

P802.1ASdm-Rev/D0.3 Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for TG Ballot

Revision 5

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2021.11.22

Ballot Statistics

☐ Thanks to
 who
 reviewed the
 document
 and
 commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	10	62.50
No (voters)	6	37.50
Voting Yes or No	16	100
Abstain Time	5	
Abstain Expertise	7	
Abstain Total	12	37.5
Respondents (who are voting members)	28	36.36
Voting Members	77	100
Non-voting member commenters	4 (1 yes, 2 no, 1 abstain with comments)	
Number of Commenters	9	
Number of Comments	121	
TR	61	
T	8	
ER	32	
E	20	

Comments by Category - 1

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses
- ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (43 comments)
 - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)
 - 1, 2, 3, (7, 104), (15, 93, 94, 96, 110, 111, 118, 119), 16, (17, 103, 113), 21, 22, 23, 29, 30, 39, 63, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 80, (84, 85), 89, (91, 101), 97, 99, 107, 112, 114, 117, (120, 31)
- ❑ The comments on the following pages will be discussed.
 - Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)
 - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

□ Comments to be discussed (78 comments):

- Definitions: (13, 14, 20)
- Maintenance items: 8, 9
- Difference in computations for CMLDS and Instance-specific peer delay: (24, 83, 82, 86)
- rxSyncCountSlaveP: (4, 19, 25, 34, 6, 100, 115)
- offsetFromMaster threshold logic: (5, 108, 116)
- Different timescales for redundant times: (26, 58, 59)
- Can either domain be used if both are good: (51, 61)
- General description of HotStandbyInstance state machine: (33, 62)
- Descriptions of SYNCED, SYNCED_TIMEOUT, and NOT_SYNCED in 17.3.1.1: (65, 121, 88, 18)
- Use of managed objects in state machines: (37, 102)
- Deletion of syncReceiptTimeoutSlaveP: (36, 10)
- New managed object gmPresent: 11
- Addition of assumptions for Hot Standby to 17.1: 12

Comments by Category - 3

□ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- Indication that desiredState can also be PassivePort: 32
- Difference between currentLogSyncInterval and currentLogSyncIntervalP: 35
- Deletion of atLeastOneEnabledandCapable: 38
- Limitation to two domains: 52
- Overview description: 54, 55, 57, 60, 87
- HotStandbyInstance state machine description: 64
- Indicating figure changes made in 802.1AS-2020/Cor1: 79
- Description of the carrying of TLVs in a Signaling message: 81
- Changing name of term isSlaveCapable: 90
- Referring to “respective applications” instead of “industrial automation applications”: 92
- Add PICS item for Signaling message carrying gPTP Capable TLV: 95
- Use of correct capitalization in rxPTPPacketDiscardCount: 98
- Addition of missing members to hotStandbyDS table, should final entry be write-only: 109

Comments by Category - 3

□ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- GM apparently never enters the SYNCED state: 105
- Split functionality: 40
- Use of application interfaces: (27, 28, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45)
- Description of ClockSourceTime interface parameters in 17.4.3.2: (46, 47, 48)
- Other comments pertaining to 17.4 (HotStandbySystem and related state machine): 50, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78
- Description of case where time aware system is a bridge, and related terminology: (56, 49)
- Return code of function slavePort() in 17.3.3.2: 106
- Miscellaneous: 53 (this comment was missed in previous versions of the editor's report)