

**Cl FM SC FM P 22 L 16 # i-3**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ**  
 According to the SA Editors, the "IMPORTANT NOTICE" is not needed and can be deleted.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Delete lines 16 through 27.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 0 SC 0 P L # i-1**  
 Berger, Catherine  
**Comment Type G Comment Status D EZ**  
 This draft meets all editorial requirements.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 0 SC 0 P 1 L 28 # i-18**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ**  
 Update publication date for 802.3cn  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change 20xx (or 201x) to 2019, also on P10 L49  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 0 SC 0 P 1 L 28 # i-17**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ**  
 Update publication date for 802.3cg  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change 20xx (or 201x) to 2019, also on P11 L1, P23 L45, P26 L22, P26 L29, P33 L27, P34 L30, P35 L3, P53 L12, P53 L35, P53 L44, P53 L50, P55 L8, P58 L1, P66 L9, P66 L17, P67 L3, P67 L41, P67 L47, P68 L5, P68 L38, P69 L23, P69 L35, P70 L7, P195 L11  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 0 SC 0 P 79 L 44 # i-4**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ**  
 Replace lower case 'x' with a multiplication symbol.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Make this change on P79 L44 & P79 L 45.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 23 L 45 # i-72**  
 Mcclellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ**  
 "IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x" is now published as "IEEE Std 802.3cg-2019"  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 change "IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x" to "IEEE Std 802.3cg-2019" in multiple locations  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 1**      **SC 1.4.494b**                      **P 23**                      **L 46**                      # **i-54**

Zimmerman, George                      ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

**Comment Type E**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

IEEE Std 802.3cg-201x has been approved as IEEE Std 802.3cg-2019

**SuggestedRemedy**  
change 802.3cg-201x to 802.3cg-2019 on P23 L45, and globally (several instances - pages 26, 33, 34, 35, 53,55,58, 66, 67,68, 69, 195 - some more than 1 per page)

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status Z**  
PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1**                      **P 32**                      **L 32**                      # **i-83**

Jonsson, Ragnar                      Aquantia

**Comment Type ER**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

In Table 45-3 the Subclause for register 1.2317 should be 45.2.1.200

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Change "Subclause" for "Register address" 1.2317 from "45.2.1.199" to "45.2.1.200".

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1.194.1**                      **P 38**                      **L 51**                      # **i-55**

Zimmerman, George                      ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

**Comment Type E**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

149.3.2.2.18 doesn't describe Reed Solomon interleaving, it describes the PCS Scrambler. The correct reference is 149.3.2.2.15. The same issue exists in 45.2.1.195.1 page 39 line 38.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Change cross reference from 149.3.2.2.18 to 149.3.2.2.15 (or appropriate link if renumbered) in both 45.2.1.194.1 and 45.2.1.195.1

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1.196.4**                      **P 41**                      **L 49**                      # **i-57**

Zimmerman, George                      ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

**Comment Type TR**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

"When the transmitter is in test mode 2, bits 1.2313.1:0 control the pattern of the jitter test signal." - what these bits do when the transmitter is not in test mode 2 is not specified...

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Suggest to add a new second sentence immediately following the quoted one, to read as follows: "When the transmitter is not in test mode 2, the setting of bits 1.2313.1:0 have no effect."

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

fix subject/verb agreement in proposal: Add the sentence "When the transmitter is not in test mode 2, the setting of bits 1.2313.1:0 has no effect."

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.3.75**                      **P 48**                      **L 1**                      # **i-73**

Mcclellan, Brett                      Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.

**Comment Type E**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

Table 45-244 should appear on page 47 following this text: "Change Table 45-244 as follows:"

**SuggestedRemedy**  
move table as indicated

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.9.3**                      **P 53**                      **L 44**                      # **i-58**

Zimmerman, George                      ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

**Comment Type E**                      **Comment Status D**                      **EZ**

Editing instruction has been separated from the table that it is editing.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Make editing instruction stay with Table 45-341

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6.4 P 68 L 48 # i-59

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Clause 97 is in the draft, but is shown as an external cross reference. It should be an active cross reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change external "Clause 97" reference to an active cross reference

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.1.3 P 79 L 18 # i-61

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM information is exchanged between two 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, or 10GBASE-T1 PHYs out-of-band." - the concept of whether this is out-of-band in the frequency domain or does not consume the bit rate for the ethernet payload has caused repeated confusion - some improved wording here might help.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Suggest change "out-of-band." to "out-of-band, that is, outside of the specified 2.5, 5, or 10 Gb/s Ethernet data stream."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.1.3.1 P 79 L 42 # i-87

Jonsson, Ragnar Aquantia

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Parameter L is introduced, without reference to the definition of L.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "L" to "A number, L,"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.1.3.1 P 79 L 44 # i-62

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"(The duration of the superframe is L x 320/ S ns.)" has no need to be a parenthetical phrase - this seems to have been left over from previous wording where the sentence structure was more complex. It is now its own stand-alone sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove the parentheses around "The duration of the superframe is L x 320 / S ns."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.1.3.2 P 80 L 17 # i-63

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

"The minimum link segment characteristics, EMC requirements, and test modes are specified in 149.5." - the link segment characteristics are specified in 149.7, not 149.5, and there are no EMC requirements in this document. Further, this subclause is supposed to be describing the PMA, not the other things.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Suggest replacing "The minimum link segment characteristics, EMC requirements, and test modes are specified in 149.5." with "The electrical parameters of the PMA, i.e., test modes, and electrical specifications for the transmitter and receiver, are specified in 149.5."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.2.2.7.1 P 88 L 39 # i-36

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Inconsistency in document. Sometimes "true" and sometimes "TRUE".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "true" to "TRUE", also on P112 L33, P112 L35, P112 L37, P112 L44, P112 L46, P112 L48, P114 L18, P114 L24, P114 L30, P114 L37, P114 L52, P115 L33, P115 L37, P115 L43, P115 L48, P115 L52, P116 L2, P116 L7, P116 L10, P116 L25, P116 L30, P116 L35, P116 L41, P119 L24, P119 L25, P119 L39, P119 L45, P123 L9, P123 L27, P123 L36, P138 L20, P138 L41, P138 L47, P139 L48, P139 L54, P144 L12, P144 L43, P156 L29, P157 L13, P157 L50, P186 L40, P204 L49, P205 L2, P205 L8, P205 L14

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Should be "TRUE" only when this represents a variable value.

Change "true" to "TRUE" on P112 L33, P112 L35, P112 L37, P112 L44, P112 L46, P112 L48, P114 L18, P114 L24, P114 L27, P114 L30, P114 L37, P114 L52, P115 L33, P115 L37, P115 L43, P115 L48, P115 L52, P116 L2, P116 L7, P116 L10, P116 L25, P116 L30, P116 L35, P116 L41, P119 L24 (2x), P119 L25, P119 L39, P119 L45, P121 L39, P123 L9, P125 L8, P125 L16, P126 L17, P126 L27, P126 L36, P138 L20, P138 L41, P138 L47, P139 L48, P139 L54, P144 L43, P156 L29, P157 L13, P157 L50, P158 L49, P186 L40, P204 L49, P205 L2, P205 L8, P205 L14, P206 L18.

Also, change "True" to "TRUE" on P136 L19.

CI 149 SC 149.3.2.2.11 P 99 L 39 # i-66

Zimmerman, George

ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

ordered set in the subclause header should be capitalized

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "149.3.2.2.11 ordered set" to "149.3.2.2.11 Ordered set"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.2.2.17 P 101 L 47 # i-23

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

superscript of 4 in x<sup>4</sup> is higher than the other superscripts

*SuggestedRemedy*

Adjust height of "4" in "x<sup>4</sup>" to match height of other x superscripts.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.2.2.17 P 101 L 47 # i-22

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

number on top of "pi" symbol is cut off

*SuggestedRemedy*

Resize equation to ensure complete equation is visible.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.2.2.22 P 105 L 16 # i-69

Zimmerman, George

ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

"The optional 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, or 10GBASE-T1 EEE capability allows compliant PHYs to transition to an LPI mode of operation when link utilization is low." isn't quite correct - EEE is independent on each direction, link utilization is not. therefore, the statement needs to be expanded - particularly because the expected applications are often asymmetric in utilization.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "when link utilization is low." to "when link utilization is low in either direction of transmission."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.2.3 P 107 L 9 # i-70

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

"PHYs with the EEE capability support transition to the LPI mode when the PHY has successfully completed training and pcs\_data\_mode is TRUE and subject to the timing requirements of 46.3.1.5." There are no timing requirements for the PHY transitioning in 46.3.1.5. It appears this is meant to reference 46.1.7 which requires the link be operational for at least one second before transitioning to LPI.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change cross reference to 46.3.1.5 to 46.1.7

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.6 P 110 L 30 # i-20

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider rewording to remove "ensure". Remove unnecessary explanatory language.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete: that is used to ensure refresh signals and alert start times are appropriately offset between the link partners

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.6.1 P 112 L 3 # i-5

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "maximize" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment. Note: This is part of the "common" wording used throughout 802.3. See 97.3.5.1, 113.3.5.1, 126.3.5.1, etc. The reasons for synchronizing refresh intervals is not required for the spec.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete: To maximize power savings, maintain link integrity, and ensure interoperability,

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.6.1 P 112 L 3 # i-6

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete: To maximize power savings, maintain link integrity, and ensure interoperability,

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.6.1 P 112 L 12 # i-19

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider rewording to remove "ensures".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change: This offset ensures that the MASTER and SLAVE ALERT windows are offset from each other and that the refresh periods are close to half cycle offset. To: The MASTER and SLAVE ALERT windows are offset from each other and the refresh periods are close to half cycle offset.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.6.3 P 113 L 8 # i-7

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "maximize" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment. Note: This is part of the "common" wording used throughout 802.3. See 97.3.5.3, 113.3.5.3, 126.3.5.3, etc. The reasons for staggering refresh signals is not required for the spec.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change: refresh signaling to maximize power savings. To: refresh signaling.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.7.2.1 P 113 L 42 # i-24

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

LP\_BLOCK\_R is not consistent with other comment names.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "LP\_BLOCK\_R" to "LPBLOCK\_R" to be consistent with other comment names.  
Also make the same change on P125 L7.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.7.2.1 P 113 L 48 # i-25

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

I\_BLOCK\_R is not consistent with other comment names.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "I\_BLOCK\_R" to "IBLOCK\_R" to be consistent with other comment names. Also make the same change on P125 L14.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.7.2.2 P 114 L 18 # i-35

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Inconsistency in document. Sometimes "false" and sometimes "FALSE".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "false" to "FALSE", also on P114 L31, P115 L19, P115 L34, P115 L38, P115 L40, P115 L44, P115 L45, P115 L49, P115 L54, P116 L4, P116 L11, P119 L25, P123 L20, P126 L6, P126 L7, P126 L8, P126 L35, P126 L44, P138 L19, P138 L44, P138 L46, P139 L51, P139 L53, P149 L12, P152 L22, P156 L28, P157 L12, P190 L3, P204 L48, P205 L1, P205 L7, P205 L13

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
Should be "FALSE" only when this represents a variable value.

Change "false" to "FALSE" on P114 L18, P114 L31, P115 L19, P115 L34, P115 L38, P115 L40, P115 L44, P115 L45, P115 L49, P115 L54, P116 L4, P116 L11, P119 L25, P121 L7, P121 L39, P123 L19, P124 L17, P125 L 15, P125 L23, P126 L6, P126 L7, P126 L8, P126 L35, P126 L43, P138 L19, P138 L44, P138 L46, P139 L51, P139 L53, P149 L12, P152 L22, P156 L28, P157 L12, P158 L9, P190 L3, P204 L48, P205 L1, P205 L7, P205 L13, P206 L6, P206 L30, P206 L41.

Also, change "False" to "FALSE" on P136 L20.

CI 149 SC 149.3.7.2.4 P 116 L 46 # i-65

Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

DECODE (rx\_symb<64:0>) - the text says that the argument is rx\_coded<64:0>. rx\_symb is what is passed by the PMA\_UNITDATA indication, before the descrambler, blocking and RS-FEC decoder (see 149.3.2.3). rx\_coded is what seems to be needed by this function according to the description.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change DECODE (rx\_symb<64:0>) to DECODE(rx\_coded<64:0>)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.1 P 128 L 37 # i-67  
 Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 "super frame" - in most places, the term is "superframe" without a space.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 replace "super frame" with "superframe" at P128 L37, L46, L51, L53; P129 L7, and PICS  
 OAM2 description (P185 L11, L13, L15)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.1 P 129 L 4 # i-26  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 The use of "0s" is not consistent with other 802.3 Clauses.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "0s" to "0's". Also make the same change on P129 L 27 and P185 L20.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.7 P 130 L 19 # i-8  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment. Note:  
 This is the same wording as 97.3.8.2.7.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change: The toggle bit is used to ensure proper OAM message synchronization between  
 the PHY and the link partner. To: The toggle bit lets the management entity determine  
 which OAM message is being referred to.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.12 P 131 L 14 # i-68  
 Zimmerman, George ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, CommScop  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 "These 32 bits are set by the PHY to convey its status in the mr\_tx\_message[95:64] to the  
 receiver (link partner)." - why is (link partner) in parentheses? I think what is meant is "to  
 the link partner." Of course it's conveyed to a receiver. When you're transmitting a  
 message, where else would it go?

SuggestedRemedy  
 change "to the receiver (link partner)" to "to the link partner."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.13 P 132 L 38 # i-30  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 typo, unnecessary "the"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "when the EEE is implemented" To "when EEE is implemented".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 149 SC 149.3.9.2.16 P 133 L 13 # i-88  
 Jonsson, Ragnar Aquantia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Simple typo "toggling" not "toggling"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "toggling" to "toggling"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.3.9.2.17 P 133 L 31 # i-31  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 type, missing space after period  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add space after "is occurring concurrently and bi-directionally."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.3 P 144 L 49 # i-37  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 missing article  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "over receive pair" To "over the receive pair".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.4 P 145 L 21 # i-38  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 The Figure is the state diagram, not a description of a state diagram.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "PHY Control shall comply with the state diagram description given in Figure 149-32." To "PHY Control shall comply with the state diagram in Figure 149-32."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.4 P 145 L 26 # i-39  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Redundant text  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "16th partial PHY frame (bits 6750 to 6845) of the PHY frame." To "16th partial PHY frame (bits 6750 to 6845)."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.4 P 145 L 32 # i-13  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE recommendation. It is not required to explain why this requirement exists.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change: Infield shall be transmitted at least 256 times with each change to octets 7-10 to ensure detection at link partner. To: Infield shall be transmitted at least 256 times with each change to octets 7-10.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.4.6 P 148 L 3 # i-9  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Consider replacing "guarantees" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment. Note: This wording is the same as 97.4.2.4.6  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change: This value of DataSwPFC24 guarantees that the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary. To: When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.



Cl 149 SC 149.4.2.6.2 P 152 L 45 # i-40  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Missing spaces  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add non-breaking spaces around +/- symbol, also on P152 L49.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.5.1 P 160 L 8 # i-41  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Redundant word  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "BER testing" to "BER".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.5.1 P 161 L 12 # i-42  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 missing article  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Instead of encoding received data from MAC," To "Instead of encoding received data from the MAC,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change "Instead of encoding received data from MAC," To "Instead of encoding data received from the MAC,"

Cl 149 SC 149.5.1 P 161 L 12 # i-43  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 poor wording  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "In the receive side" To "On the receive side".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.5.1 P 161 L 14 # i-44  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 missing article  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "calculated in RS-FEC block error rate." To "calculated in the RS-FEC block error rate."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.5.2.2 P 162 L 50 # i-45  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 missing Oxford comma  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "10GBASE-T1, 36 dB in 5GBASE-T1 and 35 dB in 2.5G mode" To "10GBASE-T1, 36 dB in 5GBASE-T1, and 35 dB in 2.5G mode"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.7.2 P 172 L 40 # i-10

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE recommendation. Note: This wording is the same as 97.6.3, 113.7.3, 126.7.3, etc.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change: To ensure the total alien NEXT loss and alien FEXT loss coupled between link segments is limited, power sum alien near-end crosstalk (PSANEXT) loss and power sum alien attenuation to crosstalk ratio far-end (PSAACR-F) is specified. To: Power sum alien near-end crosstalk (PSANEXT) loss and power sum alien attenuation to crosstalk ratio far-end (PSAACR-F) are specified to limit the total alien NEXT and alien FEXT coupled between link segments.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.7.2.1 P 172 L 48 # i-11

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change: In order to limit the alien crosstalk at the near end of a link segment, the differential pair-to-pair near-end crosstalk (NEXT) loss between the disturbed link segment and the disturbing link segment is specified to meet the bit error ratio objective. To: The differential pair-to-pair near-end crosstalk (NEXT) loss between the disturbed link segment and the disturbing link segment is specified to meet the bit error ratio objective by limiting the alien crosstalk at the near end of a link segment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.7.2.2 P 173 L 42 # i-12

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "ensure" per IEEE recommendation.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Change: To ensure the total alien FEXT coupled into a link segment, multiple disturber attenuation to crosstalk ratio far-end ACRF is specified as the power sum of the individual alien ACRF disturbers. To: Multiple disturber attenuation to crosstalk ratio far-end ACRF is specified as the power sum of the individual alien ACRF disturbers to limit the total alien FEXT coupled into a link segment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.8.2.2 P 175 L 45 # i-21

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Empty Subclause

**SuggestedRemedy**

Delete subclause

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.8.2.2 P 175 L 45 # i-79

Mcclellan, Brett

Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ

The subclause '149.8.2.2 MDI coupling attenuation' has no content and there has been no proposal for content. It should be removed.

**SuggestedRemedy**

delete subclause 149.8.2.2

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.8.2.2 P 175 L 45 # i-2

Mueller, Thomas

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The intention of subclause 149.8.2.2 was to provide a measurement setup and electrical requirements for a proper shield termination of the linksegment to the MDI. As for today, there is not enough experience / data for a solid description of this test. Suggestion would be to leave this question to the implementer for now.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Suggest to remove subclause 149.8.2.2 from the standard due to a lack of information.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.9.2.1 P 176 L 33 # i-80

McClellan, Brett

Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

ISO 167540-5 is a typo copied from Clause 96, ISO 16750-5 is the correct reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "ISO 167540-5" to "ISO 16750-5"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.11.4.2.2 P 182 L 1 # i-89

Jonsson, Ragnar

Aquantia

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Section title should be "PCS Receive" not "PCS Transmit"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "PCS Transmit" to "PCS Receive"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149 SC 149.11.4.3.4 P 187 L 26 # i-14

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Update PICS to match requirement text.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete: to ensure detection at link partner

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149A SC 149A.3 P 196 L 32 # i-15

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Consider replacing "ensures" per IEEE Mandatory Editorial Coordination comment.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change: This also ensures that connectors and cable are matched in terms of balance and shielding, in order to reach sufficient accuracy to measure coupling and screening attenuation. To: In order to reach sufficient accuracy to measure coupling and screening attenuation, the connectors and cable should be matched in terms of balance and shielding.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 149A SC 149A.4 P 198 L 27 # i-16

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

missing period

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add "." at end of paragraph.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

CI **149B** SC **149B.2** P **202** L **29** # **i-77**  
McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.  
Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** EZ  
"PHY TempWarning" for D5 doesn't match the bit name in 149B.3.3, "Internal temperature warning"  
SuggestedRemedy  
change "PHY TempWarning" to "Internal temperature warning"  
Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

CI **149B** SC **149B.4.1** P **204** L **33** # **i-74**  
McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.  
Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ  
missing definition for ++ operator  
SuggestedRemedy  
page204 line 33 add text: "The notation ++ after a counter or integer variable indicates that its value is to be incremented."  
Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.