

IEEE 802.3 Maintenance Task Force
March 2012 Meeting Minutes
Waikoloa, HI
Tuesday, March 13th and Wednesday, March 14th, 2012
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/index.html>

Minutes recorded by the recording secretary.

Meeting called to order by Mr. Wael William Diab (Chair) at 9:03AM March 13th, 2012.

For the meeting slides, please refer to: http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0312.pdf

For the comment resolution database, please refer to:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/index.html>

Patent Slides

Mr. Diab displayed the patent policy slides and guidelines and allowed time for the group to digest the information. The patent slides were shown at 9:04AM. Mr. Diab called for any known Letters of Assurance (LOAs). Response: none.

Attendance

Mr. Diab asked the meeting attendees to introduce themselves. Mr. Diab informed the attendees about the attendance recording mechanisms. The following individuals recorded their attendance and affiliation on March 13th:

Name	Affiliation
Anslow, Pete	Ciena
Balasubramanian, Koussalya	Cisco
Carlson, Steve	High Speed Design
Diab, Wael	Broadcom
Dudek, Mike	Qlogic
Dwellely, Dave	Linear Technology
Grimwood, Mike	Broadcom
Grow, Bob	Intel/Self
Hajduczenia, Marek	ZTE
Heath, Jeff	Linear Technology
Kosanovich, Keith	Leviton
Law, David	HP

Name	Affiliation
Maguire, Valerie	Siemon
McCormack, Mike	Texas Instruments
McNarney, Martin	Broadcom
Palkert, Tom	Molex
Ray, Adee	Intel
Signorino, Irene	Microsemi
Tazebay, Mehmet	Broadcom
Thaler, Pat	Broadcom
Tracy, Nathan	TE Connectivity
Turner, Michelle	IEEE
Winkel, Ludwig	Siemens

The following individuals recorded their attendance and affiliation on March 14th:

Name	Affiliation
Abaye, Ali	Broadcom
Brown, Kevin	Broadcom
Diab, Wael	Broadcom
Dwellely, Dave	Linear Technology

Name	Affiliation
Maguire, Valerie	Siemon
McCormack, Mike	Texas Instruments
McNarney, Martin	Broadcom
Signorino, Irene	MicroSemi

Estes, Dave	UNH-IOL
Grimwood, Mike	Broadcom
Grow, Bob	Intel/Self
Hajduczenia, Marek	ZTE
Heath, Jeff	Linear Technology

Tazebay, Mehmet	Broadcom
Thompson, Geoff	GraCaSi
Winkel, Ludwig	Siemens
Woodruff, Bill	Broadcom

Agenda

Mr. Diab went through the agenda:

- Review patent slides
- Review and approve agenda
- Approve maintenance minutes
- Maintenance request status
- P802.3 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh) Task Force
 - SA Initial Ballot Statistics
 - Chair’s Guidelines on Discussion
 - Comment resolution and ad-hoc reports per http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_0312.pdf
 - Future schedule
- Interpretation
- Future meetings

Motion #1 Approve agenda

M: M. Grimwood

S: R. Grow

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #2 Approve January 2012 minutes with the following three changes:

- ICN Ad Hoc Report: “No reported was...” changed to “No report was...”
- PoE Ad Hoc Report: “No reported was...” changed to “No report was...”
- New Business: “valid 10GBASE-Rx work clock in” changed to “valid 10GBASE-W clock in”

M: M. Grimwood

S: K. Balasubramanian

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Maintenance Requests

Mr. Diab indicated that we have:

- 32 Open Maintenance requests
- 0 new requests since March 2011
- Current status of open requests:

Balloting	27
Ready for ballot	0
Awaiting clarification	0
Errata	0
To be categorised	5

Note: All requests in balloting state are being balloted in IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) Revision to IEEE Std 802.3-2008.

No new maintenance requests were received this period.

Maintenance Notes

Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0312.pdf

Officers

Mr. Diab introduced the officers of the Maintenance and the IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) Task Force:

- Mr. Pete Anslow (Section Editor P802.3 TF)
- Mr. Marek Hajduczenia (Section Editor P802.3 TF)
- Ms. Valerie Maguire (Recording Secretary/Maintenance TF; Clause Editor P802.3 TF)

P802.3/D3.0 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh)

Mr. Diab reviewed the Sponsor ballot statistics, including statistics on individual comments related to maintenance requests and overall comment distribution. Mr. Diab noted that the approval rating is greater than 90%. Mr. Diab also reviewed guidelines for discussion. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0312.pdf

The Maintenance Comment Schedule provided a guideline for the order and timeline associated with comment resolution. Refer to

http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_0312.pdf

Comment resolution was recorded online in the comment database. Refer to

http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/P802d3_802d3_bh_D3p0_All_Comment.pdf

Ms. Maguire led the group through Section 1 general comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to

http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/maguire_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 102, 103, 123, 131, 127, 16, 17, 6, 14, 15, 10, 11, 12, 13, 96, 9, 124, 8, and 5 were resolved and closed.
- Comment 32 was resolved and closed.
- Comment 65 was deferred for resolution later in the meeting.

Motion #3 Accept response to comment 7 recorded in

http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/P802d3_802d3_bh_D3p0_All_Comment.pdf

M: P. Anslow

S: A. Ran

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 10 N: 3 A: 3

Motion Passes

Mr. Diab led the group through Normative/Informative reference-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to

http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

- Comments 39, 40, 38, and 37 were resolved and closed.
- Comment 35 was deferred for resolution later in the meeting.

The group took a break Tuesday, March 13th at 10:48AM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 11:04AM on Tuesday, March 13th.

Mr. Anslow led the group through Cross-section reference-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf and http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 55, 122, 132, 126, and 32 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Anslow led the group through Cross-section general reference-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

- Comments 56, 58, and 59 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Anslow led the group through Section 4 comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 4 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 119, 120, 54, 82, 83, 84, 85, 66, 30, 42, 43, 145, 111, 149, and 31 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Anslow led the group through Section 6-Specific comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 5 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 108, 112, 113, 147, 138, 71, and 125 were resolved and closed.

The group took a break Tuesday, March 13th at 12:11PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 1:16PM on Tuesday, March 13th.

ICN Ad Hoc Report

Mr. Tom Palkert has been leading an Ad Hoc investigating proposed changes to table 85-12 in IEEE 802.3bh. Mr. Palkert presented a summary of the Ad Hoc's investigative task, teleconference schedule, measured data, proposed solution, and final recommendations. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/palkert_1_0312.pdf. Mr. Anslow reviewed proposed ICN-related changes to IEEE 802.3bh. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_3_0312.pdf.

Mr. Anslow continued to lead the group through Section 6 ICN-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 5 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 64, 63, and 129 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Diab led the group through a review of comment 37 and deferred comment 35.

- Comment 37 was re-opened for discussion without objection.
- The resolution to comment 37 was revised and the comment closed.
- Comment 35 was resolved and closed.

Mr. Anslow continued to lead the group through Section 6-Specific comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 5 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comment 104 was resolved and closed.

Mr. Diab appointed Mr. Palkert to Chair an Ad Hoc to discuss common mode specifications related to comment 104. The purpose of the Ad Hoc is to investigate restoring the common-mode specifications of IEEE 802.3ba, but with different (generally more relaxed) limits that take the characteristics of connectors, compliance boards, and other factors into account.

Comments against Revision of IEEE 802 Architecture Standard

Mr. Diab asked if there was any objection to adding a new item to the agenda to look at comments assigned to IEEE 802.3 Working Group as a result of the P802 Architecture Standard review. There was no objection. Mr. Diab requested Task Group members to review four comments received against the IEEE 802 Architecture standard that relate to reference models for IEEE 802.3 devices. Mr. David Law provided an overview of the comments and proposed resolutions. Resolutions to the four comments were accepted without opposition.

P802.3/D3.0 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh), continued

Mr. Anslow led the group through the remainder of Section 6-Specific comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 5 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

Motion #4 Accept response to comment 133 recorded in

http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/P802d3_802d3_bh_D3p0_All_Comment.pdf.

M: P. Anslow

S: K. Kosanovich

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 6 N: 1 A: 1

Motion Passes

- Comments 134, 136, 135, 137, 140, 142, 141, 143, and 91 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Anslow led the group through Section 6-General comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to slide 6 of http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 106, 62, 110, 86, 87, 109, 88, 114, 107, and 105 were resolved and closed.

The group took a break Tuesday, March 13th at 3:23PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 3:48PM on Tuesday, March 13th.

Motion #5: Agree to review and resolve comments submitted after the initial recirculation Sponsor Group ballot closed (i.e. “rogue” comments)

M: M. McCormack

S: A. Ran

Procedural (>50%)

All: Y: 10 N: 0 A: 1

Motion passes

No objection was raised to discussing and resolving three PoE-related comments out of the order listed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule. Mr. Diab led the group through resolution of these comments.

PoE Ad Hoc Report

Mr. Mike McCormack has been leading an Ad Hoc investigating POE-related revisions and updates, including those proposed in comments 78, 79, and 80, to the P802.3/D3.0 Revision. Mr. McCormack presented a summary of the Ad Hoc’s attendance, an overview of the three comments, and proposed resolutions. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/mccormack_1_0312.pdf.

- Comments 79 and 80 were resolved and closed.
- Comment 78 was deferred for resolution later in the meeting.

Late Comments

No objection was raised to discussing and resolving the comments that were received after the initial recirculation Sponsor Group ballot closed. Comments were entered under rogue comment interface as comments 150, 151, and 152 (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/anslow_4_0312.pdf). Mr. Anslow led the group through resolution of these comments.

- Comments 150, 151, and 152 were resolved and closed.

P802.3/D3.0 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh), continued

Mr. Hajduczenia led the group through Section 5 comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/hajduczenia_1_0312.pdf).

- Comment 115 was resolved and closed.

No objection was raised to discussing and resolving the one remaining PoE-related comment out of the order listed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule. Mr. Diab led the group through a review of deferred comment 78.

- Comment 78 was resolved and closed.

The group recessed Tuesday, March 13th at 6:07PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 9AM on Wednesday, March 14th.

Mr. Hajduczenia led the group through the remainder of Section 5 comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/hajduczenia_1_0312.pdf).

- Comments 116, 117, 146, 139, 61, 100, 98, 99, 101, and 97 were resolved and closed.

Mr. Diab agreed to note the resolution of comment 97 in the Maintenance report to IEEE 802.3. Mr. Diab affirmed that he is always willing to bring forth the resolution of any comment in the Maintenance report to IEEE 802.3 at the request of a Task Force member.

Mr. Diab led the group through OCL-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf.)

- Comment 67 was resolved and closed.

Mr. Diab led the group through EEE and EEE Management and OUI-related comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (also refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf.)

- Comments 68, 69, 70, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, and 81 were resolved and closed.

Motion #6 Accept the resolution to the comments identified in Bucket Motion 1 (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

M: H. Barrass

S: M. McNarney

Technical (>75%)

All: Y: 7 N: 0 A: 0

Motion passes

Mr. Diab led the group through S1/S2/S3 General, FM, Other-related comment resolution (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

Motion #7 Accept the resolutions to comments 18 through 29.

M: V. Maguire

S: M. McNarney

Technical (>75%)

All: Y: 6 N: 0 A: 0

Motion passes

The group took a break Wednesday, March 14th at 12:08PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 1:15PM on Wednesday, March 14th.

Mr. Diab led the group through remaining S1/S2/S3 General, FM, Other-related comment resolution (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

- Comments 1, 2, 3, 148, 33, 34, 35, 36, 53, 94, 130, 144 were resolved and closed.
- Comment 65 was resolved and closed in accordance with http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/thaler_1_0312.pdf. It was noted that changes will be limited to non-deprecated clauses or clauses that are required for new implementations

The group took a break Wednesday, March 14th at 1:55PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 2:37PM on Wednesday, March 14th.

Mr. Diab led the group through Withdrawn standards and deprecation-related comment resolution (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_2_0312.pdf).

- Comments 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 89, 90, 92, 93, 95, and 96 were resolved and closed.

As part of resolution to comment 50, the Task Force agreed to investigate deleting or deprecating clause 4 in the future.

Interpretation Requests

Interpretation 1-03/12: Clarification regarding Annex 86A nPPI – XLPPI – CPPI electrical parameter (refer to <http://www.ieee802.org/3/interp/interp-1-0312.pdf>).

Response:

- The standard is unambiguous.
- This request is being returned to you because the question asked does not constitute a request for interpretation but instead a request for consultation. Generally, an interpretation request is submitted when the wording of a specific clause or portion of a standard is ambiguous or incomplete. The request should state the two or more possible interpretations or the lack of completeness of the text.
- Note that the text that is in question refers to the output voltage *tolerance*.

Motion #8 Approve the response above to interpretation 1-03/12.

M: D. Estes

S: K. Balasubramanian

Technical (>75%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Schedule

Mr. Diab reviewed the schedule for 1st Sponsor Group recirculation ballot. The schedule summarized approximate ballot open and close, post results, post comments, post comments with proposed responses, and meet to consider comments dates. A conservative schedule with two recirculation ballots (March - May and May - July) will support the target of submitting the document to the Standards Association Standards Board (SASB) in August, 2012. It was noted that July 20, 2012 is the submittal deadline for the RevCom package supporting this schedule. It is anticipated that a request for non-conditional approval will be made at the July IEEE 802/802.3, which will support the August SASB meeting submittal deadline of July 20th. Refer to: http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0312.pdf.

Motion #9: Request that the IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) editorial team prepare draft D3.1 based upon D3.0 and responses to D3.0 comments as recorded in the database for a recirculation ballot and create drafts and conduct subsequent recirculation ballots as required.

M: V. Maguire

S: R. Grow

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #10: Adjourn

M: R. Grow

S: K. Balasubramanian

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Adjourned at 4:12PM March 14th, 2012