EFM Task Force   Meeting Minutes   Tuesday, March 12, 2002
Notes taken by Meir Bartur

{Start 8:30am}
Opening remarks and Agenda presented by Howard F. and approved with no objection. [Roy Bynum asked for more general presentations from the different tracks.]

Overview, ground rules, IEEE Standards Process etc. presented by Howard F.

Patent policy reviewed.
Infineon letter of assurance regarding US patents US6,088,368 US09/332062 was read by Howard.

Objectives presented and reviewed H.F.

Liaison Letters:
ITU-T Study Group 13, letter read and referred to OAM sub-task Chair Matt Squire
T1E1.4 Massiano Sorbara chair described new project re high speed symmetric DSL, referred to Cu sub-task Chair Hugh Barrass.
TIA TR42 Letter presenting a case for MM fiber PMD inclusion in EFM efforts presented by Chris DiMinico. Referred to Optics sub-task editor Wael Diab.
ITU-Q.2/15 WDM over PON and GPON document references. Doc's given to Gerry Pesavento. for response.

Sub Task force reports
Gerry P. P2MP presented plan for the meeting.
Hugh B. Cu track. Reviewed plan for the meeting, and explained the line code issue (one at the final spec, two alternatives currently explored).
Wael D. Optical PMD three target proposals review
Matt S. Status - choose one approach out of three, presented plan for the meeting. Straw polls:
  ➢ *My level of understanding on the baseline OAM proposals. ALL [High – 32; Medium – 38; Low – 43]*
  ➢ *Based on what you know now how will you vote. ALL[Channelized - 1; Preamble - 32; Frames - 40;]   802.3voters [Channelized - 1; Preamble - 23; Frames - 30;]*
An effort to re partition the voting for copper and optics was stopped due to general confusion.

Additional Objective: p2p 100Mb/s on SM fiber
Bruce T. presented a motion:
  ➢ To add an objective to the family of physical layer specifications
       o 100Base-X >= 10 km over SM fiber

Moved: Bruce Tolley;   2nd Sterling Rooke
Supporting and clarifications comments from numerous individuals
----
Amendment to include MM by changing "SM" to "MM or SM"
Moved by Lisa Peng 2nd Chris Diminico
Argument for the amendment, against, and confused.
Chair observed that this could be offered as a separate motion.
Amendment withdrawn by mover and seconder.

Vote on main motion:
ALL – for 105; Against 4; Abstained 22
802.3voters - for 59; Against 3; Abstained 9

Motion passed

Motion to add an objective to the family of physical layer specifications-
"100BASE-FX Extended Temp Optics"
Moved : Chris DiMinico
Second: Lisa Peng

ALL – for 32; Against 30; Abstained 72
802.3voters - for 16; Against 21; Abstained 30

Motion fails

Carlos Rebeiro presentation; EFM Deployment ….
Mark Easley presented EFMA - an industry alliance dedicated to promote EFM.

Final remarks future Meetings and plan for the week

{Stop 12:35 pm}

EFM Meeting Minutes   Thursday, March 14, 2002
Notes taken by Meir Bartur

{Start 8:40}
Opening remarks.

Motion #1:
Previous meeting minutes adopted with the following changes:
- ➢ All instances of copper subtask force on page p2 of the minutes to "802.3ah".
- ➢ On p. 3, last two motions replace previous copper objectives with the exception of the spectral management objectives.
- ➢ In the motion two p.3 wire gauge should be deleted

Moved: Hugh Barrass
Second: Roy Bynum

Passed by acclamation
****

Brian Ford Bell South presented extended reach demand for PON beyond 10km to 20km.

Motion #2:
Additional objective:
PHY for PON, >= 20km, 1000Mbps, single SM fiber, >=1:16

Moved: Brian Ford
Second: Richard Brand

All: For - 117; Against - 1; Abstained - 16;
802.3 voters: For - 64; Against - 1; Abstained - 5

Motion Passed
****

Ed Eckert reviewed some of the current copper objective(s) and potential market demand arguing that a single line code can result in the disfunctioning of the copper track therefore he offered:

Motion #3

1. The copper objective be restated as follows:
"Specify a generic xDSL Adaptation Layer between the IEEE®802.3 Media Interface and PTM (Packet Transfer Mode) specific gamma-interface as defined in ITU-T Recommendation G.993.1 Annex H"

2. The baseline recommendations agreed by the IEEE®802.3ah Copper Sub-Task Force to date be declared null and void by the assembly of IEEE®802.3ah.

3. The next meeting of IEEE®802.3ah Copper Sub-Task Force address presentations towards expediting this new objective.

Moved: Ed Eckert
Second: George Eisner

All: For - 51; Against - 32; Abstained - 68;
802.3 voters: For - 27 ; Against - 24; Abstained - 33

Motion Failed
****

OAM Sub-Task Force Matt Squire
Recap towards a consensus frame work of combined approached fram and pre-amble OAM. Motion #4 presented.

Motion #4
:
Use OAM in frames… and in pre-amble… (excluding copper)…..   { from Matt Squire}
◆Adopt suzuki_2_0302.pdf and gentry_1_0302.pdf as a framework for EFM OAM, where the functionality is partitioned as:
■Use OAM in frames for following functions
◆Performance monitoring
◆Asynchronous event reporting
◆Remote Status
◆Extensible management control channel
■Use OAM in preamble for
◆Fault detection (ping)
◆Fault signaling (remote/local failure bits)
◆Alarm bit
■OAM for EFM Cu are not addressed by this motion.

Mover by Matt Squire on behalf of the OAM sub-task force

During discussion on the motion...
Bruce Tolley calls the question
All: For - 41; Against - 55;
Discussion resumes

All: For - 69; Against - 22; Abstained - 45;
802.3 voters: For - 39; Against - 16; Abstained – 26

Motion fails
A note from the chair as to why this motion failed. While it is true that the motion received a just greater than 75% majority amongst all of the members of 802.3ah (all those present in the room and who felt qualified to vote), it did not receive a 75%

majority amongst the voting members of the 802.3 WG present in the room. Both votes must receive a greater than or equal to 75% majority in order for the motion to pass. The chair also notes a very high number of abstentions on both votes. Therefore, consensus on the issue has not been reached.
****

Review ITU liaison letter response ITU-T SG13. and presented for a motion to approve:

Motion #5
Mover: Matt Squire
Second: Hugh Barras

All: For - 98; Against - 0; Abstained - 4;
Motion passed
****
Final task summary by Matt Squire.

Motion #6
Confirm Kevin Daines as the editor for the OAM Sub-Task force
Mover: Roy Bynum
Second: Steven Haddock
All: For - 70; Against - 3; Abstained - 18;
802.3 voters: For - ; Against - ; Abstained –
****

P2MP Sub-Task Force Gerry Pesavento

Presnted track results for 5 presentations and votes:

Motion #7
Motion: Adopt the proposals shown as baseline for the EFM P2MP, as detailed in following 5 P2MP task group motion slides.

Mover: Gerry Pesavento on behalf of the P2MP sub-task force.

All: For - 89; Against - 1; Abstained - 21;
802.3 voters: For - 48; Against - 1; Abstained – 9

Motion passed
****

Motion #9
Adopt page 1-12 of Suzuki_1-0302.pdf as P2MP baseline document for 802.1D compliance and downstream broadcast with the replacement of line 5 (P2P) of page 11 with

Downstream: [ONU receive frames with PHY tags = its own](#)
With the replacement of line 10 (Broadcast) page 11 with
Downstream: [ONU receive frames with PHY tag != its own](#)
With deletion of pages 4 & 5

Mover: Hiroshi Suzuki
Second: Dolores Sala
All: For - 85; Against - 0; Abstained - 31;
802.3 voters: For - 46; Against - 0 ; Abstained – 16
Motion passed
****

P2P Optics track – Vipul Bahat
Progress Report
Group motions reviewed Motion for extended temp, 4 PON PMDs, 100BASE PMD for single and dual, and Liaison letters to the TIA TR-42 and ITU SG15

Motion #10
802.3ah accept the motions and work of the optics sub task force, including the liason response to SG-15.
Mover: Vipul Bahat
Second: Wael William Diab
All: For - 105; Against - 0; Abstained - 11;
802.3 voters: For - 61; Against - 0 ; Abstained – 6

Motion passed
****
Chris DiMinico like the group to consider

Motion #11
Motion: to create informative annex to address environmental considerations.

Mover: Chris DiMinico
Second: Alan Flatman

All: For - 59; Against - 1; Abstained - 40;
802.3 voters: For - 40; Against - 1 ; Abstained – 17

Motion passed
****

Copper Sub-Task Force
Hugh Barrass Chair
Not all presentation reviewed during the meeting. Consensus was not reached except for the liaison letter.

Motion #12 draft
Adopt presentations fosmark_1_0302.pdf, marris_1_0302.pdf, simon_1_0302, rezvani_1_0302.pdf (with addition of comments documents), as the basis of the first draft to meet the following objectives:
PHY for single pair non-loaded voice grade copper disctance >=750m and speed >=10Mbps full duplex.

Motion to divide
Mover: Michael Beck
Second: Massimo Sorbara
All: For - 86; Against - 8; Abstained - ;
Motion to divide passed

Motion #12 (Half of Copper Baseline)
Adopt presentations fosmark_1_0302.pdf, marris_1_0302.pdf, simon_1_0302, as the basis of the first draft.

Mover: Hugh Barrass on behalf of the task force
Second:
All: For - 94; Against - 0; Abstained - 33;
802.3 voters: For - 46; Against - 0 ; Abstained – 18

Motion passed
****
Motion #13 (2nd half of Copper baseline) draft 1
Adopt presentation rezvani_1_0302.pdf (with addition of comments document,
"notes_to_editor_1_0302.doc", with the exception of note 13) as the basis of the first draft.

Motion to amend this motion

With the addition of the following proposal: the draft of the baseline wil include a specific definition of the MII gamma interface (as defined in ITU G.983.1) separate from the fully specified PHY definition.

Mover: Scott Simon
Second: Massimo Sorbara
All: For - 34; Against - 26; Abstained - 58;
802.3 voters: For - 15; Against - 16 ; Abstained – 35
Amendment failed
****

Motion #13 (2nd half of Copper baseline) cont.
Adopt presentation rezvani_1_0302.pdf (with addition of comments document, "notes_to_editor_1_0302.doc", with the exception of note 13) as the basis of the first draft.
Mover: Hugh Barrass on behalf of copper sub-task force
All: For - 43; Against - 37; Abstained - 47;
802.3 voters: For - 24; Against - 21 ; Abstained – 28

Motion failed
****

Next Steps:
Edinburgh Meeting detail presented

Planning to go: 86

{Stop 12:10pm}