Cl **44**	*SC* **44.3**	*P* **32**	*L* **8**	# 43

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

broken link

SuggestedRemedy

Change: text 150.1
To: Link to 150.10

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.1.185**	*P* **34**	*L* **17**	# 6

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 0 1 00
To: 0 1 0 0

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.1.185.2**	*P* **34**	*L* **28**	# 1

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Modify Editor Instruction based on 802.3cg change

SuggestedRemedy

Change Editor Instruction to: Insert the following text after the fifth sentence of 45.2.1.185.2 (as modified by 802.3cg) as follows:

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **78**	*SC* **78**	*P* **37**	*L*	# 8

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Page forced to 21

SuggestedRemedy

Change to use next available page number.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **98B**	*SC* **98B**	*P* **145**	*L* **16**	# 44

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Change bit assignments in ch and cg to remove interleaved reserved bits and plan for future PHYs.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 2.5GBASE-T1 ability to A3 from A7
Change 5GBASE-T1 ability to A4 from A8
Change 10GBASE-T1 ability to A5 from A9

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**	*SC* **1.4**	*P* **45**	*L* **15**	# 45

Wu, Mau-Lin — MediaTek

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

In Table 125-1, the ""Description"" of 2.5GBASE-T1 is ""TBD modulation"". It's not correct!

SuggestedRemedy

The team had adopted PAM4 as the modulation of 2.5GBASE-T1 and 5GBASE-T1. Shall modify ""TBD modulation"" into ""PAM4 modulation"".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **125**
SC **1.4**

Page 1 of 8
9/4/2018 3:32:23 PM

Cl **125**	*SC* **1.4**	*P* **45**	*L* **22**	# 46

Wu, Mau-Lin   MediaTek

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

In Table 125-1, the ""Description"" of 5GBASE-T1 is ""TBD modulation"". It's not correct!

SuggestedRemedy

The team had adopted PAM4 as the modulation of 2.5GBASE-T1 and 5GBASE-T1. Shall modify ""TBD modulation"" into ""PAM4 modulation"".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**	*SC* **125.1.3**	*P* **44**	*L* **48**	# 7

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change: PAM4for
To: PAM4 for

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**	*SC* **125.1.4**	*P* **45**	*L* **53**	# 48

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

EEE is optinal for 5GBASE-T1

SuggestedRemedy

Marked as "O"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **125**	*SC* **125.1.4**	*P* **45**	*L* **48**	# 47

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

EEE is optinal for 2.5GBASE-T1

SuggestedRemedy

Marked as "O"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.1.2**	*P* **50**	*L* **2**	# 9

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Missing period at end of sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Add missing period.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.1.2**	*P* **50**	*L* **20**	# 3

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

The MDI is not part of the PHY and should not be shaded in Figure 149-1.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove shading on MDI "box" in Figure 149-1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.2.2.1**	*P* **58**	*L* **25**	# 13

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

missing periods

SuggestedRemedy

Add periods at end of OK and NOT_OK statements

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.2.2.1**

Page 2 of 8
9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.1**   *P* **70**   *L* **1**   # 16
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    typo

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: stat). To state.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.2**   *P* **70**   *L* **15**   # 18
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    broken link

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: text 149.1
    To: Link to 149.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.6**   *P* **75**   *L* **27**   # 55
WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    SEND_S signaling modification - 703.125MHz

SuggestedRemedy
    see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01a_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.6**   *P* **76**   *L* **2**   # 49
WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    SEN_S signaling modification

SuggestedRemedy
    see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.6.2**   *P* **77**   *L* **40**   # 51
WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    send_s_timer expiration changed to "1.25us±0.05us"

SuggestedRemedy
    see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.6.2**   *P* **77**   *L* **44**   # 52
WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    sigdet_wait_timerexpiration changed to" 5.0us±0.15us"

SuggestedRemedy
    see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.4.1**   *P* **81**   *L* **25**   # 20
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    missing periods

SuggestedRemedy
    Add periods at end of SEND_N, SEND_I, SEND_T, SEND_Z statements

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.1**   *P* **84**   *L* **37**   # 22
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    The PMA electrical specification tests for Multi-Gig are the same as they are for slower
    speeds as specific frequencies are not specified.

SuggestedRemedy
    Accept the text in clause 149.5.1 and its subclauses, e.g. remove yellow highlighting.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 3 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.5.1**   9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.2.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **15**   # 24

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

    Figure 149-13 was not drawn in Frame

SuggestedRemedy

    Redraw Figure 149-13 in Frame.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.3.5**   *P* **88**   *L* **21**   # 26

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Set peak differential output tolerance to 30%.

SuggestedRemedy

    Change: transmit differential signal at MDI shall be less than 1 +TBD V peak-to-peak
    To: transmit differential signal at MDI shall be less than 1.3 V peak-to-peak

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.3.6**   *P* **88**   *L* **27**   # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Set the symbol transmission rate tolerance to 50 ppm.

SuggestedRemedy

    Remove yellow highlighting on 50 ppm.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.3.6**   *P* **88**   *L* **30**   # 31

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Set the short-term rate of frequency variation to 0.1 ppm/second.

SuggestedRemedy

    Remove yellow highlighting on 0.1 ppm/second.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7.1.1**   *P* **90**   *L* **34**   # 33

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    IL frequency axis should start at 0

SuggestedRemedy

    Change Fequency axis to be 0 to 3000.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7.1.5**   *P* **92**   *L* **31**   # 35

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Set maximum link segment propagation delay to 94 ns as the maximum segment length is
    the same as bp. This is a propagation delay of 6.27 ns/m. Most cable used for this
    purpose is about 5.5 ns/m.

SuggestedRemedy

    Remove yellow highlighting on 94 ns.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7.1.5**   *P* **92**   *L* **32**   # 37

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Set maximum frequency for link segment propagation delay to 3000 MHz.

SuggestedRemedy

    Remove yellow highlighting on 3000 MHz.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 4 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.7.1.5**   9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.8.1**   *P* **92**   *L* **39**   # 39
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    This spec should not define a specific MDI connector.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on: Further
    specification of the mechanical interface is beyond the scope of this standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.8.3**   *P* **92**   *L* **53**   # 41
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    The automotive fault tolerance is the same for all communication speeds..

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on: See 96.8.3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.1.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **25**   # 4
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    The MDI is not part of the PHY and should not be shaded in Figure 150-1.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove shading on MDI "box" in Figure 150-1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.1.3**   *P* **98**   *L* **1**   # 10
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    noun/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: The 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs utilizes four level
    To: The 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs utilize four level

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.1.3**   *P* **99**   *L* **14**   # 11
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    broken link

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: text 150.1
    To: Link to 150.4

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.2**   *P* **100**   *L* **2**   # 12
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    broken link

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: text 150.1
    To: Link to 150.2.2

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **150**
SC **150.2**

Page 5 of 8
9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.2.2.1**	*P* **106**	*L* **25**	# 14

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

missing periods

SuggestedRemedy

Add periods at end of OK and NOT_OK statements

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.1**	*P* **116**	*L* **27**	# 15

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

broken link

SuggestedRemedy

Change: text 150.1
To: Link to 150.2.2

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.1**	*P* **118**	*L* **1**	# 17

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change: stat). To state.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.2**	*P* **118**	*L* **15**	# 19

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

broken link

SuggestedRemedy

Change: text 150.1
To: Link to 150.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.6**	*P* **123**	*L* **27**	# 56

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

SEND_S signaling modification- - 703.125MHz

SuggestedRemedy

see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01a_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.6**	*P* **124**	*L* **2**	# 50

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

SEN_S signaling modification

SuggestedRemedy

see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.6.2**	*P* **125**	*L* **40**	# 53

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

send_s_timer expiration changed to "1.25us±0.05us"

SuggestedRemedy

see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **150**   Page 6 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **150.4.2.6.2**   9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.2.6.2**	*P* **125**	*L* **44**	*#* 54
WU, Peter		Marvell		

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

sigdet_wait_timerexpiration changed to" 5.0us±0.15us"

SuggestedRemedy

see attached contrtibution "Wu_3ch_01_0918.pdf"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.4.4.1**	*P* **129**	*L* **25**	*#* 21
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

missing periods

SuggestedRemedy

Add periods at end of SEND_N, SEND_I, SEND_T, SEND_Z statements

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.1**	*P* **132**	*L* **37**	*#* 23
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

The PMA electrical specification tests for Multi-Gig are the same as they are for slower speeds as specific frequencies are not specified.

SuggestedRemedy

Accept the text in clause 150.5.1 and its subclauses, e.g. remove yellow highlighting.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.2.2**	*P* **135**	*L* **15**	*#* 25
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Figure 150-13 was not drawn in Frame

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw Figure 150-13 in Frame.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.3**	*P* **135**	*L* **51**	*#* 28
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Duplicate clause heading: Test Modes

SuggestedRemedy

Remove duplicate clause heading 150.5.3 Test Modes

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.4.5**	*P* **136**	*L* **21**	*#* 27
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Set peak differential output tolerance to 30%.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: transmit differential signal at MDI shall be less than 1 +TBD V peak-to-peak
To: transmit differential signal at MDI shall be less than 1.3 V peak-to-peak

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.4.6**	*P* **136**	*L* **27**	*#* 30
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Set the short-term rate of frequency variation to 0.1 ppm/second.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove yellow highlighting on 50 ppm.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**	*SC* **150.5.4.6**	*P* **136**	*L* **30**	*#* 32
Wienckowski, Natalie		General Motors		

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Set the short-term rate of frequency variation to 0.1 ppm/second.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove yellow highlighting on 0.1 ppm/second.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **150**
SC **150.5.4.6**

Page 7 of 8
9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.7.1.1**   *P* **138**   *L* **33**   # 34
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    IL frequency axis should start at 0

SuggestedRemedy
    Change Fequency axis to be 0 to 3000.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.7.1.5**   *P* **140**   *L* **27**   # 36
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Set maximum link segment propagation delay to 94 ns as the maximum segment length is the same as bp. This is a propagation delay of 6.27 ns/m. Most cable used for this purpose is about 5.5 ns/m.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on 94 ns.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.7.1.5**   *P* **140**   *L* **28**   # 38
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    Set maximum frequency for link segment propagation delay to 3000 MHz.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on 3000 MHz.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.8.1**   *P* **140**   *L* **35**   # 40
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    This spec should not define a specific MDI connector.

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on: Further
    specification of the mechanical interface is beyond the scope of this standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **150**   *SC* **150.8.3**   *P* **140**   *L* **49**   # 42
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
    The automotive fault tolerance is the same for all communication speeds..

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove yellow highlighting on: See 96.8.3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **Intro**   *SC* **Intro**   *P* **9**   *L* **4**   # 5
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Duplicate of Amendment:

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove second Amendment:

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **Intro**   *SC* **Intro**   *P* **12**   *L*   # 2
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove all empy pages throughout document

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line   *Cl* **Intro**   Page 8 of 8
SC **Intro**   9/4/2018 3:32:29 PM