



**IEEE Standards Association Standards Board
Report of Actions on IEEE 802.20
Issued: 19 September 2006**

On 15 September 2006, the IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Standards Board (SASB) adopted a plan to enable the IEEE 802.20 Working Group to move forward with its work, and provide the best opportunity for completion and approval of the standard. Since at least mid-2005, the IEEE-SA has been investigating the status and operations of the IEEE 802.20 Working Group. We analyzed minutes, voting patterns, and other documentation of the Working Group, spoke with a number of participants in the Working Group, and senior representatives of the IEEE-SA observed the meetings. Several consistent themes emerged: the working group had become highly contentious (significantly beyond what is normally experienced in the IEEE-SA); appeared to lack transparency; and showed evidence of possible dominance and other potential irregularities. Our analysis of this preliminary investigation led us to temporarily suspend the Working Group's activities until 1 October 2006, to provide an opportunity to complete our ongoing investigation of the activities and handle the pending appeals.

During the suspension, we sought out and provided the opportunity for any IEEE 802.20 participant and a cross-section of other interested parties to provide additional input to the SASB for its consideration. This included written submissions as well as oral presentations to the entire SASB in a public meeting held on 14 September 2006.

The SASB remains committed to the adoption of an IEEE 802.20 standard. Nevertheless, after completing our investigation and hearing from interested parties, the SASB unanimously concluded that the existing IEEE 802.20 process was not effectively serving the IEEE-SA goal of high-quality standards achieved through a fair and open process. The SASB considered a variety of possible remedies proposed by the IEEE 802.20 Chair, other SASB members, and guests. To ensure fair consideration of all views, the SASB strictly followed its conflict-of-interest policy and excused from the decision-making those members whom the SASB determined might have a conflict of interest. The remaining SASB members unanimously adopted the following plan of action:

- All of the IEEE 802.20 officers will be replaced as part of the Working Group's reorganization, in an effort to provide clearly neutral leadership and to eliminate perceptions of possible bias. The SASB is establishing a Search Committee co-chaired by the IEEE 802 Chair and the SASB Chair and consisting of members of the SASB and the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC). The Search Committee will define criteria and requirements for the candidates, solicit volunteers,

evaluate candidates, and present a final proposed slate to the SASB no later than 3 November 2006, to be followed by an SASB vote on or before 12 November 2006 on the candidates forwarded by the Search Committee. The suspension of the IEEE 802.20 Working Group will continue until at least a chair is approved by the SASB.

- The SASB has charged the non-conflicted members of the IEEE 802 EC to work with the new officers, once appointed, to identify and address any efforts to dominate the IEEE 802.20 Working Group, whether by affirmatively seeking to achieve a standard through domination or by deliberately blocking the development of a standard, and to submit a plan for approval to the SASB at its December 2006 meeting to ensure that dominance does not occur. Using current methods as prescribed in their procedures (including treating the votes of a dominating organization as one vote) or other remedies that may be relevant, the IEEE 802 EC shall implement a plan of action and report to the SASB within 30 days of the end of each interim and plenary IEEE 802.20 session on its continuing efforts in this area.
- The plan has also clarified and tightened requirements for IEEE 802.20 participants to declare their affiliations at all meetings. For a complete definition of such a declaration, please refer to Appendix A of this report.
- Any IEEE 802.20 Working Group ballot bodies, sponsor ballot bodies, and/or ballot resolution committees have been dissolved and will be reconstituted under the new Working Group leadership. The IEEE 802 EC Chair will determine when any balloting may begin.

An SASB Oversight Committee has been established to advise the IEEE 802 EC and assist them in implementing corrective actions. The members of this committee will be announced once identified.

The plan preserves the right of the Working Group to move forward with the existing work product or to consider alternative technology.

The SASB has strived to provide a pathway for the Working Group to complete its work and produce an IEEE 802.20 standard that meets the fundamental requirements of IEEE's consensus process.

Appendix A

An individual's status as affiliated with an organization shall be based on self-disclosure of affiliation and ultimate parent entity in compliance with the following and on other information that may be available to the SASB and the Sponsor.

An individual is deemed "affiliated" with any individual or entity that has been or will be financially or materially supporting that individual's participation in a particular IEEE

standards activity. This includes but is not limited to his or her employer and any individual or entity that has or will either directly or indirectly requested, paid for, or otherwise sponsored his or her participation.

Each participant's affiliation shall be disclosed at any working group or project meeting. The chair or the chair's delegate shall inform the meeting of the requirement for disclosure of affiliation. This shall be via a sign-in (e.g., sign-in sheet, electronic sign-in, verbal disclosure, or electronic communication) that provides for disclosure of employer and any other affiliation, a reminder of the definition of affiliation, and possible penalties for non-compliance.

Each individual shall also declare the "ultimate parent entity" of their affiliation. The ultimate parent entity is an entity that directly or indirectly, through one or more intermediaries, controls the entity identified as the individual's affiliation. For the purposes of this definition, the term "control" and its derivatives, with respect to for-profit entities, means the legal, beneficial or equitable ownership, directly or indirectly, of more than fifty percent (50%) of the capital stock (or other ownership interest, if not a corporation) of an entity ordinarily having voting rights. "Control" and its derivatives, with respect to non-profit entities, means the power to elect or appoint more than fifty percent (50%) of the Board of Directors of an entity.

The minutes of each working group meeting shall record a list of attendees and the disclosed affiliation of each attendee.

A meeting attendee who fails to disclose affiliation shall not accrue any membership rights, including rights of or towards voting membership, until such disclosures have been made. Failure to disclose affiliation, or materially false or misleading disclosure of affiliation, shall result in loss of membership privileges and may also result in loss of other participation privileges within the IEEE-SA for such participants and any affiliated entities.