P802.3cu D2.1
Comment Resolution Agenda

P802.3cu Editorial Team

IEEE P802.3cu Task Force Conf Call, 2 June, 2020

Editorial Team

Editor	Clauses/Annexes
Gary Nicholl Editor-in-Chief	FM, 1, 30, 45, 78, 80, 91, 116
David Lewis	140, 151
Mark Kimber	Advisor and reviewer for optical clauses

Comment Resolution Process

Goal is to resolve all comments against Draft 2.1.

Any presentations associated with comments will be reviewed during comment resolution session.

If there is no disagreement on the final proposed response, the comment will be closed as proposed.

If there is disagreement on the final proposed response from anyone other than the commenter, a measure of consensus will be taken and the majority position will decide the final response.

Comment Resolution Process

Editors have identified non-controversial comments as candidates for a bucket motion.

- The initial list of comments for the bucket motion are on slide 9 (also marked "Bucket" in comments file), please review this and ask for a comment to be taken off the list if you don't agree with the proposed response.

- These comments will not be reviewed individually, but will be resolved as proposed via a single motion

Comments bracketed together with [ ] cover a common topic.

Where a comment is underlined it contains the proposed response for the group of comments.

The order in which the comments are reviewed and the schedule are subject to change.

Comment Resolution Process

Baseline Terminology

- "Open" comments – comments that Task Force have not agreed upon a remedy
- "Closed" comments – comments that Task Force have agreed upon a remedy
- "Final" comments – Task Force has approved motion to adopt the responses to the closed comments

Post updated comment database after each meeting

- Allow individuals (other than commenter) two business days (AoE) to request on the reflector a "Closed" comment from the prior meeting only be considered for re-opening
- Individual needs to be present at next meeting to address
- Normal procedures within the group will apply to determine if comment will be re-opened

After all comments closed – normal procedures to adopt responses and generate next draft will be followed

- Comments cannot be re-opened after meeting where responses are adopted by TF

Status Update

- Reviewed 2 presentations and closed 9 comments during May 26 conf call.
- 14 comments still to be closed (excluding bucket).
- If the updated proposed response to comment #28 is accepted we need to re-open comments #20 and #25, and update the responses accordingly.
- Bucket list:
  - 5 comments in the bucket (5 withdrawn since May 26 call)
  - Deadline for requesting comments to be removed from the bucket has been extended until the June 2 conf call. If you would like to remove any comments from the bucket please contact Mark or Gary by email.
- Added a slide to track "D2.x Unsatisfied comments" at the end of this presentation

Plans for the June 2 Interim Conference Call

Proposed comment order for June 2.

Topic	Comment #	Commenter
Tx Overshoot	28, 31	Piers Dawe
Tx peak-to-peak power	29	Piers Dawe
Tx peak-to-peak power	9	David Lewis (Mark Kimber)
Interop (cross-PMD)	[22, 23, 24, lewis_01_060220], 26	Mike Dudek
Reinstate 10LogCeq	30	Piers Dawe
Definitions	12, 15	Massimo Sorbara
References (IEC 61753-1)	[1, 3, 4]	Masood Shariff
TOTAL	14	

Cross-Clause comments

Topic	Clause	Comment #	Count
~~Optical specs~~	~~140, 151~~	~~8, nicholl_03_051920~~	~~1~~
~~RS Figure~~	~~140, 151~~	~~5, [10, 11, 27, lewis_01_051920, lewis_01_052620]~~	~~4~~
Tx Overshoot	140, 151	[~~20, 25~~], [9, ~~kimber_01_051920~~], 28, 31, ~~32, 33~~, ~~rodes_01a_052620~~	7
Tx peak-to-peak power	140, 151	29	1
Interop	140, 151	[22, 23, 24, lewis_01_060220], 26	4
Reinstate 10LogCeq	140, 151	30	1
Definitions	140, 151	12, 15	2
References (IEC 61753-1)	140, 151	[1, 3, 4]	3
Total			23

Legend: [##,##,##] = process together, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	6, 7, 21	3
151	2, 19	2
	Total	5

Requests to remove:

Legend: ##* = updated proposed response (also identified as "Topic=bucket2" or "Topic=bucket3" in the comment reports)

Withdrawn comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	13, 14	2
151	16, 17, 18	3
	Total	5

D2.x Unsatisfied comments

Clause	Comment #	Count
00		
FM		
1		
30		
45		
78		
80		
91		
116		
140	20068, 20069, 20070, 20072	4
151	20058, 20059, 20062, 20073	4
	Total	8

Legend: 2x###, where x=the recirculation ballot number and ### is the original comment number from the 2.x ballot.

Note: see unsatisfied comments report for more details..