

5 Criteria for P802.1AD

1 Broad Market Potential

A standards project authorized by IEEE 802 shall have a broad market potential. Specifically, it shall have the potential for:

- a) Broad sets of applicability.
- b) Multiple vendors and numerous users.
- c) Balanced costs (LAN versus attached stations).

This project is intended to facilitate the use of existing Bridged and Virtual Bridged LAN technologies in service ~~provision-provider~~ environments. Despite user demand and initial deployment of LAN-based services ~~s-provision~~, there is currently ~~no-neither~~ interoperability between different vendors, nor a coherent management framework for different techniques.

In the absence of an IEEE P802.1 standard, other standards bodies are defining similar services, using other technologies, which may be incompatible with services based on bridged LANs. For example, the IETF is currently engaged in a layer 2 VPN standard development; it is our intention that this 802 project will ~~make-use-of~~interoperate with the results of that work, and will assist the IETF in developing a L2VPN interface that is compatible with LAN Bridging techniques.

The costs related to this technology should be broadly similar to those of existing Bridging technology based on 802.1D/802.1w/802.1Q/802.1s.

2 Compatibility

IEEE 802 defines a family of standards. All standards shall be in conformance with the IEEE 802.1 Architecture, Management and Interworking documents as follows: 802. Overview and Architecture, 802.1D, 802.1Q and parts of 802.1f. If any variances in conformance emerge, they shall be thoroughly disclosed and reviewed with 802.

Each standard in the IEEE 802 family of standards shall include a definition of managed objects which are compatible with systems management standards.

This project will be compatible with existing 802.1 Architecture, Management and Interworking standards.

[This standard will require a minor change to the maximum frame size for 802.3 frames. We will request that 802.3 assist us in achieving this change.](#)

3 Distinct Identity

Each IEEE 802 standard shall have a distinct identity. To achieve this, each authorized project shall be:

- a) Substantially different from other IEEE 802 standards.
- b) One unique solution per problem (not two solutions to a problem).
- c) Easy for the document reader to select the relevant specification.

There is no other IEEE standard or project that has the same scope & purpose.

There is no existing solution available within our current standards or projects. It will be easy for the document reader to select the relevant specification.

4 Technical Feasibility

For a project to be authorized, it shall be able to show its technical feasibility. At a minimum, the proposed project shall show:

- a) Demonstrated system feasibility.
- b) Proven technology, reasonable testing.
- c) Confidence in reliability.

The proposed standard will extend existing, proven, standardized, Bridged LAN technology. There are existing examples in the marketplace of proprietary solutions based on this approach.

5 Economic Feasibility

For a project to be authorized, it shall be able to show economic feasibility (so far as can reasonably be estimated), for its intended applications. At a minimum, the proposed project shall show:

- a) Known cost factors, reliable data.
- b) Reasonable cost for performance.
- c) Consideration of installation costs.

Cost factors are well understood from existing proprietary implementations.

Trivial cost for significant feature improvement.

Installation costs not affected relative to existing bridging technology.

~~The technology that will be developed in proposed standard will not differ significantly from the economic factors associated with existing Bridged LAN and Virtual Bridged LAN technologies.~~