

1  
2  
3  
4 ***Proposed DISPOSITION OF BALLOT COMMENTS***  
5 ***ON IEEE Draft P802.1AB/D12***  
6

7  
8  
9 ***DRAFT IEEE Standard for Local and***  
10 ***Metropolitan Area Networks: Station***  
11 ***and Media Access Control***  
12 ***Connectivity Discovery***  
13  
14  
15  
16

17  
18 Sponsor  
19 **LAN MAN Standards Committee of the IEEE Computer Society**  
20

21 Prepared by: **Bill Lane, Project Editor**  
22

23 8320 Woodman Ln., Newcastle, CA 95658; e-mail bill\_lane@ieee.org  
24

25 *Commentary:*

26 This Proposed Disposition of Ballot Comments documents the ballot comments received during the sponsor  
27 confirmation ballot on P802.1AB/D12 and records the resolutions of those ballot comments that will be dis-  
28 cussed and agreed upon at the 802 plenary meeting to be held in San Antonio, Texas, during the week of  
29 November 14 through 19, 2004. The document contains:

- 30
- 31 1) A table of responses received during the initial sponsor ballot on P802.1AB/D10 as well as bal-  
32 lot comments reconfirmed or changed during the two reconfirmation ballots.
  - 33 2) Listings of voter comments received during P802.1AB/D12 reconfirmation balloting. Each  
34 comment is accompanied by a disposition.

35 When approved, this document will constitute a record of the Instructions to the Editor for the preparation of  
36 P802.1AB/D13.  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

# 1. Table of Responses

The following table indicates the status of each ballot response received in the P802.1AB/D10 confirmation ballot. The Status column indicates the voting status of the responder. *V(oting)* indicates an eligible voting member of the ballot pool at the start of the ballot period. *C(oordination)* indicates a coordination response. The *Vote* column indicates the vote cast; Y = Approve, N = Disapprove, A = Abstain, C = Comment only.

Table 1 lists the eligible voters and coordinators in the ballot pool. Votes received during the draft 12 confirmation ballot are shown with a right arrow. The comment column indicates whether or not comments were received from the associated voter during draft 12 balloting.

**Table 1—Table of responses**

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V	Y	Butch Anton	
V		Hugh Barrass	
C		Bruce Barrow	
V		Clint Chaplin	
V	Y ==> Y	Keith Chow	
C	C	Michelle Turner, IEEE Editorial Coordinator	
C		D. C. Mohla, IEEE SCC10 Coordinator	
V	Y	Dr. Guru Dutt Dhingra	
V	Y	Wael Diab	
V	Y	Thomas Dineen	
V	Y	Dr. Sourav Dutta	
V	Y	Clint Early, Jr.	
V	Y	Will Foulds	
V	Y	Samuel Fryer	
V	Y	Yukihiro Fujimoto	
V		Devon Gayle	
V	Y	Mike Geipel	
V	Y	Patrick Gonia	
V		Robert Grow	

**Table 1—Table of responses**

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V		Stuart Holoman	
V	Y	Atsushi Ito	
V	Y	Peeya Iwagoshi	
V	Y	Raj Jain	
V	N ==> N	David James	Y
V	Y	Neil Jarvis	
V	Y	Tony Jeffree	
V	Y	Peter Jones	
V		Junghong Kao	
V	Y	Piotr Karocki	
V		Stuart Kerry	
V		Patrick Kinney	
V		John Lemon	
V	Y	Randolph Little	
V	Y	Nikolai Malykh	
V	Y	Jonathon McLendon	
V	Y	David Mitton	
V		Denish Mohan	
V	Y	Mike Moreton	
V	Y ==> Y	Narayanan Murugesan	N
V	Y	Jeremy Newberry	
V	Y == Y	Nick S. A. Nikjoo	N
V	Y	Donald O'Connor	
V	Y ==> Y	Bob O'Hara	N
V	Y	Satoshi Obara	
V	Y	Chris Osterloh	

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

**Table 1—Table of responses**

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V	Y	Stephen Palm	
V		Glenn Parsons	
V	Y ==> Y	Vikram Punj	N
V	Y	Maximilian Riegel	
V	A	John Roese	
V	Y	Floyd Ross	
V	Y	Marco Scorrano	
V	A	Vaughn Sheline	
V	Y	Gil Shultz	
C	Y	John C. Scott, IEEE SCC14 Coordinator	
V	Y	Matt Squire	
V	Y	Adrian Stephens	
V	Y	Joseph Tardo	
V	Y	Mark-Rene Uchida	
V	A	Scott Valcourt	
V	Y	Karl Weber	
V	Y	Derek Woo	
V	Y	Oren Yuen	

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

**Table 2—Results**

CATEGORY	TOTAL	PERCENTAGE
Yes	45	
No	1	
Abstain	2	
Coordination	2	
No. of Voters	59	
Voters responding	46	

## 2. Ballot Comments

The comments and their dispositions are separated into two categories:

a) Comments from one voter who voted no on draft 11. These include:

- 1) 78 T
- 2) 59 E

b) New comments from voters who voted yes draft 11. These include:

- 1) 8 T
- 2) 4 E

### 2.1 Ballot comments from the voter who voted “No” on draft 12

#### **Comment 1      David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 3

PAGE: 5

LINE: 3

COMMENT START:

I like to define shall, should, and may, since these are normative and not uniformly/consistently defined by IEEE.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Include definitions from associated FrameMaker text. These were used in 802.17 and have been carefully reviewed by IEEE Editors. Terms, definitions, and notation

3. Terms, definitions, and notation

#### **3.1 Conformance levels**

Several key words are used to differentiate between different levels of requirements and options, as described in this subclause.

**3.1.1 may:** Indicates a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard with no implied preference (“may” means “is permitted to”).

**3.1.2 shall:** Indicates mandatory requirements to be strictly followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (“shall” means “is required to”).

1 **3.1.3 should:** An indication that among several possibilities, one is recommended as particularly suitable,  
2 without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily  
3 required; or that (in the negative form) a certain course of action is deprecated but not prohibited (“should”  
4 means “is recommended to”).

5 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
6

7 ***Disposition of Comment 1***  
8

9 Discuss  
10

11 <<Editor’s note: The IEEE style guide also includes the following definition for the use of  
12 *can*. I recommend *can* also be considered:  
13

14 “The word *can* is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physi-  
15 cal, or casual (*can* equals *is able to*).” >>  
16

17 ***Comment 2* David V James**  
18

19 COMMENT TYPE: E  
20

21 CLAUSE: 5.1  
22

23 PAGE: 8  
24

25 LINE: 35  
26

27 COMMENT START:  
28

29 Break leaves isolated number on next line.  
30

31 COMMENT END:  
32

33 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
34

35 Use nonbreaking space within:  
36

37 Clause 11  
38

39 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
40

41 ***Disposition of Comment 2***  
42

43 Accept -- place cursor in the word and select Esc/n s  
44

45 ***Comment 3* David V James**  
46

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 7.2

1 PAGE: 11  
2  
3 LINE: 59 (should be 49)  
4 COMMENT START:  
5 A line break within key word is confusing.  
6 COMMENT END:  
7  
8 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
9 Use a nonbreaking space  
10  
11 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

12 ***Disposition of Comment 3***

13  
14  
15 accept - see comment 2  
16

17 ***Comment 4***      **David V James**

18  
19  
20 COMMENT TYPE: E  
21 CLAUSE: 8.1  
22  
23 PAGE: 15  
24 LINE: 55 (should be 45)  
25 COMMENT START:  
26 I think there is an unnecessary space before the em dash.  
27 COMMENT END:  
28  
29 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
30 eliminate the space  
31  
32 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

33  
34 ***Disposition of Comment 4***

35  
36 accept  
37

38 ***Comment 5***      **David V James**

39  
40  
41 COMMENT TYPE: T  
42 CLAUSE: 8.1  
43  
44 PAGE: 15  
45 LINE: 50  
46 COMMENT START:

1 If "MAC Bridges" has a special meaning, then this meaning should be included in the  
2 glossary.

3 COMMENT END:

4 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

5  
6 Either:

7 1) Add glossary term: MAC Bridges: (whatever)...

8 2) Make this lower case, here and throughout

9  
10 If the definition of MAC Bridges happens to be Bridges that conform to IEEE Std 802.1D  
11 then, that aside can be deleted here.

12 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

13  
14  
15 ***Disposition of Comment 5***

16  
17  
18 Withdrawn

19  
20 ***Comment 6***      **David V James**

21  
22  
23 COMMENT TYPE: E

24 CLAUSE: 8

25 PAGE: 15

26 LINE: 35

27 COMMENT START:

28  
29 The meaning of header is standard, not special.

30 COMMENT END:

31 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

32  
33 Header ==> header

34  
35  
36 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

37  
38 ***Disposition of Comment 6***

39  
40 this comment is related to comment \_\_\_\_\_

41  
42  
43 ***Comment 7***      **David V James**

44  
45  
46 COMMENT TYPE: T

1 CLAUSE: 8.3  
2  
3 PAGE: 16  
4 LINE: 39 (should be 33)  
5 COMMENT START:  
6 Leave out the subscript here, when hex numbers have digits  
7  
8 COMMENT END:  
9 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
10 Drop hex here, insert text in glossary, as was done in RPR.  
11

12  
13 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
14

15 ***Disposition of Comment 7***  
16

17 This comment is related to comment 44  
18  
19

20  
21 ***Comment 8***      **David V James**  
22

23 COMMENT TYPE: E  
24  
25 CLAUSE: 9.2  
26 PAGE: 17  
27 LINE: 50 (should be 42)  
28 COMMENT START:  
29 Two periods at the end of the sentence  
30  
31 COMMENT END:

32 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
33  
34 Use only one  
35

36 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
37

38  
39 ***Disposition of Comment 8***  
40

41 Accept  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

1       **Comment 9       David V James**

2  
3  
4       COMMENT TYPE: E

5       CLAUSE: 9.2

6       PAGE: 17

7  
8       LINE: 37 (figure 9-1)

9       COMMENT START:

10       I believe your convention was TLV names are caps, fields are not.

11       COMMENT END:

12       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

13  
14       In that case, this should be: Time to live TLV ==> Time To Live TLV

15       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

16  
17  
18       ***Disposition of Comment 9***

19  
20       Accept

21  
22       **Comment 10       David V James**

23  
24  
25       COMMENT TYPE: E

26       CLAUSE: 9.4.1

27       PAGE: 19

28       LINE: 35

29       COMMENT START:

30  
31       Should be an en dash, not an em dash

32       COMMENT END:

33       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

34       Change to an en dash

35       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

36  
37  
38  
39       ***Disposition of Comment 10***

40  
41       accept

42  
43       **Comment 11       David V James**

44  
45  
46       COMMENT TYPE:

1 CLAUSE: 9.4.1

2  
3 PAGE: 19

4 LINE: 27

5 COMMENT START:

6 Fill empty cells with something, preferably an em dash, so it doesn't look like a typo.

7 COMMENT END:

8  
9 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

10 Insert an em dash

11 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

12  
13  
14 ***Disposition of Comment 11***

15  
16 Accept -- do global search and insert in all blank cells

17  
18 ***Comment 12 David V James***

19  
20  
21 COMMENT TYPE: E

22 CLAUSE: 9.4.1

23 PAGE: 19

24 LINE: 27

25 COMMENT START:

26  
27 should be an en dash, not an em dash

28 COMMENT END:

29  
30 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

31 em dash ==> en dash

32 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

33  
34  
35 ***Disposition of Comment 12***

36  
37 accept

38  
39 ***Comment 13 David V James***

40  
41  
42 COMMENT TYPE: E

43 CLAUSE: 9.5.2.2

44 PAGE: 21

45  
46 LINE: 15

1 COMMENT START:

2 Fill in balnk cells with something (I prefer an em dash)

3 COMMENT END:

4 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

5 Insert an em dash

6 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

7  
8  
9  
10 ***Disposition of Comment 13***

11  
12 Accept - see comment 11

13  
14 ***Comment 14 David V James***

15  
16  
17 COMMENT TYPE: E

18 CLAUSE: 9.5.2.2

19 PAGE: 21

20 LINE: 14

21 COMMENT START:

22  
23 Center the left column better; his looks like manual spacing. Applying a paragraph center  
24 works better.

25 COMMENT END:

26 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

27 Use centered paragraphs

28 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

29  
30  
31  
32 ***Disposition of Comment 14***

33  
34 Accept - do global search and center

35  
36 ***Comment 15 David V James***

37  
38  
39 COMMENT TYPE: E

40 CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

41 PAGE: 26

42 LINE: 36

43 COMMENT START:

44  
45  
46 Fill in the blank cell with an em dash, or something that doesn't look like a typo.

1 COMMENT END:

2  
3 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

4 Insert an em dash, here and all blank table cells

5 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

6  
7 ***Disposition of Comment 15***

8  
9  
10 Accept- see comment 11

11  
12 ***Comment 16***     **David V James**

13  
14 COMMENT TYPE: E

15  
16 CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

17  
18 PAGE: 26

19  
20 LINE: 36

21 COMMENT START:

22 Center the numbers in the left column; something looks not centered.

23 COMMENT END:

24 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

25 Center the paragraphs properly

26 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

27  
28 ***Disposition of Comment 16***

29  
30  
31 Accept - see comment 14

32  
33 ***Comment 17***     **David V James**

34  
35 COMMENT TYPE: E

36  
37 CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

38  
39 PAGE: 26

40 LINE: 31 (table heading)

41 COMMENT START:

42 Position doesn't seem to be a proper noun, since its not defined in the glossary.

43 COMMENT END:

44  
45 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

46

1 Bit Positon ==> Bit position

2 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

3  
4 ***Disposition of Comment 17***

5  
6  
7 Accept -- do global search for all table headings

8  
9 ***Comment 18 David V James***

10  
11 COMMENT TYPE: T

12  
13 CLAUSE: 9.6.1

14  
15 PAGE: 29

16  
17 LINE: 47

18  
19 COMMENT START:

20 Field names be spelled the same, whether in a figure or in text. What is less clear is  
21 whether you want to adopt the same convention within subclause headings, where its more  
22 consistent but looks a bit funny.

23 COMMENT END:

24 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

25 Don't capitalize field names in figures, unless that is how they are normally spelled in the  
26 middle of a sentence. Changes apply here and everywhere.

27 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

28  
29 ***Disposition of Comment 18***

30  
31 Discuss

32  
33 ***Comment 19 David V James***

34  
35  
36 COMMENT TYPE: FYI

37  
38 CLAUSE: 9.6.1

39  
40 PAGE: 29

41  
42 LINE: 47 (figure field name)

43  
44 COMMENT START:

45 This hyphen is unnecessary and (in fact) is wrong

46 COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

1 Eliminate the hyphen

2 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

3  
4 ***Disposition of Comment 19***

5  
6  
7 Accept - global search for hyphen use

8  
9 ***Comment 20 David V James***

10  
11 COMMENT TYPE: E

12 CLAUSE: 9.6

13 PAGE: 29

14 LINE: 28

15 COMMENT START:

16 A reference is missing

17 COMMENT END:

18 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

19 ==> see F.6 and ?? (fill in the ??)

20  
21 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

22  
23  
24  
25  
26 ***Disposition of Comment 20***

27  
28  
29 Accept - the missing reference is G.6

30  
31 ***Comment 21 David V James***

32  
33 COMMENT TYPE: T

34 CLAUSE: 9.6.1.4

35 PAGE: 30

36 LINE: 15

37 COMMENT START:

38 A shall requirement on maintaining listings seems hard to quantify. I suspect there is some  
39 sort of implied requirements that might need to be stated. Are there backup copies, what is  
40 the penalty for not doing so, is this public or private, etc.

41 COMMENT END:

42 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

1 change shall to should  
2

3  
4 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
5

6 ***Disposition of Comment 21***  
7

8 discuss -- consider removing the entire 2nd sentence - how an organization ensures that its  
9 TLV subtypes are unique is an implementation issue  
10

11 ***Comment 22 David V James***  
12

13  
14 COMMENT TYPE: E

15 CLAUSE: 10

16 PAGE: 32

17 LINE: 8 ( table 10-1

18 COMMENT START:  
19

20 blank cell falsely implies a typo  
21

22 COMMENT END:  
23

24 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
25

26 fill with an em dash  
27

28 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
29

30 ***Disposition of Comment 22***  
31

32 Accept - see comment 11  
33

34 ***Comment 23 David V James***  
35

36 COMMENT TYPE: E

37 CLAUSE: 10.1.1

38 PAGE: 33

39 LINE: 9

40 COMMENT START:  
41

42 The straight single quotes are different from the curly ones (different font or character).  
43

44 COMMENT END:  
45

46 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

1 Use the same character (cut and paste from above).  
2 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
3

4 ***Disposition of Comment 23***  
5

6  
7 Accept - do global search and for quote font replace with one style  
8

9 ***Comment 24***     **David V James**  
10

11 COMMENT TYPE: E

12 CLAUSE: 10.3.2

13 PAGE: 35

14 LINE: 37

15 COMMENT START:

16 Space is missing

17 COMMENT END:

18 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

19 add space

20 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
21

22 ***Disposition of Comment 24***  
23  
24

25  
26 accept - global search of cross references for similar instances  
27

28 ***Comment 25***     **David V James**  
29

30 COMMENT TYPE: E

31 CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

32 PAGE: 35

33 LINE: 58 (should be 35)

34 COMMENT START:

35 Key word hyphenated

36 COMMENT END:

37 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

38 Don't hyphenate

39 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

1       **Disposition of Comment 25**

2  
3       accept - see comment 2  
4

5       **Comment 26     David V James**

6  
7  
8       COMMENT TYPE: E

9  
10      CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

11      PAGE: 35

12      LINE: 48

13      COMMENT START:

14  
15      Key word hyphenated

16      COMMENT END:

17      SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

18  
19      Don't hyphenate

20      SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

21  
22      **Disposition of Comment 26**

23  
24      accept - see comment 2  
25

26      **Comment 27     David V James**

27  
28  
29      COMMENT TYPE: E

30  
31      CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

32      PAGE: 35

33      LINE: 47

34      COMMENT START:

35  
36      Key word hyphenated

37      COMMENT END:

38      SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

39  
40      Don't hyphenate

41      SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

42  
43      **Disposition of Comment 27**

44  
45      accept - see comment 2  
46

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

**Comment 28 David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E  
CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)  
PAGE: 35  
LINE: 41  
COMMENT START:  
Key word hyphenated  
COMMENT END:  
SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
Don't hyphenate  
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

**Disposition of Comment 28**

accept - see comment 2

**Comment 29 David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E  
CLAUSE: 10.3.2  
PAGE: 35  
LINE: 42  
COMMENT START:  
These lists are hare to follow, with follow-on sentences within.  
COMMENT END:  
SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
Use the third level number listing, with i, ii, iii, to list the actions taken with steps a1, a2, etc.  
If these don't work well in the IEEE templates (which I hear is the case), then format them with indents or other things, and send a note to the IEEE to fix these before publication.  
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

1       **Disposition of Comment 29**

2  
3       Accept - applies to a1, a2, b1, b2, c1, and c2 -- do global search and correct other similar  
4       instances  
5

6       **Comment 30     David V James**

7  
8  
9       COMMENT TYPE: E

10       CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (still is 10.3.2)

11  
12       PAGE: 36

13       LINE: 11

14       COMMENT START:

15  
16       confusing hyphenation

17       COMMENT END:

18       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

19  
20       Don't hyphenate

21       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
22

23       **Disposition of Comment 30**

24  
25  
26       accept - see comment 2  
27

28       **Comment 31     David V James**

29  
30  
31       COMMENT TYPE: E

32       CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (10.3.2)

33  
34       PAGE: 36

35       LINE: 6

36       COMMENT START:

37       confusing hyphenation

38       COMMENT END:

39  
40       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

41       Don't hyphenate

42       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
43  
44  
45  
46

1 ***Disposition of Comment 31***

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

accept - see comment 2

***Comment 32***     **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (10.3.2)

PAGE: 37

LINE: 61

COMMENT START:

confusing hyphenation

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

***Disposition of Comment 32***

accept - see comment 2

***Comment 33***     **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: FYI

CLAUSE: 11.5.1

PAGE: 51

LINE: 63

COMMENT START:

did you mean for the list to continue? These seem like different lists

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

none supplied

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

1       **Disposition of Comment 33**

2  
3       Accept in principle - convert to 2-level lists

4  
5       **Comment 34     David V James**

6  
7  
8       COMMENT TYPE: E

9       CLAUSE: 11.5.1

10       PAGE: 52

11       LINE: 8

12       COMMENT START:

13       did you mean for the list to continue?

14       COMMENT END:

15       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

16       Reset list numbering

17       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

18  
19  
20  
21       **Disposition of Comment 34**

22       Accept in principle - convert to 2-level lists as in comment 33

23  
24       **Comment 35     David V James**

25  
26  
27       COMMENT TYPE: E

28       CLAUSE: 11.5.3.2

29       PAGE: 52

30       LINE: 63

31       COMMENT START:

32       I like to do cross-references as "(see 9.5.3.3)" uniformly throughout. Otherwise, (9.5) can  
33       sometimes look like a decimal number.

34       COMMENT END:

35       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

36       Add "see" to all (x.x) references.

37       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

1 ***Disposition of Comment 35***  
2

3  
4 Accept

5  
6 ***Comment 36***     **David V James**  
7

8 COMMENT TYPE: E

9  
10 CLAUSE: 11.5.4

11 PAGE: 54

12 LINE: 4

13 COMMENT START:

14  
15 Could you swap the left two columns? That would avoid the need to interpolate between  
16 rows on left and right.

17 COMMENT END:

18  
19 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

20 Swap the columns  
21  
22

23 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
24

25 ***Disposition of Comment 36***  
26

27 accept  
28

29  
30 ***Comment 37***     **David V James**  
31

32 COMMENT TYPE: E

33  
34 CLAUSE: 11.5.4

35 PAGE: 54

36 LINE: 1

37 COMMENT START:

38  
39 Could you swap the left two columns? That would avoid the need to interpolate between  
40 rows on left and right.

41 COMMENT END:

42  
43 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

44 Swap the columns  
45  
46

1 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
2

3 ***Disposition of Comment 37***  
4

5 accept- this refers to the same table as comment 36  
6

7  
8 ***Comment 38***     **David V James**  
9

10 COMMENT TYPE: E

11 CLAUSE: 11.5.4

12 PAGE: 55

13 LINE: 34

14 COMMENT START:

15 Esidual reg underscore.  
16

17 COMMENT END:  
18

19 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

20 remove it  
21

22 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
23

24 ***Disposition of Comment 38***  
25

26 accept  
27

28  
29 ***Comment 39***     **David V James**  
30

31 COMMENT TYPE: E

32 CLAUSE: 12.1

33 PAGE: 58

34 LINE: 4

35 COMMENT START:

36 Widen this column, to avoid the wrap in the header.  
37

38 COMMENT END:  
39

40 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

41 Widen the column  
42

43 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
44  
45  
46

1 ***Disposition of Comment 39***

2  
3  
4 Accept

5  
6 ***Comment 40***     **David V James**

7  
8 COMMENT TYPE: E

9  
10 CLAUSE: A

11 PAGE: 95

12 LINE: 10

13 COMMENT START:

14  
15 The typing seems to list "C2" as a language.

16 COMMENT END:

17 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

18  
19 C2 ==> C

20 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

21  
22 ***Disposition of Comment 40***

23  
24 Accept

25  
26  
27 ***Comment 41***     **David V James**

28  
29 COMMENT TYPE: E

30  
31 CLAUSE: B.3

32 PAGE: 96

33 LINE: 58

34 COMMENT START:

35  
36 Force a page break before B.3, so heading and first text are on the same page.

37 COMMENT END:

38  
39 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

40 Force a page break

41 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

42  
43 ***Disposition of Comment 41***

44  
45 accept

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46

**Comment 42 David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: B.3.4.2

PAGE: 98

LINE: 63

COMMENT START:

Nonstandard terminology

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

NA ==> N/A, as described previously

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

***Disposition of Comment 42***

Accept

**Comment 43 David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: B.4

PAGE: 100

LINE: 6

COMMENT START:

Shouldn't be a period here

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Clause 8. ==> Clause 8

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

***Disposition of Comment 43***

accept

**Comment 44 David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: D.1

PAGE: 103

LINE: 23

COMMENT START:

No subscript

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

- 1) Remove subscript in hyphen separated addresses.
- 2) Add notation description, as per provided FrameMaker text.
- 3) Do this throughout.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

***Disposition of Comment 44***

Discuss

**<< Editor's note - the provided FrameMaker text would add the following to definition to Clause 3:**

**3.3 Numerical representation**

Decimal, hexadecimal, and binary numbers are used within this document. For clarity, decimal numbers are generally used to represent counts, hexadecimal numbers are used to represent addresses, and binary numbers are used to describe bit patterns within binary fields.

Decimal numbers are represented in their usual 0, 1, 2, ... format. Hexadecimal numbers are represented by a string of one or more hexadecimal (0-9,A-F) digits followed by the subscript 16, except in C-code contexts, where they are written as 0x123EF2 etc. Binary numbers are represented by a string of one or more binary (0,1) digits, followed by the subscript 2. Thus the decimal number "26" may also be represented as "1A<sub>16</sub>" or "11010<sub>2</sub>".

MAC addresses and OUI/EUI values are represented as strings of 8-bit hexadecimal numbers separated by hyphens and without a subscript, as for example "01-80-C2-00-00-15" or "AA-55-11".

**>>**

1       **Comment 45     David V James**

2  
3  
4       COMMENT TYPE: E

5       CLAUSE: D.1

6       PAGE: 103

7       LINE: 25

8       COMMENT START:

9  
10       Center numbers under the blocks

11       COMMENT END:

12       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

13  
14       Center numbers

15       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

16  
17       **Disposition of Comment 45**

18  
19  
20       Accept

21  
22  
23       **Comment 46     David V James**

24  
25  
26       COMMENT TYPE: E

27       CLAUSE: F.2.1

28       PAGE: 107

29       LINE: 68

30       COMMENT START:

31  
32       Odd page should never be on the left.

33  
34       Odd page numbers should be on the right.

35       COMMENT END:

36       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

37  
38       Either:

39       1) Fix this.

40       2) Add to list for IEEE Editors to fix.

41  
42       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

1 ***Disposition of Comment 46***  
2

3  
4 Accept - instruct the IEEE editors to do it

5  
6 ***Comment 47***     **David V James**  
7

8 COMMENT TYPE: E

9  
10 CLAUSE: F.2.1

11 PAGE: 107

12 LINE: 61

13 COMMENT START:

14  
15 Force a page break before header, so header and text are on same page.

16 COMMENT END:

17  
18 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

19 Force a page break

20 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

21  
22 ***Disposition of Comment 47***  
23

24  
25 accept

26  
27 ***Comment 48***     **David V James**  
28

29 COMMENT TYPE: E

30  
31 CLAUSE: F.1

32 PAGE: 107

33 LINE: 32

34 COMMENT START:

35  
36 Blank space looks like a typo

37 COMMENT END:

38  
39 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

40 Fill with an em dash

41 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

42  
43 ***Disposition of Comment 48***  
44

45  
46 Accept see comment 11

1       **Comment 49     David V James**

2  
3  
4       COMMENT TYPE: E

5       CLAUSE: F.3.1

6       PAGE: 108

7       LINE: 43

8       COMMENT START:

9  
10       I think this should be a en dash, not an em dash

11       COMMENT END:

12       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

13  
14       em dash ==> en dash

15       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

16  
17       **Disposition of Comment 49**

18  
19  
20       accept

21  
22       **Comment 50     David V James**

23  
24  
25       COMMENT TYPE: E

26       CLAUSE: F.5.3

27       PAGE: 110

28       LINE: 35

29       COMMENT START:

30  
31       Space after i.e.

32       COMMENT END:

33       SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

34  
35       Add a space

36       SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

37  
38       **Disposition of Comment 50**

39  
40  
41       Accept in principle -- replace with "for example"

42  
43       **Comment 51     David V James**

44  
45  
46       COMMENT TYPE: E

1 CLAUSE: F.5

2 PAGE: 110

3 LINE: 9

4 COMMENT START:

5 If the field is called: "protocol identity" then it should not be capitalized. That's because:

6 1) Its not a heading

7 2) Context-dependent caps makes it hard to determine what is the real field name.

8 COMMENT END:

9 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

10 Make this lower case. Similar changes for other field names.

11 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

### 12 ***Disposition of Comment 51***

13 See comment 18

### 14 ***Comment 52***     **David V James**

15 COMMENT TYPE: E

16 CLAUSE: F.7

17 PAGE: 113

18 LINE: 56

19 COMMENT START:

20 Blank cell looks like typo.

21 COMMENT END:

22 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

23 Fill in with an em dash, here and throughout.

24 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

### 25 ***Disposition of Comment 52***

26 Accept - see comment 11

### 27 ***Comment 53***     **David V James**

28 COMMENT TYPE: FYI

1 CLAUSE: G.1

2 PAGE: 132

3 LINE: 33

4 COMMENT START:

5  
6 Fill in with an em dash, here and throughout. I normally put an em dash in such empty  
7 table cells, so its clear that its intended to be nothing.

8 COMMENT END:

9  
10 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

11 Fill empty cell with em dash, here and throughout.

12 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

13  
14  
15 ***Disposition of Comment 53***

16  
17 Accept - see comment 11

18  
19 ***Comment 54***     **David V James**

20  
21  
22 COMMENT TYPE: E

23 CLAUSE: G.2.1

24 PAGE: 133

25 LINE: 6

26 COMMENT START:

27  
28 Here it is bit-0 and bit-1, elsewhere its bit 0 and bit 1

29 COMMENT END:

30  
31 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

32 Be consistent - Preference is "bit[0]".

33 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

34  
35  
36 ***Disposition of Comment 54***

37  
38 Accept - global search and replace

39  
40  
41 ***Comment 55***     **David V James**

42  
43 COMMENT TYPE: E

44 CLAUSE: G.2.1

45 PAGE: 133

46

1 LINE: 20  
2 COMMENT START:  
3  
4 I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be  
5 nothing.  
6 COMMENT END:  
7 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
8  
9 blank cell ==> em dash  
10 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
11

12 ***Disposition of Comment 55***

13  
14 Accept - see comment 11  
15

16  
17 ***Comment 56***     **David V James**

18  
19 COMMENT TYPE: E  
20  
21 CLAUSE: G.2.1  
22  
23 PAGE: 133  
24 LINE: 20  
25 COMMENT START:  
26 I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be  
27 nothing.  
28 COMMENT END:  
29 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
30  
31 blank cell ==> em dash  
32  
33 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
34

35 ***Disposition of Comment 56***

36  
37 This is a duplicate of the previous comment  
38 Accept - see comment 11  
39

40  
41 ***Comment 57***     **David V James**

42  
43 COMMENT TYPE: E  
44  
45 CLAUSE: G.2.1  
46  
47 PAGE: 133

1 LINE: 19  
2 COMMENT START:  
3  
4 this should be an en dash, not an em dash  
5 COMMENT END:  
6 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
7 em dash ==> en dash  
8 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
9

10  
11 ***Disposition of Comment 57***

12  
13 accept

14  
15 ***Comment 58***     **David V James**

16  
17  
18 COMMENT TYPE: E

19 CLAUSE: G.2.1

20  
21 PAGE: 133

22 LINE: 13

23 COMMENT START:

- 24 a) Nonstandard line widths in table.  
25  
26 b) The "Bit" column should be centered.

27 COMMENT END:

28  
29 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

30 Include this in a list of "to-be-fixed", so its not missed by the IEEE editors.

31 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
32

33  
34 ***Disposition of Comment 58***

35  
36 accept

37  
38 ***Comment 59***     **David V James**

39  
40  
41 COMMENT TYPE: E

42 CLAUSE: G.3.5

43  
44 PAGE: 134

45 LINE: 61

46 COMMENT START:

1 I think two different size fonts are being used here (usage rules seems big)

2 COMMENT END:

3  
4 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

5 Use uniform font size

6 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

7  
8 ***Disposition of Comment 59***

9  
10  
11 accept

12  
13 ***Comment 60***     **David V James**

14  
15  
16 COMMENT TYPE: E

17 CLAUSE: G.3.1

18 PAGE: 134

19 LINE: 38

20 COMMENT START:

21  
22 I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be  
23 nothing.

24 COMMENT END:

25  
26 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

27 Blank cell ==> em dash

28  
29 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

30  
31 ***Disposition of Comment 60***

32  
33 accept - see comment 11

34  
35 ***Comment 61***     **David V James**

36  
37  
38 COMMENT TYPE: E

39 CLAUSE: G.3.1

40 PAGE: 134

41 LINE: 45

42 COMMENT START:

43  
44  
45 The G.3.2 in front of the second note appears erroneous.

46 COMMENT END:

1 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

2 Delete it

3 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

4  
5  
6 ***Disposition of Comment 61***

7  
8 Accept in principle - change the line format to "note" and add the number "2" to the line

9  
10  
11 ***Comment 62***     **David V James**

12  
13 COMMENT TYPE: E

14 CLAUSE: G.3.1

15 PAGE: 134

16 LINE: 24

17 COMMENT START:

18 a) Nonstandard line widths in table.

19 b) The "Bit" column should be centered.

20 COMMENT END:

21 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

22 Include this in a list of "to-be-fixed", so its not missed by the IEEE editors.

23 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

24  
25  
26  
27  
28 ***Disposition of Comment 62***

29  
30 Accept

31  
32  
33 ***Comment 63***     **David V James**

34  
35 COMMENT TYPE: E

36 CLAUSE: G.4.1

37 PAGE: 135

38 LINE: 36

39 COMMENT START:

40 I think this would be clearer if split into four subcells, so that

41 a) 0 and 1 are on separate rows

42 b) 0/1 and descriptions are on different columns.

43 COMMENT END:

1 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:  
2  
3 Split into subcells  
4 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

5  
6 ***Disposition of Comment 63***

7  
8 Accept  
9

10  
11 ***Comment 64***     **David V James**

12  
13 COMMENT TYPE: E  
14 CLAUSE: G.4  
15 PAGE: 135  
16 LINE: 12  
17 COMMENT START:

18 I think we can drop the subscript 16 here, if defined properly in the glossary (see example)  
19 COMMENT END:

20 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

21 Hyphenated addresses: delete the subscript 16. Here and throughout.

22 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29 ***Disposition of Comment 64***

30 accept  
31

32  
33  
34 ***Comment 65***     **David V James**

35 COMMENT TYPE: E  
36 CLAUSE: G.4.1  
37 PAGE: 135  
38 LINE: 36  
39 COMMENT START:

40 Blank cells look like a typo

41 COMMENT END:

42 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

1 insert an em dash

2 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

3  
4 ***Disposition of Comment 65***

5  
6  
7 accept - see comment 11

8  
9 ***Comment 66***     **David V James**

10  
11 COMMENT TYPE: E

12  
13 CLAUSE: G.7.1

14  
15 PAGE: 140

16  
17 LINE: 63

18  
19 COMMENT START:

20  
21 don't break URL

22  
23 COMMENT END:

24  
25 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

26  
27 force a line break before the URL

28  
29 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

30  
31 ***Disposition of Comment 66***

32  
33 accept

34  
35 ***Comment 67***     **David V James**

36  
37 COMMENT TYPE: E

38  
39 CLAUSE: G.7

40  
41 PAGE: 140

42  
43 LINE: 7

44  
45 COMMENT START:

46  
47 An em dash in the empty cell would make it clear this was intended to be blank. An n/a  
48 would also work.

49  
50 COMMENT END:

51  
52 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

53  
54 blank ==> em dash

1  
2 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
3

4 ***Disposition of Comment 67***  
5

6  
7 accept - see comment 11  
8

9 ***Comment 68***     **David V James**  
10

11 COMMENT TYPE: T

12 CLAUSE: 9.6.1.3

13 PAGE: 30

14 LINE: 7

15 COMMENT START:

16  
17  
18 The mapping of the OUI must be accurately defined, in terms of the IEEE/RAC supplied  
19 values, expressed in the format-assignment letter. The current reference is bit-oriented  
20 (not hex oriented, vertically oriented (not horizontal oriented), puts LSB on the left (not  
21 right), described different things (40-bit and 48-bit), which makes the reference difficult to  
22 understand in this context.  
23

24 COMMENT END:

25 SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

26 Replace text with:

27  
28  
29 9.6.1.3 Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI)  
30

31 The Organizationally Unique Identifier field shall contain the organization's OUI. For  
32 example, when using the 802.1 OUI value of 00-80-C2, 00 and C2 bytes correspond to the  
33 first and last of these three transmitted bytes, respectively (see F.2).  
34

35  
36 SUGGESTED CHANGES END:  
37

38 ***Disposition of Comment 68***  
39

40 discuss  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46