zal Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than $1 \mathrm{~Gb} / \mathrm{s}$ Automotive Ethernet 4th Tí

| CI 44 | SC | 44.1.3 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Maguire, Valere | P27 | L3 |

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

SuggestedRemedy
Insert a comma after the last word coming before "which" in these locations: page 27 - line
3 , page 35 - line 31 , page 61 - line 8 , page 69 - line 37 , page $70-$ line 2 , page $80-$ line 5 , and page 90 - line 51.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 45 | SC 45.2.3.72.5 | P42 | $L 15$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Anslow, Pete | Ciena | \# 8 |  |

Comment Type E Comment Status D
Editorial
In the second line of text "8 octet" has been changed to "8-octet"
In the second line of text " 8 octet" has been changed
If it is intended that this amendment changes " 8 octet" to " 8 -octet" then this has to be shown with strikethrough and underline font, preferably with "8 octet" in strikethrough and "8-octet" in underline for clarity.

## SuggestedRemedy

If it is intended that this amendment changes " 8 octet" to " 8 -octet" then this has to be shown with strikethrough and underline font, preferably with "8 octet" in strikethrough and 8-octet" in underline for clarity.
Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| Cl $45 \quad$ SC 45.2.3.75 | P44 | L3 | \# 10 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Anslow, Pete | Ciena |  |  |

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial While the addition of the hyphen in "8-octet" is shown with underline, the removal of the space is not shown with strikethrough.
SuggestedRemedy
Show "8 octet" in strikethrough and "8-octet" in underline for clarity.
Proposed Response Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 149 SC 149.1.3.3 | P69 <br> Wienckowski, Natalie | Leneral Motors |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Periodically the transmit
To: Periodically, the transmit
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(rewrite, removing need for the comma and improving clarity)
Change: Periodically the transmit function of the local PHY transmits refresh frames that are used by the link partner to update adaptive filters and timing circuits in order to maintain link integrity.

To: The transmit function of the local PHY periodically transmits refresh frames. These are used by the link partner to update adaptive filters and timing circuits in order to maintain link integrity

| Cl 149 | SC 149.2.2.1.1 | P74 | L48 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  | \# 154 |

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

We removed SEND_I, but didn't change the number of values to "three" from "four" in the text.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: four
To: three
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: can take on one of the following four values of the form:
To: can take on one of the following values:

| Cl 149 | SC 149.2.2.3 | P76 | L34 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Chen, Steven | Broadcom |  | \# 114 |

Using XGMII instead.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "to represent GMII data and ..." to "to represent XGMII data and ..." Suggest to search and replace it globally.
Proposed Response

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Make the suggested change and also make this change on P148 L34.


SuggestedRemedy
Change "In order to improve error correction capability, the PHY may aggregate L RS-FEC input frames into an interleaved RS-FEC input superframe."
to
"The PHY aggregates L RS-FEC input frames into an L-interleaved (L=1, 2, or 4) RS-FEC input superframe."
Proposed Response Response Status w PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| Cl 149 SC 149.3.2.2.15 | P91 | L15 | CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |

Zimmerman, George CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP
Comment Type Eomment Status D Editorial
"This may be computed". "may" is a special word for "is permitted to". In this case, it is describing an implementation.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "may" to "can"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
zal Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than $1 \mathrm{~Gb} / \mathrm{s}$ Automotive Ethernet 4th Tí

| CI 149 | SC 149.3.2.2.16 | P94 <br> Broadcom | L19 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Tu, Mike |  | \# 96 |  |

Comment Type TR Comment Status D
Editorial
Wrong indices. "m_L" should be "m_0" at both the input and the output of the Lth encoder.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "m_L" to "m_0" at bot the input and the output of the Lth RS Encoder.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 149 SC 149.3.2.2.16 | P94 | L19 | \# 117 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Chen, Steven | Broadcom |  |  |

Comment Type TR Comment Status D
Editorial
The last message symbol of the input message symbols should be m 0 , not mL .
SuggestedRemedy
In the input message symbols, change "mL" to "m0".
Proposed Response
Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| Cl 149 | SC | 149.3.2.2.16 | P94 | L19 | Futurewei Technologie |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wei, Dong |  | 266 |  |  |  |
| Comment Type | ER | Comment Status D |  | Editorial |  |

Comment Type ER Comment Status D
Editorial Typo
SuggestedRemedy
Change "mL" to "m0"; Figure 149-10, at the RS Encoder \#L, the input and output mL should be m0.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.



Add comma for readability.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: monitors the signal quality asserting hi_rfer if excessive
To: monitors the signal quality, asserting hi_rfer if excessive
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: monitors the signal quality asserting hi_rfer if excessive RS-FEC frame errors are detected.

To: monitors the signal quality and asserts hi_rfer to indicate excessive RS-FEC frame errors.


> Comment Type $\mathbf{T} \quad$ Comment Status D according to 149.3 .4 .1 , alignment bits are placed every 450 symbols.

SuggestedRemedy
Change 80 to 450.
Proposed Response Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: 180
To: 450
Changing 80 to 450 would yield 1450 which is not what is desired here.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { Cl } & 149 \\ \text { SC } & 149.3 .2 .3\end{array}$

Page 3 of 10 3/1/2019 5:42:41 PM

| Cl 149 SC 149.3.4 | P98 | L47 | \# 237 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Zimmerman, George | CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP |  |  |
| Comment Type T | Comment Status D |  | Editorial |

"PMA training side-stream scrambler polynomials" - these are also used in data mode. They're not just for breakfast anymore.

## SuggestedRemedy

Delete "PMA Training" so that the header for 149.3.4 reads "Side-stream scrambler polynomials"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 149 | SC 149.3.4.1 | P99 | L37 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| den Besten, Gerrit | NXP Semiconductors | \# 305 |  |

## Comment Type T Comment Status D <br> Editorial <br> "alignment to the RS-FEC block and the 16 partial PHY frames that comprise the block"

"block" is confusing here as block is used in the context of 64B/65B block encoding. What is meant here is PAM2 training sequence with the length of $4 R S$ frames. I think this is called super-frame.

## SuggestedRemedy

Replace by: "alignment to the RS-FEC super-frame comprising 16 partial PHY frames" Proposed Response Response Status W

## PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change: alignment to the RS-FEC block and the 16 partial PHY frames that comprise the block

To: alignment to the RS-FEC super-frame comprised of 16 partial PHY frames

| Cl $149 \quad$ SC 149.3.5 | P100 | L34 | \# 32 |
| :--- | ---: | :---: | :---: |
| Benyamin, Saied | Aquantia |  |  |
| Comment Type E | Comment Status D |  | Editorial |

We space alerts so they do it in more clear to refer
We space alerts so they do not overlap by forcing their start times. It is more clear to refer
to alert start time as opposed to alert signal. Also in the same sentence we refert to the link to alert start time as opposed to alert signal. Also in the same sentence we refert to the
lpi_offset is a fixed value equal to Ipi_qr_time / $2+4$ ( 52 RS-FEC frame periods) that is used to ensure refresh signals and alert signals are appropriately offset by the link partner's.

## SuggestedRemedy

Ipi_offset is a fixed value equal to lpi_qr_time / $2+4$ (52 RS-FEC frame periods) that is used to ensure refresh signals and alert start times are appropriately offset from the link partner's.
Proposed Response Response Status w PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "alert signals" to "alert start times" on P100 L34.

zal Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than $1 \mathrm{~Gb} / \mathrm{s}$ Automotive Ethernet 4th Tí


TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 5 of 10 3/1/2019 5:42:41 PM
;al Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than $1 \mathrm{~Gb} / \mathrm{s}$ Automotive Ethernet 4th $\mathrm{T}_{\text {c }}$

| CI 149 SC 149.3.8.2.1 | P114 $\quad$ L41 | \# 235 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Zimmerman, George | CME:ADI,Aquantia,AP |  |

Comment Type Eomment Status D Editorial
"it may be possible". "may" means "it is permitted to" - "it is permitted to be possible"
doesn't really make sense. If it is, indeed possible, "it is possible", if we are unsure, let's figure it out! (in 2 places, also on line 44)
SuggestedRemedy
Change "it may be possible" to "it is possible" on lines 41 and 44
Proposed Response Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 149 | SC 149.3.8.2.12 | P117 <br> Broadcom | $L 31$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Chen, Steven | \# 122 |  |  |

Comment Type TR Comment Status D
Editorial
The definition of "not receiving transmit messaged from the MAC" needs to be clarified.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "... not receiving transmit messaged from the MAC" to "... not receiving valid transmit message from the MAC"
Proposed Response Response Status
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI $149 \quad$ SC 149.3.8.2.13 | P118 | L14 | \# 202 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  |  |


| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |
| :--- | ---: | :---: |
| Comment Type E Comment Status D |  | subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy
Change: The $\operatorname{RS}(16,14)$ parity symbols is indicated
To: The $\operatorname{RS}(16,14)$ parity symbols are indicated
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| CI 149 | SC 149.3.8.2.14 | P118 | L41 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  | \# 205 |

Comment Type E Comment Status D
Editorial missing periods

SuggestedRemedy
Add periods at the end of the $a$ ) and b) statements.
Proposed Response Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
(change is on page 119, and a) and b) are not sentences.
Change: a) $\operatorname{RS}(16,14)$ uncorrectable error
b) Uncorrectable PHY frame on any of the 16 symbols

To: a) RS $(16,14)$ contains an uncorrectable error, or
b) there is an uncorrectable PHY frame on any of the 16 symbols


Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial
"that may cause the PHY" - it appears "can cause the PHY" would be more appropriate.
This is neither permission nor option. Occurs 2 times, also on line 51.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "may" to "can" on lines 48 \& 51
Proposed Response Response Status
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 6 of 10 3/1/2019 5:42:41 PM
zal Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than $1 \mathrm{~Gb} / \mathrm{s}$ Automotive Ethernet 4th Tí

| CI $149 \quad$ SC 149.3.8.4.3 | P126 | L47 | \# 214 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  |  |

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial missing periods
SuggestedRemedy
Add period at the end of the 0 and 1 sentences.
Proposed Response
Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: "0: BASE-T1 OAM message not received and read by the link partner
1: BASE-T1 OAM message received by the link partner"
to: "0: BASE-T1 OAM message was not received and read by the link partner.
1: BASE-T1 OAM message was received by the link partner."

| CI 149 | SC 149.3.8.4.3 | P127 | L11 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  | \# 215 |

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial improve wording to match other statements

## SuggestedRemedy

Change: Don't send request to link partner...
To: Don't request link partner...
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: false: Don't send request to link partner to clear their REC counter.
To: false: Don't request link partner to clear its REC counter.

| Cl 149 SC 149.3.8.4.3 | P127 | L12 | \# 216 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wienckowski, Natalie | General Motors |  |  |
| Comment Type E | Comment Status D | Editorial |  |

improve wording to match other statement
Editorial

SuggestedRemedy
Change: Send request to link partner...
To: Request link partner..
Proposed Response Response Status w
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change: true: Send request to link partner to clear their REC counter.
To: true: Request link partner to clear its REC counter.


Add periods at the end of both values, and editorial license to add periods at the end of other Values in 149.3.8.4.3 which may be lacking and are complete sentences (e.g., P127 L21 \& 22)


TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 7 of 10 3/1/2019 5:42:41 PM
ial Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than 1 Gb/s Automotive Ethernet 4th Tis

ial Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than 1 Gb/s Automotive Ethernet 4th Tá


| Cl 149 | SC 149.7.1.3 | P160 | L38 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Wei, Dong |  | Futurewei Technologie | \# 255 |
| Comment Type | ER | Comment Status D |  |
| Editorial |  |  |  |

## typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change " $\mathrm{N}=1$ " to " $\mathrm{N}=1$ " in the equation (149-23)
Proposed Response
Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change " $\mathrm{N}=1$ " to " $\mathrm{N}=1$ curve which is equivalent to equation (149-19)."

| CI 149A | SC 149A. 2 | P169 <br> Wei, Dong |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial Typo

SuggestedRemedy
Change " $23^{\circ} \mathrm{C} \pm 5^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ " to " $23 \pm 5^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ "
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

| $C l$ various $S C$ various | $P 0$ | $L 0$ | $\# 42$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Benyamin, Saied | Aquantia |  |  |

Comment Type Comment Status D

Editorial
There are a zillion places where 1000Base-T1 is mentioned; on some, we have crossed out the "1000"

SuggestedRemedy
They all need to change to MGBase-T1
Proposed Response Response Status W

## PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE

OAM registers used for both 1000BASE-T1 and MultiGBASE-T1 are named BASE-T1
The following are the places where "1000" does not have strikethrough but it should.
P119 L38, P127 L35

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 10 of 10 3/1/2019 5:42:41 PM

