

IEEE 802.5 Committee
July 7th-10th, 1997
Maui, Hi
Meeting 'DD'

Paul Gessert, 802.5 Recording Secretary (Acting)
Bay Networks, USA

<i>Revision History</i>

v0.0	7 Mar 97	Template
v1.0	19 July 97	First Release

Attendees

Full Time

Bob Love	<i>IBM</i>
Mick Hanrahan	<i>Texas Instruments</i>
George Lin	<i>3Com</i>
Carson Stuart	<i>Cisco Systems</i>
Paul Gessert	<i>Bay Networks</i>
Denis Murphy	<i>Pulse</i>
Bob Ross	<i>Lan Utilities</i>
David Wilson	<i>Madge Networks</i>

Part Time

Michael Saltzman	<i>Madge Networks</i>
------------------	-----------------------

Detailed Meeting Minutes

Monday July 7th

802.5 Opening Plenary

The meeting started at 15:32 with Bob Love giving a review of the status of 802.5s, 802.5r and 802.5j. Discussion followed on the 802.5r negative ballot vote, which was resolved, but will require a re-circulation vote due to the change being technical in nature. (see CRF issue in 802.5/97/07-05) Publication for all of the standards is scheduled for November. There was open Q&A on the process the three standards will follow culminating in the November publication. The discussion then moved to last minute editorial changes and how (or if) they will be corrected prior to publication. Bob explained how ISO voted on 802.5rD7.1, USA had comments on 802.5rD7.1, SC6 agreed with the USA comments. These comments now need to be integrated.

Bob will not ask that the MII study group continue due to no e-mail discussion and no published papers on the subject.

Bob passed around the attendance book and all signed, business cards were collected and Bob discussed the voting rules for the meeting. The agenda was discussed and some of the items were moved in time based on input from the attendees. Mick made a motion (it passed) to hold off approving the minutes from the March plenary (meeting CC) until Thursday morning. Bob made the following announcements: A CD containing all released 802 standards would be handed out starting at 7:30 am on Wednesday, copies of the LMSC rules are available at the main desk for all who are interested, 802 members are encouraged to join the Standards Activity Board (IEEE SA) sign up forms are available at the front desk.

The group discussed the importance of the Wednesday morning 802.1 plenary as the 802.3 Vlan tag proposal may exclude Token Ring frame format. The group asked if a copy of the proposal could be made available to us Tuesday prior to the meeting. A short Vlan tag discussion followed.

The agenda for the week was approved, printed and distributed.

Tuesday July 8th

First half of meeting 8:30 - 11:30

Wake On Lan

The meeting opened with a discussion of the "wake on lan" issue and Microsoft's definition of a different wake up packet. Should we get involved with other people implementing non-standards based approaches. Dave Wilson proposed we standardize the "state" the TR nic is in when it is in the listening mode for wake on lan.

Mick: This is not a MAC protocol, it's at the LLC level and should not be standardized by this group but only its behavior or effect on the ring as a whole while in this mode.

Dave Wilson proposed a comment on this issue be added to a 802.5 document and asked if DTR should put a protocol in place.

Mick suggested to add information about this subject to the 802.5 WEB site. (sleep modes etc.) The text of Motion 6 from 3/13/97 will be modified and put on the WEB site.

A motion was written to change the wording of (Motion 6 from 3/13/97) to remove "ring poll failure and"
A vote was taken (DD02) yes 5 no 0 abstain 1, it passed. Moved by R. Ross second by D. Wilson

Review new comments on current drafts

Mick went over document 802.5/97/07-10 which covers editorial mistakes found in the 802.5r draft 7.1. MJH01 through MJH08 were discussed and all agreed the editor should use these comments. A Motion will be voted on later.

VLAN Tag issues

Open discussion on the issues of SR information in the Vlan tag vs keeping the SR information in the TR frame and larger than 1.5K frame size in Ethernet. We tried to get copies of Neil's presentation from the March 97 plenary to see what we asked him to present at the 802.1 meeting, a copy was found. The discussion continued about Vlans within enet, tr, fddi vs Vlans across the three technologies. This is the Vlans in heterogeneous vs homogeneous networks. The problem is how to get the RIF information from one end of a heterogeneous network to the other, TR to ??? to TR. This is seen as a switch issue not an end station issue. 802.1H is the root of the problem, Bob Ross suggested .3 and .5 join forces and get .1 to fix H, .p and .q is not the place to fix this problem.

.H removes the SR information, this has broken the TR frame when its encapsulated and passed from TR to Enet and back to TR.

Bob passed out copies of the "Source Routing Encapsulation" presentation given to 802.1 by George Duane at the March Plenary (802.5/97/07-12)

Start of afternoon session

Paul G. started the talk on Tolly with the collection of articles and then gave his presentation on Bay's view of the Tolly meeting. 802.5/97/07-07, 802.5/97/07-09)

Dave Olechovsky From IBM called in and talked about his view of the meeting. (802.5/97/07-13)

Open discussion began on the issue of FTR, Vlan tags on TR and TR encapsulated on Enet.

The time line was talked about, industry solution vs IEEE stds based solution. Is 2-3 yrs. The reality track for a standards based solution??

Bob Ross's view was you can't just migrate a deterministic lan to a non deterministic lan without breaking the customers model, banks, trading houses etc.

Each person went around and gave their "one minute" version of their view of FTR and what they believe IEEE and the industry should do.

A vote was taken to request (DD03) a high speed TR study group be formed, moved by Bob Ross and seconded by Paul Gessert. " In light of renewed public interest in High speed T-R 802.5 requests the SEC grant formation of a Hi Speed T-R study group with in 802.5. Y=5 N=0 A=1
(Dave Wilson =A)

The idea of a "one day" interim meeting after the "August" Tolly meeting was talked about to further focus on the HSTR initiative and work toward a possible PAR in November.

Proposal for merging current Drafts

Bob started with a talk about how he believes the process needs to move forward. We need an editor to take this issue. We decided the project is of value and should move forward.

Wednesday July 9th

802.5 attended the 802.1 Plenary meeting for the Vlan tag discussions (TR/FDDI on Ethernet BB)

Closing 802.5 Plenary

Thursday July 10th

The meeting opened with Bob Love announcing a date and time for the interim meeting, August 27th 1997 at the Ritz Carlton, Boston, USA.

The meeting minutes for the March Plenary (meeting CC) were voted on (Vote DD09) and approved, Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0.

We voted to forward 802.5REV to REVCOM (Vote DD04) Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0

We voted to forward 802.5j to REVCOM (Vote DD05) Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0

We voted that 802.5r be recirculated for LMSC approval following a minor technical change required to resolve a negative ballot received during initial LMSC balloting. (Vote DD06) Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0
(Only the pages involved in the change will be mailed out)

We voted to conditionally forward 802.5r to REVCOM based on the re-circulation passing. (Vote DD07)
Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0

We voted on holding an interim meeting on August 27th (Vote DD08) Yes 5 No 0 Abstain 0
We also discussed Tolly announcing our public meeting being held the day after his meeting in his meeting invitation and the topic of the meeting be announced as High Speed Token Ring.

We had open discussion on the outcome of the 802.1 Plenary meeting. Bob Love believed all Back Bone implementations must follow 802.1q and support the encapsulated Token Ring format but Ethernet end stations have no requirement to understand the RIF. All involved in the discussion wanted to find a win-win middle ground preserving the Token Ring RIF in the Backbone but not requiring Ethernet end stations to process the information. Bob Ross stated that 802.3 needs to make the statement that end stations do not need to pass the RIF but any 802.3 devices acting as a bridge must pass the RIF or pass on the full encapsulated Token Ring frame. **Liaison assignments for all of the other groups will be made at the start of the November Plenary meeting, Bob Ross would like to continue as a liaison for 802.1.**

We voted on the new standards format survey, the group agreed on CD Rom and limited (120 day) FTP availability 6 yes 0 no. On the new books issue 4 voted yes and 1 voted no and all supported mailing the books.

Bob discussed membership in the IEEE SA (Standards Association) group and how 802 members may sign up for this.

We voted on our preference for the meeting site selection for November 1999 Plenary.

This concluded the 802.5 closing plenary. 802.5 will next meet again during a August 27th 97 Interim meeting to be held in Boston at the Ritz Carlton. This meeting is the day after the Tolly Token Ring meeting being held at the same location.

Meeting Document List

Note: Documents marked with *r1*, *r2*, *etc.* indicate that they were updated during the meeting, and re-issued to the committee. The number indicates the revision.

#	Title	Author	Status
00r1	Document List: 802.5 July 97 Plenary	RD Love	Available
01r2	802.5 Agenda for July 97 Plenary	M Hanrahan	Available
02	Plenary Meeting Report, Meeting: CC	RD Love	Available
03	Business Cards	M Hanrahan	Available
04	Resolution of Comments on 802.5j	RD Love	Available
05	Resolution of Comments on 802.5-REV	RD Love	Available
06	Resolution of Comments on 802.5r	RD Love	Available
07	Token Ring Futures Fire up Roundtable +	P Gessert	Available
08	Voters July 1997 Maui Meeting	RD Love	Available
09	Bay Network's View of Tolly TR Summit	P Gessert	Available
10	Proposed Editorial Changes to 802.5r	M Hanrahan	Available
11	802.3 VLAN Tagging Proposal	J Messenger	Available
12	Source Routing Encapsulation (from meeting CC)	G Duane	Available
13	IBM's view Tolly HSTR Roundtable Summary	D Olechovsky	Available

Meeting Action Items

Number	Owner	Description	Status
1	Mick H	Creare an errata database for the 802.5 standards	
2	Bob L	Text of motion 6 to be put on 802.5 WEB site	
3	Bob L	Liaison assignments for all of the other groups	

802.5 WORKING GROUP PRELIMINARY AGENDA 7th July 1997 - 11th July 1997

7th July MONDAY

1:00pm 3:15pm 802 Opening Plenary

3:30pm	5:00pm	802.5 Opening Plenary including Status and Updates on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 802.5s Ballots - 802.5j Ballots - 802.5r Ballots - SC6 Report - MII Study Group New Business
--------	--------	--

8th July TUESDAY

8:30am	11:30am	WakeOnLan standardisation discussion Review new comments on current drafts VLAN Tagging Discussion
11:30am	1:30pm	Lunch
1:30pm	5:00pm	Tolley Group Update Future Work Items - Discussion Presentations invited

9th July WEDNESDAY

8:30am	10:30am	802.1 Open Plenary VLAN TAGGING
10:30am	Noon	802.1 Open Plenary FUNCTIONAL REQUIREMENTS
Noon	1:30pm	Lunch
1:30am	5:00pm	Proposal for merging current drafts

10th July THURSDAY

8:30am	10:00am	Completion of DTR Draft Status
10:00am	Noon	802.5 Closing Plenary New Business and Wrap-up
7:00pm		Midnight 802 Executive Meeting

11th July FRIDAY

8:00am	10:00am	Closing 802 Plenary
--------	---------	---------------------