

IEEE P802.1ap Draft 3.1 Comment Resolution Summary

January 30, 2008

Editors: Glenn Parsons – gparsons@nortel.com
David Levi – dlevi@nortel.com

WG Ballot Vote on D3.0

> Yes – 8 (38%)

> No – 13 (62%)

> Abstain – 56 (72%)

> Did not vote – 14

> Non-voters - 3

| Ballot P802.lap/D3.0
| Type Working Group
| Results Fetched *Tue Nov 13 10:15:59 2007*

Participant	Vote	Date
Brian Hausauer	Abstain	Mon Nov 12 18:25:08 2007
Frank Chan (fchan)	Abstain	Mon Nov 12 13:43:09 2007
WJNEN, Bert (Bert)	Disapprove	Mon Nov 12 10:18:24 2007
[*] Uri Cummings	Approve	Mon Nov 12 04:29:51 2007
max prittin	Abstain	Sun Nov 11 10:28:03 2007
Ali Sajassi (asajassi)	Abstain	Sat Nov 10 11:09:38 2007
Rob Boatright	Abstain	Fri Nov 09 16:35:23 2007
Ananda Rajagopal	Abstain	Thu Nov 08 13:01:53 2007
Dinash Mohan	Abstain	Thu Nov 08 03:35:26 2007
John Terry	Abstain	Thu Nov 08 01:35:17 2007
Glenn Parsons	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07
[X] Ken Young	Abstain	Wed Nov 07
Yonghan Kim	Approve	Wed Nov 07 23:36:01 2007
Ken Patton	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 22:27:14 2007
Don Fedyk	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07 22:17:26 2007
Dat Thaler	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07 22:04:57 2007
Bob Sultan	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 20:13:21 2007
Paul Congdon	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07 18:03:47 2007
Hesham Elbakoury	Approve	Wed Nov 07 15:42:47 2007
Oliver Thorp	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 12:31:36 2007
Ranagiri Satalidis	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 11:29:48 2007
David Elie-Dit-Coeaque	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 11:26:31 2007
Jesay V Souyer	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07 10:46:10 2007
Frans Goets	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 02:15:43 2007
Michael Johas Tesmer	Abstain	Wed Nov 07 02:23:39 2007
Joseph Salowey (jsalowey)	Disapprove	Wed Nov 07 00:25:06 2007
[*] Wasekar, Manoj K	Approve	Tue Nov 06 16:15:41 2007
Mon Finn	Disapprove	Tue Nov 06 15:53:34 2007
Mick Seaman	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 20:30:32 2007
[*] Francois Tallet (ftallet)	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 19:50:23 2007
[*] SPTD, Koichiro	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 18:10:05 2007
Linda Dunsar	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 17:45:05 2007
[*] Bob Frazier	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 16:49:27 2007
Steve Haddock	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 16:30:13 2007
Rick Gray	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 15:05:12 2007
Romannan, Dan (Dan)	Disapprove	Tue Nov 06 11:41:35 2007
[X] Kevin Mollah	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 10:33:42 2007
Winkel, Ludwig	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 09:24:44 2007
Kari Laalinen	Approve	Tue Nov 06 09:08:22 2007
Alex Conta	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 04:14:36 2007
[*] Romain Inzler	Abstain	Tue Nov 06 03:38:25 2007
Claudio DeBartoli	Approve	Tue Nov 06 03:28:13 2007
Chien-Hsien Wu	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 23:33:55 2007
Attila Takacs	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 13:17:54 2007
[*] Stanton, Kevin B	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 12:34:58 2007
[*] Osama Aboul-Magid	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 10:48:44 2007
Hain Kuroki	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 10:39:11 2007
Brian Haseink	Abstain	Mon Nov 05 10:31:21 2007
Tony Jeffrey	Approve	Mon Nov 05 10:16:07 2007
Stranmer, Roderic (NSN - DE/Munich)	Disapprove	Mon Nov 05 07:44:43 2007
Shimon Ovedia	Abstain	Sun Nov 04 22:18:35 2007
[*] Dennis Volpano	Abstain	Sun Nov 04 18:04:08 2007
Hai Keen	Abstain	Sun Nov 04 16:19:52 2007
Muriel Spenscher	Disapprove	Sun Nov 04 07:57:48 2007
[*] Paul Hongkyu Jeong	Abstain	Sat Nov 03 21:53:59 2007
Felix Peifei Peng	Abstain	Sat Nov 03 21:26:50 2007
Alan McQuire	Abstain	Fri Nov 02 07:43:04 2007
Sehavi, Alon	Disapprove	Thu Nov 01 19:51:39 2007
[X] Don Pannell	Abstain	Wed Oct 31 17:40:12 2007
Marco Mascitto	Abstain	Wed Oct 31 08:16:58 2007
Robert Roden	Abstain	Wed Oct 31 06:42:54 2007
[*] Maarten Visser	Abstain	Fri Oct 26 18:04:07 2007
Jean-Michel Bonnymer	Abstain	Fri Oct 26 04:07:21 2007
Yannick La Goff	Abstain	Thu Oct 25 20:33:21 2007
Hironori Ono	Abstain	Wed Oct 24 01:17:06 2007
Roesse, Josef	Abstain	Tue Oct 23 07:11:42 2007
Sauer, John M.	Abstain	Mon Oct 22 15:50:53 2007
[X] Menu Munecherry	Abstain	Mon Oct 22 13:45:06 2007
[*] Michael Wright	Approve	Mon Oct 22 13:13:13 2007
David Olsen	Abstain	Mon Oct 22 13:00:42 2007
Gunther, Craig	Abstain	Mon Oct 22 12:13:05 2007
Raghu Kondapalli	Abstain	Fri Oct 19 20:07:02 2007
[*] David James	Disapprove	Tue Oct 16 18:08:36 2007
Geoffrey M. Garner	Abstain	Tue Oct 16 15:35:20 2007
Miko Ko	Abstain	Tue Oct 16 15:22:23 2007
Munayoshi Suzuki	Abstain	Tue Oct 16 05:06:01 2007
Jari Halkowski	Abstain	Wed Oct 10 16:13:21 2007
Keti Kilcrease (Kilcrease)	Abstain	Tue Oct 09 17:27:30 2007
Anoop Chawani	Abstain	Tue Oct 09 15:48:54 2007
John Wals Puller	Abstain	Tue Oct 09 14:57:57 2007
Karen Randall	Abstain	Mon Oct 08 09:01:47 2007
Paul Bortorff	N/A	
Edna Gannon	No Vote	N/A
Ken Gweal	No Vote	N/A
Tae-eun Kim	No Vote	N/A
Bruce Kwan	No Vote	N/A
David Martin	No Vote	N/A
John Neussinger	No Vote	N/A
Heli Peers	No Vote	N/A
Charles Qi	No Vote	N/A
Alyyn Romanov	No Vote	N/A
Sas Sambasivan	No Vote	N/A
Himanshu Zhab	No Vote	N/A
Gopi Srinivasi	No Vote	N/A
Zong Liang Wu	No Vote	N/A

[X] Not In The Voter List
[*] Voted More Than Once

Ballot failed

TF Ballot Comments

Ballot	Commentors	TR	T	ER	E	Total
D1.0 TF	7	11	7	12	10	40
D2.0 TF	3	13	1	15	17	46
D2.2 TF recirc	9	16	32	30	35	113
D3.0 WG	16	61	51	17	60	189

Goal: Initiate another WG ballot after comment resolution

802.1ah synchronization with 802.1ap

> 802.1ah goes to sponsor ballot first

- Will go through recircs
- And will stay in recircs (i.e, held up) until...

> 802.1ap enters sponsor ballot

- 802.1ah issues up to this time from 802.1ap would be in scope in the 802.1ah recircs irrespective of whether that sections has “closed” or not
- Any changes needed in 802.1ah based on 802.1ap sponsor ballot comments will not be included in P802.1ah

Notable changes in D3.1

- > Creating a STP MIB module that is the merging of RSTP MIB module and the STP aspects of the BRIDGE MIB module
- > Merging of the P-BRIDGE module into the BRIDGE MIB module
- > Significant clause 17 reorganization and merging resulting from the removal of MIB modules
- > Inclusion of unmodified CFM MIB module (and proposal for ISID indexing)
- > Addition of capabilities to BridgeBasePort table and removal from PB and PBB MIB modules.

No WG ballot on D3.1

- > Not all D3.0 comments resolved at last meeting (~20 outstanding)
- > Insufficient consensus on key concepts that affect PBB and base MIB modules
- > Significant churn resulting from MIB module merge

Unresolved comments

> Annex Z

- Counting PIPs
 - 194
- PB, PBB types
 - 191
- PIP to VIP mapping table
 - 203, 168, 204, 141, 142, 170
- Service template table
 - 172, 152, 173, 174, 175
- Destroying dynamic components
 - 188, 187, 189
- Display tables
 - 153, 190

> Bridge port creation (notably static vs dynamic)

- 119, 162, 151

> IfIndex

- KN-STACK (110 et al), 52

Goals/Agenda for this meeting

- >Confirmation on merging
 - Continue with RSTP + MSTP merge?
 - Continue with BRIDGE + QBRIDGE merge?
- >PBB Clause 12 churn
 - Port type
 - ifIndex usage
- >Bridge port creation proposals
 - Consensus on static vs dynamic
- >CFM MIB update
- >PBB service creation proposals
- >Discuss other unresolved comments

Presentations

> Dynamic port creation

- Ken Young - ap-young-d3-1-bridge-port-creation-0128.pdf
- Zehavit Alon - ap-alon-dynamic-bridge-port-creation-0108-v01.pdf
- Kevin Nolish - ap-knolish-internallan-0108-v01.pdf

> Service creation

- Zehavit Alon – ap-alon-service-creation-0108-v01.pdf

> CFM MIB indexing

- Kevin Nolish - ap-knolish-cfmindexing-0108-v01.pdf