

# Chief Editor's comment resolution agenda

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, P802.3ct Chief Editor

IEEE P802.3ct Task Force, 9 April 2020 Interim Teleconference Meeting

# Comment Resolution Process

- Resolve comments against Draft 1.2
  - Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.
  - T and TRs will be treated with same status, no signoff is required
  - E and ERs will be treated with same status, no signoff is required
- If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response the comment will be closed as proposed.
- If there is disagreement, a straw poll on the area of concern will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.
  - The commenter is not allowed to disagree.
  - If the straw poll contains more than 2 choices, the choice with the lowest number of supporters will be removed. This process will continue until there are only 2 choices.

# Comment Resolution Process

- The order in which the comments are reviewed on a given call are subject to change
  - Comments from other calls will not be considered
- Comments bracketed together with [ ] cover a common topic
- Where a comment number is colored orange it contains the proposed response for the group of comments
- Comments with underline (e.g., 59) have associated hyperlinked presentations

# Comment Resolution Process (.3ck,.3cu,.3ct)

- Baseline Terminology
  - “Open” comments – comments that Task Force have not agreed upon a remedy
  - “Closed” comments – comments that Task Force have agreed upon a remedy
  - “Final” comments – Task Force has approved motion to adopt the responses to the closed comments
- Post updated comment database after each meeting
  - Allow individuals (other than commenter) two business days (AoE) to request on the reflector reconsideration of a “Closed” comment from the prior meeting
  - Individual needs to be present at next meeting to address
  - Normal procedures within the group will apply to determine if comment will be re-opened
- After all comments closed – normal procedures to adopt responses and generate next draft will be followed
  - Comments can not be re-opened after meeting where responses are adopted by TF

# Note about Comment Resolutions Going Forward

- Consensus building will be key
  - Rule #1 – Use the Reflector
  - Rule #2 – See Rule #1
- Reference: IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines (<https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>)
  - Multiple reasons possible for rejecting comment given –
    - a statement that the CRG could not reach consensus on the changes necessary to address the comment;

# Comment Resolution – March 19

- 20 of 21 comments resolved
  - Comment 31 was moved to the April 9<sup>th</sup> meeting to be resolved in conjunction with comment 32
- No requests to reopen any comments from this meeting were submitted

Topic	Clauses	Comment #	Count
Alignment	152, 153	<del>[11, 17, 29, 35]</del> , [6, 15], <del>18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25,</del> <del>26, 27, 28, 30, 31, 34, 36</del>	21

# Comment Resolution – March 26

- 18 of 19 comments resolved
  - Comment 89 and associated late presentation were moved to the April 2<sup>nd</sup>
- No requests to reopen any comments from this meeting were submitted

Topic	Clauses	Comment #	Count
Optical Channels	154	<del>[76, 99], [77, 97, 102], [83, 104], 73, 74, 75, 78, 79, 80, 81, [82, 103, 119], 86, 89</del>	19

# Comment Resolution – April 2

- All 6 comments resolved
  - 1 presentation in support of comment 89
- No requests to reopen any comments from this meeting were submitted

Topic	Clauses	Comment #	Count
Inverse RS-FEC	152	<del>8,9</del>	2
Nomenclature	1, 154	<del>[40, 84], 85</del>	3
Optical Channels	154	<u>89</u> schmitt_3ct_01_200402	1



# Comment Resolution – April 9

- Resolve the following comments
  - 2 comments and request for supporting presentation were withdrawn

Topic	Clauses	Comment #	Count
Editing	45, 152, 153, 154	43, 59, 61, 62, 100, 101, 124	7
SC-FEC	153	12, 14, 16, [31, 32], 37, 65	7
Withdrawn		64, 66	2

# Bucket Comments

- One request was received to remove comment 46 from the bucket.

C/A	Comment #	Count
1	49, 50, 105, 108	4
45	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 47, 48	7
80	7, [41, 111], [42, 54], 44, [45, 58], [51, 110], 52, 53 [55, 115], [56, 116], 57, 109, 112, 113, 114, 117	22
152	10, 60, 118	3
153	13, 33, 38, 87, 88	5
154	<b>46</b> , 69	2
Annex 83C/135A	70, 71, 72	3

Thanks!