Response to Paper 802.5/98/03-02r1

Ivar Jeppesen's High Media Rate Trade-Up Proposal

I have the following major points on this proposal.

1. The concept proposed needs to be first considered as to whether it is required.

    a. If the committee feels it *is not* required, exit.

    b. If the committee feels it *is* required, then continue.

2. The concept presented is technically sound, but requires the C-Port *and* Station to return to the Bypass state.

    This is **unacceptable** since returning to the Bypass state causes the standard to loose all knowledge of what just happen. This is the equivalent to *closing* the C-Port and Station in terms of existing implementations requiring the C-Port and Station to be opened at a different speed. However, no interface exists to allow this type of operation.

3. I have the following counter-proposal.

    a. Change the C-Port operation to recognize 100 Mbit/s is supported and remain in the Registration state (JS=PREG) [Ivar's proposal causes entry into the Bypass state.]

    b. Change the Station Operation Table so a **new state** allows Trade-up *without* exiting to the Bypass state. This is analogous to the TXI Trade-up protocol in 802.5r.

        This allows a *state* to be defined to accomplish the following.

        i)   Start the 100 Mbit/s link.

        ii) Time the starting of the 100 Mbit/s link and:

             a)   recognize its success (continue with registration) *or*

             b)   failure (exit to the Bypass state).

        The above deletes one transition in Ivar's proposal and introduces one new state with two new transitions.