ground rules for the meeting.

Attendance, Mr. Zimmerman advised the group that the attendance tool should be used each day to record attendance. The physical attendance log was introduced and passed to the group.

IEEE Patent Policy, at **1:14 PM**, Mr. Zimmerman read aloud slides #1 and #2. Mr. Zimmerman then made the call for potentially essential patents at **1:15 PM**, none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then read aloud slides #3 and #4.

Mr. Zimmerman showed and summarized the slide entitled "Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings". Mr. Zimmerman asked if there was any discussion necessary, none responded.

Chair reviewed the IEEE 802.3 Standards process and where the Task Force was in the process and the process by which we will develop the standard.

LIAISONS

[Proposed liaison of draft to IEC SC31G, PT 60079-47](#)

The Chair noted that the Task Force would review the proposed letter later in the meeting.

Title: Ad Hoc Report ([jones 10spe 01 0719.pdf](#))
Presenter: Peter Jones, Cisco Systems

Title: Editor's Opening Report: P802.3cg Draft D3.1 ([maguire 3cg 01 0719.pdf](#))
Presenter: Valerie Maguire, Siemon; P802.3cg chief editor

The Editor reviewed the last draft balloting status, outlined the comments by topic, and reminded participants that the comments had been posted by topic on the website.

Motion #3: Move to consider 6 comments (r01-228, r01-229, r01-230, r01-231, r01-232, and r01-233) submitted after the P802.3cg draft 3.1 SA ballot deadline and not included with Editor's proposed resolutions

M: Valerie Maguire S:
(Technical >= 75%)

Motion Passes by voice without objection

During Motion #3 the Chair asked Jon Lewis to run the meeting.

The Chief Editor reviewed the distribution of the submitted comments and asked if there were any comments where the commenter would like to withdraw the comment, none responded.

Motion #4: Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d3p1 comments marked with the Topic “EZ” and posted as, [“EZ Bucket” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by Comment ID](#), excluding comments r01-2 and r01-143.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Stefan Graber
(Technical >= 75%)

Motion Passes by voice without objection

Motion #5: Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d3p1 comments marked with the Topic “Editorial” and posted as, [“Editorial” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by Comment ID](#), excluding comments r01-37, r01-96, r01-97, r01-119, r01-130, r01-132, r01-133, r01-134, r01-135, r01-136, r01-137, r01-139, r01-140, r01-146, and r01-197.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Piergiorgio Beruto
(Technical >= 75%)

Motion Passes by voice without objection

At this time, the editor’s report was concluded.

COMMENT RESOLUTION

Decisions during comment resolution were made by consensus, except where noted that motions were taken. For details on comment resolution see the posted comment database.

Presentations related to comment resolution are listed as they were presented. Details on the outcome of these presentations are contained in the comment database.

The group took a short break at 3:06 PM.

The group resumed at 3:42 PM.

Comment resolution continued.

Title: False carrier indication in 10BASE-T1S ([beruto 3cg false carrier 1p2.pdf](#))

Presenter: Piergiorgio, Canova Tech

Straw Poll #1:

I support:

- A. Making False Carrier Indication for 10BASE-T1S Optional as in [Beruto 3cg false carrier 1p2.pdf](#)
- B. Deleting False Carrier Indications in draft 3.2 of 802.3cg clause 147.
- C. No change

A: 23

B: 2

C: 0

No Opinion: 12

The group recessed for the day at 6:06 PM.

The Chair called the meeting to order at 8:07 AM, Tuesday 16 July.

The Chair brought the meeting to order and noted that introductions would be done just prior to the break.

The Chair reminded the group to sign into IMAT and the attendance sheet.

- Mr. Zimmerman noted that there should be no recording or photography permitted.
- Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting. None responded.

Chair reviewed the goals for the meeting, big ticket items, access to the reflector and website, and ground rules for the meeting.

IEEE Patent Policy, at 8:14 AM, Mr. Zimmerman read aloud slides #1 and #2 and made the call for potentially essential patents at **8:16 AM**, none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then displayed slides #3 and #4.

Mr. Zimmerman showed and then showed the slide entitled "Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings". Mr. Zimmerman asked if there was any discussion necessary, none responded.

Chair reviewed the IEEE 802.3 Standards process and where the Task Force was in the process and the process by which we will develop the standard.

Title: 10BASE-T1L PHY State Diagram Changes ([Graber 3cg 02 0719.pdf](#))
Presenter: Stefan Graber, Pepperl+Fuchs

The Chair demonstrated the IMAT tool for the Task Force.

Comment resolution continued

The group broke for a short break at 10:23 AM.

The group resumed at 10:50

Comment resolution continued

Straw Poll #2:

I support the 802.3cg Task Force asking the 802.3 Working Group Chair to consider making the proposed change in comment i-207 on an administrative basis in the next revision of IEEE Std 802.3, and make no change to the draft of P802.3cg.

Y: 30 N: 1 A: 10

Straw Poll #3:

- A. We work on the connector description as it is in the document and correct it and finalize it.
- B. We remove reference to any specific connector type from the document.

(pick one)

A: 9 B: 24

Straw Poll #4 (Chicago Rules):

I support the following proposed resolution for comments #55/88/89

- AIP #55/88/89: Resolution 1 in bains_3cg_01c_0719, remove both IEC 63171-1 and IEC 63171-6 from the draft.
 - Y: 21
- AIP #55/88/89: Resolution 2 in bains_3cg_01c_0719, retain IEC 63171-1 and remove IEC 63171-6 from the draft.
 - Y: 12
- Reject #55/88/89: No consensus for change.
 - Y: 8

Straw Poll #5:

(pick one)

AIP #55/88/89: Remove both IEC 63171-1 and IEC 63171-6 from the draft as per Resolution 1 in bains_3cg_01c_0719

Yes 25 No 3 Abstain 13

Straw Poll #6:

(pick one)

AIP #55/88/89: Retain IEC 63171-1 and remove IEC 63171-6 from the draft as per Resolution 2 in bains_3cg_01c_0719

Yes 9 No 12 Abstain 15

Straw Poll #7:

(pick one)

Reject #55/88/89: No consensus to change.

Yes 6 No 18 Abstain 15

Motion #6: Move to: Respond to comments #55/88/89 with ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: Remove both IEC 63171-1 and IEC 63171-6 from the body of the draft as per Resolution 1 in bains_3cg_01c_0719.pdf

M: Peter Jones

S: Lennart Yseboodt

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 28 N: 3 A: 12

Motion Passes

The Task Force broke for lunch at 12:16

The Task Force resumed from lunch at 1:15

Comment resolution continued

Straw Poll #8:

I support the above proposed REJECT response to comment r01-226:

Y: 23 N: 2 A: 13

Motion #7: Move to strike, “The references to 1.1.3.1 and 1.1.4 provide no additional clarity or information. The referenced subclauses refer to the division of 802.3 on architectural lines, but do not provide any information on technical issues specifically in conflict with this draft.” from the proposed response to comment r01-227.

M: Geoff Thompson

S: Yong Kim

(Technical \geq 75%)

Y: 1 N: 13 A: 19

Motion Fails

Motion #8: Move to reconsider Motion #7.

M: Jon Lewis

S: David Brandt

(Procedural $>$ 50%)

Y: 21 N: 1

Motion Passes

Motion #9: Reconsideration of Motion 7:

Move to strike, “The references to 1.1.3.1 and 1.1.4 provide no additional clarity or information. The referenced subclauses refer to the division of 802.3 on architectural lines, but do not provide any information on technical issues specifically in conflict with this draft.” from the proposed response to comment r01-227.

M: Geoff Thompson

S: Yong Kim

(Technical \geq 75%)

Y: 3 N: 17 A: 21

Motion Fails

**Motion #10: I move to reject comment r01-227 with the following response:
REJECT.**

The CRG disagrees with the commenter. The CRG disagrees with the commenter, and believes the draft is within the PAR scope.

A key responsibility of the ballot pool is to evaluate whether the scope of the draft is within the scope of the PAR, and an affirmative vote indicates your agreement that the work does not exceed the scope of the PAR. The ballot pool has voted in the affirmative.

This comment is essentially a restatement of the arguments in previously rejected comments i-27 and i-270, and are not associated with a new disapprove vote.

The references to 1.1.3.1 and 1.1.4 provide no additional clarity or information. The referenced subclauses refer to the division of 802.3 on architectural lines, but do not provide any information on technical issues specifically in conflict with this draft.

The majority of the CRG believes that the functions are appropriately placed in the architecture of IEEE Std. 802.3 and ISO layering model.

M: Peter Jones
S: Martin Miller
(Technical >= 75%)
Y: 5
N: 8
A: 22
Motion Fails

Discussion on the proposed resolution continued with additional details provided.

Motion #11: Move to reconsider Motion #7.

M: Jon Lewis
S: Chris DiMinico
(Procedural > 50%)
Y: 23 N: 1 A: 7
Motion Passes

Motion #12: Reconsideration of Motion 7:

Move to strike, “The references to 1.1.3.1 and 1.1.4 provide no additional clarity or information. The referenced subclauses refer to the division of 802.3 on architectural lines, but do not provide any information on technical issues specifically in conflict with this draft.” from the proposed response to comment r01-227.

(Technical >= 75%)
Y: 18 N: 0 A: 16
Motion Passes

Motion #13: I move to reject comment r01-227 with the following response:

REJECT.

The CRG disagrees with the commenter. The CRG disagrees with the commenter, and believes the draft is within the PAR scope.

A key responsibility of the ballot pool is to evaluate whether the scope of the draft is within the scope of the PAR, and an affirmative vote indicates your agreement that the work does not exceed the scope of the PAR. The ballot pool has voted in the affirmative.

This comment is essentially a restatement of the arguments in previously rejected comments i-27 and i-270, and are not associated with a new disapprove vote.

The majority of the CRG believes that the functions are appropriately placed in the architecture of IEEE Std. 802.3 and ISO layering model.

M: Jon Lewis

S: Tim Baggett

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 19 N: 2 A: 11

Motion Passes

The group broke for afternoon break at 3:10 PM.

The meeting resumed at 3:30 PM.

Comment resolution continued

Title: 802.3cg D3.1 Comments 90 & 91: Precision Time Protocol(PTP) and Half-Duplex ([jones 3cg 02a 0719.pdf](#))

Presenter: Amrik Bains, Peter Jones; Cisco

Straw Poll #9:

I support the following response to comments r01-90 and r01-91:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE the resolution of comments #r01-90 and r01-91 as shown in [jones_3cg_02a_0719.pdf](#).

Y: 8 N: 14 A: 15

Motion #14: Move to REJECT comments r01-90 and r01-91 with the (same) following response:

The comment is out of scope of the recirculation, bringing new text, unrelated to changed text into the draft on the recirculation.

This change would introduce new functionality into the draft beyond the existing text or approved project objectives.

M: G. Thompson

S: J. Lewis

Technical (>= 75%)

Y:13 N: 3 A: 21
Motion Passes

The Chair noted that the start time for Wednesday would be 9:30 AM.

The Task Force recessed for the day at 5:47 PM.

The Task Force resumed at 9:38 AM

The Chair called the meeting to order and asked if there were new attendees that didn't introduce themselves, one person responded that they were new. The Task Force introduced themselves.

- Mr. Zimmerman noted that there should be no recording or photography permitted.
- Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting. None responded.

Chair reviewed the goals for the meeting, big ticket items, access to the reflector and website, and ground rules for the meeting.

The Chair reminded the group to sign into IMAT and the attendance sheet.

IEEE Patent Policy, at 9:44 AM, Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone had not seen the patent policy this week, none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then showed slides #1 and #2 and made the call for potentially essential patents at 9:47 AM, none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then displayed slides #3 and #4.

Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone in the room had not seen the slide entitled "Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings", none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then summarized the slide and asked if there was any discussion necessary, none responded.

Chair reviewed the IEEE 802.3 Standards process and where the Task Force was in the process and the process by which we will develop the standard.

The group took a short break at 10:46 AM.

The group resumed at 11:01 AM.

Comment resolution continued.

Straw poll #10:

I support the following proposed response:

"PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE:

Add the following final sentence to 1st paragraph of 148.1:

"When PLCA is disabled, the reconciliation sublayer mapping is identical to that specified in clause 22."

Y: 17 N: 1 A: 19

The group broke for lunch at 12:16 PM.

The group resumed from lunch at 1:07 PM.

Comment resolution continued.

Comment resolution concluded.

The Chair then displayed the proposed Liaison letter:

[Proposed Liaison to IEC SC31G, PT 60079-47](#)

Motion #15: Move to accept the text of IEEE_802d3_to_IEC_SC31G_0719_draft2.docx as proposed liaison communication from IEEE 802.3 to IEC SC31G.

M: Jon Lewis S: Steffen Graber

Approved by voice without opposition

Future Meetings Straw Poll:

August OOC interim (Aug 14-15, Milwaukee WI)

Y: 12 N: 17 Maybe: 5

September 2019 Interim

Indianapolis, IN, USA, Sept 9-13

Y: 16 N: 10 Maybe: 10

November 2019 Plenary

Waikoloa Village, HI USA, Nov 11-14

Y: 12

N: 5

Maybe: 15

Future Meeting Straw Poll (Possible Study Group):

For the Proposed 10SPE Multidrop Enhancements Study Group

September 2019 Interim

Indianapolis, IN, USA, Sept 9-13

Y: 10 N: 10 Maybe: 9

November 2019 Plenary

Waikoloa Village, HI USA, Nov 11-14

Y: 8 N: 10 Maybe: 13

Motion #16: Move to: Confirm the ad hoc minutes from July 3 2019 as posted.

M: Peter Jones S: Piergiorgio Beruto
(Procedural > 50%)

Approved by voice without opposition

Title: Editor's Closing Report: P802.3cg Draft D3.1 ([maguire 3cg 02 0719.pdf](#))

Presenter: Valerie Maguire, Siemon; P802.3cg chief editor

Motion #17: Move to grant the Task Force editors license to editorially conform the comment responses to RevCom guidelines

M: Valerie Maguire S: Bob Grow

(Technical >= 75%)

Motion passes by voice without objection

Motion #18: Move to instruct the Task Force editors to generate draft 3.2 from draft 3.1 and the closed comments, with editorial license granted to update PICS as needed, and conduct a 15-day second SA Recirculation ballot.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Jon Lewis

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 31 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

The Chair asked if anyone had additional business, none responded.

Motion #19: Adjourn the meeting.

M: Geoff Thompson S: Theo Brillhart

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:24 PM

Appendix A: Attendees at the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single-Pair Ethernet Task Force Meeting, July 15-17, 2019.

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 July 2019				Day 1 15 July	Day 2 16 July	Day 3 17 July
By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.						
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Mon	Tues	Wed
Andr�	Stefan	SEI ANTech-Europe GmbH	SEI ANTech-Europe GmbH	X	X	
Araki	Nobuyasu	Yazaki	Yazaki	X	X	
Baggett	Tim	Microchip	Microchip	X	X	X
Bains	Amrik	Cisco	Cisco	X	X	X
Beruto	Piergiorgio	Canova Tech SRL	Canova Tech SRL	X	X	X
Brandt	David	Rockwell Automation	Rockwell Automation	X	X	X
Brillhart	Theo	Fluke Networks	Fluke Networks	X	X	X
Brueckner	Klemens	Audi AG	Audi AG	X	X	
Carty	Clark	Cisco	Cisco	X	X	
Choi	Emily	DGIST	DGIST	X	X	
Darshan	Yair	Microchip	Microchip	X		
Dawson	Fred	Chemours	Chemours	X	X	X
Dimmn	Chris	Panduit	Panduit	X	X	
Dinh	Thuyen	Pulse Electronics	Pulse Electronics		X	X
Engels	Andreas	TE Connectivity	TE Connectivity	X		
Faure	Jean-Philippe	Progizon	Panasonic	X	X	

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 July 2019	Day 1 15 July	Day 2 16 July	Day 3 17 July
---	------------------	------------------	------------------

By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.

Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Mon	Tues	Wed
Franchuk	Brian	Emerson Automation Solutions	Emerson Automation Solutions	X	X	X
Graber	Steffen	Pepperl+Fuchs	Pepperl+Fuchs	X	X	X
Hess	Dave	Cord Data	Cord Data	X	X	X
Hormmeyer	Bernd	Phoenix Contact	Phoenix Contact	X	X	X
Hosang	Song	DGIST	DGIST	X	X	
Islinger	Tobias	Infineon	Infineon	X		
Ito	Hiroaki	Yazaki	Yazaki	X	X	
Jeony	Woojin	DGIST	DGIST	X	X	
Jones	Peter	Cisco	Cisco	X	X	X
Kabra	Lokesh	Synopsys Inc.	Synopsys Inc.	X	X	X
Kang	Steve	Velonect	Velonect	X	X	
Koczwara	Wojciech	Rockwell Automation	Rockwell Automation	X	X	X
Kurobe	Alcio	Panasonic	Panasonic	X	X	
Lackner	Hans	QoSCom	QoSCom	X	X	X
Maguire	Valerie	Siemon	Siemon	X	X	X
Marques	Flavio	Furukawa Electric	Furukawa Electric		X	
Matheus	Kirsten	BMW	BMW	X	X	X
McCarthy	Mick	Analog Devices	Analog Devices	X	X	X
Miller	Martin	Microchip	Microchip	X	X	X
Muller	Sinia	Hirschman	Hirschman	X	X	X

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 July 2019	Day 1 15 July	Day 2 16 July	Day 3 17 July
---	------------------	------------------	------------------

By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.

Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Mon	Tues	Wed
Pandey	Sujan	NXP	NXP	X		X
Pohl	Christopher	Beckhoff	Beckhoff	X	X	X
Rehrs	Thomas	Beckhoff	Beckhoff	X	X	X
Rusch	Christian	TE Connectivity	TE Connectivity	X		
Schicketanz	Dieter	Self	Reutlingen University	X	X	X
Schmidt	Rainer	Harting	Harting	X	X	X
Shariff	Masood	Commscope	Commscope	X	X	X
Stewart	Heath	Analog Devices	Analog Devices	X	X	X
Tatolov	Ievgen	Robert Bosch Car Multimedia GmbH	Robert Bosch Car Multimedia GmbH		X	
Thompson	Geoff	GraCaSI SA.	Independent	X	X	X
Thompson	Tom	IEEE-SA	IEEE-SA		X	
Wucher	Markus	Endress+Hauser	Endress+Hauser	X	X	
Xu	Dayin	Rockwell Automation	Rockwell Automation	X	X	X
Zielinski	Martin	Emerson Automation Solutions	Emerson Automation Solutions	X	X	X
Zimmerman	George	CME Consulting	Commscope, Aquantia, CME Consulting, Cisco, ADI, BMW, APL Group, SensTek	X	X	X

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 July 2019	Day 1 15 July	Day 2 16 July	Day 3 17 July
---	------------------	------------------	------------------

By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.

Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Mon	Tues	Wed
Zinner	Helge	Continental	Continental			X
Zon	Gaolwo	Maxim	Maxim		X	X