

P802.1DG/D1.1 Editor's Report for Ballot Comment Resolution (v4)

by: Craig Gunther
Craig Gunther Consulting, Bosch

P802.1DG/D1.1 Summary

The Editor's main purpose for D1.1 was to evaluate the value of some informative tutorial content and to set the future direction for the project. Comments received have been extremely helpful in reaching this goal. THANKS TO ALL WHO SUBMITTED COMMENTS!

This document sorts comments into discussion topics for ease of comment resolution. The Editor has made a best effort to organize the comments by CommentType (E, ER, T, TR, etc). In case of errors, the comment resolution database is the definitive source.

In those places where comments are grouped together (i.e. enclosed in []), they have been put into the category that is the best fit for that group.

Since this is a Task Group ballot the Editor has occasionally taken the liberty of providing a "Response" that points to another comment's Response.

Ballot Statistics

CATEGORY	TOTAL	%
Yes	7	39
No	11	61
Voting Yes or No	18	51
Abs. Time	5	14
Abs. Expertise	10	29
Abs. Other	2	6
Respondents	35	100
Voting members		
Non-voting commenters		
No. of commenters	35	100
No. of comments	176	100
TR	52	30
T	42	24
ER	16	9
E	66	38

Ballot Comments NOT planned for discussion-1

These comments will be accepted as-is, or with changes similar in nature to what was in the Suggested Remedy. No discussion is anticipated unless someone requests it.

Clarification/readability:

- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 13, 48, 61
- “T” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 5, 10, 18
- “ER” ACCEPT: 19
- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [26,89], [44,113], 95, 103, 104, 106, 107, 108, 109, 112, 119, 121, 130, 133

Ballot Comments NOT planned for discussion-2

These comments will be accepted as-is, or with changes similar in nature to what was in the Suggested Remedy. No discussion is anticipated unless someone requests it.

Typos:

- “TR” ACCEPT: 23
- “ER” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 14, 16, 17, 20, 21, 35, 77, 176
- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 27, 28, 29, 32, 33, 34, 97, 127

Reorganization

The tutorial information in clause 6.2 and associated subclauses is informative in nature and will be moved to an Informative Annex.

- There is information in these tutorials that may not make it into a profile, but is still valuable for those IVN designers who may wish to go beyond the profiles we define
- Therefore, the information should be kept but not in the core of the document
- Profiles will reference the tutorial information when a detailed explanation is needed
- Several profiles may point to the same informative details

Ballot Comments for discussion (general topics-1)

Profiles:

- “TR” ACCEPT: [40,81,82]
- “T” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [9,76], 174

Reorganization: Comments that relate directly to restructuring. Comment that are affected by this restructuring are not listed here.

- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [80,92,99,126]

Redundancy:

- “ER” Discuss: 45

Security:

- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 86

Ballot Comments for discussion (general topics-2)

Clarification/readability/typo:

- “TR” REJECT: 47
- “ER” REJECT: 2, 46, 93
- “E” REJECT: 1, 75, 105, 111, [114,115], [129,153]
- “TR” Discuss: 49
- “T” Discuss: 122
- “TR” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 41, 87, 90, [91,125]
- “ER” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [88,117], 94
- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [100,101,102], 116, [123,124], 128, 142
- “E” Discuss: 118, 120

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1CB-1)

802.1CB Stream Identification (6.2.1.1):

- “E” REJECT: 131
- “TR” Discuss: [36,49,51,52,132,173] A presentation which is targeted at OEMs will likely follow the resolution of this comment group so we can create some type of agreement. This will impact many decisions going forward with this standard.
- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 50

802.1CB Number of Member Streams per Compound Stream (6.2.1.2):

- “E” REJECT: 134
- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [53,78,79,139]
- “E” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 135, 136, 137, 138

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1CB-2)

802.1CB Intermittent vs Bulk streams (6.2.1.3):

- “TR” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [30,31,54,140], [42,59,84], 83
- “T” Discuss: [141,143,146,149,150]

802.1CB Individual/Sequence Recovery (6.2.1.4):

- “TR” REJECT: 57
- “TR” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [4,63,64,85], 55, 56

802.1CB In-order vs. out-of-order (6.2.1.5)

- “TR” REJECT: 60, 62
- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 43, 58, 65,[66,145]
- “T” Discuss: 144

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1CB-3)

802.1CB FRER functions (6.2.1.9):

- “ER” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 94
- “T” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [6,148,151]

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1AS-1)

802.1AS Timing and Synchronization (6.2.2):

- “E” REJECT: 152
- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 37, 69
- “T” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 7, [8,15,154], 11, 12

802.1AS BMCA (6.2.2.1)

- “E” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 155

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1AS-2)

802.1AS Pdelay (6.2.2.2)

- “TR” REJECT: 70
- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 3, 38, [71,160,161]
- “E” ACCEPT: 157, 158
- “T” Discuss: 156, 159

802.1AS Sync messages (6.2.2.3)

- “TR” ACCEPT/ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 24, [25, 73], [39,72,163], [74,164]
- “E” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 162

Ballot Comments for discussion (802.1AS-3)

802.1AS Clock Domains (6.2.2.4)

- “TR” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: 22
- “T” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [165,166]

Ballot Comments for discussion (Informative)

Future TSN Standards Tutorials (6.2.3)

- “E” ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE: [96,167,168,169,170,171,175]

Thank you!