

Title: Response to your liaison dated July 3, 2019 on MAAP
From: IEEE 802.1 Working Group
For: Action
Contacts: Glenn Parsons, Chair, IEEE 802.1, glenn.parsons@ericsson.com
John Messenger, Acting Chair, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.1, jmessenger@advaoptical.com
Jessy Rouyer, Acting Vice-Chair, Secretary IEEE 802.1, jessy.rouyer@nokia.com
Janos Farkas, 802.1 TSN Task Group Chair, janos.farkas@ericsson.com
Roger Marks, P802.1CQ Editor, roger@ethair.net
Dorothy Stanley, Chair, IEEE 802.11 Working Group, dorothy.stanley@hpe.com

To: IEEE 1722 Working Group
Dave Olsen, Working Group Chair, dave.olsen@ieee.org
Don Pannell, Secretary, donald.pannell@nxp.com

Date: July 18, 2019

Dear colleagues,

Thank you for your informative and constructive response, entitled “Liaison to IEEE 802.1 regarding IEEE 1722’s new work and our willingness to transfer ownership of the MAAP (MAC Address Acquisition Protocol) to 802.1” <<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/liaison-ieee-1722-to-802-1-and-omniran-0719.pdf>>, to our earlier inquiry. We would like to provide you with some updated information and further thoughts regarding your suggestions.

We appreciate the update concerning your new amendment project IEEE P1722b and the invitation to IEEE 802.1 and its participants to participate in this new work, particularly regarding the addition of new frame formats.

Thanks also for the background information on IEEE Std 1722’s MAC Address Acquisition Protocol (MAAP). We acknowledge your view that “during the development of MAAP, it was realized by the group, that IEEE 802.1 would be a better keeper of this standard if it ever needed to be enhanced and/or improved.” In this regard, we would like to bring you up to date on our P802.1CQ project on Multicast and Local Address Assignment. Since our last statement, the project has been reassigned to our Time-Sensitive Networking (TSN) Task Group, and the first substantive draft (P802.1CQ/D0.2) has become available. The draft does discuss the relationship of the work to MAAP and some of the issues to be decided on that topic. Per the PAR, we expect P802.1CQ to provide two different assignment protocols, one for peer-to-peer address claiming and one for client-server address allocation. The current (immature) draft indicates that the client-server method will be based on the principles of DHCP and that the claiming method will be based on MAAP but will differ in some respects, particularly regarding the message format and the address allocation range. We are open to adopting MAAP and maintaining it on an ongoing basis in IEEE P802.1CQ, ensuring the necessary backward compatibility, while intending a high level of alignment with the new more general claiming protocol. We would of course be open to your Working Group’s further input as the details are developed.

We agree that timeliness of P802.1CQ and 1722b projects may turn out to be very convenient. Detailed issues regarding Ethertype and subtypes are presented as notes in the current P802.1CQ draft and would need to be agreed by the two Working Groups. We do appreciate your offer to “carve out a range of Ethertype Subtypes as well as MAC addresses (if necessary) for sole use of IEEE 802.1.”

Thank you for the information regarding the July 30 IEEE 1722b teleconference meeting. It is our expectation that the P802.1CQ Editor will offer a personal presentation on the status of the work. We look forward to a discussion at that time and would hope to informally develop an initial list of issues that will need to be decided if the transfer of MAAP into P802.1CQ is to proceed.

We currently expect to have a draft ready for Task Group ballot in November. At that stage, we would be happy to share it with your group. In the meantime, we would appreciate the opportunity to have IEEE Std 1722-2016, and drafts of P1722b, shared with our participants in a password-protected web area. We would be happy to discuss the details with you and with IEEE staff.

IEEE 802.1 meets next September 16-20, 2019 in Edinburgh, United Kingdom. Progress on P802.1CQ is expected before then during some TSN teleconferences, at which your attendance will be welcome.

IEEE 802.1 face-to-face meeting details are available at <http://www.ieee802.org/1/meetings>. For details of TSN teleconferences, see <<https://1.ieee802.org/category/tsn-tg-calls>>.

Respectfully submitted,

John Messenger
Acting Chair, Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.1 Working Group