P802.1ASdm-Rev/D0.3
Editor’s Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for TG Ballot

Revision 4

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2021.11.19
Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (voters)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (voters)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Yes or No</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Time</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Expertise</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Total</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents (who are voting members)</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Members</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-voting member commenters</td>
<td>4 (1 yes, 2 no, 1 abstain with comments)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Commenters</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Comments</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comments by Category - 1

- In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses.

- Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (43 comments)
  
  ▪ All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)

  • 1, 2, 3, (7, 104), (15, 93, 94, 96, 110, 111, 118, 119), 16, (17, 103, 113), 21, 22, 23, 29, 30, 39, 63, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 80, (84, 85), 89, (91, 101), 97, 99, 107, 112, 114, 117, (120, 31)

- The comments on the following pages will be discussed.

  ▪ Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)

  ▪ Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution.
Comments by Category - 2

- Comments to be discussed (78 comments):
  - Definitions: (13, 14, 20)
  - Maintenance items: 8, 9
  - Difference in computations for CMLDS and Instance-specific peer delay: (24, 83, 82, 86)
  - rxSyncCountSlaveP: (4, 19, 25, 34, 6, 100, 115)
  - offsetFromMaster threshold logic: (5, 108, 116)
  - Different timescales for redundant times: (26, 58, 59)
  - Can either domain be used if both are good: (51, 61)
  - General description of HotStandbyInstance state machine: (33, 62)
  - Descriptions of SYNCED, SYNCED_TIMEOUT, and NOT_SYNCED in 17.3.1.1: (65, 121, 88, 18)
  - Use of managed objects in state machines: (37, 102)
  - Deletion of syncReceiptTimeoutSlaveP: (36, 10)
  - New managed object gmPresent: 11
  - Addition of assumptions for Hot Standby to 17.1: 12
Comments by Category - 3

- Comments to be discussed (Cont.):
  - Indication that desiredState can also be PassivePort: 32
  - Difference between currentLogSyncInterval and currentLogSyncIntervalP: 35
  - Deletion of atLeastOneEnabledandCapable: 38
  - Limitation to two domains: 52
  - Overview description: 54, 55, 57, 60, 87
  - HotStandbyInstance state machine description: 64
  - Indicating figure changes made in 802.1AS-2020/Cor1: 79
  - Description of the carrying of TLVs in a Signaling message: 81
  - Changing name of term isSlaveCapable: 90
  - Referring to “respective applications” instead of “industrial automation applications”: 92
  - Add PICS item for Signaling message carrying gPTP Capable TLV: 95
  - Use of correct capitalization in rxPTPPacketDiscardCount: 98
  - Addition of missing members to hotStandbyDS table, should final entry be write-only: 109
Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- GM apparently never enters the SYNCHED state: 105
- Split functionality: 40
- Use of application interfaces: (27, 28, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45)
- Description of ClockSourceTime interface parameters in 17.4.3.2: (46, 47, 48)
- Other comments pertaining to 17.4 (HotStandbySystem and related state machine): 50, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78
- Description of case where time aware system is a bridge, and related terminology: (56, 49)
- Return code of function slavePort() in 17.3.3.2: 106
- Miscellaneous: 53 (this comment was missed in previous versions of the editor’s report)