P802.3cu D2.0
Comment Resolution Update

P802.3cu Editorial Team

IEEE P802.3cu Task Force Conf Call, 24 March 2020

Comment Resolution Process

Goal is to resolve all comments against Draft 2.0.

Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.

If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response, the comment will be closed as proposed.

If there is disagreement on the final proposed response from anyone other than the commenter, a measure of consensus will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.

Comment Resolution Process

Editors have identified non-controversial comments as candidates for a bucket motion.

- The initial list of comments for the bucket motion are on slide 10 (also marked "Bucket" in comments file), please review this and ask for a comment to be taken off the list if you don't agree with the proposed response.

- These comments will not be reviewed individually, but will be resolved as proposed via a single motion

Comments bracketed together with [ ] cover a common topic.

Where a comment is underlined it contains the proposed response for the group of comments.

The order in which the comments are reviewed and the schedule are subject to change.

Big ticket items

- Tx Overshoot
  - See straw polls #2, #3 and #4 from 3/17 meeting minutes
- 10LogCeq
  - See straw poll #1 from 3/17 meeting minutes
- 400GBASE-LR4 reach (proposal to change to 10km)

Cross-Clause comments

Topic	Clause	Comment #	Count
Tx Overshoot	140, 151	[8, 9, 16, 17, 36, 39, 47, 48, 58, 70, 72, 73, 88, 89, 90, 94, 95, 97, 122], ~~rodes_01, zivny_01,~~ rodes_01_032420	19
10LogCeq	140, 151	[59, 69, 87, 93], [38, 52, 53, 56, 57, 71, 119, 120, 121], [62, 68], ~~cole_01, dawe_01, nicholl_03, stassar_01,~~ nicholl_02a_032420	15
Interop	140, 151	[37, 67], 103, 104, 105, 106, 115, 116	8
Rx Sensitivity	140, 151	29, 83, 84, 85, 102, 77, 78, 79, 96, 111	10
Tx Average Power	140, 151	54, [92, 109]	3
Total			55

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, ##* = cross-clause comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

FM and Clause 1 to 116 comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
80	Nomenclature and Table name	42	1
	Total		1

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, ##* = cross-clause comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 140 (100G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
140	Test patterns	75	1
140	Tx OMA - TDECQ	66	1
140	Tx Reference equalizer	[74, 101]	2
140	Tx TECQ	60, [61, 76]]	3
	Total		7

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, ##* = cross-clause comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 151 (400G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
151	Connector loss	114	1
151	Editorial	63	1
151	Reach	82	1
151	Test patterns	81	1
151	Tx OMAouter	19	1
151	Tx RINxx.x	113	1
151	Tx TECQ	80	1
151	Tx transition time	64	1
	Total		8

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, ##* = cross-clause comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Withdrawn comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	30	1
151	21, 34	2
	Total	3

Bucket comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00	10, 49, 100	3
FM	2, 43, 44, 99	4
1	1	1
30		
45	3, 4, 5	3
78		
80		
91		
116	6, 7, 26, 45	4
140	27, 28, 46, 35, 11, 55, 65, 86, 41, 91, 107	11
151	31, 51, 13, 15, 50, 108, 18, 33, 32, 20, 112, 110, 23, 22, 25, 24, 14, 12, 98, 40	20
	Total	46

Requests to remove:

Piers [22,23,117]

Late comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	117	
151	118	
	Total	2

Summary count (double check)

Topic	Comment count
Cross-clause - "Tx Overshoot"	19
Cross-clause - "10Log(Ceq)"	15
Cross-clause - Other	21
FM and Clause 1 to 116	1
Clause 140	7
Clause 151	8
Withdrawn	3
Late	2
Total (non-bucket)	76
Bucket	46
Total	122