Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **26**　　　# 1

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018 is now approved

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3cd-201x" to "IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **3**　　　# 2

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

The abstract should not contain "Draft D1.1 is prepared for Task Force Review."

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "Draft D1.1 is prepared for Task Force Review."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　*P* **21**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 3

Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

"2019Draft Standard for Ethernet" contains a spurious "2019"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "2019"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **25**　　　# 26

Maguire, Valere　　　　　　The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

IEEE Std 802.3cd-201x has published.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all occurances of "IEEE Std 802.3cd-201x" with "IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **5**　　　# 21

Maguire, Valere　　　　　　The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Incorrect capitalization

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "physical layer" with "Physical Layer"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **5**　　　# 22

Maguire, Valere　　　　　　The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

MASTER-SLAVE could be added to the keywords

SuggestedRemedy

Insert " MASTER-SLAVE;" after "IEEE 802.3chTM; "

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**　　*SC* **1.3**　　　　　*P* **22**　　　*L* **6**　　　# 131

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　General Motors

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　EZ

Change wording of Editor's note.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Insert the following references in 1.3 alphanumeric order as follows:
To: Insert the following references in 1.3 in alphanumeric order as follows:

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **1**
SC **1.3**

Page 1 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:46 PM

Cl **1**	*SC* **1.4**	*P* **22**	*L* **26**	# 132

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 802.3cb-2018)as
To: 802.3cb-2018) as

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**	*SC* **1.5**	*P* **22**	*L* **50**	# 133

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Remove note on the type of paragraph to use for Abbreviations.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove: [abbreviations use paragraph tag AcrList,ac]

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **44**	*SC* **44.1.3**	*P* **27**	*L* **41**	# 282

den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Figure 44.1 shows "WIS = WAN INTERFACE SUBLAYER" inside the lower diagram of the figure, and not in the list below. This is confusing because WIS does not occur in that lower diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the definition: "WIS = WAN INTERFACE SUBLAYER" to the list below the figure.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **44**	*SC* **44.1.3**	*P* **28**	*L* **3**	# 4

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Item d of 44.1.3 contains five external cross-references that are not in forest green

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag "External" to "Clause 53", "Clause 54", "Clause 55", "Clause 68", and "Clause 52"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**	*SC* **45..2.3**	*P* **40**	*L* **23**	# 7

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Part of the suggested remedy for Comment #27 against D1.0 was:
In the editing instruction, change: "1.2318 - 1.2320" to: "1.2318 to 1.2324"
The response was:
ACCEPT
but the text in the editing instruction is "1.2318 to 1.2320" where the second number is still incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change: "1.2318 to 1.2320" to: "1.2318 to 1.2324"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.1.18.aa**	*P* **32**	*L* **33**	# 5

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

In the editing instruction "before 45.2.1.18a (added by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018)" the reference "45.2.1.18a" should be "45.2.1.18.a"

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change "45.2.1.18a" to "45.2.1.18.a"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**
SC **45.2.1.18.aa**

Page 2 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.192.1**   *P* **34**   *L* **28**   # 146

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Remove timing for restoration of normal operation and refer to 149.4.2.1 instead.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The control and management interface shall be restored to operation within 0.5 s from the setting of bit 1.2309.15.
To: The control and management interface shall be restored to operation within the time specified in 149.4.2.1 from the setting of bit 1.2309.15.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.192.3**   *P* **35**   *L* **13**   # 134

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change: the device shall, as a minimum
To: the device shall, at a minimum

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.192.4**   *P* **35**   *L* **25**   # 6

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Comment #16 against D1.0 was:
In the heading of 45.2.1.192.4, "(1.2309.14)" should be "(1.2309.10:9)"
The response was:
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This is covered by Comment #85.
but comment #85 made no change to the draft.

SuggestedRemedy

In the heading of 45.2.1.192.4, change "(1.2309.14)" to "(1.2309.10:9)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.192.4**   *P* **35**   *L* **28**   # 135

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

verb/noun agreement

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Setting these bits force the precoder to the mode set.
To: Setting these bits forces the precoder to the mode set.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.74**   *P* **43**   *L* **12**   # 9

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

In the "Description" for bit 3.2313.15, "This bit shall self clear when register 3.2317 is read." has been changed to "See 45.2.3.74.1 for self-clearing behavior".
However, this is text in the base standard being changed via a "Change" editing instruction so this change has to be shown with strikethrough and underline font.

SuggestedRemedy

In the "Description" for bit 3.2313.15:
show "This bit shall self clear when register 3.2317 is read." in strikethrough font.
and show "See 45.2.3.74.1 for self-clearing behavior." in underline font. Note the addition of "." at the end of this.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.74.2**   *P* **43**   *L* **41**   # 298

den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

asociate: missing d

SuggestedRemedy

asociated

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **45**   Page 3 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **45.2.3.74.2**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.3.78.1**	*P* **46**	*L* **1**	# 11

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Extra ")" at the end of "45.2.3.78.1 PCS reset (3.2322.15))"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the extra ")"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.9.2.7**	*P* **49**	*L* **51**	# 12

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

As noted in Comment #38 against D1.0, space missing before "(" in the editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the space.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**	*SC* **45.2.9.3.2**	*P* **50**	*L* **30**	# 13

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

As noted in Comment #39 against D1.0, space missing before "(" in the editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the space.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**	*SC* **98.5.1**	*P* **56**	*L* **8**	# 83

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The editor note should refer to 98.5.1, not 98.1.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editor note from "… dashed list of 98.1.5 after …"
to
"… dashed list of 98.5.1 after …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98B**	*SC* **98B.3**	*P* **168**	*L* **24**	# 259

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A6through" to "A6 through"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **104**	*SC* **104.7.2.4**	*P* **60**	*L* **1**	# 14

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The heading for Table 104-9 has a grey background.

SuggestedRemedy

Make it white.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **104**   Page 4 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **104.7.2.4**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.1.2**   *P* **61**   *L* **12**   # 147

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Incorrect wording for MDI

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Media Dependent Interface (MDI)
To: Medium Dependent Interface (MDI)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **125**   *SC* **125.1.2**   *P* **62**   *L* **17**   # 140

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
alignment of figure elements

SuggestedRemedy
Need to align MDI box of 5GBASE-T which overlaps the AN box.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Align MDI and AN boxes, and editorial license to align other boxes and lines in Figure 125-
1 to fix overlaps.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149**   *P* **66**   *L* **2**   # 141

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: (PMA) sublayer and
To: (PMA) sublayer, and

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3**   *P* **66**   *L* **49**   # 142

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing space

SuggestedRemedy
Change: at least 15 m.The
To: at least 15 m. The

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.3**   *P* **69**   *L* **25**   # 262

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Repeat statement

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the sentence:"The PMA Transmit function in the PHY then sends an alert message
to the link partner" in line 25~26

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.3.3**   *P* **69**   *L* **25**   # 149

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Duplicate sentence.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove one instance of: The PMA Transmit function in the PHY then sends an alert
message to the link partner.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 5 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.1.3.3**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.1.4**   *P* **72**   *L* **16**   # 152

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

missing comma before and

SuggestedRemedy

Change: refresh, quiet and alert signaling
To: refresh, quiet, and alert signaling

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.2**   *P* **73**   *L* **5**   # 15

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

"Clause 98.4" should be just "98.4"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Clause 98.4" to "98.4"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.2.2.3.1**   *P* **76**   *L* **44**   # 155

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Formatting of text under SYMB and ALERT does not match the rest of the document.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the paragraph formatting.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **83**   *L* **10**   # 156

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Add commas for readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: These bits are then mapped two at a time into a PAM4 symbol.
To: These bits are then mapped, two at a time, into a PAM4 symbol.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **83**   *L* **22**   # 157

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Missing open parenthesis

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Tn)
To: (Tn)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   *P* **83**   *L* **23**   # 158

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Change signal value to +1 for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: {-1, 1}
To: {-1, +1}

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change: {-1, 1}
To: {−1, +1}

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 6 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.3.2.2**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.1**   *P* **84**   *L* **4**   # 159

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 65B-RS_FEC
To: 65B RS-FEC

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.2**   *P* **85**   *L* **31**   # 161

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

extraneous word

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the word "pair" from Figure 149-6. This is left from the 4-pair figure and ins't needed here.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.3**   *P* **85**   *L* **37**   # 185

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Need to keep this paragraph with the one before it instead of allowing them to be separated by the Figures or the statement "The subscript in the above labels" is out of context.

SuggestedRemedy

Keep paragraphs together through formatting.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.11**   *P* **89**   *L* **37**   # 25

Maguire, Valere   The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Correct grammatical of the word "which"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "(which is reserved)" with ", which is reserved"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.15**   *P* **90**   *L* **39**   # 265

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Just shows half g of g(x), and half 0 of g0 in Equation (149-1)

SuggestedRemedy

Zoom out a little bit for the equation (149-1) to show the full equation.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.15**   *P* **90**   *L* **39**   # 16

Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Equation (149-1) is truncated
Is this a "Medium" equation?

SuggestedRemedy

If it is not already, make this a "Medium" equation.
"Shrink-wrap" the equation.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.3.2.2.15**

Page 7 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.16**   *P* **93**   *L* **33**   # 116

Chen, Steven   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   The L33~L37 seems being a duplicated copy of the L27~L31.

SuggestedRemedy
   Remove L33~L37.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.16**   *P* **93**   *L* **33**   # 95

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Line 33 to line 37 are the same as line 27 to line 31.

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete line 33 to line 37.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.16**   *P* **93**   *L* **33**   # 263

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Repeat statement

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete the repeat statement of line 33-37, which are the same as line 27-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.16**   *P* **93**   *L* **36**   # 186

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   i,r should be subscripts

SuggestedRemedy
   For pi,r, change i,r to a subscript of p.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.2.21**   *P* **96**   *L* **27**   # 187

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Add comma for readability.

SuggestedRemedy
   Change: After the sleep signal is transmitted LPI control characters shall be
   To: After the sleep signal is transmitted, LPI control characters shall be

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.3**   *P* **97**   *L* **14**   # 99

Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Change "65B-RS-FEC" to "65B RS-FEC", same as the convention used in 149.3.2.2.2

SuggestedRemedy
   Change "65B-RS-FEC" on line 14 and line 15 to "65B RS-FEC".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.3**   *P* **97**   *L* **14**   # 160

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   typo

SuggestedRemedy
   Change: 65B-RS-FEC
   To: 65B RS-FEC
   Also page 97 line 15 and page 140 line 46.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 8 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.3.2.3**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.3**   *P* **97**   *L* **51**   # 189
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Add comma for readability.

SuggestedRemedy
Change: After these frames the link partner
To: After these frames, the link partner

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.3.2**   *P* **98**   *L* **16**   # 190
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
The equation references are swapped. The Master receive function should use the Slave transmit scrambler to descramble and the Slave receiver should use the Master transmit scrambler to descramble.

SuggestedRemedy
Swap the references to Equation (149-5) and Equation (149-6) in the following text: For side-stream descrambling, the MASTER PHY shall employ the receiver descrambler generator polynomial per Equation (149–5) and the SLAVE PHY shall employ the receiver descrambler generator polynomial per Equation (149–6).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.2.3.3**   *P* **98**   *L* **24**   # 17
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Two instances of "Table 149–1" (in b) and c)) should be cross-references.

SuggestedRemedy
Make the two instances of "Table 149–1" cross-references.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.3**   *P* **98**   *L* **43**   # 234
Zimmerman, George   CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
"however there is the possibility that the RS-FEC decoder may have corrected some errors." "may" is a special word for "is permitted to" in this case a fact is being described.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "however there is
the possibility that the RS-FEC decoder may have corrected some errors." to
"however there is
the possibility that the RS-FEC decoder corrected some errors."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.4.4**   *P* **100**   *L* **8**   # 49
Lo, William   Axonne Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Section duplicated

SuggestedRemedy
Delete section.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.4.4**   *P* **100**   *L* **8**   # 191
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
This is a duplicate of 149.3.4.3.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete 149.3.4.4.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   Page 9 of 19
SC **149.3.4.4**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.3.5**	*P***100**	*L***25**	# 192

Wienckowski, Natalie · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · General Motors

Comment Type **E** · · · · · *Comment Status* **D** · *EZ*

Add comma for readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Within the LPI mode PHYs use a repeating quiet-refresh cycle
To: Within the LPI mode, PHYs use a repeating quiet-refresh cycle

Proposed Response · · · · · · *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.3.5**	*P***100**	*L***29**	# 194

Wienckowski, Natalie · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · General Motors

Comment Type **E** · · · · · *Comment Status* **D** · *EZ*

grammer - the letter L is "el" which requires an in front of it

SuggestedRemedy

Change: a LPI
To: an LPI

Proposed Response · · · · · · *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.3.5**	*P***100**	*L***30**	# 193

Wienckowski, Natalie · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · General Motors

Comment Type **E** · · · · · *Comment Status* **D** · *EZ*

Add comma for readability.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: lpi_qr_time equal to 96 RS-FEC frame periods.
To: lpi_qr_time, equal to 96 RS-FEC frame periods.

Proposed Response · · · · · · *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.3.5.1**	*P***101**	*L***19**	# 35

Benyamin, Saied · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · Aquantia

Comment Type **TR** · · · · *Comment Status* **D** · *EZ*

We need to establish limitation for alert starts so that it does not overlap with the link partner's alert.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following paragraph:
The four RS-Frame long Alert may start at the beginning of every eighth PHY frame boundary starting at the beginning of the frame following the refresh PHY frame. This sets alert_period to 4 PHY frames and provides the following two benefits: The MASTER and SLAVE allowable alert transmissions do not overlap and Alert does not overlap device's own refresh. The MASTER and SLAVE shall derive the tx_refresh_active and tx_alert_start signals from the transmitted PHY frames (tx_rsfc) as shown in Table 149-5 and Table 149-6.

Proposed Response · · · · · · *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **149**	*SC* **149.3.6.2.3**	*P***104**	*L***2**	# 74

Graba, Jim · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · Broadcom

Comment Type **E** · · · · · *Comment Status* **D** · *EZ*

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response · · · · · · *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.3.6.2.3**

Page 10 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.6.2.4**   *P* **105**   *L* **42**   # 197
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Hex alphabetic charcters should be capitalized.

SuggestedRemedy
Change: 0x1e
To: 0x1E
Also on page 105, line 45

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.6.2.4**   *P* **105**   *L* **53**   # 198
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
duplicate sentence.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete on instance of: A valid O code is one containing an O code specified in Table 149–1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.6.2.5**   *P* **107**   *L* **1**   # 220
Zimmerman, George   CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Accept rfer counter logic for rfer monitor state machine. These are needed, and should not be controversial.

SuggestedRemedy
Accept text in yellow at lines 1 through 6 on page 107, delete editor's note on lines 47 through 51 on page 106.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.6.2.5**   *P* **107**   *L* **1**   # 102
Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Remove editorial highlights from line 1 to line 5.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove editorial highlights on line 1 to line 5.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.7.1**   *P* **107**   *L* **46**   # 119
Chen, Steven   Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Change PCS_status to the defined pcs_status for naming consistency.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "PCS_status" to "pcs_status"
Suggest to search and replace it globally.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make suggested change.

Also make change on P150 L46 x2, P151 L12, P151 L18, P48 L35.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.4**   *P* **115**   *L* **44**   # 200
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
awkward wording

SuggestedRemedy
Change: This bit is set by the PHY to for the link partner to echo on Ping RX.
To: This bit is set by the PHY for the link partner to echo on Ping RX.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.3.8.2.4**

Page 11 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.12**   *P* **117**   *L* **17**   # 201
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing period

SuggestedRemedy
Add a period at the end of the sentence.
Also on page 117, lines 24, 30, 36, 42, and 49.
Also on page 118, lines 1 and 6.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.13**   *P* **118**   *L* **32**   # 203
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing period

SuggestedRemedy
Add a period at the end of the sentence.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.13**   *P* **118**   *L* **35**   # 204
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing period

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Figure 149–19 Before calculation
To: Figure 149–19. Before calculation

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.13**   *P* **118**   *L* **35**   # 307
den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Period missing after "Figure 149–19"

SuggestedRemedy
Add period

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented by comment 204.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.17**   *P* **120**   *L* **22**   # 207
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: After the link partner receives the OAM message it transfers it
To: After the link partner receives the OAM message, it transfers it

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.2.17**   *P* **120**   *L* **23**   # 208
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: One OAM message can be loaded into the OAM transmit registers while another
OAM message is being transmitted by the PHY to the link partner while yet another OAM
message is being read out at the link partner's OAM receive registers.
To: One OAM message can be loaded into the OAM transmit registers while another OAM
message is being transmitted by the PHY to the link partner, while yet another OAM
message is being read out at the link partner's OAM receive registers.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 12 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.3.8.2.17**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.2.17** | *P* **120** | *L* **26** | # 209 |

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
Change: The exchange of OAM messages are occurring concurrently and bi-directionally.
To: The exchange of OAM messages is occurring concurrently and bi-directionally.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.2.17** | *P* **120** | *L* **27** | # 210 |

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: On the transmit side mr_tx_valid = 0 indicates that the
next OAM message can be written into the OAM transmit registers.
To: On the transmit side, mr_tx_valid = 0 indicates that the
next OAM message can be written into the OAM transmit registers.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.2.17** | *P* **120** | *L* **30** | # 211 |

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma and subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Once the registers are written the management entity sets mr_tx_valid to 1 to
indicate that the OAM transmit registers contains a valid OAM message.
To: Once the registers are written, the management entity sets mr_tx_valid to 1 to
indicate that the OAM transmit registers contain a valid OAM message.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.2.17** | *P* **120** | *L* **33** | # 212 |

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: On the receive side mr_rx_lp_valid indicates that valid OAM message can be
read from the OAM receive registers.
To: On the receive side, mr_rx_lp_valid indicates that valid OAM message can be read
from the OAM receive registers.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.2.17** | *P* **120** | *L* **35** | # 213 |

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: If mr_rx_lp_valid is not cleared then the OAM
To: If mr_rx_lp_valid is not cleared, then the OAM

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| *Cl* **149** | *SC* **149.3.8.4.2** | *P* **128** | *L* **16** | # 45 |

Lo, William   Axonne Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Highlighted sentence is accurate

SuggestedRemedy
Remove highlight

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 13 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.3.8.4.2**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.2**   *P* **129**   *L* **30**   # 46
Lo, William   Axonne Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Highlighted sentence is accurate

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove highlight

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.3**   *P* **127**   *L* **17**   # 217
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    missing periods

SuggestedRemedy
    Add periods at the end of all 4 "Values" sentences.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.3**   *P* **127**   *L* **35**   # 162
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    We changed to BASE-T1 OAM

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: 1000BASE-T1 OAM
    To: BASE-T1 OAM

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.3**   *P* **128**   *L* **16**   # 39
Benyamin, Saied   Aquantia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    rx_boundary description has yellow highligted

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove the yellow as the text is correct

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.3**   *P* **129**   *L* **30**   # 40
Benyamin, Saied   Aquantia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    tx_boundary description has yellow highligted

SuggestedRemedy
    Remove the yellow as the text is correct

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.3.8.4.6**   *P* **131**   *L* **17**   # 124
Chen, Steven   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    The downward arrow from RECEIVE INIT state to CHECK READ state is missing the
    transition condition.

SuggestedRemedy
    Add conditional label "UCT" for the arrow in the middle.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED REJECT.

    If comment #66 is accepted as the response is written, a condition is added to this
    transition.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2**   *P* **134**   *L* **47**   # 168
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
    Incorrect Figure reference

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: Figure 149-12
    To: Figure 149-24
    Make the same change on line 49.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 14 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.4.2**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.1**   *P* **135**   *L* **4**   # 169
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
missing space

SuggestedRemedy
Change: hold true.All
To: hold true. All

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.1**   *P* **135**   *L* **4**   # 264
Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change "true.All" to "true. All", just add one space.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement change as requested in comment 169.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.1**   *P* **135**   *L* **4**   # 294
den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
"true.All"

SuggestedRemedy
Add space

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement change as requested in comment 169.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.1**   *P* **135**   *L* **7**   # 145
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Add requirement for time allowed to perform a reset at the end of this section.

SuggestedRemedy
Add a new paragraph at the end of this section: The time for the PMA to resume normal
transmit and receive functions after pma_reset transitions to OFF shall not exceed 20 ms.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**
PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.3**   *P* **135**   *L* **34**   # 225
Zimmerman, George   CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
RS-FEC error rate specification "The quality of these symbols shall allow RFER of less
than TBD after RS-FEC decoding"… 10^-12 BER with an RS-FEC frame of 3260
message bits (with the errored frame replaced by error symbols) means an RFER same as
the BER, or 10^-12.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "TBD" with "10^-12" (where ^ indicates superscript)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**
PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.3**   *P* **135**   *L* **44**   # 173
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
Change: from any other values
To: from any other value

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 15 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.4.2.3**   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.4**   *P* **136**   *L* **13**   # 18
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
In the third paragraph of 149.4.2.4, "149.4.2.4.2" and "149.4.2.4.8" should be cross-references and "FFigure 149–27" has a spurious extra "F"

SuggestedRemedy
Make "149.4.2.4.2" and "149.4.2.4.8" cross-references and delete the spurious "F" in "FFigure 149–27".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.4**   *P* **136**   *L* **14**   # 174
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
extra "F"

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Ffigure 149-27
To: Figure 149-27

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete leading "F" before cross-reference.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.4.5**   *P* **138**   *L* **17**   # 177
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Should be the letter "O", not the number "0".

SuggestedRemedy
Change: [0ct8<7:0>, 0ct9<7:0>, 0ct10<7:0>]
To: [Oct8<7:0>, Oct9<7:0>, Oct10<7:0>]

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.5**   *P* **141**   *L* **36**   # 179
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
Change: the Auto-Negotiation function set link_control
To: the Auto-Negotiation function sets link_control

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.7**   *P* **146**   *L* **5**   # 75
Graba, Jim   Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Update the moving time window length to be equivalent to 2.5G/5G/10GBASE-T

SuggestedRemedy
Change 50 to 256. Change 16.384/S ms to 7.864/S ms

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**
PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.8**   *P* **146**   *L* **13**   # 106
Tu, Mike   Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Remove editorial highlight.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove editorial highlight.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
Cl **149**   *SC* **149.4.2.8**   Page 16 of 19   3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.3.1** *P* **146** *L* **27** # 19

Anslow, Pete — Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

In "{−1, -1/3, 1/3, 1}" the hyphen should be an en dash

SuggestedRemedy

In "{−1, -1/3, 1/3, 1}" change the hyphen to an en dash

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change: {−1, -1/3, 1/3, 1}
To: {−1, −1/3, +1/3, +1}

See comment 181

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.3.1** *P* **146** *L* **27** # 181

Wienckowski, Natalie — General Motors

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

fix "-" and add "+" to be consistent with the rest of the document.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: {−1, -1/3, 1/3, 1}
To: {−1, −1/3, +1/3, +1}

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.4** *P* **148** *L* **14** # 271

WU, Peter — Marvell

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

PAM3 stilll used

SuggestedRemedy

change "PAM3" to "PAM4"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.4.1** *P* **147** *L* **3** # 241

Zimmerman, George — CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Accept variables for en_slave_tx, infofield_complete, loc_phy_ready, loc_countdown_done, PMA_state, rem_countdown_done, rem_phy_ready, and sync_link_control.
Do not accept PMA_watchdog_status, as this is not used.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove highlighting from en_slave_tx, infofield_complete, loc_phy_ready, loc_countdown_done, PMA_state, rem_countdown_done, rem_phy_ready, and sync_link_control.

Delete PMA_watchdog_status at P147 L51- P148 L9

Proposed Response *Response Status* **Z**

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.4.1** *P* **148** *L* **1** # 110

Tu, Mike — Broadcom

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Change "PAM3" to "PAM4"

SuggestedRemedy

On line 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 9, change "PAM3" to "PAM4".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149** *SC* **149.4.4.1** *P* **148** *L* **14** # 54

Lo, William — Axonne Inc.

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

rem_countdown_done variable

SuggestedRemedy

Change PAM3 to PAM4

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**
SC **149.4.4.1**

Page 17 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:50 PM

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.1**   *P* **151**   *L* **37**   # 182

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Add commas for readability.

SuggestedRemedy
Change: If MDIO is implemented these test modes shall be enabled by setting a control register 1.2313.15:13 as
To: If MDIO is implemented, these test modes shall be enabled by setting a control register, 1.2313.15:13, as

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.1**   *P* **152**   *L* **36**   # 183

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Remove extraneous comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: , or,
To: , or

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.1.1**   *P* **154**   *L* **26**   # 184

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

SuggestedRemedy
Remove "Link Partner" box in Figure 149-36 over the Figure title.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.5.1.1**   *P* **154**   *L* **27**   # 269

WU, Peter   Marvell

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Figure 149-36 with wrong piece copied

SuggestedRemedy
remove the block of " link partner" in the figure

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.6.1**   *P* **157**   *L* **38**   # 230

Zimmerman, George   CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Remaining parameters will be communicated via infofields. List is complete at this time.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete editor's note at 157 line 38

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7.1.3**   *P* **160**   *L* **13**   # 252

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change "N" to "N = " in the equation (149-21)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.7.1.3**   *P* **160**   *L* **33**   # 254

Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change "N" to "N = " in the equation (149-23)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **149**   Page 18 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **149.7.1.3**   3/1/2019 5:41:51 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.8.2.1**   *P* **163**   *L* **15**   # 258
Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change "4000 MHz × S" to "4000 × S MHz"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **149A**   *SC* **149A.4**   *P* **170**   *L* **33**   # 261
Wei, Dong   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change "Testfixture" to "Test Fixture"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **Introdu**   *SC* **Introduction**   *P* **11**   *L* **5**   # 278
den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
"for 2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 10 Gb/s operation on automotive cabling in an automotive application."

SuggestedRemedy
replace by: "for operation at 2.5Gb/s, 5Gb/s, and 10Gb/ over single shielded balanced pair of conductors."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **Page**   *SC* **Title page**   *P* **21**   *L* **1**   # 279
den Besten, Gerrit   NXP Semiconductors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
"2019Draft" The 2019 seems not to belong here.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace by "Draft"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **Page**
SC **Title page**

Page 19 of 19
3/1/2019 5:41:51 PM