Minutes IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single Pair Ethernet TF Comment 573 to Draft 2.0 AdHoc meeting 18/11/2018

Prepared by James Withey

Proposed Agenda:

- 1. Agenda/Admin: James Withey, Agenda_Comment573adhoc_20181018.pdf
- 2. SG Chair's comments: no presentation
- 3. Presentations:

PRESENTATION TITLE	AUTHOR/PRESENTER	AFFILIATION
802.3cg Supporting QoS on PLCA: A	Don Pannell	NXP
Problem Statement		
MAC & Scope Background for 802.3cg,	George Zimmerman	CME Consulting/ADI, APL
Priority & PLCA		Group, BMW,
		Cisco, Commscope, Aquantia

4. Discussion & Next steps - All

See adhoc webpage for agenda deck and presentations

Agenda/Admin James Withey as ad hoc chair:

Meeting began at 9am Pacific.

The agenda was approved without change

Introductions & Affiliations.

Mr Withey request emails of attendees with affiliation.

Agenda Review: Agenda_Comment573adhoc_20181018.pdf

- 1. Reviewed the Attendance information related to the ad hoc.
- 2. Displayed the Participation slide and reviewed it.
- Displayed patent slide deck, and reviewed it.
 Call for Patents was made at 0905, none responded
- 4. Reminded participants to indicate full names and employer/affiliation for the meeting minutes.

Instructions for subscribing to the reflector may be found at http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/reflector.html. If you cannot subscribe to the reflector for some reason, and need additional assistance please contact the Task Force chair.

Chair's Comments - James Withey

The Chair reminded the group, that its scope was to develop a solution in scope to 802.3cg for the comment 573 to draft 2.0, and it was not the scope of the ad-hoc to debate support or merit for this comment.

Presentations/Discussion:

Presentation: "802.3cg Supporting QoS on PLCA: A Problem Statement", Don Pannell, NXP

Don Pannell went through the presentation.

Questions of understanding were resolved, and the ad-hoc agreed the problem statement, as presented, was understood.

Presentation: "MAC & Scope Background for 802.3cg, Priority & PLCA", George Zimmerman, CME Consulting/ADI, APL Group, BMW, Cisco, Commscope, Aquantia

George Zimmerman went through the presentation.

This presentation reviewed that the scope of 'cg was restricted in regard to resolving the issues raised by Comment 573, primarily as it is not within scope of 'cg to make changes to the MAC (in addition to other layers).

Several possible ways round this were discussed but no solutions in scope to 'cg were found. In addition, several attendees expressed views that no such solutions would be possible.

This led to review of the reference model of 802 (Figure B.2), and the MAC Merge model from 802.3 (Figure 99-1) which led to firmer understanding of how a resolution to comment 573 would require work outside of the scope of 'cg. (these were added to the presentation during the discussion for reference)

There was general consensus to the suggestion that a new project might be the best approach.

Closing Business

The chair concluded by remarking that:-

- No solution in scope to 'cg had yet been found
- The Adhoc had general consensus that a better way forward would be to consider a new project.
- The next meeting at 0900 (Pacific) on 1st November would allow discussion of this item in context of a new project with cooperation of the NEA.

ACTION - Mr Zimmerman took an action to work contact the NEA to arrange that the next meeting of the Comment 573 ad-hoc take place under the auspices of the NEA to additionally allow discussion of a potential new project.

Meeting adjourned at 1045.

Attendees (from Webex + emails)

First	Last	Affiliation	
<mark>MRE</mark>	<mark>???</mark>	<mark>???</mark>	
TaeHyung	Kim	Hyundai Motor Group & Hanyang University	
Byungjoo	Kim	Hyundai Motor Group & Hanyang University	
Charlie	<mark>Adams</mark>	<mark>???</mark>	
Tim	Bagget	Microchip	
Amrik	Bains	Cisco	
David	Brandt	Rockwell	
Phillip	Brownlee	Consulting / TDK	
Claude	Gauthier	NXP	
Steffen	Graber	Pepperl+Fuchs	
Craig	Gunther	Craig Gunther Consulting	
Venkat	lyer	Microchip	
David	Law	Hewlett Packard Enterprise	
Brett	McClellan	Marvell	
Don	Pannell	NXP	
Aniruddha	Phatek	Renesas	
James	Withey	Fluke Networks	
George	Zimmerman	CME Consulting/ADI, APL Group, BMW, Cisco, Commscope, Aquantia	
TOTAL	18	Attendees	