P802f YANG Data Model for EtherTypes

Overview and Open Issues

Glenn Parsons – Chair 802.1
Scott Mansfield – Chair YANGster
Marc Holness – P802f Editor

Version 0.6
July  2020
Background and Timelines

- IETF requested IEEE to create a YANG module of EtherTypes (early 2017)
  - A program was proposed for the RAC to generate a YANG module for all EtherTypes
  - IETF wanted a short list of relevant or favorite EtherTypes
    - This would require a project to define
  - IETF published a YANG module of EtherTypes in RFC 8519 (early 2019)
    - They will deprecate when IEEE module is available

- IEEE 802.1 WG created a project to work YANG EtherTypes (late 2019)
  - Initial P802f discussion held in YANGsters (Chair: Scott Mansfield)
  - Marc Holness assigned as editor (mid 2020)
PAR: https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject-web/public/view.html#pardetail/7215

Highlights of the PAR

- **Type of Project:** Amendment to IEEE Standard 802-2014
- **Scope:** This amendment specifies YANG modules that contain the EtherType information, including a compact human-readable name and description. The name and description for an initial set of EtherTypes are defined for inclusion in the IEEE Registration Authority EtherType public listing. This amendment also addresses errors and omissions in IEEE Std 802 description of existing functionality.

- **Are there other standards or projects with a similar scope? Yes**
  **Explain:** The Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) has requested that the IEEE create an EtherTypes YANG module, since the IEEE owns the EtherTypes registry. The IETF will use the IEEE YANG module once completed and deprecate the EtherTypes Module they have written which is found in RFC 8519 "YANG Data Model for Network Access Control Lists (ACLs)" https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc8519.
Introduction

- The IEEE SA Registration Authority for Ethertype ([https://standards.ieee.org/products-services/regauth/ethertype/index.html](https://standards.ieee.org/products-services/regauth/ethertype/index.html)) provide access to the public listing of the EtherType registry
  - [http://standards-oui.ieee.org/ethertype/eth.txt](http://standards-oui.ieee.org/ethertype/eth.txt)
  - [http://standards-oui.ieee.org/ethertype/eth.csv](http://standards-oui.ieee.org/ethertype/eth.csv)

- Contains the following information, and has a tabular representation as illustrated below:
  - Ethertype Assignment (hex)
  - Organization Address (string)
  - Protocol (string)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Registry</th>
<th>Assign</th>
<th>Organization Name</th>
<th>Organization Address</th>
<th>Protocol</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethertype</td>
<td>891c</td>
<td>Martin Professional A/S</td>
<td>Olof Palmes AllÃ© 18 Å…rhus N Midtjylland DK 8200</td>
<td>This protocol is used for high bandwidth, low latency transmission of video data to video wall display devices over an Ethernet network. The protocol is proprietary to Martin Professional A/S, refer to <a href="http://www.martin.dk">www.martin.dk</a> for further information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethertype</td>
<td>8946</td>
<td>IETF TRILL Working Group</td>
<td>No Internet Society Reston VA US 20190-5108</td>
<td>The RBridge Channel protocol is specified in <a href="http://www.ietf.org/id/draft-ietf-trill-rbridge-channel-05.txt">http://www.ietf.org/id/draft-ietf-trill-rbridge-channel-05.txt</a>. Most of the document is about communication between RBridges. Section 4 describes the differences for transmission between and end station and an RBridge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Introduction

- **IETF RFC 8519** contains a YANG module for Ethertypes with a structure that includes:
  - Ethertype Name (as an enum literal string)
  - Ethertype Value (as decimal number)
  - Short Description (as string)

- An example of a Registry tabular representation that incorporates a short EtherType name and short description is shown below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Registry Type</th>
<th>Assignments</th>
<th>Short Name</th>
<th>Short Description</th>
<th>Organization Name</th>
<th>Organization Address</th>
<th>Protocol</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethertype</td>
<td>0800</td>
<td>ipv4</td>
<td>Internet Protocol version 4 (IPv4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethertype</td>
<td>0842</td>
<td>wlan</td>
<td>Wake-on-LAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethertype</td>
<td>8946</td>
<td>trill</td>
<td>Rbridge</td>
<td>IETF TRILL Working Group</td>
<td>502 Internet Society Reston VA US 20190-5108</td>
<td>The RBridge Channel protocol is specified in <a href="http://www.ietf.org/id/draft-ietf-trill-rbridge-channel-05.txt">http://www.ietf.org/id/draft-ietf-trill-rbridge-channel-05.txt</a>. Most of the document is about communication between RBridges. Section 4 describes the differences for transmission between and end station and an RBridge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

```yaml
enum wlan {
  value 2114;
  description
    "Wake-on-LAN. Hex value of 0x0842.";
}
enum trill {
  value 8947;
  description
    "Transparent Interconnection of Lots of Links. Hex value of 0x22F3.";
  reference
    "RFC 6325: Routing Bridges (RBridges): Base Protocol Specification.";
}
```
P802f Project Impact on the RAC

• The RAC introduces additional fields to the EtherTypes registry
  • Short Name
  • Short Description

• The RAC provides a mechanism to alert interested entities (i.e., subscribers) when an EtherType registry item has changed

• The RAC continues to validate and provide approval for requests to add or modified EtherType registry entries

• The RAC provides a mechanism to allow interested parties (e.g., other SDOs) to subset the EtherType registry
The P802f project will specify the process to generating the EtherTypes YANG representation of the EtherType registry

• The YANG representation could be of the entire EtherType registry and/or could be a selected subset of the EtherType registry
• The resulting 802f standards document may or may not contain the YANG modules, it may contain a description of the process to create YANG modules

• The P802f project will modify the description of the IEEE Std 802-2014 specification related to the administration of EtherTypes
P802f Project Progress ...

• Preliminary draft P802f specification available for review
• Tool created to auto-generate a YANG model from the EtherTypes registry
• Need to resolve Outstanding open issues
  • Requesting feedback on best method to pursue resolution of these Open Items
    a) Via email to RAC reflector
    b) Schedule [periodic] meetings with this audience to discuss
    c) 802.1 Chair (and/or P802f Editor, etc.) periodically engages the RAC
    d) Other?
Project Open Issues

Clarification Items

1) There are items in the EtherType registry of the form EtherTypeX = EtherTypeY (e.g., 86BB = 86DA, 86AD = 86B0).
   • How should these be interpreted?

2) There are missing EtherTypes (e.g., 0x800) from the Public listing. How to we clean this up?

3) How to correct with EtherTypes with incorrect protocol description? Especially where the owner no longer exists.

4) Is there a “master database”? If so, does it need to be updated with the new fields?
Project Open Issues

Design Consideration Items

5) IEEE maintains the "complete" list of the EtherType registry but provides a tool that can be used by other entities (e.g., other SDOs, etc.) to generate a subset of the "complete" list.

6) How is the EtherType registry master list subset delineator governed and managed? There needs to be one if a per SDO (or subset) view of the EtherType registry YANG model representation can be provided. Options include:

   a) IEEE generates overall IEEE EtherType "complete" list via YANG representation. However the RAC can generate the subset based upon some delineation scheme. Scheme to be determined.
   NOTE: There may be a business opportunity for the RAC, where they can change a subset delineation fee.

   b) Each subset entity (i.e., consumer) has their own and manages their own subsetting scheme, and they prune the "complete" list to create their own list. The subset entity can then run the IEEE provided tool to generate the YANG representation.
   NOTE: A distinct benefit of using our tool to generate the YANG representation is that the structure of the YANG model will be consistent, uniform, and correct.
Project Open Issues

Implementation Items

7) When there is a request to add a new EtherType is being added to registry, how should the Order form be updated to reflect the new fields (e.g., short name and short description)?

8) When there is a request to update/modify an existing EtherType in the registry, how should the Order form be updated to reflect these new fields (i.e., short name and short description)?
Project Open Issues

Implementation Items

9) When an EtherType registry item has changed, a description of who gets notified and the notification mechanism is required
   • For example, perhaps the entity (e.g., person or organization) needs to subscribe/register to get alerts/notifications when a registry item changes

10) YANG representation gets generated whenever a change to the registry occurs or perhaps a refreshed YANG representation gets generated periodically (e.g., every 24-hours)

11) YANG representation gets deposited on a designated IEEE Server.
   • Or perhaps there is no repository needed. Rather there is just access to a tool that can generate the YANG representation
   • If the YANG representation is stored on an IEEE Server, then do we just retain the latest version, or do we also provide version control (i.e., history)?

12) The EtherType Tutorial document (https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/tutorials/ethertype.pdf) is outdated and needs a refresh