

Maintenance Task Group Meeting

November 13, 2018

Paul Congdon

V02 – Post Meeting

Maintenance Task Group Meeting

November 13, 2018 Agenda

- Patents and Guidelines
- Attendees
- [Updated Standard Group MAC Address Table](#) – Mick Seaman
- Issue Status
- New Maintenance items
- Existing Maintenance items
- Comment resolution
 - None
- Liaisons
 - None received
- SC6 comment resolution
 - Discuss response to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1AE:2013/FDAmD 3
 - Discuss response to comments on 802.1AR-Rev
- SC6 status

Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

- **Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation**
- **Advise the WG attendees that:**
 - IEEE's patent policy is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
 - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
 - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither IEEE, the WG, nor the WG Chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.
- **Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:**
 - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
 - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
 - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.
- The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
- It is recommended that the WG Chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 14 and 15 on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)

Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE

- Participants shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed) of the identity of each holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents
- Participants should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed) of the identity of any other holders of potential Essential Patent Claims

**Early identification of holders of potential
Essential Patent Claims is encouraged**

Ways to inform IEEE

- **Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or**
- **Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or**
- **Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents**

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

Other guidelines for IEEE WG meetings

- **All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.**
 - **Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.**
 - **Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.**
 - Relative costs of different technical approaches that include relative costs of patent licensing terms may be discussed in standards development meetings.
 - **Technical considerations remain the primary focus**
 - **Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.**
 - **Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.**
 - **Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed ... do formally object.**

For more details, see *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and *Antitrust and Competition Policy: What You Need to Know* at <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf>

Patent-related information

The patent policy and the procedures used to execute that policy are documented in the:

- ***IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws***
(<http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6>)
- ***IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual***
(<http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/opman/sect6.html#6.3>)

Material about the patent policy is available at
<http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/materials.html>

**If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA
Standards Board Patent Committee
Administrator at patcom@ieee.org**

Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

Participation in any IEEE 802 meeting (Sponsor, Sponsor subgroup, Working Group, Working Group subgroup, etc.) is on an individual basis

- **Participants in the IEEE standards development individual process shall act based on their qualifications and experience. (https://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sb_bylaws.pdf section 5.2.1)**
- **IEEE 802 Working Group membership is by individual; “Working Group members shall participate in the consensus process in a manner consistent with their professional expert opinion as individuals, and not as organizational representatives”. (subclause 4.2.1 “Establishment”, of the IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures)**
- **Participants have an obligation to act and vote as an individual and not under the direction of any other individual or group. A Participant’s obligation to act and vote as an individual applies in all cases, regardless of any external commitments, agreements, contracts, or orders.**
- **Participants shall not direct the actions or votes of any other member of an IEEE 802 Working Group or retaliate against any other member for their actions or votes within IEEE 802 Working Group meetings, see https://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sb_bylaws.pdf section 5.2.1.3 and the IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures, subclause 3.4.1 “Chair”, list item x.**

By participating in IEEE 802 meetings, you accept these requirements. If you do not agree to these policies then you shall not participate.

(Latest revision of IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures: <http://www.ieee802.org/devdocs.shtml>)

November 13, 2018 Attendees

Geoff Garner
Craig Gunther
Nader Zein
Yi Yu
John Messenger
Scott Mansfield
Karen Randall
Takahiro Yamaura
Woojung Huh
Eric Gray
Dave Sinicrope
Satoka Itaya
Yoshihiro Ito
Steve Haddock
Glenn Parsons
Kenichi Maruhashi
Yolanda Yu
Johannes Specht
Christian Boiger

Rodney Cummings
Randy Kelsey
Mike Potts
Norm Finn
Stephan Kehrer
Don Pannell
Weiyang Cheng
Michael Karl
Janos Farkas
Marina Gutierrez
Lou Berger
Frank Schewe
Marc Holness
Alex Sato
Jessy Rouyer
Paul Bottorff
Guogang Huang
Mick Seaman

Updated Standard Group MAC public listing

- [The Current listing](#) is out of date
- Mick Seaman has a proposed [updated list](#)

Status Update

- 802.1AS-Rev/D7.3 WG recirculation Comment resolution completed in September. Another recirculation ballot planned for after November Plenary.
- 802.1Xck-2018 was approved by the Standards Board on September 27th, 2018 meeting. Awaiting publication. 802.1X-Rev will be a future vehicle for security related items.
- 802.1AC-2016/Cor 1-2018 was approved by the Standards Board on September 27th, 2018 meeting. Awaiting publication.
- 802.1AX-Rev/D0.4 TG ballot closed November 2nd. TG ballot resolution will begin at November Plenary.
- 802.1ABcu is waiting for an initial draft and TG ballot.
- Open Items awaiting document vehicles
 - 0170 – waiting for 802.1BA
 - 0174 – waiting for 802.1AC
 - 0205 – waiting for 802.1CM

802.1 Maintenance Status

Category	Count
Approved	0
Ready for Ballot	1
Complete then Ballot	2
Complete then Errata	0
Errata	0
Failed	0
Incomplete	0
Rejected	30
Published	123
Received	0
Errata Sheet Published	0
Technical experts review	12
Balloting	22
Withdrawn	1

BALLOT RESOLUTION

- none

Existing Maintenance Items

- All existing open maintenance items are included here, **except** items which are in “balloting” state already, as those aren’t really interesting to track.
- Task force chairs and editors: have you decided in your groups not to change something which is covered by a Maintenance item? If so, you please ensure you bring this to the attention of the Maintenance Task Group.

Items for review

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject
0170	Ready for Ballot	2016-05-16	802.1BA-2011	7.3.5	References to other standards in 802.1BA-2011
0174	Complete then Ballot	2016-11-08	802.1AC-2016	2	802.1AC: IEEE 802.17 has been withdrawn
0205	Complete then Ballot	2018-05-21	802.1CM	7.4 & 9	Include regional Navigation satellite systems into IEEE Std 802.1CM
0210	Technical experts review	2018-09-11	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	43.3.3.4	ECP protocol code point for P802.1CS needed in 802.1Q-2018
0211	Technical experts review	2018-09-18	802.1Qbv-2016	12.29.1; 17.2.22; 17.7.22	AdminCycleTime and Interval max values
0213	Technical experts review	2018-09-24	802.1AB-2016 and 802.1AB-2009	9.2.5.6	The range of msgTxHold and the range of its MIB object lldpV2MessageTxHoldMultiplier are not consistent
0214	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.2	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should replace the usage of the port-number type with if:interface-ref for the port-map list
0215	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6	Bridge YANG data models should use YANG version 1.1
0216	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should add 'derive-from-or-self' to the bridge port augmentation's 'when' statement
0217	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model filtering entries should be broken out to 'config true' and 'config false' containers

Items for review

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject
0218	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.2	ieee802-dot1q-types YANG model should split the port-map-grouping into separate groupings for filtering entries and vlan registration entries
0219	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.2	ieee802-dot1q-types YANG model should remove the map-type YANG choice model and use an enumeration for the "forward", "filter", and "forward-filter" states
0220	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should have a consistent iana-if-type prefix with the iana-if-type YANG model
0221	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should limit the configured VLAN names to be unique
0222	Technical experts review	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should add a 'config false' list for dynamically learned VLANs

NEW MAINTENANCE ITEMS

- 0210 - ECP protocol code point for P802.1CS needed in 802.1Q-2018 – 802.1Q-2018
- 0211 - AdminCycleTime and Interval max values - 802.1Qbv-2016
- 0213 - msgTxHold and IldpV2MessageTxHoldMultiplier are not consistent - 802.1AB-2016
- 0214 - replace the usage of the port-number type with if:interface-ref - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0215 - use YANG version 1.1 - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0216 - add 'derive-from-or-self' to the bridge port augmentation's 'when' statement - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0217 - break out filtering entries to 'config true' and 'config false' containers - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0218 - split the port-map-grouping into separate groupings - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0219 - use a enumeration for the "forward", "filter", and "forward-filter" states - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0220 - have a consistent iana-if-type prefix - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0221 - limit configured VLAN names to be unique - 802.1Qcp-2018
- 0222 - add a 'config false' list for dynamically learned VLANs - 802.1Qcp-2018

Note: Status updated manually due to issue with database

Items progressed

Nov 2018 Plenary Meeting

Location: Bangkok

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject	Draft
0210	Complete then Ballot	2018-09-11	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	43.3.3.4	ECP protocol code point for P802.1CS needed in 802.1Q-2018	
0211	Complete then Ballot	2018-09-18	802.1Qbv-2016	12.29.1; 17.2.22; 17.7.22	AdminCycleTime and Interval max values	
0213	Complete then Ballot	2018-09-24	802.1AB-2016 and 802.1AB-2009	9.2.5.6	The range of msgTxHold and the range of its MIB object IldpV2MessageTxHoldMultiplier are not consistent	
0214	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.2	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should replace the usage of the port-number type with if:interface-ref for the port-map list	
0215	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6	Bridge YANG data models should use YANG version 1.1	
0216	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should add 'derive-from-or-self' to the bridge port augmentation's 'when' statement	
0217	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model filtering entries should be broken out to 'config true' and 'config false' containers	
0218	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.2	ieee802-dot1q-types YANG model should split the port-map-grouping into separate groupings for filtering entries and vlan registration entries	
0219	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.2	ieee802-dot1q-types YANG model should remove the map-type YANG choice model and use an enumeration for the "forward", "filter", and "forward-filter" states	
0220	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should have a constant iana-if-type prefix with the iana-if-type YANG model	

Note: Status updated manually due to issue with database

Items progressed

Nov 2018 Plenary Meeting

Location: Bangkok

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject	Draft
0221	Reject	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should limit the configured VLAN names to be unique	
0222	Withdrawn	2018-09-25	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.3	ieee802-dot1q-bridge YANG model should add a 'config false' list for dynamically learned VLANs	

LIAISONS

- None.

JTC1 SC6 COMMENT RESPONSES

- comment response for IEEE 802.1AEcg – FDIS ballot closed 28 August with 1 comment from China.
- comment responses for IEEE 802.1AR-Rev. The 60-day pre ballot closed on 14 October with 2 comments from China.

Comment Responses

- Discussed and drafted in Security TG
 - <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/SC6CommentResponse1AEcg2018-v02.pdf>
 - <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/SC6CommentResponse1AR2018-v01.pdf>
- Review the motion for EC consent agenda

JTC1 SC6 STATUS – September 2018

ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6 Status

- Karen Randall has been performing this tracking
- Volunteers sought to assist with this task

JTC1 SC6 STATUS – November 2018

ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6 Status

- PSDO agreement in place to allow progress of IEEE standards in ISO/IEC
- EC JTC1 standing committee is administering the process for IEEE 802 Standards
 - 802.1, 802.3, 802.11, 802.15, 802.16, 802.21, 802.22
- 802.1 has previously agreed to submit its standards to SC6
 - Most standards and their amendments (note – not sending Recommended Practices)
 - Motion required per standard
 - To forward Sponsor Ballot draft for information and comment
 - To submit approved standard for PSDO approval
 - Procedure for Corrigenda: one 90 day ballot and three questions.

802.1 Stds for SC6 approval (1/3)

– PSDO approved

- 802.1AE-2006 - FDIS passed Oct 2013, cmnts liaised Jan 2014
- 802.1X-2010 - FDIS passed Oct 2013, cmnts liaised Jan 2014
- 802.1AS-2011 (Time synch) - FDIS passed Dec 2013, cmnts liaised May 2014
- 802.1AB-2009 (LLDP) - FDIS passed Dec 2013, cmnts liaised May 2014
- 802.1AR-2009 (Secure device ID) - FDIS passed Dec 2013, cmnts liaised May 2014
- 802.1AEbn-2011 - ISO/IEC 8802-1AE:2015/Amd 1 (Apr 2015)
- 802.1AEbw-2013 - ISO/IEC 8802-1AE:2015/Amd 2 (Apr 2015)
- 802.1AX-2014 - FDIS passed Nov 2015; no comments
- 802-2014 - FDIS passed Nov 2015, cmnts liaised Jan 2016
- 802.1Xbx-2014 - FDIS passed Dec 2015; cmnts liaised 20 April
- 802.1Q-2014 - FDIS passed Jan 2016; cmnts liaised 20 April
- 802.1BA-2011 (AVB systems) - FDIS passed August 2016; no comments
- 802.1BR-2012 (Port extender) - FDIS passed August 2016; no comments
- 802.1AB-2016 (Stn & MAC Conn Disc) - FDIS passed 4/17; Cmt resp liaised Jul 2017
- 802.1Qbv-2015 (Enhs for Sch Traffic) - FDIS passed 4/17; Cmt resp liaised Jul 2017
- 802.1Qca-2015 (Path Control & Reserv) - FDIS passed 4/17; Cmt resp liaised Jul 2017
- 802.1Q-2014/Cor 1-2015 - FDIS passed 4/17; Cmt resp liaised Jul 2017 published Oct 2017
- 802.1Qbu-2016 (Frame Preemption) - FDIS passed Oct 2017; no cmnts; pub Nov 2017
- 802.1Qbz-2016 (Enh to Bridging 802.11) - FDIS passed Oct 2017; no cmnts; pub Nov 2017

802.1 Stds for SC6 approval (2/3)

– PSDO approved (cont'd)

- 802.1Qcd (Application VLAN TLV) - FDIS passed Dec 2017 – no cmts; pub Jan 2018
- 802.1AX-2014/Cor1-2017 - 90 day Cor FDIS passed Jul 2017; no cmts published Sep 2018
- 802.1AC-2016 (MAC Svc Def) - FDIS passed 3/2018 – cmt resps sent Apr 2018 published Apr 2018
- 802d-2017 (URN Namespace) - FDIS passed 3/2018; no cmts; pub Apr 2018

802.1 Stds for SC6 approval (3/3)

- For adoption - PSDO in process (FDIS ballots)
 - 802.1AEcg-2017 (EDE devices) - FDIS ballot closed 28 Aug 2018 w cmt from China
 - 802.1CB (Frame Repl & Elim for Reliability) - FDIS ballot 8 Aug 2018; closes 26 Dec 2018
 - IEEE 802c (Local MAC Address Usage) - Ballot passed w cmts; resp sent April 2018; FDIS closes 26 Dec 2018
 - 802.1Qch (Cyclic Queuing & Fwding) - Ballot Jan 18 w no cmts; FDIS closes 3 Jan 2019
 - 802.1Qci (Per stream filtering & policing) - Ballot passed with cmt from China – response sent April 2018; FDIS ballot closes 3 Jan 2019
- For adoption - PSDO in process (60 day pre-ballots)
 - IEEE 802.1CM (Time Sens N/W fronthaul) - Ballot passed Oct 2018 with no comments.
 - IEEE 802.1AR-Rev (Secure DevID) - Ballot passed Oct 2018 with 2 cmts from China
- Next to send - send for adoption/start ballots when published (Motions for all of these were approved at July 2018 Plenary)
 - IEEE 802.1Q-Rev (Bridges) - D2.0 sent 27 July 2017 (*pub 7/2018: send after Qch, Qci)
 - IEEE 802.1Qcc (Stream Res Protocol) - D2 sent 12/2017 (SB apprv 6/18, send when pub)
 - IEEE 802.1Qcp (Bridges YANG) - D2 sent 12/2017 (*pub 9/2018; send after Q)
 - IEEE 802.1Qcy (VDP extension) - D2.1 sent April 2018 – send final text when pub
 - IEEE 802.1Xck (802.1X YANG model) - D2 sent April 2018 – send final text when pub
 - IEEE 802.1AE-Rev (MAC security) - D1.1 sent April 2018 – send final text when pub
 - IEEE 802.1AC-2016/Cor 1 (LLC encaps) - Sent for info Apr 2018 – send final COR text for one 90-day ballot when pub
- For Information – send document drafts
 - P802.1AS-Rev/D8? (Timing & Synchn) - expect Sponsor Ballot in late Nov/Dec 2018