

**IEEE 802.3 Maintenance Task Force**  
**March 2009 Meeting Minutes**  
**Vancouver, Canada**  
**Wednesday March 11<sup>th</sup>, 2009**  
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/index.html>

Meeting called to order by Wael William Diab (Chair) at 1.10PM March 11<sup>th</sup> 2009.

Steve Carlson volunteered to act as recording secretary and record the minutes.

Mr. Diab read the meeting agenda.

For the meeting agenda and slides, please refer to:

[http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab\\_1\\_0309.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0309.pdf)

### **Patent Slides**

Wael displayed the patent policy slides, reading aloud the highlights and guidelines and allowing time for the group to digest the information.

Patent slides shown at 1:16 PM. Call for any known LOAs. Response: none.

### **Attendance**

Wael informed the attendees about the attendance recording mechanisms and briefly described the rules for voting membership. The following individuals recorded their attendance:

Wael Diab, Broadcom  
Michell Turner, IEEE Staff  
Geoff Thompson, Nortel  
Howard Frazier, Broadcom  
David Law, 3Com  
Steve Carlson, HSD  
Bob Grow, Intel  
Jeff Lepak, UNH  
George Zimmerman, Solarflare  
Fred Schindler, Cisco  
Anoop Vetteth, Cisco

### **Agenda**

Wael went through the agenda:

- Time: 1pm to 3pm
  - Review and approve agenda
  - Review patent slides
  - Approve January minutes
  - Interpretations
    - 1-03/09

- New maintenance request
  - 1205
- 802.3bb
- Time: 3pm to 4pm (Fairmont, “Boardroom”)
  - New maintenance request (15 mins)
    - 1206, 1207 and 1208
  - Containment overview and contributions (15 mins)
  - Containment discussion (30 mins)
- Time: 4pm to END
  - 802.3bc WG Ballot comment resolution\*
  - ISO/IEC JTC 1 SC6 WG 1 8802-3:2000

\* work on 802.3bc may commence prior to 4pm

**Motion to approve agenda.**

M: Frazier

S: Grow

Approved by voice vote without opposition.

**Previous Minutes**

**Motion to approve the January 2009 minutes.**

M: Jeff Lapak

S: D. Estes

Approved by voice vote without opposition.

**Interpretations**

There was interpretation request received 1-03/09:

*Discussion of request*

This request is not in the form of an interpretation; it is request for consultation since he does not state two different interpretations of the material. The functionality is unambiguous stated in the standard. The standard does not mandate implementations, i.e. how the copy must be provided, just that a copy shall be made.

*Proposed response*

This request is a request for consultation rather than an interpretation request. It also does not meet the requirement of providing at least two possible interpretations.

The functionality required is unambiguously stated in the standard.

The requester’s interpretation is not correct as the standard does not specify or limit how the functionality is achieved.

**Motion:**

- Move: Accept above response to interpretation request 1-03/09
  - M: R. Grow S: S. Carlson
  - Y: 7 N:0 A:0 Motion Passes

## New Maintenance Requests

Wael described that we have

- 24 Open Maintenance requests
- 4 new requests since January
  - Related to CARRIER\_STATUS transition editorial issue, 100BASE-TX objectives and 10GBASE-T objectives
- Current status of open requests:

Balloting	10
Ready for ballot	7
Awaiting clarification	0
To be categorised	7

Notes: Some 'Balloting' assigned to IEEE P802.3at

### *New Request Summary*

Request	Standard	Subclause	Subject
1205	802.3-2008	22.2.1.3.3	CARRIER_STATUS transition editorial error
1206	802.3-2008	24.1.2	100BASE-TX Media grade objective
1207	802.3-2008	24.1.2	100BASE-TX Media reference objective
1208	802.3-2008	55.1.1	10GBASE-T Media reference objective

### *Maintenance Notes*

Refer to [http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab\\_1\\_0309.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0309.pdf)

### **Joint Discussion with IEEE P802.3at and IEEE P802.3az**

Maintenance items 1206, 1207 and 1208 were discussed. Refer to [http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab\\_1\\_0309.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0309.pdf).

### **Straw Polls**

- Maintenance request 1206
  - Requester updated suggested change to “deleting the word “UTP” from bullet (d)”
    - Poll of support of such a remedy
    - Y: 1 N: 7 A: 13
    - Lacks consensus
  - Propose adding the “5” footnote designation after the word UTP
    - Y: 9 N:1 A:11
    - Has consensus
- Maintenance request 1207
  - Requester updated suggested change “adding the “5” footnote designation after the word unshielded”
    - Y: 11 N: 0 A: 8
    - Has consensus
- Maintenance work items
  - Prefer to do the maint requests 1206 and 1207 in P802.3az: 1
  - Prefer to do the maint requests 1206 and 1207 in a future maint project: 3
  - Don't care: 5

## **Containment and LLDP**

There was a discussion on the containment model used for LLDP and what architecture should be recommended to the 802.3 projects dealing with this.

### **Motion (Containment and LLDP)**

Move:

- Affirm the containment model contained in IEEE P802.3bc D2.0 is the model used for LLDP related projects moving forward
- Request that IEEE P802.3at and IEEE P802.3az make the changes to their drafts to match above
- Copy the text from IEEE 802.1AB-2005 Section 5.2, items N and M to IEEE 802.3bc

M: D. Law            S: H. Frazier

- Technical (75%)
- All:                Y:15                N:0                A:6
- Motion Passes

### **End of joint discussion with IEEE P802.3at and IEEE P802.3az**

## **802.3bb**

Draft submitted for WG preview was reviewed. No changes were suggested or requested.

### **Motion (802.3bb)**

Move:

- Request that IEEE 802.3 authorize the IEEE 802.3 Working Group chair to submit IEEE P802.3-2008/Cor 1 to sponsor ballot conditional upon successful completion of the Working Group ballot (making this request at the same time as Working Group ballot authorization is not setting precedent).
- Request that IEEE 802.3 authorizes the Maintenance Task Force to conduct meetings and recirculation ballots as necessary to resolve comments received during Working Group and Sponsor Balloting.
- M: D. Law        S: G. Zimmerman
- Technical (75%)
- All:                Y: 5                N: 0                A: 1
- Motion Passes

## **802.3bc**

Wael showed the results of the initial working group ballot. The working group ballot closed successfully after the extensions by the Working Group Chair to accommodate the response rate.

All comments against IEEE P802.3bc's initial Working Group ballot were considered. Result of the comment resolution was recorded in the comment database. A total of 104 comments were considered.

### **Motion (802.3bc #1)**

Move:

- Accept all open Es and ERs in the comment database
- Provide the Editor of P802.3bc editorial license
  
- M: G. Zimmerman    S: J. Lapak
- Technical (75%)
- All:                Y:7                N:0                A:0
- Motion Passes

### **Motion (802.3bc #2)**

Move:

- Charter the Editor of P802.3bc to generate D2.1 incorporating resolution to comments received on D2.0 and changes captured in diab\_1\_0309.pdf
  
- M: N. Finn    S: J. Lapak
- Technical (75%)
- All:                Y:     7                N:0                A:0
- Motion Passes

### **Motion (802.3bc #3)**

Move:

- Request that IEEE 802.3 authorize the IEEE 802.3 Working Group chair to submit IEEE P802.3bc to sponsor ballot conditional upon successful completion of the Working Group ballot.
- Request that IEEE 802.3 authorizes the Maintenance Task Force to conduct meetings and recirculation ballots as necessary to resolve comments received during Working Group and Sponsor Balloting.
  
- M: D. Law    S: G. Zimmerman
- Technical (75%)
- All:                Y: 6                N: 0                A: 0
- Motion Passes

### **Liaisons**

There was a discussion on a liaison with Liaison to ISO/IEC JTC 1 SC6 WG 1.

### **Motion (Liaison)**

- Move
  - Accept liaison response as drafted in diab\_1\_0309.pdf as a basis for a liaison communication to ISO/IEC JTC 1 SC6 WG 1.
  - Provide editorial licence to the Maint TF Chair to convert the bulleted text into a letter and present at the closing IEEE 802.3 plenary session for review
  - M: G. Thompson

- S: R. Grow
- Technical (75%)
- Passes by voice vote without opposition

**Motion to adjourn.**

M: A. Vetteth

S: F. Schindler

Approved by voice vote without opposition.

**Adjourned at 6.30pm**