

P802.3cu D2.0 Comment Resolution Update

P802.3cu Editorial Team

IEEE P802.3cu Task Force Conf Call, 7 April 2020

Comment Resolution Process

Goal is to resolve all comments against Draft 2.0.

Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.

If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response, the comment will be closed as proposed.

If there is disagreement on the final proposed response from anyone other than the commenter, a measure of consensus will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.

Comment Resolution Process

Editors have identified non-controversial comments as candidates for a bucket motion.

- The initial list of comments for the bucket motion are on slide 10 (also marked “Bucket” in comments file), please review this and ask for a comment to be taken off the list if you don’t agree with the proposed response.
- These comments will not be reviewed individually, but will be resolved as proposed via a single motion

Comments bracketed together with [] cover a common topic.

Where a comment is underlined it contains the proposed response for the group of comments.

The order in which the comments are reviewed and the schedule are subject to change.

Acknowledgments

- A special thanks to Matt Brown for the considerable time and effort he continues to put in behind the scenes supporting the 802.3cu editorial team. It is very much appreciated.

Status to date (as of Apr 7)

- 42 out of 69 (non-bucket) comments have been closed
- 8 comments withdrawn
 - 5 since the last interim teleconference call (#22,#23,#79,#85,#117)
- Bucket list:
 - 3 comments previously requested to be removed from the bucket have now been withdrawn (#22, #23, #117)
 - the proposed response to comment #24 has been updated to provide further clarification

Plans for the Apr 7 Interim Conference Call

During the last call (Mar 31) we closed 8 comments in 1 hours (~ 7.5 minutes per comment). We need to pick up the pace!

Proposed comment order for the Apr 7 call.

Topic	Comment #	Commenter
Interop	[103, 104, 105, 106, 115, 116]	Mike Dudek
RS Sen (equations in tables)	[77, 83]	David Lewis
Tx Average Power (min)	54	Eric Maniloff
Tx Average Power (max)	[92, 109]	Gary Nicholl, Mike Dudek
Editorial (Clause 80)	42	Steve Trowbridge
CI 140 - Test Patterns	75	David Lewis
CI 140 - Tx OMA - TDECQ	66	Piers Dawe
CI 140 - Tx Ref EQ	[74, 101]	Davis Lewis, Mike Dudek
CI 140 - Tx TECQ	60, [61, 76]	Piers Dawe, David Lewis
If done with above, we will continue working down the list in nicholl_3cu_01_040720		

Cross-Clause comments

Topic	Clause	Comment #	Count
Tx Overshoot	140, 151	[8, 9, 16, 17, 36, 39, 47, 48, 58, 70, 72, 73, 88, 89, 90, 94, 95, 97, 122], redes_01, zivny_01, redes_01_032420, zivny_01_032420	49
10Log10Geeq	140, 151	[59, 69, 87, 93], [38, 52, 53, 56, 57, 71, 119, 120, 121], [62, 68], cole_01, dawe_01, nicholl_03, stassar_01, nicholl_02a_032420	45
Interop	140, 151	[37, 67] , [103, 104, 105, 106, 115, 116]	8
Rx Sensitivity	140, 151	[29, 78, 84, 96, 102, 111] , [77, 83, nicholl_02_040720]	8
Tx Average Power	140, 151	54, maniloff_01_040720, <u>92</u> , 109]	3
Total			53

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

FM and Clause 1 to 116 comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
80	Nomenclature and Table name	42	1
	Total		1

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 140 (100G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
140	Test patterns	75	1
140	Tx OMA - TDECQ	66	1
140	Tx Reference equalizer	[<u>74</u> , 101]	2
140	Tx TECQ	60, [<u>61</u> , 76]	3
	Total		7

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 151 (400G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
151	Connector loss	114	1
151	Editorial	63	1
151	Reach	82, chang_01_033120	1
151	Test patterns	81	1
151	Tx OMAouter	19	1
151	Tx RINxx.x	113	1
151	Tx TECQ	80	1
151	Tx transition time	64	1
	Total		8

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00	10, 49, 100	3
FM	2, 43, 44, 99	4
1	1	1
30		
45	3, 4, 5	3
78		
80		
91		
116	6, 7, 26, 45	4
140	11, 27, 28, 35, 41, 46, 55, 65, 86, 91, 107	11
151	12, 13, 14, 15, 18, 20, 24*, 25, 31, 32, 33, 40, 50, 51, 98, 108, 110, 112, 118	19
	Total	45

Requests to remove:

Legend: ##* = updated proposed response (also identified as "Topic=bucket2" in the comment reports)

Withdrawn comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	30, 85, 117	3
151	21, 22, 23, 34, 79	5
	Total	8

Summary count (double check)

Topic	Comment count
Gross clause — “Tx Overshoot”	49
Gross clause — “10Log(Geq)”	45
Cross-clause - Other	19
FM and Clause 1 to 116	1
Clause 140	7
Clause 151	8
Total (non-bucket)	69
Bucket	45
Withdrawn	8
Total	122

Big ticket items (remaining)

- 100GBASE-LR4 reach (proposal to change to 10km)