Cl **00**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **19**   # 1

Brett McClellan   Solarflare

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**

This response makes an incorrect statement:
"An XGMII data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x1 is an invalid XGMII character and will be encoded as /K30.7/ (a data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x0 is the XGMII code for /I/)."
According to tables 48-2 and 46-3, an XGMII data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x1 is a valid Idle code. It is only considered invalid by the Clause 48 transmit process when it is part of an incomplete Idle column. In addition, a data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x0 is valid data byte.

SuggestedRemedy

Change text to:
"An XGMII data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x1 is a valid XGMII Idle character, however when it is part of an incomplete idle column it is encoded to the K30.7 PCS code group as shown in Table 48-2."
RemedyEnd:

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT.

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **16**   # 2

Brett McClellan   Solarflare

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

This response makes an incorrect statement:
typo: "not" should be "nor"

SuggestedRemedy

Change text as indicated.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **10**   # 3

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **R**

According to this draft there are two interpretations. In other words, the standard contradicts itself. Although in the committee's opinion, either is OK, the committee's views on what the standard SHOULD say are beside the point. The difference between Option 2 (/E/ /E/ /E/ /E/) and Option 4 (/I/ /I/ /I/ /E/) can be observed on the line, so a tester who believes one interpretation can fail an implementation that follows the other. I think this amounts to ambiguity and a defect in the standard.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the classification to "Ambiguous" and add "This ambiguity has been brought to the attention of the Working Group for possible action at the next revision." or similar words.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

There are two alternative implementations, these are interoperable. Anybody testing the line should accommodate both implemenations, just as a compliant receive is required to.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **16**   # 13

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

not

SuggestedRemedy

nor

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **17**   # 11

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Should use en-dash rather than hyphen in table numbers

SuggestedRemedy

per comment

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **Q2**
SC

Page 1 of 3
12/29/2006 10:59:02

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **18**   # 12

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**

I still don't know if or why "An XGMII data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x1" has anything to do with Q2, but if this means XGMII (data) character of 0x07 with a control signal of 0, why is that not encoded like any other data character, as D7.0 per Table 36-1a?

SuggestedRemedy

?

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Text has been removed by comment #1.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **18**   # 16

George Zimmerman   Solarflare Communica

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Text ("An XGMII data code of 0x07 with a control code of 0x1 is an invalid XGMII character and will be encoded as /K30.7/") can be read to incorrectly state that an XGMII character with control code 0x1 and data 0x07 is an invalid XGMII character. What appears to be meant is that with the incomplete column of idle it is an invalid character.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "In the absence of a full column of idle" at the beginning of the sentence starting "An XGMII data code..."

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #1.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **18**   # 4

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Use proper terminology: change "XGMII data code" to

SuggestedRemedy

XGMII data character

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

See comment #1.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **19**   # 6

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**

If this "control code" is TXC<i> then it's a single bit and can't be hex, hence not 0xAnything.

SuggestedRemedy

0? 1? 1110?

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will use TXC<i>=1

Note comment #1 has changed this text so this comment will be applied to the new text from comment #1.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **19**   # 5

Piers Dawe   Avago Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **A**

control code

SuggestedRemedy

control signal TXC<i>

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Note comment #1 has changed this text so this comment will be applied to the new text from comment #1.

Cl **Q2**   *SC*   *P* **6**   *L* **20**   # 15

George Zimmerman   Solarflare Communica

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Parenthetical remark incorrectly identifies an idle as having an XGMII control codes of 0x0, words with control codes of 0x0 are normal data, ref. Table 46-3 46.3.1.2 of 802.3-2005.

SuggestedRemedy

change control code of 0x0 to code of 0x1.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #1.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **Q2**
SC

Page 2 of 3
12/29/2006 10:59:02

Cl **Q2** *SC* *P* **6** *L* **20** # 8

Piers Dawe Avago Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**
control code

SuggestedRemedy
control signal

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Text has been removed by comment #1.

Cl **Q2** *SC* *P* **6** *L* **20** # 9

Piers Dawe Avago Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**
0x0

SuggestedRemedy
1 (according to Table 48-2)

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

See comment #1.

Cl **Q2** *SC* *P* **6** *L* **20** # 7

Piers Dawe Avago Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**
data code

SuggestedRemedy
data character

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Text has been removed by comment #1.

Cl **Q4** *SC* *P* *L* # 10

Piers Dawe Avago Technologies

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
subcluase

SuggestedRemedy
subclause (or delete, at least three times)

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **Q5** *SC* *P* **8** *L* **23** # 14

Piers Dawe Avago Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**
in PCS synchronization state diagram

SuggestedRemedy
in the PCS synchronization state diagram

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **Q5**
SC

Page 3 of 3
12/29/2006 10:59:02