|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Title: | Liaison to ITU-T Q10/15 regarding MIPs in Recommendation ITU-T G.8013/Y.1731 (revision) |
|  |  |
| Date: | 18 July 2013 |
|  |  |
| Location: | Geneva, Switzerland |
|  |  |
| To: | Huub van Helvoort, Rapporteur Q10/15 ([hhelvoort@huawei.com](mailto:hhelvoort@huawei.com)) (for action)  Greg Jones, Counsellor SG15 ([tsb@itu.int](mailto:tsb@itu.int)) |
| Cc: | Stephen Shew, Rapporteur Q12/15 ([sshew@ciena.com](mailto:sshew@ciena.com))  Kam Lam, Rapporteur Q14/15 ([kam.lam@alcatel-lucent.com](mailto:kam.lam@alcatel-lucent.com))  Mike Bencheck, Co-chair MEF ([mike.bencheck@verizon.com](mailto:mike.bencheck@verizon.com))  Raghu Raganathan, Co-chair MEF ([rraghu@ciena.com](mailto:rraghu@ciena.com))  Nan Chen, Chair MEF ([nan@metroethernetforum.org](mailto:nan@metroethernetforum.org)) |
|  |  |
| From: | IEEE 802.1 Working Group |

Dear Mr. van Helvoort,

Thank you for your liaison on the status of recommendations in SG15 OLS 041.

Regarding consented recommendation G.8013/Y.1731, we note that there have been changes to the wording concerning the usage of certain OAM messages by maintenance points, in particular removing the restriction that EXM and VSM are only sent by MEPs in clauses 9.19.2 and 9.17.2. IEEE 802.1 would like to draw your attention to its concerns over the initiation of OAM messages from MIPs. 802.1Q clause 3.106 allows MIPs to originate CFM PDUs only in response to received CFM PDUs. This is in order to allow scalability to large numbers of MIPs:

1. The creation of a Maintenance Association and its MEPs can create an arbitrary number of MIPs. These MIPs can come and go as the network topology changes, and the flow of VLANs shifts from one bridge port to another. It is important, therefore, that MIP creation and destruction be trivial.
2. For this reason, MIPs have no associated state variables, except their existence.
3. In particular, individual MIPs have no presence in the MIB structure, so cannot be commanded to transmit messages. The only MIB variables for MIPs control the conditions under which they can be automatically (and easily) created.

We recommend that ITU-T Q10/15 incorporates language into G.8013/Y.1731 disallowing the generation of OAM messages from MIPs except in response to received OAM messages.

We would like to ensure long-term compatibility of the architecture of CFM in IEEE 802.1 standards and ITU-T recommendations, and we consider that this behaviour of MIPs is an important part of that architecture.

Best regards,

Tony Jeffree, Chair IEEE 802.1 Working Group ([tony@jeffree.co.uk](mailto:tony@jeffree.co.uk))

Stephen Haddock, Chair IEEE 802.1 Interworking Task Group ([shaddock@stanfordalumni.org](mailto:shaddock@stanfordalumni.org))