

Closing Chief Editor's Report P802.3cg draft 2.0

Valerie Maguire
IEEE P802.3cg, Chief Editor

September 14, 2018 – Spokane, WA

Draft 2.0 Comment Review Summary

- 739 comments reviewed and resolved
- Editors to generate draft 2.1 from draft 2.0 and the closed comments, and request that IEEE 802.3 progress the draft to a 20-day first WG Recirculation Ballot (**MOTION**)

Timeline: Draft 2.1 20-day WG Recirc Ballot

- Announcement of the electronic IEEE 802.3 Working Group first Working Group recirculation ballot on IEEE P802.3cg (IEEE 802.3cg) Draft Standard for Ethernet Amendment: Physical Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for 10 Mb/s Operation and Associated Power Delivery over a Single Balanced Pair of Conductors anticipated by Monday, **OCTOBER 8th**
- Ballot anticipated to close no later than Sunday, **OCTOBER 28th AOE**
- Comment database with proposed resolutions ready for circulation by Monday, **NOVEMBER 4th**

The Comment Process

- Comment instructions will be provided by the Working Group Chair
- Be sure to use the most UP TO DATE comment tools
- Annexes at the end of this report contain reference information on:
 - What do the Editors do?
 - Submitting Baseline Proposals
 - The Comment Process
 - Submitting Comments – Task Force Review
 - Style Guidelines

Questions?

Thank you!

Valerie Maguire
valerie_maguire@siemon.com

Annex: What do the Editors do?

- Editors' responsibilities:
 - Consolidate all approved baselines into the draft
 - Ensure style and format of the draft is consistent with the official IEEE Style Manual (current version: 2014)
 - Make sure text is grammatically correct
- Editors DO NOT:
 - Create text of draft based on bullets from PowerPoint presentations
 - Fill in missing technical details from baselines (any TBDs from baselines will be included in the draft as well)
 - Rewrite or develop text based on proposals

Annex: Submitting Baseline Proposals

- Provide Editors with complete baseline materials
 - Editable files in Word or FrameMaker formats shall including all the necessary text, figures, drawings, code, etc.
 - Text formats: Word (.doc(x)), FrameMaker 10 (.fm or .mif)
 - Table data: Excel .xml(x)
 - Drawings / figures: FrameMaker 10 (.fm or .mif) or Visio (.vsd) for simple content copying
- Include all descriptive text
- Ensure that there are no missing technical features or technical conflicts between baselines

Annex: Comment Process

- Comments are the formal way to make corrections and changes to the draft
- “Chad’s General Rules” to make comments easier to read (thus easier to resolve):
 - DO copy the text you are commenting against and paste into the comment. This helps immensely if you have a typo in the page or line number.
 - DO cover only one topic per comment. File multiple comments for multiple concepts in the same page/line.
 - DO NOT make a comment and leave the suggested remedy empty. If you know it is a problem, you have an idea of the answer. Share this with the group.
 - DO make crisp comments, minimize 'stream of consciousness' style of writing. Present the facts and the solution.”

Annex: Comment Process, cont.

- Please don't give half sentences or assume the editor knows what you mean in all but the simplest circumstances
 - For example, instead of saying “fix the typo above”, you should say, “change ‘half sentences’ to ‘half sentences’ on line x of page y”.
- DO NOT use revision markings (e.g., strikethroughs and hyphens) to show changes when using the “comment entry spreadsheet” tool – these marks do not transfer to the Access database

Annex: Submitting Comments – TF Review

- Here is a useful helpful overview of the comment tool:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov14/diab_01_0512.pdf
 - Note that the “R” designation really doesn’t have much meaning in task force review, only to underscore how important you think the comment is
- See “Chad’s Rules for Making Comments” for some common sense tips:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/bt/public/nov14/Rules%20for%20making%20comments.txt>

Annex: Style Guidelines

- Clause 18.2 “Amendments and corrigenda” of the 2014 IEEE-SA Style Manual provides explicit instructions on how to change the text in an existing base standard or an existing amendment
- Refer to [Maguire_3cg_02_0717.pdf](#) for editing examples