802.1H Task Group Ballot
Draft 0.3

Kevin Nolish
Michael Wright
802.1H Overview

• 802.1H is a recommended practice concerning the conversion of protocol indications between various 802.X networks.

• The version 0.3 of 802.1H is a complete rewrite of the original 802.1H document.
Draft P802.1Qay/D0.3 has been released on April 20th.

The second task group ballot closed on May 16th.
Current Ballot Results
As Of 11 May 2009

• Ballot Opened 20 April 09
• Ballot Closed 14 May 09
• Results
  – Approve 3
  – Disapprove 6
  – Abstain 45 ( 2 with comments )

• Includes all ballots received on or before 17 May 2009
## History Of Ballot Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting</th>
<th>March 09</th>
<th>May 09</th>
<th>July 09</th>
<th>Sep 09</th>
<th>Nov 09</th>
<th>Jan 10</th>
<th>March 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Version and Ballot Type</td>
<td>V 0.1 Task Group</td>
<td>V 0.3 Task Group</td>
<td>V 0.4 Task Group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disapprove</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current Comment Overview
As of 11 May 2009

• 15 Total Comments
  – Editorial (E) – 6
  – Required Editorial (ER) – 30
  – Technical (T) – 6
  – Required Technical (TR) – 41

• Required comments are those that are necessary to support a disapprove vote and must be addressed by the editor to change or prevent a disapprove vote.

• The breakdown between technical and editorial is at the discretion of the voter.
# History Of Comment Types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting</th>
<th>March 09</th>
<th>May 09</th>
<th>July 09</th>
<th>Sep 09</th>
<th>Nov 09</th>
<th>Jan 10</th>
<th>March 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Version and Ballot Type</td>
<td>V 0.1 Task Group</td>
<td>V 0.3 Task Group</td>
<td>V 0.4 Task Group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Required</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial Required</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Editorial Comments Breakdown

• Clean Up Standard Templates
• Fix Frame Counter Issues – Clause Numbering
• Change Definitions To References
• RFC 1042 terminology
  – Use “RFC 1042 Encapsulation”
• Better Align Document With IEEE Style Document. Major problem areas:
  – Clause 3
  – Figures need to be scrubbed
  – Insert Captions and Figure References
Major Technical Comments

• The explanation of the various protocol indication mechanisms needs to be better organized into a hierarchy along the following lines:

• LLC/SNAP is a LLC
  – With a specific SAP address where the LLC header is followed by a protocol identifier

• RFC 1042 Encapsulation is a LLC/SNAP
  – With a specific OUI of 00-00-00 and the protocol id is an Ethertype

• Bridge Tunnel Encapsulation is a LLC/SNAP
  – With a specific OUI of XX-XX-XX and the protocol id is an Ethertype
Major Technical Comments - 2

• Remove some definitions from clause 3 and replace them with references to definitions in other documents.
• Fix some Frame issues with respect to clause numbers and active cross references.
Major Editorial Issues

• Need a statement outlining the problem. Mick suggested that this belongs in 1.2, unfortunately clause 1.2 SHALL correspond to the purpose statement in the PAR according to the IEEE standards style guideline. Need to find a home for this.

• Remove the term LLC/SNAP. Lots of comments on this.
Editor Issues

• Kevin Nolish is resigning as 802.1H co-editor after the May interim meeting.
  – Intention is to prepare 0.4 draft quickly and have it balloted at the July Plenary.
Long Term Issues

• The rewrite of the document will keep us in task group ballot longer than expected.
• We may need a PAR extension as the PAR expires 31 Dec 2010. The extra time in cleaning this document up may push us past this date.