

IEEE 802.3 Maintenance Task Force
November 2011 Meeting Minutes
Atlanta, GA
Tuesday, November 8th, 2011
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/index.html>

Minutes recorded by the Recording Secretary.

Meeting called to order by Mr. Wael William Diab (Chair) at 9:03AM November 8th, 2011.
Mr. Diab introduced the officers of the Maintenance Task Force and the IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) Task Force:

- Ms. Valerie Maguire (Recording Secretary/Maint TF; Clause Editor P802.3 TF)
- Mr. Pete Anslow (Section Editor P802.3 TF)
- Mr. Marek Hajduczenia (Section Editor P802.3 TF)

For the meeting slides, please refer to:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_1111.pdf

For the comment resolution database, please refer to:

<http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/index.html>

Patent Slides

Mr. Diab displayed the patent policy slides and guidelines and allowed time for the group to digest the information. The patent slides were shown at 9:04AM. Mr. Diab called for any known Letters of Assurance (LOAs). Response: none.

Mr. Diab asked the meeting attendees to introduce themselves.

Attendance

Mr. Diab informed the attendees about the attendance recording mechanisms. The following individuals recorded their attendance and affiliation:

| Name | Affiliation |
|-------------------|--------------------|
| Alexander, Tom | Ixia |
| Anslow, Pete | Ciena |
| Aslam, Hassaan | Broadcom |
| Barrass, Hugh | Cisco |
| Belopolsky, Yakov | Bel Stewart |
| Brown, Alan | Aurora Networks |
| Carlson, Steve | High Speed Design |
| Diab, Wael | Broadcom |
| Dwellely, Dave | Linear Tech |
| ElBakoury, Hesham | Huawei |
| Estes, Dave | UNH-IOL |

| Name | Affiliation |
|------------------|--------------------|
| Larsen, Wayne | CommScope |
| Law, David | HP |
| Lowell, Lamb | Broadcom |
| Maguire, Valerie | Siemon |
| McCormack, Mike | Texas Instruments |
| McNarney, Martin | Broadcom |
| Nordin, Ron | Panduit |
| Ossman, Valy | PMC-Sierra |
| Panguluri, Sessa | Broadcom |
| Remein, Duane | Huawei |
| Sharma, Atul | Voilex |

| | |
|--------------------|----------|
| Grimwood, Michael | Broadcom |
| Grow, Robert | Intel |
| Hajduczenia, Marek | ZTE |
| Kramer, Glen | Broadcom |
| Kosanovich, Keith | Leviton |

| | |
|--------------------|----------|
| Sparrowhawk, Bryan | Leviton |
| Stassar, Peter | Huawei |
| Thaler, Pat | Broadcom |
| Wagner, Bob | Panduit |
| Weiying, Cheng | Tellabs |

Agenda

Mr. Diab went through the agenda:

- Review patent slides
- Review and approve agenda
- Approve maintenance minutes
- Maintenance request status
- P802.3 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh) Task Force
 - Statistics on the 1st recirculation ballot
 - Chair’s guidelines on discussion
 - Comment resolution
 - Per
 - http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_1111.pdf
 - Future schedule
 - Motions
 - Request for conditional approval for SASB ballot
- Interpretation Requests
- Future meetings

Motion #1: Approve agenda

M: H. Barrass

S: M. Grimwood

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #2: Approve the September 2011 minutes with change to add a space between “for” and “a” on motion #21.

M: P. Anslow

S: H. Barrass

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Maintenance Requests

Mr. Diab indicated that we have:

- 32 Open Maintenance requests
- 0 new requests since March
- Current status of open requests:

| | |
|------------------------|----|
| Balloting | 27 |
| Ready for ballot | 0 |
| Awaiting clarification | 0 |
| Errata | 0 |
| To be categorised | 5 |

Note: All requests in balloting state are being balloted in IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) Revision to IEEE Std 802.3-2008.

No new maintenance requests were received this period.

Maintenance Notes

Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_1111.pdf

P802.3 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh)

Mr. Diab reviewed the initial recirculation Working Group ballot statistics, including statistics on individual comments related to maintenance requests and overall comment distribution. Mr. Diab noted that the Approval rating improved compared to the initial Working Group ballot. Mr. Diab also reviewed guidelines for discussion. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_1111.pdf.

Mr. Diab reported that the publication editor has performed a Pre-Mandatory Editorial Coordination (Pre-MEC) review of draft 2.1. Items required to proceed to sponsor balloting were checked and, from a Pre-MEC perspective, the Task Force may proceed to sponsor ballot.

Motion #3: Agree to hear comments submitted after the initial recirculation Working Group ballot close date

- M: M. McCormack
- S: H. Barrass
- Procedural (>50%)
- Passed by voice vote without opposition

Comment resolution was recorded online in the comment database. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/P802d3_802d3_bh_D2p1_All_Clause.pdf

Presentations related to comments

- “Modify Definition of MA-DATA Primitives in Sub-Clause 64.2.2.6”, by Mr. Glen Kramer
- “Modify Definition of MA-DATA Primitives in Sub-Clause 77.2.2.6”, by Mr. Glen Kramer
- “Revised Figure 77-1”, by Mr. Glen Kramer

- “Proposed modifications in IEEE 802.3REV_D2p1 in relation to optical safety in IEC 60825”, by Mr. Peter Stassar
- “ICN Ad Hoc”, by Mr. Tom Palkert

Mr. Anslow led the group through section 4 and 6 cross-section comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_1111.pdf), with the exception that comments 89 and 76 were addressed after comment 49.

- Comments 60, 62, 84, 39, 41, 37, 64, 65, 63, 61, 56, 52, 72, 77, 38, 78, 42, 47, 48, 49, and 89 were closed without opposition.

Mr. Diab appointed Ms. Maguire to Chair an Ad Hoc to discuss component interoperability as related to comments 77, 38, 78, 42, 47, 48, and 49. The purpose of the Ad Hoc is to increase visibility of this issue and allow for comments to be revised in a manner that has a broadly acceptable resolution. The intention is for revised comments to be submitted and considered at Sponsor ballot.

The group took a break Tuesday, November 8th at 10:30AM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 10:52 AM on Tuesday, November 8th.

Mr. Peter Stassar presented “Proposed modifications in IEEE 802.3REV_D2p1 in relation to optical safety in IEC 60825”. Mr. Diab requested that Mr. Stassar develop a liaison letter to IEC requesting that access to copies of IEC 60825-1 and IEC 60825-2 be provided to the Task Force to assist in developing the P802.3bh project. The liaison will clarify that documents will be shared with participants under password protection only and access would be removed after the project is complete. The commenter was invited to re-submit comment 76 at Sponsor ballot. The Chair will inform IEEE staff that this liaison will be sent to IEC.

- Comments 76, 75, 58, 36, 44, 43, 45, 46, and 12 were closed without opposition.

The group agreed to revise the agenda to allow Mr. Tom Palkert to present the 100GCR10/SR10 Ad Hoc report after resolution to comment 12. Mr. Palkert presented “ICN Ad Hoc” (see http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/palkert_1_1111.pdf). Recommend changes to table 85-12, proposed solutions, and a call-to-action to validate the proposed solution were reviewed. The Ad Hoc is chartered to continue meeting until the deadline for comment submission to Sponsor Ballot. Mr. Palkert agreed to continue in his role as Chair of the Ad Hoc.

The group took a break Tuesday, November 8th at 12:05PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 1:17 PM on Tuesday, November 8th.

Mr. Diab reviewed the liaison letter to IEC requesting access to copies of IEC 60825-1 and IEC 60825-2.

Motion #4: Approve the content of liaison letter as shown in diab_1_1111.pdf with appropriate editorial license

M: P. Anslow

S: J. King

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 12 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

- Comments 40, 22, and 69 were closed without opposition.

Mr. Anslow led the group through section 1 through 6 “broad interest” comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_1111.pdf).

- Comments 55, 57, and 66 were closed without opposition.

Mr. Hadjuzenia led the group through section 5 comment resolution in the order outlined in http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/hajduczenia_1_1111.pdf.

- Comment 91 was withdrawn. Comments 90, 10, 11, 83, 79, 92, and 82 were closed without opposition.

Mr. Diab led the group through comment resolution related to “Management”, “OCL”, and “S1/S2/S3 General, FM, Other” in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_1111.pdf).

- Comments 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 80, 9, 59, 74, 1, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 67, 72, 73, 50, 71, 81, 87, and 88 were closed without opposition.

Ms. Maguire led the group through section 1 general comment resolution in the order proposed in the Maintenance Comment Schedule (refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_1111.pdf).

- Comment 70 was withdrawn. Comments 17, 19, 20, 21, 15, 18, 13, 14, 16, 68, 85, 23, 86, 51, 54, and 53 were closed without opposition.

The group took a break Tuesday, November 8th at 3:10PM.

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 3:45PM on Tuesday, November 8th.

Interpretation Requests

Interpretation 1-11/11 - Simultaneous Output Power on Standard in reference to IEEE 802.3af-2003 was discussed and a response was produced.

Response to both questions 1 and 2:

- The standard is unambiguous.
- This request is being returned to you because the question asked does not constitute a request for interpretation but instead a request for consultation. Generally, an interpretation request is submitted when the wording of a specific clause or portion of a standard is ambiguous or incomplete. The request should state the two or more possible interpretations or the lack of completeness of the text.
- The header text on the PICS pro-forma indicates that the implementer claims conformance. The committee does not take positions as to whether a specific implementation is conformant.

Motion #5: Approve the response above to interpretation 1-11/11

M: V. Maguire

S: R. Grow

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 9 N: 0 A: 0

Motion Passes

Interpretation 2-11/11 - MMD register access through Clause 22 register 13 & 14 in reference to IEEE 802.3-2008 and IEEE 802.3az-2010 was discussed and a response was produced.

Response to both questions 1 and 2:

- This request is being returned to you because the questions asked do not constitute a request for interpretation but instead a request for consultation. Generally, an interpretation request is submitted when the wording of a specific clause or portion of a standard is ambiguous or incomplete. The request should state the two or more possible interpretations or the lack of completeness of the text.

Response to question 1:

- The standard is unambiguous. Refer to Table 45-2.

Response to question 1:

- The standard is unambiguous. Refer to section 45.2.

Motion #6: Approve the response above to interpretation 2-11/11

M: V. Maguire

S: G. Thompson

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 6 N: 0 A: 3

Motion Passes

Interpretation 3-11/11 - Missing Section in reference to IEEE 802.3ba-2010 was discussed and a response was produced.

Response to the question:

- The standard is unambiguous. Section 74.7.4.7 appears in IEEE Std802.3-2008 which IEEE Std802.3ba-2010 is part of and amends. The amendment does not stand on its own.

Motion #7: Approve the response above to interpretation 3-11/11

M: R. Grow

S: G. Thompson

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 9 N: 0 A: 0

Motion Passes

Schedule

Mr. Diab reviewed the schedule for 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot. The schedule summarized approximate ballot open and close, post results, post comments, post comments with proposed responses, and meet to consider comments dates. The schedule accommodates opening the initial Sponsor Group ballot in late December. The target approval date was revised to June, 2012. Refer to:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_1111.pdf

Motion #8: Request that the IEEE 802.3 editorial team prepare draft D2.2 based upon D2.1 and responses to D2.1 comments as recorded in the database for a recirculation ballot

M: R. Grow

S: M. Grimwood

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 12 N: 0 A: 0

Motion Passes

Motion #9: Request that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group Chair request conditional approval to begin sponsor ballot on IEEE P802.3 (IEEE 802.3bh) from the IEEE 802 EC.

M: R. Grow

S: M. Grimwood

Technical ($\geq 75\%$)

All: Y: 11 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

Motion #10: Adjourn

M: M. McCormack

S: S. Carlson

Procedural (>50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition

Adjourned at 5:26PM November 8th, 2011