To: 802exec@hepnrc.hep.net@internet
cc: stds-802-5@mail.ieee.org@internet
From: Robert Love/Raleigh/IBM @ IBMUS
Subject: Revised PAR for 802.5 Revision, and Proposed 5 Criteria

In an attempt to satisfy the concerns raised by Geoff and Pat, I have pass 2 of the PAR for the 802.5 Revision with Scope and Purpose modified from Pass 1, along with the 5 criteria.

This new version, along with the 5 criteria will be posted on the IEEE 802.5 web site.

----------PAR - Pass 2

IEEE Standards Board

Project Authorization Request (PAR) Form

1. Sponsor Date of Request	2. Assigned Project Number	3. PAR Approval Date
[1998 Nov 12]	[P802.5y]	_____
		[...] PAR Signature Page received {IEEE Staff to check box}

4. Project Title, Recorder and Working Group/Sponsor for this Project

Document type and title: {Place an X in only one option below}

[X] **Standard for**{document stressing the verb "shall"}

[..] **Recommended Practice for**{document stressing the verb "should"}

[..] **Guide for** {document stressing the verb "may"}

Title: [Information technology Telecommunications and information exchange between systems – Local and metropolitan area networks – Part 5:

Token ring access method and physical layer specifications]

{Copyright release must be submitted with appropriate signatures by postal mail or FAX (1-732-562-1571)}

Name of Working Group:	[IEEE 802.5 Token Ring Working Group]
Name of Official Reporter (usually the W.G. Chair)	[Robert D. Love]

Title in WG:	[Chair, IEEE 802.5 Working Group]	IEEE/Affiliate Member #	[1609353]
Company:	[IBM]	Telephone:	[919 543-2746]
Address:	[PO Box 12195 DGTA/664]	FAX:	[919 254-5410]
City/State/Zip:	[Research Triangle Park/NC/27709]	Email:	[rdlove@us.ibm.com]

Name of Working Group Chair (if different): [...]

		IEEE/Affiliate Member #	[...]
Company:	[...]	Telephone:	[...]
Address:	[...]	FAX:	[...]
City/State/Zip:	[...]	Email:	[...]

Name of Sponsoring Society and Committee:	[IEEE Computer Society / LAN MAN Standards Committee]
Name of Committee Sponsor Chair:	[James Carlo]

		IEEE/Affiliate Member #	[05572953]
Company:	[Texas Instruments Inc.]	Telephone:	[972-480-2524]
Address:	[9208 Heatherdale Drive]	FAX:	[972-480-2611]
City/State/Zip:	[Dallas/TX/75243]	Email:	[jcarlo@ti.com]

5. Describe This Project; *Answer each of four questions below:*

a. Update an existing PAR [NO]

If YES, indicate PAR Number/Approval Date [P####-YEAR]

If YES, attache a cover letter indicating changes/rationale for changes.

If YES, is this project in ballot now? [yes/no]

b. Choose one from the following:

[NO] New Standard

[YES] Revision of existing Standard {number and year} [802.5:1998]

[NO] Supplement to an existing standard {number and year) []

c. Choose one from the following:

[X] Full Use (5-year life cycle)

[...] Trial Use (2-year life cycle)

d. Fill in Target Completion Date to IEEE RevCom : [03/00]

6. Scope of Proposed Project:

[

To create a single ISO/IEC Token Ring standard, by performing a technical merge and clarification of ISO/IEC 8802-5:1998 and its amendments. The scope does not include the development of new technical capabilities, but does provide for clarification and correction of existing functions and features. It will not include 802.5c.

]

7. Purpose of Proposed Project:

[

To provide a single cohesive document describing the various capabilities and options for Token Ring as defined within the family of IEEE 802.5 Standards. Various sections of the standard were written at different times, based on slightly different models. Therefore, the revision is required to rewrite the standard bringing all sections together under the same global view.

]

8. Intellectual Property {Answer each of the questions below}

a. Are you aware of any patents relevant to this project?

[YES] {Yes, with detailed explanation below / No}

[Patents which apply to the present set of standard still apply. Patent letters covering these patents are on file with IEEE.] {Explanation}

b. Are you aware of any copyrights relevant to this project?

[NO] {Yes, with detailed explanation below / No}

[...] {Explanation}

c. Are you aware of any trademarks relevant to this project?

[NO] {Yes, with detailed explanation below / No}

[...] {Explanation}

9. Are you aware of any other standards or projects with a similar scope?

[NO] {Yes, with detailed explanation below / No}

[...] {Explanation}

10. International Harmonization

Is this standard planned for adoption by another international organization?

[YES] {Yes/No/?? if you don't know at this time}

If Yes: Which International Organization [ISO/IEC JTC/1]

If Yes: Include coordination in question 13 below

If No: Explanation [...]

11. Is this project intended to focus on health, safety or environmental issues?

[NO] {Yes/No/?? if you don't know at this time}

If Yes: Explanation [...]

12. Proposed Coordination/Recommended Method of Coordination

a. Mandatory Coordination

SCC 10 (IEEE Dictionary)	by **DR**	{Circulation of **DR**afts}
IEEE Staff Editorial Review by	by **DR**	
SCC 14 (Quantities, Units and Letter symbols)	by **DR**	

b. Coordination requested by Sponsor:

[US TAG for JTC1/SC6 WG 1 & 3]	by [DR]	{circulation of **DR**afts/**LI**aison memb/**CO**mmon memb}

	by [DR]	{circulation of **DR**afts/**LI**aison memb/**CO**mmon memb}
	by [DR]	{circulation of **DR**afts/**LI**aison memb/**CO**mmon memb}
[.....]	by [...]	{circulation of **DR**afts/**LI**aison memb/**CO**mmon memb}

c. Coordination Requested by Others:

[...] {added by staff}

Additional Explanation Notes: {Item Number and Explanation}

[...]{If necessary, these can be continued on additional pages}

The PAR Copyright Release and Signature Page must be submitted by FAX or physical delivery before this PAR will be sent on for NesCom and Standards Board approval.

----------End of PAR - Pass 2

802.5 vote to adopt above PAR: 10/0/0 (Pass)

----------5 Criteria

5 CRITERIA:

1. Broad Market Potential
- Broad set(s) of applications
- Multiple vendors, multiple users
- Balance cost, LAN vs. attached stations

Token Ring is a highly successful LAN protocol ~~on~~ in the market today with ~~Over~~ over 20 million nodes deployed and sales in the 4 - 5 million node per year range. Token Ring hardware is offered by many large data communications companies within this industry. These large volumes, and the well known industry offering for Token Ring hardware adequately demonstrate ~~mulitple~~ multiple vendors and users. High customer acceptance of Token Ring is adequate demonstration of balanced costs.

Approved by 802.5 vote: 10/0/0 (Pass)

2.IEEE Project 802 defines a family of standards. All standards shall be in conformance with 802.1 Architecture, Management and Interworking. All LLC and MAC standards shall be compatible with ISO/IEC 10039, MAC Service Definition at the LLC/MAC interface. Within the LLC Working Group there shall be one LLC standard, including one or more LLC protocols, with a common LLC/MAC interface. Within a MAC Working Group there shall be one MAC standard and one or more Physical Layer standards with a common MAC / Physical Layer interface.

Each standard in the IEEE Project 802 family of standards shall include

a definition of managed objects which are compatible with OSI systems management standards.

The standards already meet this criterion. No new functional capability is being created under this PAR. Therefore, the criterion will continue to be met.

Approved by 802.5 vote: 10/0/0 (Pass)

3. Distinct Identity
- Substantially different from other ~~802.5~~802 specs / solutions
- Unique solution for problem (not two alternatives / problem)
- ~~Specifically addresses the needs of 802.5, as opposed to 802.3~~
- Easy for document reader to select relevant spec

Token Ring has a well-known and distinct identity from other LANs.

Distinct capabilities are described in the PICS, and in separate Clauses, making it easy for the reader to select relevant specifications.

Approved by 802.5 vote: 10/0/0 (Pass)

4. Technical Feasibility
- Demonstrated feasibility; reports - working models
- Proven technology, reasonable testing
- Confidence in reliability

The hardware exists, and is on the market. The revision will describe what is already there. Therefore, the product to be described is definitely feasible.

802.5 implementations have been extensively tested and shown to be reliable.

Approved by 802.5 vote: 10/0/0 (Pass)

5. Economic Feasibility
- Cost factors known, reliable data
- Reasonable cost for performance expected
- Total installation costs considered

The strong market acceptance of Token Ring adequately demonstrates economic feasibility.

Approved by 802.5 vote: 10/0/0 (Pass)

----------End of 5 Criteria

Motion 11-10: That 802.5/98/11-11, containing the PAR and 5 criteria for 802.5rev be adopted and submitted to the SEC for their approval. Vote: 11/0/0 (Pass).

Best regards.

Robert D. Love
Chair IEEE 802.5 Token Ring Working Group
IBM
800 Park Offices
P. O. Box 12195 DGTA/664
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709, USA
Phone: +1 919 543-2746
Fax: +1 919 254-5483
E-Mail: rdlove@us.ibm.com