

# **P802.3cu D2.0**

## **Comment Resolution Update**

P802.3cu Editorial Team

IEEE P802.3cu Task Force Conf Call, 21 April 2020

# Comment Resolution Process

Goal is to resolve all comments against Draft 2.0.

Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.

If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response, the comment will be closed as proposed.

If there is disagreement on the final proposed response from anyone other than the commenter, a measure of consensus will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.

# Comment Resolution Process

Editors have identified non-controversial comments as candidates for a bucket motion.

- The initial list of comments for the bucket motion are on slide 10 (also marked “Bucket” in comments file), please review this and ask for a comment to be taken off the list if you don’t agree with the proposed response.
- These comments will not be reviewed individually, but will be resolved as proposed via a single motion

Comments bracketed together with [ ] cover a common topic.

Where a comment is underlined it contains the proposed response for the group of comments.

The order in which the comments are reviewed and the schedule are subject to change.

# Comment Resolution Process (.3cu,.3ck,.3ct)

## Baseline Terminology

- “Open” comments – comments that Task Force have not agreed upon a remedy
- “Closed” comments – comments that Task Force have agreed upon a remedy
- “Final” comments – Task Force has approved motion to adopt the responses to the closed comments

## Post updated comment database after each meeting

- Allow individuals (other than commenter) two business days (AoE) to request on the reflector a “Closed” comment from the prior meeting only be considered for re-opening
- Individual needs to be present at next meeting to address
- Normal procedures within the group will apply to determine if comment will be re-opened

After all comments closed – normal procedures to adopt responses and generate next draft will be followed

- Comments cannot be re-opened after meeting where responses are adopted by TF

# Status Update

- 65 out of 68 (non-bucket) comments have been closed
  - 3 comments remaining !
- 9 comments withdrawn
- Bucket list:
  - proposed response to comment #11 has been updated from AIP to reject, after consulting with the IEEE Style manual. The comment is identified with an “\*” in slide 11 of this deck and with “topic=bucket3” in the comment reports.
- While implementing comment #42, we realized that the suggested remedy had already been implemented in P802.3cd
  - propose to ask the TF if there are any objections to reopening the comment, and give the commenter a chance to withdraw

# Plans for the Apr 21 Interim Conference Call

Proposed comment order for the Apr 21 call.

Topic	Comment #	Commenter
CL 151 - Tx RINxx.x	113	Mike Dudek
CL 151 - Tx TECQ	80	David Lewis
CL 151 - Tx transition time	64	Piers Dawe

Following these three comments, we will have a motion to accept the bucket comments.

# Cross-Clause comments

Topic	Clause	Comment #	Count
<del>Tx Overshoot</del>	<del>140, 151</del>	<del>[8, 9, 16, 17, 36, 39, 47, 48, 58, 70, 72, 73, 88, 89, 90, 94, 95, 97, 122], rodes_01, zivny_01, rodes_01_032420, zivny_01_032420</del>	<del>49</del>
<del>10Log10Geq</del>	<del>140, 151</del>	<del>[59, 69, 87, 93], [38, 52, 53, 56, 57, 71, 119, 120, 121], [62, 68], cole_01, dawe_01, nicholl_03, stassar_01, nicholl_02a_032420</del>	<del>45</del>
<del>Interop</del>	<del>140, 151</del>	<del>[37, 67], [103, 104, 105, 106, 115, 116]</del>	<del>8</del>
<del>Rx Sensitivity</del>	<del>140, 151</del>	<del>[29, 78, 84, 96, 102, 111], [77, 83, nicholl_02_040720, lewis_01_041420]</del>	<del>8</del>
<del>Tx Average Power</del>	<del>140, 151</del>	<del>54, maniloff_01_040720, [92, 109]</del>	<del>3</del>
<del>Total</del>			<del>53</del>

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# FM and Clause 1 to 116 comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
<del>80</del>	<del>Nomenclature and Table name</del>	<del>42</del>	<del>4</del>
	Total		4

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation



# Clause 140 (100G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
<del>140</del>	<del>Test patterns</del>	<del>75</del>	<del>4</del>
<del>140</del>	<del>Tx OMA — TDECQ</del>	<del>66</del>	<del>4</del>
<del>140</del>	<del>Tx Reference equalizer</del>	<del>[74, 101]</del>	<del>2</del>
<del>140</del>	<del>Tx TECQ</del>	<del>60, [61, 76]</del>	<del>3</del>
	Total		7

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Clause 151 (400G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
<del>151</del>	Editorial	<del>63</del>	4
<del>151</del>	Reach	<del>82, chang_01_033120, stassar_01a_041420</del>	4
<del>151</del>	Test patterns	<del>81</del>	4
<del>151</del>	Tx OMA <sub>outer</sub>	<del>49</del>	4
151	Tx RIN <sub>xx.x</sub>	113	1
151	Tx TECQ	80	1
151	Tx transition time	64	1
	Total		7

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Bucket comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00	10, 49, 100	3
FM	2, 43, 44, 99	4
1	1	1
30		
45	3, 4, 5	3
78		
80		
91		
116	6, 7, 26, 45	4
140	11*, 27, 28, 35, 41, 46, 55, 65, 86, 91, 107	11
151	12, 13, 14, 15, 18, 20, 24*, 25, 31, 32, 33, 40, 50, 51, 98, 108, 110, 112, 118	19
	Total	45

Requests to remove:

Legend: ##\* = updated proposed response (also identified as “Topic=bucket2” or “Topic=bucket3” in the comment reports)

# Withdrawn comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	30, 85, 117	3
151	21, 22, 23, 34, 79, 114	6
	Total	9

# Summary count (double check)

Topic	Comment count
Cross-clause - "Tx Overshoot"	19
Cross-clause - "10Log(Ceq)"	15
Cross-clause - Other	19
FM and Clause 1 to 116	1
Clause 140	7
Clause 151	7
Total (non-bucket)	68
Bucket	45
Withdrawn	9
Total	122