

CRITERIA FOR STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT (CSD) for a proposed PAR:

P802.1Q~~zz~~

Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—Bridges and Bridged Networks Amendment: YANG Data Model for [Connectivity Fault Management](#)

The text of the CSD given here in italics is that provided on the IEEE 802 website under 'IEEE 802 Procedural Documents' based on IEEE 802 LMSC Operations Manuals approved 15 November 2013 and last edited 20 January 2014. Responses to the questions asked in the CSD are given in roman font.

1. IEEE 802 criteria for standards development (CSD)

The CSD documents an agreement between the WG and the Sponsor that provides a description of the project and the Sponsor's requirements more detailed than required in the PAR. The CSD consists of the project process requirements, 1.1, and the 5C requirements, 1.2.

1.1 Project process requirements

1.1.1 Managed objects

Describe the plan for developing a definition of managed objects. The plan shall specify one of the following:

- a) The definitions will be part of this project.*
- b) The definitions will be part of a different project and provide the plan for that project or anticipated future project.*
- c) The definitions will not be developed and explain why such definitions are not needed.*

This project will not develop managed objects in the form of an SNMP MIB, as that has already been done as part of the base standard, IEEE 802.1Q-2014. This project is concerned with enabling ~~NETCONF~~-management of IEEE 802.1Q implementations through ~~development of~~ a YANG data model.

1.1.2 Coexistence

A WG proposing a wireless project shall demonstrate coexistence through the preparation of a Coexistence Assurance (CA) document unless it is not applicable.

- a) Will the WG create a CA document as part of the WG balloting process as described in Clause 13? (yes/no)*
- b) If not, explain why the CA document is not applicable.*

This is not a wireless project so a Coexistence Assurance (CA) document is not applicable.

1.2 5C requirements

1.2.1 Broad market potential

Each proposed IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall have broad market potential. At a minimum, address the following areas:

- a) Broad sets of applicability.
- b) Multiple vendors and numerous users.

The proposed amendment will support the use of YANG ~~together with NETCONF~~, which commands broad industry support -especially from network service providers, in networks that use ~~IEEE Std 802.1Q Connectivity Fault Management~~. Both IEEE Std 802.1Q and ~~NETCONF YANG~~ are already supported and used by multiple vendors/network providers/network users.

1.2.2 Compatibility

Each proposed IEEE 802 LMSC standard should be in conformance with IEEE Std 802, IEEE 802.1AC, and IEEE 802.1Q. If any variances in conformance emerge, they shall be thoroughly disclosed and reviewed with IEEE 802.1 WG prior to submitting a PAR to the Sponsor.

- a) Will the proposed standard comply with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1AC and IEEE Std 802.1Q?
- b) If the answer to a) is no, supply the response from the IEEE 802.1 WG.

The review and response is not required if the proposed standard is an amendment or revision to an existing standard for which it has been previously determined that compliance with the above IEEE 802 standards is not possible. In this case, the CSD statement shall state that this is the case.

The amendment will be in conformance with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1AC, and the existing provisions of IEEE 802.1Q.

1.2.3 Distinct Identity

Each proposed IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall provide evidence of a distinct identity. Identify standards and standards projects with similar scopes and for each one describe why the proposed project is substantially different.

IEEE 802.1Q is already a recognized and established standard. This project enhances IEEE 802.1Q to meet expressed customer needs; it does not duplicate existing capabilities. There is no other IEEE 802 standard or approved project that overlaps with the Scope of this project.

1.2.4 Technical Feasibility

Each proposed IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall provide evidence that the project is technically feasible within the time frame of the project. At a minimum, address the following items to demonstrate technical feasibility:

- a) Demonstrated system feasibility.
- b) Proven similar technology via testing, modeling, simulation, etc.

YANG data models are in use today in ~~provider-data~~ networks. Other ~~SDOs-standard development organizations~~ (e.g., ~~the IETF~~) have already defined YANG data models and there is sufficient joint membership and liaison to ensure that IEEE 802 benefits from their prior experience. ~~The proposed amendment will use mature NETCONF protocol (~2006) and YANG language (~2008) definitions.~~

1.2.5 Economic Feasibility

Each proposed IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall provide evidence of economic feasibility. Demonstrate, as far as can reasonably be estimated, the economic feasibility of the proposed project for its intended applications. Among the areas that may be addressed in the cost for performance analysis are the following:

- a) Balanced costs (infrastructure versus attached stations).
- b) Known cost factors.
- c) Consideration of installation costs.
- d) Consideration of operational costs (e.g., energy consumption).
- e) Other areas, as appropriate.

- a) The capabilities defined in this amendment do not affect the balance of costs.
- b) Reasonable cost for performance, comparable to today's management solutions.
- c) The installation cost of enhanced VLAN bridges and end stations providing remote management is expected to be reduced compared to existing implementations
- d) The operation cost of enhanced VLAN bridges and end stations providing remote management is expected to be reduced compared to existing implementations

~~The additional implementation resources consumed by support of the YANG data model and NETCONF protocol in are those of an enhanced software protocol whose requirements are bounded, well known, and of minimal impact on equipment cost in networks requiring management. The industry-wide effort to adopt NETCONF/YANG is largely driven by a need to reduce operational costs.~~

Formatted: List Paragraph, Numbered + Level: 1 +
Numbering Style: a, b, c, ... + Start at: 1 + Alignment:
Left + Aligned at: 0.25" + Indent at: 0.5"