IEEE P802.1ap Draft 3.1
Comment Resolution Summary

January 30, 2008

Editors:  Glenn Parsons – gparsons@nortel.com
          David Levi – dlevi@nortel.com
Ballot Vote on D3.0

>Yes – 8 (38%)
>No – 13 (62%)
>Abstain – 56 (72%)

>Did not vote – 14
>Non-voters - 3

Ballot failed
## TF Ballot Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ballot</th>
<th>Commentors</th>
<th>TR</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>ER</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D1.0 TF</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2.0 TF</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2.2 TF recirc</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3.0 WG</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Goal:** Initiate another WG ballot after comment resolution
802.1ah synchronization with 802.1ap

> 802.1ah goes to sponsor ballot first
  • Will go through recircs
  • And will stay in recircs (i.e, held up) until…

> 802.1ap enters sponsor ballot
  • 802.1ah issues up to this time from 802.1ap would be in scope in the 802.1ah recircs irrespective of whether that sections has “closed” or not
  • Any changes needed in 802.1ah based on 802.1ap sponsor ballot comments will not be included in P802.1ah
Notable changes in D3.1

> Creating a STP MIB module that is the merging of RSTP MIB module and the STP aspects of the BRIDGE MIB module

> Merging of the P-BRIDGE module into the BRIDGE MIB module

> Significant clause 17 reorganization and merging resulting from the removal of MIB modules

> Inclusion of unmodified CFM MIB module (and proposal for ISID indexing)

> Addition of capabilities to BridgeBasePort table and removal from PB and PBB MIB modules.
No WG ballot on D3.1

> Not all D3.0 comments resolved at last meeting (~20 outstanding)

> Insufficient consensus on key concepts that affect PBB and base MIB modules

> Significant churn resulting from MIB module merge
Unresolved comments

> Annex Z
  • Counting PIPs
    • 194
  • PB, PBB types
    • 191
  • PIP to VIP mapping table
    • 203, 168, 204, 141, 142, 170
  • Service template table
    • 172, 152, 173, 174, 175
  • Destroying dynamic components
    • 188, 187, 189
  • Display tables
    • 153, 190

> Bridge port creation (notably static vs dynamic)
  • 119, 162, 151

> IfIndex
  • KN-STACK (110 et al), 52
Goals/Agenda for this meeting

> Confirmation on merging
  - Continue with RSTP + MSTP merge?
  - Continue with BRIDGE + QBRIDGE merge?

>PBB Clause 12 churn
  - Port type
  - ifIndex usage

>Bridge port creation proposals
  - Consensus on static vs dynamic

>CFM MIB update

>PBB service creation proposals

>Discuss other unresolved comments
Presentations

> Dynamic port creation
  • Ken Young - ap-young-d3-1-bridge-port-creation-0128.pdf
  • Zehavit Alon - ap-alon-dynamic-bridge-port-creation-0108-v01.pdf
  • Kevin Nolish - ap-knolish-internallan-0108-v01.pdf

> Service creation
  • Zehavit Alon – ap-alon-service-creation-0108-v01.pdf

> CFM MIB indexing
  • Kevin Nolish - ap-knolish-cfmindexing-0108-v01.pdf