IEEE 802.21: Media Independent Services

Liaison Communication

## Source: IEEE 802.21 Working Group

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| To: | Jooran Lee | ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6 Secretariat [jooran@ksa.or.kr](mailto:jooran@ksa.or.kr) |
| CC: | Konstantinos Karachalios | Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board Secretary, IEEE-SA Board of Governors [sasecretary@ieee.org](mailto:sasecretary@ieee.org) |
|  | Paul Nikolich | Chair, IEEE 802 LMSC  [p.nikolich@ieee.org](mailto:p.nikolich@ieee.org) |
|  | Andrew Myles | Chair, IEEE 802 JTC1 Standing Committee [amyles@cisco.com](mailto:amyles@cisco.com) |
|  | Jodi Haasz | Stakeholder Engagement Liaison, IEEE-SA [j.haasz@ieee.org](mailto:j.haasz@ieee.org) |
| From: | Subir Das | Chair, IEEE 802.21: Media Independent Services  [sdas@vencorelabs.com](mailto:sdas@vencorelabs.com) |

Subject: Liaison reply to China NB comments on the IEEE Std 802.21-2017 and IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017 60-day ballots

Approval: Agreed to at the IEEE 802.21 Plenary meeting, Berlin, Germany, July 12, 2017

Dear ISO/IEC JTC1 SC 6 Secretariat,

IEEE 802.21 would like to thank the China NB for their review and comment on the submission of IEEE Std 802.21-2017 and IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017 as part of the PSDO process. Please find below each comment and the response from the IEEE 802.21 Media Independent Services Working Group.

**China NB Comment CN1 on IEEE Std 802.21-2017:**

*IEEE 802.21-2017 is implemented with IEEE 802.1X-2010 which have also been proposed to ISO under the PSDO agreement. China NB has expressed objection to the submissions and provided detailed comments. IEEE has acknowledged the receiving of China NB’s comments but has not made any satisfactory attempts to change Chinese negative vote. Since Chinese objection to the base/associated standards still stands, we cannot support other standards that rely on previous standards on security. For previous China NB comment, please refer to 6N15555.China NB proposed change 1*

1 This document solely represents the views of the IEEE 802.21 Working Group, and does not necessarily represent a position of the IEEE, the IEEE Standards Association.

**China NB proposed change 1 on CN1**

*Recommend not referencing the defective standards or enhancing its security mechanism.*

# Response from the IEEE 802.21: Media Independent Services Working Group on CN1

## The China NB voted “no” on IEEE Std 802.21-2017 progressing to FDIS ballot due to the reference of IEEE Std 802.1X-2010 in IEEE Std 802.21-2017. The China NB has long standing concerns related to IEEE Std 802.1X-2010. IEEE 802 has responded to these concerns several times including a recent response to the China NB on IEEE 802.1Q-2014/Cor 1-2015, IEEE 802.1AB-2016, IEEE 802.1Qca-2015, IEEE 802.1Qbv-2015, and IEEE 802.1AC-2016.

## Unfortunately, the China NB has not substantiated its concerns about IEEE Std 802.1X-2010, despite numerous requests from IEEE 802 over many years. IEEE 802.21 Working Group cannot make changes to IEEE Std 802.21-2017 without substantiation of any issues that are directly related to the implementation of IEEE Std 802.21-2017

## IEEE 802.21 Working Group invites the China NB to submit for consideration any additional technical details, beyond the issues that have already been resolved, that support their concerns.

**China NB Comment CN1 on IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017**

*IEEE 802.21-2017 is the base standards of IEEE 802.21.1-2017, since Chinese objection to the base standards, we cannot support other standards that rely on IEEE 802.21-2017.*

# China NB Proposed change on CN1:

*Recommend not referencing the defective standards or enhancing its security mechanism.*

# Response from the IEEE 802.21: Media Independent Services Working Group on CN1

The China NB voted “no” on IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017 progressing to FDIS ballot due to the reference of IEEE Std 802.1X-2010 in the base IEEE 802.21-2017 standards. The China NB has long standing concerns related to IEEE Std 802.1X-2010. IEEE 802 has responded to these concerns several times including a recent response to the China NB on IEEE 802.1Q-2014/Cor 1-2015, IEEE 802.1AB-2016, IEEE 802.1Qca-2015, IEEE 802.1Qbv-2015, and IEEE 802.1AC-2016.

Unfortunately, the China NB has not substantiated its concerns about IEEE Std 802.1X-2010, despite numerous requests from IEEE 802 over many years. IEEE 802.21 Working Group cannot make changes to IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017 without substantiation of any issues that are directly related to the implementation of IEEE Std 802.21.1-2017.

IEEE 802.21 Working Group invites the China NB to submit for consideration any additional technical details, beyond the issues that have already been resolved, that support their concerns.

Sincerely,

Subir Das

Chair, IEEE 802.21: Media Independent Services Working Group