Cl **44**	*SC* **44.1.3**	*P* **23**	*L* **23**	# 17

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Renumber figures and change editor instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1a and Figure 44-1b as shown below.
Renumber Figure 44-1 to 44-1a.
Renumber Figure 44-1a to 44-1b.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1 shown below.

Combine current figures into a single figure with two separate drawings in it.

Grant editorial license to modify figures and/or keep as two figures to fit on a single page.

Cl **44**	*SC* **44.1.3**	*P* **24**	*L* **15**	# 19

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *PCS*

10GBASE-T1 does not hav a LDPC PCS.

SuggestedRemedy

In 10GBASE-T1 stack, change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B PCS".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B RS-FEC PCS".

Cl **78**	*SC* **78.1**	*P* **30**	*L* **11**	# 4

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EEE*

Add Section 78.1.4, Table 78-1 with 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1, all referenced to Clause 149.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a row for 2.5GBASE-T1 after 2.5GBASE-T, insert a row for 5GBASE-T1 after 5GBASE-T, and insert a row for 10GBASE-T1 after 10GBASE-T.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **125**	*SC* **125.1.2**	*P* **33**	*L* **8**	# 18

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Renumber figures and change editor instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 125-1 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018) with Figure 125-1a and Figure 125-1b as shown below. Insert the following text at the end of the list after d) of 125.1.2 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018) as follows:
Renumber Figure 125-1 to 125-1a.
Renumber Figure 125-1a to 125-1b.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 125-1 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018) with Figure 125-1 shown below.

Combine current figures into a single figure with two separate drawings in it.

Grant editorial license to modify figures and/or keep as two figures to fit on a single page.

Cl **125**	*SC* **125.1.4**	*P* **35**	*L* **17**	# 5

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change "64B/65Bencoding" to "64B/65B encoding".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.1**	*P* **38**	*L* **14**	# 6

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change " The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.1**

Page 1 of 8
11/14/2018 8:26:38 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **17**   # 7

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change " The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **19**   # 8

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change " The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3**   *P* **39**   *L* **14**   # 30

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Change "TBD encoding" to "64B/65B encoding"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "TBD encoding" to "64B/65B encoding"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3**   *P* **39**   *L* **16**   # 33

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *PCS*

Need to specify the meaning of "50 blocks"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "each group of 50 blocks" to "each group of 50 64B/65B blocks"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3**   *P* **40**   *L* **7**   # 31

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

When Auto-Negotiation is not used, MASTER and SLAVE must be synchronized by the PHY Link Synchronization function as defined in 149.4.2.6.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "The MASTER and SLAVE are synchronized by a PHY Link Synchronization function ..." to "The MASTER and SLAVE shall be synchronized by the PHY Link Synchronization
function ...

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3**   *P* **40**   *L* **26**   # 9

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change "10GBASE-T1over" to "10GBASE-T1 over"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 2 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.1.3**   11/14/2018 8:26:39 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.1**   *P* **40**   *L* **41**   # 21
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*
Change awkward wording: A 10-bit OAM field is next appended

SuggestedRemedy
Change "A 10-bit OAM field is next appended" to "Next, a 10-bit OAM field is appended".

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.3**   *P* **41**   *L* **31**   # 22
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*
These PHYs use XGMII

SuggestedRemedy
Change "GMII" to "XGMII". Also on line 34.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.4**   *P* **41**   *L* **49**   # 23
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   Synchronization
Change 1 us to 1.25 us per send_s_timer

SuggestedRemedy
Change "the MASTER PHY sends a synchronization sequence for 1 µs." to "the MASTER PHY sends a synchronization sequence for 1.25 µs."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.4**   *P* **41**   *L* **50**   # 24
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   Synchronization
Change to 6.25 us, sum of send_s_timer and sigdet_wait_timer.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "MASTER repeats by sending a synchronization sequence every 5 µs." to "MASTER repeats by sending a synchronization sequence every 6.25 µs."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.4**   *P* **41**   *L* **51**   # 25
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   Synchronization
Change 1 us to 1.25 us per send_s_timer

SuggestedRemedy
Change "it responds with a synchronization sequence for 1 µs" to "it responds with a synchronization sequence for 1.25 µs".

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.4**   *P* **41**   *L* **52**   # 26
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   Synchronization
Change to 5 us per sigdet_wait_timer.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "after the SLAVE response for 4 µs" to "after the SLAVE response for 5 µs".

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.1.3.4**

Page 3 of 8
11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.4**   *P* **56**   *L* **40**   # 37

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *PCS*

There should be 1800 rx_PAM4 symbols per RS FEC frame. The figure is showing 1801 rx_PAM4 symbols.

SuggestedRemedy

Option 1: Change "rx_PAM4n (PMA)" to "rx_PAM4n+1 (PMA)"
Option 2: Change "rx_PAM4n+1800 (PMA)" to "rx_PAM4n+1799 (PMA)"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See Comment #41 where we changed to option 2.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.4**   *P* **42**   *L* **11**   # 38

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

this is a single pair PHY

SuggestedRemedy

delete "on any pair combination."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.4**   *P* **42**   *L* **22**   # 34

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

PAM4 has four transmit voltage levels

SuggestedRemedy

Change "one of ??? Power levels" to "one of four voltage levels"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.2.1.1.1**   *P* **43**   *L* **29**   # 27

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Make DISABLE and ENABLE statements parallel.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Used by the Auto-Negotiation to enable the PHY." to "Used by the Auto-Negotiation function to enable the PHY."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.2.2.4.2**   *P* **47**   *L* **17**   # 10

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "for 5GBASE-T1 and 5625 MHz for" to "for 5GBASE-T1, and 5625 MHz for"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.2.2.8.1**   *P* **49**   *L* **3**   # 28

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Missing periods

SuggestedRemedy

Add periods at the end of the OK and NOT_OK statements.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   Page 4 of 8
SC **149.2.2.8.1**   11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **53**   *L* **3**   # 39

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PCS*

figure references should be clause 149 instead of 136

SuggestedRemedy

change "136" to "149" in multiple locations

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Update the references, which are currently highlighted in yellow, to the appropriate references when the Figures are provided and added to the document.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **53**   *L* **24**   # 43

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *PCS*

symbol period scales with 1/S not with S

SuggestedRemedy

Change "x S" to "/ S"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **53**   *L* **32**   # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**   *PAM2 levels*

accept highlighted text for PAM 2 levels

SuggestedRemedy

Remove yellow highlighting on "2/3, 2/3" to keep the transmit power in the training mode close to the transmit power in normal mode."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change 2/3 to 1 and -2/3 to -1.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **53**   *L* **32**   # 35

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *PAM2 levels*

The PAM2 transmit levels have not yet been determined.

SuggestedRemedy

An agreement by the task force is reuqired.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.
That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow. See Comment #29.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **54**   *L* **1**   # 36

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *Interleaving*

The interleaving depths have not yet been determined.

SuggestedRemedy

An agreement by the task force is reuqired.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.
That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.3**   *P* **54**   *L* **33**   # 11

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "/O/, /S/ and /T/" to "/O/, /S/, and /T/".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 5 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.3.2.2.3**   11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.4**   *P* **55**   *L* **31**   # 42

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   PCS

indexes usually start at zero

SuggestedRemedy

change indexes from 1 through 1800 to 0 through 1799

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
The editor will also chang this on page 56, Line 33.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.4**   *P* **56**   *L* **40**   # 41

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   PCS

a block has 1800 symbols

SuggestedRemedy

change "n+1800" to "n+1799"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.6**   *P* **57**   *L* **46**   # 12

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2.5, 5 and 10" to "2.5, 5, and 10".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.13**   *P* **59**   *L* **46**   # 40

McClellan, Brett   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   PCS

figure references should be clause 149 instead of 136

SuggestedRemedy

change "136" to "149" in multiple locations

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Update the references, which are currently highlighted in yellow, to the appropriate references when the Figures are provided and added to the document.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.16**   *P* **62**   *L* **14**   # 32

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

Input should be m325, m324, .

SuggestedRemedy

Change "m355" to "m325". Use subscript for "325".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.3**   *P* **66**   *L* **39**   # 13

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "the local transmitter, the channel and remote receiver." to "the local transmitter, the channel, and remote receiver.".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.3.3**

Page 6 of 8
11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.5.1**   *P* **91**   *L* **1**   # 20

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

Carryover of comment #24 from D0p5.

SuggestedRemedy

Redraw Figure 149-20 in FM.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7**   *P* **93**   *L* **52**   # 14

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s and 10 Gb/s" to "2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 10 Gb/s".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.9.1**   *P* **97**   *L* **21**   # 3

Jones, Chad   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   Conformance

"All equipment subject to this clause may be additionally required to conform to any applicable local, state, or national standards or as agreed to between the customer and supplier." the customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.

SuggestedRemedy

change to: "All equipment subject to this clause may be additionally required to conform to any applicable local, state, or national standards."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Change: All equipment subject to this clause may be additionally required to conform to any applicable local, state, or national standards or as agreed to between the customer and supplier.

To: All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to all applicable local, state, national, and application-specific standards.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.9.2.2**   *P* **97**   *L* **51**   # 1

Jones, Chad   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   Conformance

"In addition, the system may need to comply with more stringent requirements as agreed upon between customer and supplier, for the limitation of electromagnetic interference." the customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.

SuggestedRemedy

change to: "In addition, the system may need to comply with more stringent requirements for the limitation of electromagnetic interference."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.9.2.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **6**   # 2

Jones, Chad   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   Conformance

"Exact test setup and test limit values may be adapted to each specific application, subject to agreement between the customer and the supplier." the customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.

SuggestedRemedy

change to: "Exact test setup and test limit values may be adapted to each specific application."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **149A**   *SC* **149A.1**   *P* **102**   *L* **12**   # 15

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   EZ

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change " 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1" to "2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required   ER/editorial required   GR/general required   T/technical   E/editorial   G/general   *Cl* **149A**   Page 7 of 8

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched   A/accepted   R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149A.1**   11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149A**   *SC* **149A.1**   *P* **102**   *L* **32**   # 16

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

missing comma

SuggestedRemedy

Change "cable, PCB connectors and inline connectors" to "cable, PCB connectors, and inline connectors".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149A**
SC **149A.1**

Page 8 of 8
11/14/2018 8:26:40 PM