

Cl 00 SC 0 P23 L3 # 109
 McClellan, Brett Marvell
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 this note wasn't intended to be included in draft 1.0
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove the editor's note. Do the same on page 50 line 3.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.3 P22 L8 # 1
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEC references in the in-force standard have an em dash in front of "Part" with no spaces on either side. This is also true for other "-" separators in the title.
 SuggestedRemedy
 For the IEC reference being added replace " - " before "Part", "Test", and "Triaxial" with an em dash with no spaces before and after.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P22 L34 # 108
 McClellan, Brett Marvell
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 typo
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "of1000" to "of 1000"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.344a P22 L31 # 3
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 has deleted definition 1.4.294, so the definition for MultiGBASE-T is now 1.4.333
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the editing instruction to:
 Insert new definition for MultiGBASE-T1 after 1.4.333 MultiGBASE-T (re-numbered from 1.4.334 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows:
 Renumber the new definition as 1.4.333a

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.344a P22 L34 # 165
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Missing space "of1000"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "of1000" to "of 1000"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.344a P22 L35 # 101
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Missing space
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "of1000 Mb/s" with "of 1000 Mb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 1 SC 1.4.495b P22 L38 # 4
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 has deleted definition 1.4.294, so the definition for Type F PoDL System should be 1.4.494b

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction change: "1.4.495a" to "1.4.494a"
Renumber the new definition as 1.4.494b

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 1 SC 1.4.82aa P22 L20 # 2
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018 has now been approved.

SuggestedRemedy

Change all occurrences of "IEEE Std 802.3cb-201x" to "IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018" throughout the draft.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change 802.3cb-201x to 802.3cb-2018 on:
page 22, line 20
page 22, line 26
page 58, line 8
page 58, line 10
page 60, line 4
page 60, line 19
page 60, line 44

CI 23 SC 23 P30 L3 # 5
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The "Notes for Editors" should not be in the draft

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the "Notes for Editors"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This is actually Clause 30 on page 23.

CI 30 SC 30 P23 L3 # 166
Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"[Notes for editors... (through) ... modified.]" - this note isn't to be included in review drafts, per its text. Also applies to clause 78.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "[Notes for editors... modified.]" P23 L3 to 9. Make same deletion in Clause 78, P50.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 44 SC 44.1.4.4 P29 L26 # 81
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Incorrect line width on bottom of 10GBASE-CX4/68 cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix line width to match the rest of the table.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L8 # 6
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The use of "-" between numbers to indicate a range is discouraged by the IEEE style guide. "adjust" is not a valid editing instruction. There are two ":" at the end

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to:
Insert new rows in Table 45-3 for registers 1.2309 to 1.2316 after the row for register 1.2308, and change the reserved row as shown (unchanged rows not shown):

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L17 # 7
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The rows for registers 1.2309 to 1.2316 are associated with an "Insert" editing instruction, so should not be underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the underline from the rows for registers 1.2309 to 1.2316
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L25 # 8
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the row for register 1.2313, "45.2.1.196" should be a cross-reference
 In the row for register 1.2315, "45.2.1.1988" has a spurious "8" character at the end.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the row for register 1.2313, make "45.2.1.196" a cross-reference
 In the row for register 1.2315, delete the "8" at the end of "45.2.1.1988"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L29 # 84
 Lo, William Axonne Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 45.2.1.1988 should be 45.2.1.198
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L29 # 130
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 45.2.1.1988 has an extra "8" (probably sitting there next to the cross reference)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to cross-ref for 45.2.1.198
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1 P31 L32 # 129
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "2317through 1.32767" missing space
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2317through" to "2317 through"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185 P32 L29 # 9
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The deleted reserved row in Table 45-149 appears to have an underlined and strikethrough space between "1" and "x" and a strikethrough space missing between the two "x" characters
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the underline from the strikethrough space between "1" and "x" and add a strikethrough space between the two "x" characters
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.185.2 P32 L39 # 10
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction "(as modified by 802.3cg)as" should be "(as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x) as"
Note the missing space after the "(" character

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction change:
"(as modified by 802.3cg)as" to:
"(as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x) as"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192 P32 L45 # 11
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the editing instruction "Insert 45.2.1.192 and 45.2.1.196" should be "Insert 45.2.1.192 through 45.2.1.196"

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction change:
"Insert 45.2.1.192 and 45.2.1.196" to:
"Insert 45.2.1.192 through 45.2.1.196"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192 P32 L48 # 12
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the text of 45.2.1.192 "MultiGBASE-T1 PMA register" should be "MultiGBASE-T1 PMA control register"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
"MultiGBASE-T1 PMA register" to:
"MultiGBASE-T1 PMA control register"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192 P33 L11 # 13
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

In the left hand column of Table 45-155a, "1.2309.13:12" should not wrap across two lines

SuggestedRemedy

Make the "Bit(s)" column wider so that "1.2309.13:12" does not wrap across two lines

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192.1 P33 L32 # 132
Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"PMD/PMA" everywhere else it is "PMA/PMD"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "PMD/PMA" to "PMA/PMD"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192.1 P33 L35 # 14
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Notes should have paragraph tag "Note" applied

SuggestedRemedy

Apply paragraph tag "Note" to the note.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192.3 P34 L2 # 15
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Strange paragraph formatting at the top of page 34.
 "The default value of bit 1.2309.11 is zero." appears to be a separate paragraph, but if so,
 the spacing is incorrect.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix the formatting at the top of page 34
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192.4 P34 L14 # 133
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "149.3.2.2.19" should be an active cross-reference, but isn't.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make "149.3.2.2.19" an active cross reference
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.192.4 P34 L14 # 17
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "149.3.2.2.19" should be a cross-reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make "149.3.2.2.19" a cross-reference
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.193 P34 L31 # 18
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In Table 45-155b, "MultiGBASE-T1 OAM Ability" should not have a capital A in Ability
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "MultiGBASE-T1 OAM ability" as per the heading of 45.2.1.193.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.194 P35 L48 # 20
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Double full stop ".."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete one "."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.195 P36 L45 # 21
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Double full stop ".."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete one "."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.196.1 P37 L48 # 22
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In the heading of 45.2.1.196.1, "(1.2315.15:13)" should be "(1.2313.15:13)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In the heading of 45.2.1.196.1, change "(1.2315.15:13)" to "(1.2313.15:13)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.197 P38 L21 # 24
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE uses an en-dash as a minus sign and also it should not be on a different line from the number.

SuggestedRemedy

Since this draft appears to be written using FrameMaker version 12, this can be fixed by changing the minus sign to an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p) and ensuring that under Format, Document, Text Options, en-dash does not appear in the Allow Line Breaks After list.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.198 P38 L28 # 25
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

IEEE uses an en-dash as a minus sign

SuggestedRemedy

Change the minus sign to an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p) here and also on line 37

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.199 P38 L32 # 26
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

it is preferable to use "Rx" rather than "RX" to be an abbreviation of receiver.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "RX" to "Rx" in 3 places in 45.2.1.199 (including the title) to align with the name in Table 45-3

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3 P38 L44 # 27
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The use of "-" between numbers to indicate a range is discouraged by the IEEE style guide. "adjust" is not a valid editing instruction The inserted rows are 1.2318 to 1.2324

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change: "1.2318 - 1.2320" to: "1.2318 to 1.2324" and change "adjust" to "change the"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3 P39 L14 # 29
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The subclause column of Table 45-176 is missing cross-references to 45.2.3.76 through 45.2.3.80 in the inserted rows

SuggestedRemedy

In the subclause column of Table 45-176 add underlined cross-references to 45.2.3.76 through 45.2.3.80 in the inserted rows

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3 P39 L20 # 30
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The entry for "3.2318 through 3.32767" in Table 45-176 should be shown as changing to "3.2325 through 3.32767"

SuggestedRemedy

Show the "18" in strikethrough and add "25" in underline font

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3 P39 L21 # 31
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The editing instruction says "unchanged rows not shown" so the last row of Table 45-176 should just contain "..."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the last row with "..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.76 P43 L31 # 34
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 In Table 45-244a, the "Name" column has unnecessary line wraps.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Increase the width of the "Name" column and decrease the width of the "Description" column to remove the line wraps
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.77 P43 L47 # 35
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "MultiGBASE-T1" should not split across two lines
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the hyphen with a non-breaking hyphen [Esc - h (three key presses)]
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.78.1 P44 L47 # 36
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Notes should have paragraph tag "Note" applied
 SuggestedRemedy
 Apply paragraph tag "Note" to the note.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.80.2 P47 L23 # 37
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE uses an en-dash as a minus sign
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the minus sign to an en-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-p) here and also on line 24
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.9.2.7 P48 L35 # 38
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE does not use the term "section" in editing instructions.
 Space missing before "("
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Change Section 45.2.9.2.7(as..." to "Change 45.2.9.2.7 (as..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC **45.2.9.3.2** P**48** L**50** # **39**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 IEEE does not use the term "section" in editing instructions.
 Space missing before "("
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Change Section 45.2.9.3.2(as..." to "Change 45.2.9.3.2 (as..."
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 78 SC **78.3** P**51** L**17** # **40**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 IEEE does not use the term "section" in editing instructions.
 Space missing before "("
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "section" here and on line 22
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 125 SC **125.1.4** P**60** L**19** # **113**
 McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 unnecessary period
SuggestedRemedy
 change ":" to ":"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 125 SC **125.1.4** P**61** L**18** # **146**
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
Comment Type T **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Table 125-2 is missing the entries in the RS and XGMII columns for clause 46 for both
 2.5GBASE-T1 and 5GBASE-T1.
SuggestedRemedy
 Add "M" under RS for both PHYs and "O" under XGMII for both PHYs.
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC **149.1.3** P**63** L**46** # **149**
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Spaces between numbers and units should be non-breaking.
SuggestedRemedy
 Make spaces between 5 Gb/s (and 2.5 Gb/s and 10Gb/s) non breaking (CNTL-space).
 Editorial license to do similarly throughout the draft. (same thing with 15 m, and other
 number-unit combinations)
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC **149.1.3** P**63** L**53** # **150**
 Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Space missing "equal to10"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "equal to10" to "equal to 10"
Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.3.3** **P92** **L47** # **70**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

"Annex 149-4" link to Figure 149-4 doesn't belong.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete "Annex 149-4".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.3.8.2.12** **P102** **L51** # **76**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

Need tab in front of OAM<13:12><7:0> to align text correctly.

SuggestedRemedy
Add tab.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.4.5** **P129** **L7** # **77**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

Remove Editor's note as it no longer applies.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove box around note and all contents.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.7** **P138** **L7** # **78**

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

Remove Editor's note as it no longer applies.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove box around note and all contents.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.9.2.1** **P144** **L25** # **106**

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

List complete Standards reference (note: these Standards were added to the main document bibliography by Maintenance Request 1315)

SuggestedRemedy
Replace, "ISO 16750-4 and IEC 60068-2--1/27/30/38/52/64/78" with "ISO 16750-4, IEC 60068-2-1, IEC 60068-2-27, IEC 60068-2-30, IEC 60068-2-38, IEC 60068-2-52, IEC 60068-2-64, and IEC 60068-2-78"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.9.2.2** **P144** **L41** # **102**

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

List complete Standards reference

SuggestedRemedy
Replace, "IEC 61967-1/4" with "IEC 61967-1, IEC 61967-4"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 **SC 149.9.2.2** **P144** **L42** # **103**

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** **EZ**

List complete Standards reference

SuggestedRemedy
Replace, "IEC 62132-1/4" with "IEC 62132-1, IEC 62132-4"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 **SC 149.9.2.2** **P144** **L43** # 104
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 List complete Standards reference

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "ISO 10605 and IEC 61000-4-2/3" with "ISO 10605, IEC 61000-4-2, IEC 61000-4-3"

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl intro **SC intro** **P21** **L27** # 80
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Typo

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2018comprehnsvie" to "comprehensive" to match template.

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 **SC 149.9.2.2** **P144** **L44** # 105
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 List complete Standards reference

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "IEC 62215-3 and ISO 7637-2/3" with "IEC 62215-3, ISO 7637-2, and ISO 7637-3"

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 **SC 149.10.** **P145** **L28** # 107
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E **Comment Status D** **EZ**
 Incorrect formatting for table contents

SuggestedRemedy
 Format the contents of Table 149-10 as Times New Roman 9.0pt (I think this can be accomplished by applying Paragraph Tag: Body)

Proposed Response **Response Status W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.