

P802.3cu D2.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

P802.3cu Editorial Team

IEEE P802.3cu Task Force Conf Call, 26 May 2020

Comment Resolution Process

Goal is to resolve all comments against Draft 2.1.

Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.

If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response, the comment will be closed as proposed.

If there is disagreement on the final proposed response from anyone other than the commenter, a measure of consensus will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.

Comment Resolution Process

Editors have identified non-controversial comments as candidates for a bucket motion.

- The initial list of comments for the bucket motion are on slide 9 (also marked “Bucket” in comments file), please review this and ask for a comment to be taken off the list if you don’t agree with the proposed response.
- These comments will not be reviewed individually, but will be resolved as proposed via a single motion

Comments bracketed together with [] cover a common topic.

Where a comment is underlined it contains the proposed response for the group of comments.

The order in which the comments are reviewed and the schedule are subject to change.

Comment Resolution Process

Baseline Terminology

- “Open” comments – comments that Task Force have not agreed upon a remedy
- “Closed” comments – comments that Task Force have agreed upon a remedy
- “Final” comments – Task Force has approved motion to adopt the responses to the closed comments

Post updated comment database after each meeting

- Allow individuals (other than commenter) two business days (AoE) to request on the reflector a “Closed” comment from the prior meeting only be considered for re-opening
- Individual needs to be present at next meeting to address
- Normal procedures within the group will apply to determine if comment will be re-opened

After all comments closed – normal procedures to adopt responses and generate next draft will be followed

- Comments cannot be re-opened after meeting where responses are adopted by TF

Status Update

- Reviewed 3 presentations on May 19 conf call:
 - kimber_01 (#9), lewis_01a (#10,#11), nicholl_01(#8)
- no comments have been closed
- a straw poll was taken on the different figure options for Tx OMA and RS captured in lewis_01a (see minutes for results)
 - most support is likely to add 3 sets of figures in the draft; TxOMA in the (normative) Tx specifications section, RS in the (normative) Rx specifications section and combined TxOMA & RS in the illustrative link power budgets section.
 - David Lewis to generate a new presentation for the May 26 conf call, to show the actual FrameMaker figures to implement such a proposal
- Bucket list:
 - 10 comments in the bucket
 - If you would like to remove any comments from the bucket please let Mark or Gary know before the May 26 conf call

Cross-Clause comments

Topic	Clause	Comment #	Count
Optical specs	140, 151	8, nicholl_03_051920	2
RS Figure	140, 151	5, [<u>10</u> , 11, 27, lewis_01_051920]	4
Tx Overshoot	140, 151	[20, 25], [9, kimber_01_051920], 28, 31, 32, 33	6
Tx peak-to-peak power	140, 151	29	1
Interop	140, 151	22, 23, 24, 26	4
Reinstate 10LogCeq	140, 151	30	1
Definitions	140, 151	12, 15	2
References	140, 151	[<u>1</u> , 3, 4]	3
Total			23

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 140 (100G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
140			0
	Total		0

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 151 (400G optical) comments

Clause	Topic	Comment #	Count
151			0
	Total		0

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	6, 7, 13, 14, 21	5
151	2, 16, 17, 18, 19	5
	Total	10

Requests to remove:

Legend: ##* = updated proposed response (also identified as "Topic=bucket2" or "Topic=bucket3" in the comment reports)

Withdrawn comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140		
151		
	Total	0